The Highlands in the Romantic Novel
Culture and Identity in Early 19th-century Scottish Literature

SETTORE SCIENTIFICO DISCIPLINARE DI AFFERENZA: Anglistica
Tesi di Dottorato di Stella Moretti, matricola 810543

Coordinatore del Dottorato: Prof. Alessandra Giorgi
Tutore del Dottorando: Prof. Emma Sdegno
## Contents

Dedication ................................................................................................................................. iii

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. iv

General Introduction ................................................................................................................. 1

### PART I: THE INVENTION OF SCOTTISH NATIONAL IDENTITY ............................................. 8

#### CHAPTER I: Literary Context and Main Themes ................................................................. 9
1. Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 9
2. Sir Walter Scott and the Canon ......................................................................................... 11
3. The Scottish Novel 1790-1814 ....................................................................................... 18
4. The Scottish Novel 1814-1835 ....................................................................................... 21

#### CHAPTER II: The Corpus and the Authors ........................................................................ 26
1. The Identity and Highlands Corpus ................................................................................. 26
2. The Authors: Nationality and Geography ..................................................................... 30
3. The Authors: Gender and Genre ................................................................................... 38

#### CHAPTER III: Genre and Identity ..................................................................................... 41
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 41
2. The Scottish Gothic: The Supernatural, History and Identity .......................................... 42
3. The National Tale: Manners, Geography and Marriage .................................................. 52
4. The Historical Novel ....................................................................................................... 64

#### CHAPTER IV: History and Identity. The Union with England and the Loss of Independence ................................................................. 70
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 70
2. The Union of the Crowns ............................................................................................... 70
3. William III and the Glencoe Massacre ........................................................................... 71
4. The 1707 Union of the Parliaments .............................................................................. 74
5. The Jacobite Risings of 1715 and 1745 ......................................................................... 75
6. After the Forty-Five ........................................................................................................ 80
7. The Past, Experience and Identity ................................................................................ 85

#### CHAPTER V: Cultural Invention and Identity in Scotland ................................................. 87
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 87
2. Literary Nationalism ........................................................................................................ 87
3. Intangible Cultural Heritage and Cultural Memory ....................................................... 91
4. The Intangible Made Tangible: National Writers and the Novel .................................. 95
5. The Invention of Scotland: Highland Warriors and Virtuous Heroines ....................... 98

#### CHAPTER VI: The Literary Myth ..................................................................................... 103
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 103
2. The Re-evaluation of the Highlands .............................................................................. 103
3. Ossian: Sympathy and Sublime ................................................................................... 105
4. Late Eighteenth-century Poets: Beattie and Burns ...................................................... 112
5. Sir Walter Scott ............................................................................................................. 116
PART II: SHAPING THE NOVEL: HISTORICAL SETTING, LANDSCAPE AND GEOGRAPHY .......................................................... 121

CHAPTER VII: Identity and Historical Setting .............................................................. 122
1. Introduction: Identity and the Chronotope ............................................................. 122
2. Historical Setting ................................................................................................. 124
3. The Remote Past .................................................................................................. 127
4. Liminal Period ..................................................................................................... 135
5. Recent Past .......................................................................................................... 142
6. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 148

CHAPTER VIII: Landscape and Identity ................................................................. 149
1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 149
2. Landscape Theories: Reality and its Representations ........................................... 149
3. A Construct of the Mind: the Highlands Perceived Landscape ......................... 152
4. Highland and Lowland Perspectives: Ethnographical Interest and Remarks on Colonialism ................................................................. 161
5. The Highland Beaten Track ............................................................................... 167
6. Stereotypical Landscape Features ..................................................................... 170
7. Authenticity, Alienation and Wilderness ......................................................... 173

CHAPTER IX: Landscape and Meaning ................................................................. 177
1. The Highlands before Improvement .................................................................. 177
2. Improvement and Change: The Effects of Modernity on Highland Landscape .................................................................................. 185
3. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 194

CHAPTER X: Literary Geography and National Identity ....................................... 196
1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 196
2. Geocriticism and Literary Geography: Mapping and Literature ....................... 197
4. Patterns of Movement and their Meaning ......................................................... 206
5. Nationalist Perspectives and Commonplaces .................................................... 226

Bibliography ............................................................................................................. 230

APPENDIX I: Novels and Tales Written by Less Known Scottish Authors 1790-1840 ........................................................................ 238

APPENDIX II: Chronology of Scott’s Works and the Identity and Highlands Corpus ........................................................................ 244

Abstract: ................................................................................................................... 246
Dedication

I am extremely grateful to my loving parents, Lirio and Cristiana, my boyfriend, Matteo, and my grandmother, Alice. They supported me during these three years of study and never stopped believing in me; they encouraged me with tender words, they endured me when I was depressed and made me hang in there when I was alone in Edinburgh.

I dedicate this work to them, to my friends, and to my beloved grandma, Lilliana, who died some months after my becoming a PhD student.
Acknowledgements

I am deeply grateful to all the people who supported me during the devising and writing of this dissertation. I wish to thank Ca’ Foscari Graduate School, for having allowed me to carry out my research as a PhD student. I am particularly grateful to my tutor, Professor Emma Sdegno, who has always been available for me, providing me with useful pieces of advice and helping me to frame the subject of this work. I am also grateful to Professor Enrica Villari; it was thanks to her lectures on Sir Walter Scott and Waverley that I was introduced to Scottish literature, and I must say that... it was love at first sight!

I would like to thank my referees, Professors Richard Ambrosini and Francis O’Gorman, who accepted to read my dissertation providing useful observations and beneficial criticism. A special thank goes to Professor Malcolm Andrews, an expert in landscape studies, who recommended some useful guidebooks about the idea of landscape. I will never forget about our first meeting in Venice: I was coming out of Palazzo Cosulich with one of Andrews’ books in my hands and his wife stopped me, in order to take a photograph of me with the book!
**General Introduction**

The aim of this dissertation is to investigate the existence of a relationship between early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels and the concern for national identity that involved Scottish society after the 1707 Union of the English and Scottish Parliaments. Literature is here considered as a representation of contemporary concerns, ideas, fears, hopes and tastes and, therefore, as historically and culturally significant. Since literary representations are always affected by the ideas and opinions of writers, the study of the novels written during a certain period can provide crucial evidence about the feelings and ideas characterising that age.\(^1\)

This dissertation is focused on Scottish novels written between 1800 and 1835, that is to say, during the romantic period. Although Scottish romanticism shares many aspects with English romanticism, such as the love of nature, the taste for the picturesque and the sublime, the nostalgic interest in the past, it differs from its English cognate in its focus on national identity issues. Sir Walter Scott is generally recognised as the most important figure in Scottish romantic literature, since his Waverley novels provide skilful examples of the treating of such issues in narrative. In this dissertation, I shall deal with Scott’s first novel, *Waverley* (1814) only marginally. Although I acknowledge Scott’s crucial role in Scottish literature and I provide some commentary on the way in which he dealt with identity issues in *Waverley*, I place him together with less known Scottish novelists active between 1800 and 1835. This choice is aimed at shifting the focus from Scott as the most famous writer of the period, to the fact that the issues he dealt with in his novels are typical of Scottish romantic literature and emerge in minor novels too.

I shall provide an analysis of a group of twenty-seven little known novels, selected among possibly hundreds of novels written by Scottish novelists during the time lapse of interest. The novels discussed are collected in a canon, which I call the “Identity and Highlands Corpus”. This name is aimed at emphasising two crucial features of these novels, i.e. the constant preoccupation with identity issues, and the setting (at least partially) in the Highlands of Scotland. Noteworthy, these features also characterise Scott’s *Waverley*,

---

\(^1\) It is beyond the scope of this dissertation to explore whether and how the meanings conveyed in the national novels here discussed were received by contemporary readers.
hinting to the fact that this novel is deeply rooted in the literary background of the romantic period.

The Identity and Highlands Corpus gathers novels written by authors of national tales, such as Elizabeth Hamilton, Honoria Scott, Mary Brunton, Christian Isobel Johnstone, Jane Porter and Mary Johnston, by anonymous Gothic novelists, and by writers of historical novels, such as David Carey, George Robert Gleig and Andrew Picken. Indeed, the canon discussed collects works belonging to various literary genres, an aspect that reinforces the thesis that identity issues were crucial in Scottish romantic literature.

The structure of this dissertation mirrors my methodological path. In the first section, “The Invention of Scottish National Identity”, I shall provide an account of the cultural process that led to the construction of Scottish national identity after the union with England and of its role in literature. After giving an account of the literary context in which the novels of the corpus discussed were written (Ch. I), I will explore the way in which these works deal with identity issues, highlighting their centrality in various literary genres, from the national tale to the historical novel (Ch. III). The Gothic novel, for instance, is centred on the discovery of individual origins, and family roots are often found in the Highlands. In such novels, the individual quest for identity and its eventual discovery stand as symbols for Scotland’s quest for its specific national identity – as distinguished from English cultural identity.

The national tale was specifically devised to deal with national issues; in these novels, the manners, life habits, landscape and language of the inhabitants of peripheral areas of Britain, such as Ireland and Scotland, are described extensively. The genre was

\[2\] In this dissertation, I frequently refer to seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Scottish national identity with the term “modern”. By doing this, I endorse Alexander Murdoch’s opinion that “Cromwell’s conquest [...] really marks the beginning of modern British history” (A. Murdoch, British History 1660-1832, Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1998, p. 17). Murdoch is here hinting at Cromwell’s 1650 victory against the Scots in Dunbar; before that date, England and Scotland were no longer two distinct, independent nations, but two parts of modern Britain.


originally developed in Ireland after the 1801 Union of the Irish and English Parliaments, and is closely connected with the loss of national independence. Due to its connection with national issues, the genre was adopted by many Scottish female writers, who found in the Highlands their own Ireland. It was in the Highlands, indeed, that the English government imposed itself more consistently; moreover, the Highlanders belong to the Gaelic ethnicity and many among them were Catholics, like the Irish people. The issues dealt with in national tales were reshaped in the historical novel, especially in the form popularised by Sir Walter Scott. In these works, the stress is on the role played by major historical events on people’s individual and national identities.\(^5\)

The first three chapters introduce the corpus and highlight the importance of national identity in Scottish romantic literature. But why were Scottish novelists so interested in national identity? I try to answer this complex question in Chapter IV, where I point to the historical events of the eighteenth century as to the root cause of this phenomenon. In fact, the loss of national identity started after the 1707 Union of the English and Scottish Parliaments entailed the rewriting of the Scottish political predicament.\(^6\) A further loss of independence followed the Jacobite Risings, when economic changes reshaped Scotland and its most peripheral areas.\(^7\)

During the early nineteenth century, Scots experienced a sense of loss of identity, due to the deep influence exerted by England on their culture. This led to a romantic nostalgia for a past of independence that, on its turn, triggered the development of cultural


\(^6\) In *Devolving English Literature*, Robert Crawford, while dealing with eighteenth-century literature, claims that “the Scots’ concern with identity, discrimination, and the possibilities of ‘improvement’ or advancement makes prejudice one of the main themes of Scottish books in this period” (R. Crawford, *op. cit.*, p 46). Crawford stresses that identity issues and the prejudice characterising the relationship between the English and the Scottish peoples were present in Scottish literature since Thomas Smollett wrote *Roderick Random* in 1748. In that novel, the protagonist is Scottish Lowlander; a crucial choice, according to Crawford: “But by choosing a Scot as his hero, and making the reader aware of the way in which Scottishness is treated, Smollett is beginning to construct a fiction that is not English (in the national sense) but both Scottish and truly British” (*Ibidem*, p. 60).

nationalism. In fact, in the nineteenth century Scotland was well integrated in the United Kingdom. In Chapter V, I provide an account of the cultural process at the root of Scottish nationalism, embracing Hugh Trevor Roper and Murray Pittock’s idea that Scottish national identity is the result of an act of cultural invention. I shall also introduce three crucial concepts, i.e. literary nationalism, culture as a construct, and cultural memory. National identity is here considered as a cultural construct. The novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus represent the tangible records of manners and ways of life that, prior to their inclusion in literature and narrative, belonged to the realm of intangible culture. The process of cultural construction lies at the root of the narrative development of national issues in the Identity and Highlands Corpus.

In Chapter VI, I shall examine the way in which, during the second half of the eighteenth-century, literature became a powerful instrument of cultural construction. Writers such as James Macpherson, Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott played a major role in the establishment of literature as a form of national invention. In different ways, they reshaped the image of Scotland, by re-evaluating the Highlands and defining the core features of Scottishness. Macpherson’s Ossianic poetry helped to utterly change the role of the Highlanders in people’s imagery, turning them from a barbarous and violent people, into a group of noble, brave, and virtuous warriors. Ossianic poetry exerted a crucial influence on all later Scottish poetry and narrative, emphasising nature, landscape and the sublime. Robert Burns, probably the most appreciated poet in Scotland nowadays, was the first to romanticise Jacobitism, establishing a connection between rebellion and national identity. Sir Walter Scott’s novels represent a further step in the creation of the literary myth of old Scotland and of the Highlanders, although in his novels Jacobitism is analysed in less

9 H.T. Roper’s The Invention of Scotland (New Haven: Yale UP, 2008), M.G.H. Pittock’s The Invention of Scotland. The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present (London: Routledge, 1991). This dissertation is focused on the role played by literature in the process of cultural invention. The novels here discussed can be considered as means of communication endowed with a specific aim: to influence the reading public by making them more reflective about national identity issues.
romantic, more political terms. These writers partook in the creation of the Highland myth and popularised a new image of Scotland both inside their nation and abroad.

The second part of this dissertation, which I called “Shaping the Novel: Historical Setting, Landscape and Geography”, is devoted to the analysis of the corpus and is aimed at providing a detailed account of the way in which the endeavour to shape Scottish national identity affected romantic narrative. I shall start my analysis with some considerations about the relationship between plot and setting, adopting Michail Bakhtin’s concept of chronotope, highlighting how the chronotope of the novels of the corpus is strikingly affected by national identity issues.¹¹ I shall deal with historical and spatial setting separately; in Chapter VII, I focus on the periods in which the novels of the canon are set, highlighting the function attached by national writers to Scottish history in the development of Scottish identity. The novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are set in three main periods, each fraught with specific national meaning: the recent past, belonging to a mythic dimension and spanning from the Wars of Scottish Independence to the sixteenth century, the liminal period, spanning from the 1603 Union of the Crowns and the 1745 Jacobite Rising, and the recent past, that is to say, the period going from the end of the Jacobite Risings and the early nineteenth century. National novelists cast a nostalgic look on Scottish past, highlighting the political status of their mother country and its relationships with England in each of these periods.

The last three chapters represent the analytical part of this dissertation; here, I deal with the spatial setting of the novels discussed, applying landscape theories and literary geography to them. In Chapter VIII, I shall give a brief account of major landscape theories, highlighting the representative, and therefore, artificial, nature of all literary descriptions of landscape.¹² I shall also examine the influence of identity issues on landscape descriptions in the novels of the corpus, quoting extensively from these works. By analysing the way in which natural and human environments are portrayed in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, it is possible to draw some interesting conclusions about the way in which specific landscape elements, such as plants, rocks, glens, torrents, etc., became symbols of Scottishness. I shall also highlight the role played by major aesthetic ideas widespread at the time, such as the

taste for the sublime and the picturesque, suggesting the existence of a form of literary tourism that made people look for Highland landscape in narrative.\(^\text{13}\)

Landscape, therefore, is not employed as a backdrop for action; instead, it is endowed with aesthetic, cultural and national meanings. National writers used it as a powerful instrument in order to comment on the effects of modernity and progress in the Highlands. In Chapter IX, I shall provide several quotations showing how, in the novels set before 1746, the Highlands are described as an idyllic place, emphasising wilderness and sublimity. These descriptions are compared with those provided in the novels set after 1746, where the negative effects of progress, such as the Clearances, the emptying of the glens and the taming of wild nature, are stressed. I also explore the representation of meaningful sites in literature, studying them as a form of cultural heritage. These sites represent culturally charged places, where the past still exerts its power. The field of Culloden, for instance, is oftentimes described in the corpus, because its historical importance is closely connected with the national history of Scotland.\(^\text{14}\)

Lastly, I shall deal with the way in which Britain and over-sea colonies are represented, focusing on the geographical representation of reality.\(^\text{15}\) The extension of the world in which the plot develops, as well as the meanings attached to different regions and areas inside and outside Britain, are fraught with national meaning. In particular, the relationship between centre and periphery is a crucial issue in most novels and reveals important information about the novelists’ political and national ideas.\(^\text{16}\) In order to better examine these issues, I shall follow a geocritical approach, a relatively recent attitude to literature aimed at the analysis of the way in which space is represented in literature.\(^\text{17}\)


\(^{17}\) My approach is particularly indebted to Franco Moretti’s works, namely *Atlas of the European Novel*, New York: Verso, 1998, where Moretti focuses on both “space in literature” and “literature in space", the former entailing the mapping of literary representations of reality, the latter the mapping of literary production according to geographical areas; *Signs Taken for Wonders. Essays in the Sociology of Literary Forms* (London: Verso, 1983), and *Graphs, Maps, Trees. Abstract Models for a Literary Theory* (London: Verso, 2005), providing
Applied to post-colonial and colonial literatures, its use in Scottish literature is still unexploited. By applying geocriticism to the Identity and Highlands Corpus, my aim is to foreground the strong influence exerted by the concern with national identity in early-nineteenth-century Scottish romantic literature.
PART I
THE INVENTION OF SCOTTISH NATIONAL IDENTITY
CHAPTER I

Literary Context and Main Themes

1. Introduction

The opening chapter of this dissertation provides a general overview of the Scottish novels written between 1790 and 1835. Sir Walter Scott is presented as the first and foremost writer of the period; to his first novel, *Waverley*, I devote a short chapter, highlighting the features, themes and issues that, in my opinion, are most representative of the way in which Scottish novelists dealt with national identity and culture in their works. In *Waverley*, the construction of identity is a crucial issue not only in view of the protagonist’s moral development, but also of the historical plot, which is closely tied with the shaping of Scottish national identity.

Scott’s major role in Scottish romantic literature is at the root of my choice to divide the Scottish novels published from 1790 to 1835 into two periods, the first going from 1790 to 1814, and the second from 1814 to 1835. This periodisation reveals the importance of Scott’s first novel, also clarifying which of the features and themes treated by Scott were already present in Scottish novels, and which were, instead, introduced by him. For instance, the concern with national identity constantly emerges in the literature of the period, affecting novels written both before and after *Waverley*. On the other hand, other important elements, such as the introduction of a new perspective on history, are more typically Scottian.

However, the main focus of my dissertation is on little-known works, in that, as a whole, they seem to demonstrate that the construction of national identity was a constant theme in Scottish romantic literature. Therefore, Scott’s novels are here placed on the same level as other novels of the period, regardless of the success and fame enjoyed by each novelist. My aim, in fact, is that of showing to what extent this theme affected literature during the romantic period in Scotland.

I agree with John Ruskin who, in *Modern Painters III*, styled Scott as “the great representative of the mind of the age in literature”, and the fact that many writers active during Scott’s life were interested in the same themes that emerge so consistently in his
novels is a proof that Scott skilfully incorporated topical concerns in his narrative. In a way, this dissertation aims to provide more definite outlines and details of the literary background to Scott’s work, to reconstruct the rich pattern of works that characterised Scotland during the romantic period.

I here employ the term “romanticism”, mainly due to the time-lapse in which the novels here discussed were written, that is to say, between 1800 and 1835. In fact, used as a temporal label, romanticism can be comfortably used to describe these novels. If, instead, we consider Romanticism as a literary and philosophical category, relying on the presence of certain themes and conventions, we should be more careful in the use of the term. Although Scottish literature is generally studied as a part of English literature, the issues and concerns dear to early-nineteenth-century Scottish writers highlight the presence of some important differences between the English and the Scottish literatures of the period. Therefore, we should add to Romanticism a further adjective: “Scottish”.

1 J. Ruskin, Modern Painters III [1856], in E.T. Cook, A. Wedderburn (eds), The Works of John Ruskin, 39 vols, London: George Allen, 1903-1912, Vol. V, p. 330. Ruskin (1819-1900) was very fond of Walter Scott’s Waverley Novels and commented them in two writings: Of Modern Landscape and Fiction Fair and Foul. Of Modern Landscape is the title of the sixth chapter of Modern Painters III and was issued in 1856; here, Scott is described as the embodiment of the spirit of his age and, more in particular, of the kind of landscape appreciated by modern man. Fiction Fair and Foul was written in 1880; in this essay, Ruskin divided modern novels into good and bad, according to their morals and contents, extolling Scott as a good writer and a promoter of fair fiction, because of the healthy morals he conveys in the Waverley Novels. For further information see J. Clegg, “Fiction Fair and Foul: Ruskin Lettore di Scott”, in Storie su storie: indagine sui romanzi storici (1814-1840), Vicenza: Neri Pozza Editore, 1985, Vol. 32, pp. 41-64, and H.H. Carter, “Ruskin and the Waverley Novels”, in The Sewanee Review, Vol. 30, No. 2, pp. 130-153.

2 As critics have demonstrated, the reading public to whom works were aimed was not very extended; in The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period (W. St. Clair, The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004, pp. 13-4), William St. Clair divides the British population into three main groups: 1. “the reading nation”, i.e. people “who regularly read English-language written books” (this is the smallest group); 2. “the literate nation”, i.e. “those many others whose reading was largely confined to the reading of commercial documents, manuscript ledgers, accounts, and letters directly associated with their employment, and to the reading of newspapers”; 3. “the non-reading nation”, i.e. “those members of society whose experience of written texts were mainly oral and visual, although almost all were also influenced, at school or in church, by texts which derived from written books”. If novels reached only a smaller part of the British people it should be pointed out that many among the novels discussed in this dissertation were published by Anthony K. Newman and the Minerva Press. Minerva books were significantly cheaper than other books, so that it is possible that these novels reached a larger part of the reading public than more costly publications. For the full publishing details of early nineteenth-century less-known novels, see the Primary Sources in the Bibliography and Appendix I.

3 Marilyn Butler, in “Romanticism in England”, deals with James Thomson, James Macpherson and Walter Scott, considering their works as belonging to English romanticism. About the use of history made by Scott, Butler claims that its function is that of “making his characters and communities familiar and likeable, and of connecting them with English history” (M. Butler, “Romanticism in England”, in R. Porter, M. Teich (eds), Romanticism in National Context, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, pp. 37-67, p. 52). What is most striking about this book is that, despite its aim being a very comprehensive view of the relationship between romanticism and national identity in Europe (it takes into account romanticism in several nations: Wales, England, Ireland, Greece, Germany, Switzerland, Scandinavia, the Netherlands, Hungary, France, Spain, Russia and Poland), it does not devote a separate chapter to Scotland. The reason at the root of this choice may lay in the fact that
The label “Scottish Romanticism” can be attached to the majority of the novels published during the period 1790-1835, only after remarking on the divergence of Scottish Romantic features from the English canon, especially in novels. While some features are shared in both English and Scottish works – such as the taste for the picturesque and the sublime, the revival of medievalism and the interest in the role played by great heroes in history, other issues are more properly Scottish. The most eye-catching ones are the concern with national and cultural identity and the nostalgia for lost independence; these features stem from Scotland’s political situation and recall Italian and German Romantic nationalism.

While not all the novels written during the period 1790-1835 can be considered as romantic, the ones concerned with identity and the Highlands can be comfortably included in this category.

2. Sir Walter Scott and the Canon

During this period, in Scotland as well as in England, critics privileged poetry over narrative fiction. Many novelists, indeed, published their works anonymously, fearful that their novels would somehow jeopardize their reputations as writers, especially in the case of novelists who were already famous as poets. The most striking example of this attitude is embodied in Sir Walter Scott (1771-1832), undoubtedly the most famous, appreciated and prolific writer of the Romantic period in Scotland. When critics refer to Scottish Romanticism, they almost always refer to Walter Scott. To his contemporaries, Scott was a great poet, an advocate at the bar, a member of the Highland Society of Edinburgh and one of the most active organisers of the welcoming ceremony for King George IV’s visit to Edinburgh in 1822. Instead, his reputation as a novelist consolidated only in the late 1820s, when he revealed that he was the generally admired “The Great Unknown”.

the editors either believe that Scotland lacked its peculiar form of romanticism (Butler considers Scott as an author writing for the English market), or that it lacked a specific national identity, incorporating it into England. I am convinced that this approach is quite restricted. The Scottish literature of the Romantic period, in fact, is decidedly distinguished from the English one, and the works of Scottish writers such as Macpherson and Scott (as well as other, less known, writers) feature specific issues and elements that can be considered as specifically Scottish.


5 In his Sir Walter Scott, The Great Unknown, Edgar Johnson focuses on Scott’s life, from his ancestors, to his childhood, his life, his career and works. “The Great Unknown” is the pseudonym with which Scott styled himself when he published his novels; his poems, instead, were published as the work of Walter Scott.
Scott began his career as a poet. Born in Edinburgh in 1771, the son of a Presbyterian couple, Scott studied to become an advocate and gained access to the Bar, where he exercised his profession. Alongside with his professional interests, Scott soon developed a deep interest in literature and poetry; he was only 25 years old when he published his first work, a collection of German ballads called *Translations and Imitations from German Ballads* (1796). In the 1800s, Scott’s career as a poet took off, with the publication of *The Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802), a collection of ballads gathered in the Borders of Scotland, where Scott had been spending much time since he was a child. From 1805 to 1817, Scott published ten poetical works; among them, the famous *The Lay of the Last Minstrel* (1805) and *The Lady of the Lake* (1810). His interest in Scottish history and traditions was already evident in his poems, but became even more explicit in his novels.

Walter Scott’s first novel is *Waverley; or, ’Tis Sixty Years Since* and was published in 1814. It enjoyed a great success, which encouraged Scott to write other historical novels. In the course of his life, he published more than thirty narrative works, among them the most famous *Rob Roy* (1817) and *Ivanhoe* (1819). *Waverley* was welcomed with enthusiasm by both readers and critics, and still is. This novel was extolled as a great novelty, both for its subject and its structure, and has been acknowledged as the first “historical novel” by Georg Lukács. Yet, *Waverley* shares many features with contemporary literature. In fact, it is structured in a way similar to that of the national tale, while the concerns about education are typical of the *Bildungsroman*.

The novel was written in two distinct periods. The first seven chapters of the first book were written in 1805, while the rest of the novel was written in 1814. In Chapter I, Scott introduces *Waverley* as being “neither a romance of chivalry, nor a tale of modern manners”. In fact, Scott believes that his choice to set his novel during the Forty-Five, that is to say, during an intermediate stage between distant past and present, distinguishes it from the tales of manners spreading in the early nineteenth century:

---

6 W. Scott, “General Preface” [1829], in W. Scott, *Waverley; or, ’Tis Sixty Years Since*, [1814], C. Lamont (ed.), Oxford: Oxford UP, 2008, pp. 349-361, p. 352: “Having proceeded as far, I think, as the Seventh Chapter, I showed my work to a critical friend, whose opinion was unfavourable […]. I therefore threw aside the work I had commenced” (*Ibidem*, p. 352).

7 *Ibidem*, p. 4. Noteworthy, among Scott’s novels there are also some novels, such as *Ivanhoe*, which are set in the middle ages and recall chivalric romances.
A tale of manners, to be interesting, must either refer to antiquity so great as to have become venerable, or it must bear a vivid reflection of those scenes which are passing daily before our eyes, and are interesting from their novelty.

In tune with his decision to provide “a description of men [rather] than manners”, Scott centres his 1805 chapters on a sixteen-year-old Englishman, Edward Waverley. Edward’s character and family background are described to the reader, providing hints to the young man’s relatives’ involvement in eighteenth-century British history. Edward’s old uncle, Sir Everard, had been a Jacobite and embodies the family’s “hereditary faith […] in high church and the house of Stuart”.

The first seven chapters are written in the style of the Bildungsroman, focusing attention on the character, temperament, decisions and ideas of a young man; history’s role is confined to the past and affects Edward only through his father and uncle’s past choices and decisions. From Chapter VIII onwards, history gradually becomes a major force, intruding into Edward’s life and partaking in his moral growth. The flow of events leads Edward to Scotland and then beyond the so-called “Highland line”, that is to say, that imaginary border separating the Highlands from the Lowlands. On the Highlands, Edward joins a group of Jacobites and gets involved in the 1745 rebellion.

Edward Waverley is a passive hero, who avoids taking important decisions and rushes into adventures more out of his love of romance, than of loyalty and devotion to some political cause; he lives in an aesthetic dimension, in which action is determined by romantic and sublime fascination, rather than by willing choices, as it would happen in an ethical dimension. This fault is evident to his friends, as Fergus MacIvor’s question exemplifies: “And is this your very sober earnest, or are we in the land of romance and fiction?”.

As a passive character, Edward is overwhelmed by events that, instead, act on him as a human character would do. In Waverley, history is a powerful force disrupting people’s everyday life and utterly altering it. Indeed, it is after the intervention of major

---

8 W. Scott, Waverley, cit., p. 4.
9 Ibidem.
10 Ibidem, p. 6.
11 Ibidem, p. 133.
12 According to Alexander Welsh, in the Waverley novels there are two kinds of characters: the passive ones (such as Edward Waverley) and the active ones (dark heroes such as Fergus MacIvor or Rob Roy). About passive heroes he observes: “The actions and commitment of the passive hero in the Waverley Novels are so restricted that any activity depends upon other sources of energy” (A. Welsh, op. cit., p. 40). I am convinced that in Waverley the “source of energy” that makes things happen is history.
historical events (the Forty-Five) that Edward abandons his initial condition of passivity and addiction to romantic reverie, and enters adult life, becoming a “sadder and wiser man”.13

Despite the fact that the focus of narration is persistently set on Edward’s adventures and on his moral growth, *Waverley* results more concerned with the description of manners than Scott devised in 1805. Of course, Scott was aware of the divergence of his finished work from the statements made in Chapter I and in “A Postscript, which should have been a Preface”, he claims that his object has been that of describing his characters “not by a caricatured and exaggerated use of the national dialect, but by their habits, manners and feelings”, adding that “to the rising generation the tale may present some idea of the manners of their forefathers”.14 The description of manners in *Waverley* is a significant feature; when dealing with the Highlands, indeed, Scott carefully provides the reader with striking descriptions of Highland manners, lifestyle, character and landscape.15

*Waverley* is a crucial work not only in Scottish romantic literature, but also in European literary production. Not only did Scott popularise a new form of narrative, the historical novel, but he also inspired great European writers such as Alessandro Manzoni and Lev Tolstoy. In Scotland, *Waverley* represents a touchstone work, whose merits include the development of a new vision of history and the attempt to use literature as an instrument to analyse social, historical, national and cultural dynamics. In *Waverley*, the concern with national identity plays a major role: Scott focuses not only on the development of Edward’s identity as an individual, but also on the construction of his identity as a member of a nation.

Scott plays extensively with Edward’s individual and national identities; a young Englishman devoid of any feeling of national belonging, Edward partakes in a rebellion against his king and government, joining a group of Highlanders. Allured by the romantic halo of the Highlands and overwhelmed by major historical events, he ends up betraying his country, embracing an identity that is not his own. The discrepancy between Edward’s actual nationality (he is an Englishman) and his acquired Highland identity is epitomised in his adoption of the Highland costume. It is only when Edward looks at himself as dressed in clothes that do not belong to his country that he realises which is his real nationality:

14 Ibidem, p. 341.
It was in that instant, that looking around him, he saw the wild dress and appearance of his Highland associated, heard their whispers in an uncouth and unknown language, looked upon his own dress, so unlike that which he had worn from his infancy, and wished to awake from what seemed at the moment a dream, strange, horrible and unnatural.¹⁶

Edward suddenly becomes aware of his singular predicament; his romantic reveries and dreams turned into a “strange, horrible and unnatural” dream. One word is crucial: “unnatural”. Edward is led by events to join the Highlanders; he wears the same dresses as they do and partakes in their activities. Nevertheless, he is a stranger among strangers and does not even understand their native language, Gaelic. He becomes an outsider: not an Englishman or a Dragoon, nor a true Highlander. Eventually, Edward accepts his English nationality and marries Rose Bradwardine, a Scottish Lowlander, instead of the Jacobite Highlander Flora MacIvor.

National identity is a major issue in Waveley. The novel is set during the 1745 Jacobite Rising and the lost battle of Culloden, fought in 1746, is portrayed in the third book of the novel. By setting his novel during this period, Scott stresses the importance it played in the development of Scottish national identity. The loss suffered by the Jacobites demonstrated that the Stuarts were finally defeated, and that Scots had to recognise King George (a Protestant and German King, dwelling in London) as their rightful sovereign. From the viewpoint of identity, the battle of Culloden represents a turning point, because, after it, Scotland became a peaceful member of the United Kingdom and people accepted their identity as British citizens. In Waverley, Scott promotes British, rather than Scottish nationalism, representing the adult Edward as an Englishman married to a moderate Scottish Lowlander.

Scott’s interest in national identity was not confined to literature. As a member of the Highland Society, he led the organisation of King George IV’s visit to Edinburgh in 1822. Rather significantly, Scott organised a party for the king, in which everyone (both Highland and Lowland aristocrats) were asked to wear the tartan and the Highland costume.¹⁷ This episode is representative of Scott’s desire to show to the king, and to England, the image of a united Scotland, where both Highlanders and Lowlanders dress the same way, showing not

---

¹⁶ W. Scott, Waverley, cit., p. 221.
¹⁷ In The Invention of Scotland, Hugh Trevor Roper devotes great attention to the way in which Scott organised the King’s visit, highlighting how the Scottish writer decided to turn it into a “Highland affair”, requiring that all the participants to the celebration should wear the Highland costume, even Lowlanders and George IV: “The king himself, at last, appeared in a kilt of the so-called ‘royal Stuart’ tartan, in which, as Lockhart dryly remarked, certainly no Stuart except Prince Charles had ever before presented himself in the salon of Holyrood” (H. T. Roper, op. cit., p. 214).
only their internal concord but also their difference from the English. Christopher Harvie comments on the event as follows:

It was the political apotheosis of Scott’s combination of unionism and cultural nationalism, the symbolic confirmation of the Hanoverian line, the transference of remaining Jacobite and nationalist sentiments to wider Britain imperial loyalties, but it had also specifically nationalist implications, reminding the political metropolis and its elite that Scots loyalty, though full-hearted, was not wholly unconditional.\textsuperscript{18}

Harvie’s remark stresses the presence of a “combination of unionism and cultural nationalism” in the celebrations for George IV’s visit. This combination is the same characterising the Waverley Novels; in both cases, Scott promotes British identity over Scottish provincial identity, without diminishing the cultural importance of Scottish manners, costume, landscape and history.

Scott’s role in the shaping of Scotland’s modern identity was an active one; his works are deeply rooted in the spirit of the period in which he wrote, but at the same time they affected the opinion of his contemporaries. Therefore, Scott can be considered as one of the most important literary figures who partook in the construction of Scottish modern identity and culture, alongside with James Macpherson and Robert Burns.\textsuperscript{19} Indeed, Scott inherited something from both Macpherson and Burns; like the Highland poet author of the poems of Ossian, Scott provided his readers with unparalleled landscape descriptions, while, like Robert Burns, Walter Scott stressed the importance of Jacobitism in Scottish history. If Jacobitism is directly connected with that great force that so significantly affects Edward Waverley’s fortune and adventures, i.e. history, landscape descriptions are more concerned with the description of manners and life in the Highlands. James Reed suggests that landscape, as well as history, are both influential on Edward’s mind:

Scott shows the pressures on Waverley’s mind and conscience by his use of environment rather than by argument, and through all the hero’s adventures from his childhood at Waverley-Honour to the Highland refuge of MacIvor, and on the battlefields of Prestonpans and Clifton Moor, locality appears as a context of moral issues, not merely as an attractive scene of action, meditation, or soliloquy.\textsuperscript{20}

\textsuperscript{19} I deal with Scott, Macpherson and Burns in Chapter VI, as they greatly affected the “invention” of Scottish culture.
In *Waverley*, environment is a combination of history and locality, of time and place, which acts upon characters as an inescapable force that compels them to action. Edward’s personality and identity develop thanks to precise events, meetings, experiences and places, all elements that are independent of him. Environment affects the lives of both passive (Edward) and active characters (Fergus MacIvor), suggesting that, according to Scott, environment leaves little power for personal choices. As a part of environment, landscape has the power to affect characters; indeed, Highland wilderness and sublime nature exert a strong influence on Edward’s mind but, while the young man considers Highland landscape as a source of aesthetic pleasure, Scott represents the Highlands as “a context, not a canvas, [...] a world of action, not an object of contemplation”.

For Scott the novel is an instrument to portray reality, enabling him to convey his theories by providing representative stories that, in a fictional language, arouse cultural and historical debate. The majority of the novelists studied in this dissertation, writing either before or after Scott, attempted to employ literature in the same way. Scottish national writers such as Honoria Scott, Elizabeth Hamilton, Jane Porter, Mary Brunton and Christian Isobel Johnstone, as well as anonymous Gothic novelists and authors of historical novels like David Carey, Alexander Sutherland, Alexander Balfour and Andrew Picken, dealt with space and time in a way similar to Scott, considering them as agents that can change people’s lives significantly. In this dissertation, I shall deal with both the historical and the geographical setting, as the environment in which the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are set proves to be affected by the same concern with national and cultural identity. As in *Waverley*, identity issues are interconnected with both history and place, therefore affecting many narrative features, from setting to plot.

21 Reed writes: “One feels, with Scott, that place and time – this place at this time – exert such power on the characters moving within them that [...] such a character at such a place and time would be inescapably subject to such forces”, in J. Reed, *op. cit.*, p. 22.


23 Instances are numerous, as it will be seen in the following chapters of this dissertation. In Christian Isobel Johnstone’s *Clan-Albin. A National Tale* (1815), for example, the protagonists of the novel are evicted from their native valley, Glen Albin, during the Clearances. The lives of both active characters like the protagonist, Norman, and more passive people like his fellow villagers, are utterly changed by environment; it is not just history that affects Norman, but also the place where he lives, the culture of his people, the feudal heritage preserved by Lady Augusta, etc. In later novels, such as *The Black Watch* (1834), written by Andrew Picken, the young protagonist, Hector, is led by his love for nature and the Highlands, to leave his master in Inverness and to join a group of Jacobites, to join the British Army and to fight at Fontenoy in 1746. Like Waverley, Hector is moved to action by a romantic disposition; moreover, he is overwhelmed by major historical events.
3. The Scottish Novel 1790-1814

The novels studied in this dissertation were written both before and after Scott’s *Waverley*. The novels written from 1790 and 1814 represent the literary background in which Scott became famous; noteworthy, this is a very rich and lively context, although most authors are now little known. In the following paragraphs, I shall provide a survey of the main genres and works of the period. To determine whether a novel belongs to Scottish literature does not always prove to be an easy task. The main cause lies in the fact that many novelists, as Scott himself, published their works anonymously or under a pseudonym. While the identity of some novelists was ascertained, either during their lives or afterwards, that of others still remains obscure. In this dissertation, I include novels written by both Scottish and anonymous writers, whose Scottish identity can be inferred either by publishing circumstances or by the contents of their novels.\(^{24}\) I deal with these novels dividing them into two main periods – from 1790 to 1714 and from 1814 and 1835. The aim of this division is to highlight the difference between the narrative works written before *Waverley* and after it.

During the 1790-1814 period, the Scottish literary landscape was dominated by the Gothic novel. As elsewhere in Great Britain, Ann Radcliffe’s first novels and *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) in particular, exerted a strong influence on narrative. One of the first writers of Gothic novels in Scotland was Helen Craik (c.1751-1825); her first works are set in France and are concerned with the French revolution (*Julia de St. Pierre*, 1796, and *Adelaide de Narbonne*, 1800), while after 1800 Craik started to choose Great Britain as a setting, as in *Stella of the North; or, the Foundling of the Ship* (1802).\(^{25}\) Another writer of Gothic novels, Isabella Kelly (1759-1857), set her novels in Great Britain, rather than in exotic and distant places; among Kelly’s novels we find *Ruthinglenne; or, The Critical Moment* (1801) and *The Baron’s Daughter* (1802).

---

\(^{24}\) Authorship represents one of the most difficult riddles to solve, when dealing with anonymous works. In this dissertation, I deal with several novels written by unknown novelists. This entails that there is a complete lack of information about some authors, including any relevant certainty about their nationality. Novelists like Felix M’Donough are dealt with in this dissertation, despite the lack of information about his national identity and the fact that his novels were all published in London; nevertheless, the concerns and ideas conveyed in *The Highlanders. A Tale* (1824) – as well as his supposedly Scottish surname – suggest that he is a Scottish writer. It is a striking fact that many novelists concerned with national identity decided to conceal their own identity, without introducing themselves as Scotsmen and Scotswomen.

During the early 1800s, the setting of Gothic novels began to shift from the Continent and England to Scotland. Although Ann Radcliffe’s very first novel, published in 1789, was set on the Highlands during the twelfth century, Scottish writers began to exploit the Highlands and Islands of Scotland as a setting for Gothic plots only in 1805, when *Monteith* was published. This novel was written by an unknown authoress, whose pseudonym is Mrs Rice; the novel hinges upon a Gothic plot and is set on a remote island in Northern Scotland.

During the following years, two other Gothic novels were published, both set on the Highlands: *Glencore Tower; or, The Feuds of Scotland* (1806) and *The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of Carron* (1809). Both novels were published anonymously; their main merit is that of being among the first novels in which history begins to gain importance. In *Glencore Tower*, in particular, the Wars of Scottish Independence become intertwined with a plot focused on identity issues. Although both novels were published in London, we may suppose that they were written by Scottish novelists, due to the strong sense of nostalgia for Scottish lost independence that they convey. These early works already exhibit not only a concern with national identity, but also an aesthetic taste for sublime nature and medieval architecture.

The interest in national identity is much more evident in another literary genre: the national tale. The first national tales were written in Ireland by Sydney Owenson Lady Morgan, the author of *St. Clair; or, the Heiress of Desmond* (1804), *The Novice of Dominick* (1806) and *The Wild Irish Girl* (1806). Other important Irish writers of national tales are Charles Maturin, author of *The Milesian Chief* (1812) and Maria Edgeworth, the author of *Castle Reckrent* (1800). The new genre was aimed at portraying national manners, habits, virtues and vices; moreover, it was an instrument of national self analysis. The national tale was developed in Ireland and then spread in Scotland, but did not receive significant attention in England. The reason is clear – the national tale was developed at the periphery of the empire, not at its centre. Therefore, its aims and structure are fit to peripheral areas with threatened cultural and national identities.

---

26 Called *The Castles of Athlyn and Dunbayne* (1789), Radcliffe’s first novel hinges upon clan feuds and turns medieval Highland society into an appealing Gothic setting.

27 When Scott began writing *Waverley* in 1805, the national tale was still an Irish genre. The most successful example is Maria Edgeworth’s *Castle Reckrent*, a family saga that possibly inspired Scott’s *Waverley*. Nevertheless, Scott’s claim that “the object of [his] tale is more a description of men than manners”, suggests that he did not want to write a national tale, a genre that was primarily devoted to the description of manners and habits (W. Scott, *Waverley*, cit., p. 4).
In Scotland, the national tale became a dominant genre towards the end of the decade, when Elisabeth Hamilton published *The Cottagers of Glenburnie* (1808). Hamilton’s novel, which is supposedly set on the Highlands, focuses on the education of children to working and the improvement of less developed areas of Scotland, echoing the English improvement of the Highlands after the Forty-Five and the Highland Clearances. Noteworthy, Hamilton is mentioned by Scott in his “A Postscript, which should have been a Preface”, where he praises her portrait of “the rural habits of Scotland, of which she has given a picture with striking and impressive fidelity”. Hamilton’s novel was quite successful and certainly hit the imagination of many readers, including Walter Scott, whose description of the village of Tully-Veolan, in Perthshire, recalls Hamilton’s descriptions of Glenburnie.

The year 1810 is a most important one for the national tale, because three novels belonging to this genre were published: Kate Montalbion’s *Caledonia; or, The Stranger in Scotland*, Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde* and Jane Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs*. Among these novels, Jane Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs* was the most successful, due to its innovative structure, in which history is intertwined with national identity, to the depiction of national manners and an alluring Gothic hue. Some critics consider *The Scottish Chiefs* as the first historical novel; however, Porter’s novel is undoubtedly an historical novel, but not of the kind popularised by Sir Walter Scott. Its underlying aim is that of describing national manners and character through the life and exploits of one of Scotland’s greatest heroes, Sir

---

29 One may compare Scott’s description of Tully-Veolan with Hamilton’s descriptions of Glenburnie in the following passages:

The houses seemed miserable in the extreme, especially to an eye accustomed to the smiling neatness of English cottages. They stood, without any respect for regularity, on each side of a straggling kind of unpaved street [...] (W. Scott, *Waverley*, cit., p. 32)

But almost every hut was fenced in front by a huge clack stack of turf on one side of the door, while on the other the family dunghill ascended in noble emulation. (*Ibidem*, p. 34).

The meadows and corn-fields, indeed, seemed very evidently to have been encroachments made by stealth on the sylvan reign: for none had their outlines marked with the mathematical precision, in which the modern improver so much delight. Not a straight line was / to be seen in Glenburnie. (E. Hamilton, *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, Edinburgh: Ballantyne, 1808, pp. 126-7)

[The village] consisted of about twenty or thirty thatched cottages, which, but for their chimneys, and the smoke that issued from them, might have passed for so many stables or hog sties, so little had they to distinguish them as the abodes of man. That one horse, at least, was the inhabitant of every dwelling, there was no room to doubt, as every door could [...] boast its dunghill [...]. (*Ibidem*, pp. 134-5).

Both writers highlighted the lack of regularity and the presence of a dunghill in front of every house, ironically stressing every family’s pride in showing it.

30 Kate Montalbion is a pseudonym; the real identity of the author is unknown.
William Wallace. Porter’s interest in a great hero is typically Romantic and, therefore, quite far from the idea of the historical novel as it was afterwards developed. We may say that *The Scottish Chiefs* is a Romantic historical novel, extolling the way in which great men make history.

Honoria Scott’s first novel, *Vale of the Clyde*, is a little-known but innovative work, which introduced a series of important couples of values, or “doubles”, that will become typical of the historical novel à la *Waverley*. For instance, the heroine of the novel is the daughter of a Lowlander and a Highlander, of an aristocrat and of a member of the middle-classes, of a Catholic and a Protestant. These pairs are present in later novels dealing with identity, from Scott’s *Waverley*, where there is a collision between Highland Catholic Jacobites and English/Lowland Protestant supporters of King George, to a late-nineteenth-century novel by Robert Louis Stevenson called *Kidnapped* (1886), where the same conflict is renovated. Noteworthy, Honoria Scott’s Flora represents the results of this collision; she is the daughter of the two sides, the amiable and honourable representative of Scottish modern identity.

From 1810 to 1814 no significant novelties were introduced in the novel. National tales and Gothic novels continued being published, exploiting the structures and themes introduced in the previous decade. This general overview of the works written before *Waverley* shows how many of these issues developed by Scott were already present in Scottish literature; not only was the interest in history and national identity widespread, but the concern with juvenile education remained a major theme, as *The Cottagers of Glenburnie* exemplifies.

4. The Scottish Novel 1814-1835

This period is characterised by a huge literary production. After the success of *Waverley*, the novel gained ground and admiration, becoming the privileged genre for prose-writing.\(^{31}\) Notwithstanding its immediate success, *Waverley* did not exert a relevant influence on the Scottish novel until the end of the 1810s. The authors of national tales who set their novels on the Highlands – completely or partially – rejected any Scottian influence in the prefaces to their novels. The first was Mary Brunton (1778-1818) who, in the preface to her second novel, *Discipline* (1814), claims that not only did she set the last part of her

\(^{31}\) In the following paragraphs, I provide an account of the most important and innovative novels written between 1814 and 1835. Other novels, which cannot be an object of analysis here, are listed in Appendix I, where a full list of titles is provided, featuring publication details.
novel on the Highlands independently from *Waverley*, but also that any comparison between her novel and Scott’s would be “absurd”. Similar claims were made by Christian Isobel Johnstone (1781-1857) who, in the “Advertisement” to *Clan-Albin. A National Tale* (1815), asserts that the first volume of her novel – the one set on the Highlands – was not only written before *Waverley* appeared, but also printed.

The effects of the rise of the historical novel on the national tale were quite dramatic; few national tales were published after 1815 – only two deserve attention, *The Lairds of Glenfern; or, Highlanders of the Nineteenth Century* (1816), by Mary Johnston, and *Glenfergus* (1820), by Robert Mudie. The genre slowly died away, and the last national tale is generally identified with Christian I. Johnstone’s *Elisabeth de Bruce*, published in 1827. The cause of this loss of interest in the national tale may lie in the fact that the main object of this genre, that is to say, to portray national manners and character, was fulfilled by another literary genre: the historical novel.

The historical novel exerted a crucial influence on the Gothic novel as well. Although the genre did not extinguish itself like the national tale did, towards the end of the 1810s it merged with the historical novel, leading to the creation of a new hybrid genre, in which historical and Gothic plots are intertwined. While purely Gothic novels were still published – in 1817 the same anonymous writer published *Hardenbrass and Haverill; or, the*

---

32 See the Preface to *Discipline*:

> “The author cannot help expressing a strong feeling of regret, that the close of her story may, from its subject, seem to provoke a comparison which it is most truly her interest to avoid. The ground which she has there taken is as yet so little trodden, that she cannot hope to escape reminding the reader of the more successful adventurers who have attempted it before her. Perhaps she ought rather say the single adventurer [...] The author of *Waverley*, alone, has incorporated with a fictitious story the characteristic manners of the Gae[...] [...] no one who peruses [this novel] will believe her to be so destitute of common understanding, as to aim at competition where it were so truly absurd” (M. Brunton, *Discipline. A Novel*, Edinburgh: George Ramsay and Co., 1814, vol. I, pp. viii-ix).

Nevertheless, there is striking likeness between *Discipline* and *Waverley*. Indeed, in both novels the protagonist is an English person, who moves from the centre of the United Kingdom to the Highlands, that is to say, the periphery. Moreover, it is on the Highlands that the identity of the protagonist develops. Despite such evident similarities, the endings of these novels are significantly divergent and, as it were, even opposed: while in *Waverley* the adventures lived on the Highlands partake in the development of Edward’s British identity, that is to say, as an Englishman who lives in the United Kingdom, in *Discipline* the protagonist embraces specific Highland manners, moral values and ways of life, shifting from an English to a Highland identity and, therefore, without reaching a British identity.

33 “In justice to the Author, it ought to be mentioned that the first half of this Tale was not only written but also printed long before the animated historian of the race of Ivor had allured the romantic adventurer into a track, rich, original, and unexplored, and rendered a second journey all but hopeless” (C.I. Johnstone, *Clan-Albin. A National Tale*, Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2003, p. 1).
Secret of the Castle and Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-muir), historical plots gained more and more ground, as David Carey’s Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden (1820) and A Legend of Argyll; or, ’Tis a Hundred Years Since (1821) show.\(^{34}\) Both novels recall Scott’s Waverley both in style and setting; though, they deserve attention, due both to Carey’s literary skills and to the innovative merging of the Gothic with the historical novel. In both Lochiel and A Legend of Argyll, the historical events of the 1715 and the 1745 are intertwined with the typically Gothic theme of the quest for family roots and origins.\(^{35}\)

Another instance of this hybrid version of the historical novel is Bannockburn; A Novel, appeared anonymously in 1821.\(^{36}\) Like The Scottish Chiefs, the novel is set during the Wars of Scottish Independence, at the time of King Bruce’s fighting against the English army at Bannockburn, near Stirling. Here too, the historical plot is intertwined with some Gothic features, such as Aberdeen’s plotting to steal Invercauld’s estate and Clementina’s threatened virtue by the villain Gordon.

Many historical novels were published in the two decades following Waverley; some are overtly indebted to Sir Walter Scott, namely E.H.H.’s The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady (1819) and Henry Duncan’s William Douglas; or, the Scottish Exiles. A Historical Novel (1826), while others are more original, such as Allan Cunningham’s Paul Jones. A Romance (1826), focused on the life of a real historical character, John Paul Jones, a Scottish American hero of the American Revolution, and Alexander Campbell’s Perkin Warbeck. The Court of James the Fourth in Scotland. A Historical Novel (1830), telling part of the life of Perkin Warbeck, an impostor who claimed to be the rightful heir to the English throne exploiting his resemblance to the Dukes of York.

Other novels provide an example of the way in which the historical novel can also be employed as a basis for moral writings. In George Robert Gleig’s Allan Breck (1834), the protagonist’s outsideness is not rooted in history, but stems from wrong education and

---

\(^{34}\) David Carey had already written a Gothic novel, The Secret of the Castle; or, The Adventures of Charles D’Almaine in 1806.

\(^{35}\) We may claim, therefore, that Carey worked on Scott’s historical novel by uniting the Jacobite settings of Waverley and Rob Roy (1817) with the Gothic elements of Guy Mannering; or, the Astrologuer (1815).

\(^{36}\) There is no information about the author of Bannockburn. Noteworthy, on the British Fiction website, attention is drawn on the fact that, in the 1822 Philadelphia edition, this novel was sub-titled “Being a Sequel to the Scottish Chiefs by Miss Jane Porter”. Actually, the novel is set right after the events described by Jane Porter in The Scottish Chiefs, but the style and the development of the plot suggest that the author must have been somebody else. This erroneous sub-title gave origin to the unlikely hypothesis that the novel was written by Jane Porter. See [http://www.british-fiction.cf.ac.uk/titleDetails.asp?title=1821A001](http://www.british-fiction.cf.ac.uk/titleDetails.asp?title=1821A001). This website is part of a project directed by Professor Peter Garside, an authority in early-nineteenth-century literature. It is a database of British fiction written between 1800 and 1829; it gathers a great quantity of works and provides useful information about editions, publishing circumstances and contemporary reviews.
parental neglect. Notwithstanding the fact that Gleig does not describe *Allan Breck* as an historical novel, the protagonist’s life and fortune are deeply affected by major historical events: born right after the 1715 Jacobite Rising, Allan becomes a skilful soldier in the 1745 and dies in France in 1789, beheaded during the French Revolution. Gleig’s novel is a weird one; education and morality are major issues, while the style is interestingly introspective, highlighting the inner conflicts that torment Allan throughout his life. Allan Breck is a hero in battle, but he is also a gambler and a murderer. Such complexity possibly makes Allan Breck the only Byronic hero in the Identity and Highlands Corpus.\(^{37}\) Gleig may have drawn some inspiration from another novel in which psychological insight plays a major role: James Hogg’s *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1826), in which the deeds of a murderer are portrayed both from the narrator’s and the criminal’s perspectives.

Besides its role in the historical novel, history became a major theme in other literary genres, such as annals, short stories and children’s literature. History is still a concern in the first works of John Galt (1776-1839), the author of novels and short stories aimed at being representative of the manners and habits of the Western Lowlands. Born in Ayrshire in 1776, John Galt became famous thanks to *The Annals of the Parish* (1821) and *The Ayrshire Legatees* (1821). In *The Annals*, history is embodied in the annals of the village, where major and minor events are recorded and logged. John Galt was a very active writer, and published several works through the 1820s, among them *The Steam Boat* (1825), *The Entail; or, The Lairds of Grippy* (1823), *The Omen*, (1825) and *The Last of the Lairds; or, The Life and Opinions of Malachi Meldrum, Esq.* (1826).

History plays a major role in the woks of another Lowland writer, Andrew Picken, dealing with the life and traditions not only of his native land, the Lowlands, but also of the Highlands. In fact, his 1834 novel, *The Black Watch*, is set on the Scottish mountains during the 1740s.

During the 1820s, history and romance became central to moral tales aimed at children and young readers. The most eye-catching example is represented by *The Scottish Orphans. A Moral Tale* (1822), and its sequel, *Arthur Monteith. A Moral Tale*, issued in the same year. The author is Isabella Wellwood Stoddart, writing under the pseudonym of

\(^{37}\) This novel was not met with favour by critics. Right after its publication, a review appeared on the *Fraser's Magazine*, where the author blames Gleig’s decision to write his novel without looking at the trials to the real Allan Breck Stuart: “[... we fear our friend the parson has not read Allan’s trial, else he might have made a far more interesting book [...] The report of his trial may not easily be found; but in not looking for it Gleig was decidedly unwise” (Anonymous, “A Dozen of Novels”, in *Fraser Magazine for Town and Country*, Vol. IX, April, 1834, No. 111, London: James Fraser, 1834, pp. 456-486, p. 461).
Martha Blackford. *The Scottish Orphans* and its sequel tell the story of Arthur Monteith, a young man of Highland origins who, after his father’s being sentenced to death due to his partaking in the 1745 Jacobite Rising, is raised with his siblings by a family of cottagers in the Lowlands. Much attention is devoted to Arthur’s education and the consequences of his disobedience to his foster father. In the end, Arthur discovers his true origins and settles on the Highlands, becoming the master of the Monteith estate.

Even though identity issues are more evident in historical and Gothic novels, they characterise other genres as well. For instance, domestic novels dealing with marriage and female life are focused on the role, and therefore the identity, of women in society. Such novels were the domain of female writers, such as Susan Ferrier (*Marriage*, 1818), Mrs Ross (*The Balance of Comfort; or, The Old Maid and the Married Woman*, 1818, and *Hesitation; To Marry or Not To Marry*, 1819) and Charlotte Susan Maria Campbell Bury (*Conduct is Fate*, 1822, *Flirtation; a Novel*, 1827, and *Journal of the Heart*, 1830).
CHAPTER II

The Corpus and the Authors

1. The Identity and Highlands Corpus

This dissertation is focused on a selection of novels that, despite belonging to different literary genres, are characterised by a set of shared patterns and themes. Inclusion in the corpus depends upon the ultimate end of this study, that is to say, to investigate how the general concern with national and cultural identity affects not only the plot, but also the setting of Scottish romantic novels. Not only are the following features shared by all the novels discussed in this dissertation, but they are also present in Walter Scott’s *Waverley*.

The main objects at the basis of my choice are:

- The plot: the novels included in this dissertation are focused on the adventures of a hero or heroine whose identity is defined in the course of the novel;
- The setting (time): the novels chosen are all set in the Scottish past, in order to best investigate the relationship between the interests in history and identity that characterised early-nineteenth-century Scottish literature;
- The setting (space): the novels chosen feature Scotland as their main setting. This element allows us to explore the role attached by the writers’ to their native country, establishing a connection between the quest for national identity and the representation of national territory and landscape.
- The doubles: the novels chosen provide a series of couples of principles, ideas and geographical areas, such as the Highland/Lowland divide, the contrast between feudalism and modernity, Jacobitism and Presbyterianism and centre and periphery.

Due to their main features, I refer to these novels as the “Identity and Highlands Corpus”, in order to highlight the two outstanding traits of these works, that is to say, their concern with identity issues and the importance attached to the Highlands as a possible source of national identity.¹

¹ By calling this can “Identity and Highlands Corpus”, instead of “Highlands Corpus”, I draw attention to the necessity of dealing with novels where the Highlands figure as a culturally significant site, rather than as a fashionable setting, and of excluding many works that, besides being set on the Highlands, are not concerned with national and identity issues, such as James Baillie Fraser’s *The Highland Smugglers* (1822), an adventure
All the novels of the corpus are set, at least in part, on the Scottish mountains; the emphasis laid on this peripheral area of Scotland will be amply discussed in this dissertation. The way in which Highland history, culture and landscape are portrayed in these novels, indeed, suggests that the Highlands were oftentimes adopted as a source of national identity. In Figure 1, I provide a list of the novels composing the corpus, ordered by publication date.

Figure 1. The Identity and Highlands Corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1805</td>
<td>Mrs Rice</td>
<td>Monteith. A Novel Founded on Scottish History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1806</td>
<td>Anon</td>
<td>Glencore Tower; or, The Feuds of Scotland. A Legend of the Thirteenth Century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1808</td>
<td>Elizabeth Hamilton</td>
<td>The Cottagers of Glenburnie. A Tale for the Farmer’s Inglenook</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1809</td>
<td>Anon</td>
<td>The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of Carron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>Honoria Scott</td>
<td>Vale of the Clyde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>Jane Porter</td>
<td>The Scottish Chiefs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>Peter Middleton Darling</td>
<td>The Romance of the Highlands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1813</td>
<td>Honoria Scott</td>
<td>Strathmay; or, Scenes of the North. Illustrative of Scottish Manners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1814</td>
<td>Mary Brunton</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1815</td>
<td>Christian Isobel Johnstone</td>
<td>Clan-Albin. A Novel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1816</td>
<td>Mary Johnston</td>
<td>The Lairds of Glenfern; or, Highlanders of the Nineteenth Century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>(Author of Hardenbrass and Haverill)</td>
<td>Conirdan; or, The St. Kildians. A Moral Tale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>(Author of Hardenbrass and Haverill)</td>
<td>Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-muir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819</td>
<td>E.H.H.</td>
<td>The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>David Carey</td>
<td>Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>Robert Mudie</td>
<td>Genfergus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821</td>
<td>David Carey</td>
<td>A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821</td>
<td>Anon</td>
<td>Bannockburn. A Novel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>Martha Blackford</td>
<td>The Scottish Orphans. A Moral Tale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>Martha Blackford</td>
<td>Arthur Monteith. A Moral Tale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td>Alexander Sutherland</td>
<td>Macrimmon; A Highland Tale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td>Felix M’Donough</td>
<td>The Highlanders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1825</td>
<td>Sir Thomas Dick Lauder</td>
<td>Lochandhu; a Tale of the Eighteenth Century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1826</td>
<td>Alexander Balfour</td>
<td>Highland Mary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

tale about alcohol distillery, and Mrs John Smythe Memes’s Precipitance, a Highland Tale (1823), a moral novel warning against rush decision-taking.
Waverley exerted a strong influence on the way in which novelists dealt with identity in their works, affecting both historical and spatial settings. In the novels written before Waverley, the national identity of the protagonists is already defined; in such novels as Glencore Tower, The Towers of Lothian, Honoria Scott’s Vale of the Clyde and Strathmay, Jane Porter’s The Scottish Chiefs, and Peter Middleton Darling’s The Romance of the Highlands, heroes and heroines are all Scottish, coming either from the Lowlands or the Highlands. Plots do not follow the construction of their national identity, as it happens in Waverley; instead, the emphasis is on the virtues, qualities and manners typical of Scottish people. In The Scottish Chiefs, for instance, Porter extols William Wallace’s virtues, turning him into a national symbol and the embodiment of true Scottishness. Likewise, in Vale of the Clyde, Honoria Scott describes Flora Hamilton as the prototypical Scotswoman, virtuous, humble, patient and sensible. In fact, the “Bildung” element was not dominant in pre-Waverley novels; instead of the construction of national identity, it is the positioning on the social ladder that plays a major role in these novels. In The Romance of the Highlands, for example, the protagonist starts as a peasant and eventually becomes a Viscount, while in Vale of the Clyde, Flora Hamilton inherits both her aunt’s Aristocratic title and her uncle’s middle-class possessions.

In many novels written after Waverley, instead, the moral and national growth of the protagonist is at the core of the novel, highlighting how many novelists considered the Bildung element introduced by Scott as a valuable instrument to deal with identity. In Discipline, for instance, Ellen Percy’s identity is completely redefined, from spoilt, insensitive English woman to virtuous, generous and loving Highland woman. Throughout her inner growth, Ellen abandons her English identity, with all the vices and faults associated with it, to embrace the lifestyle and manners of the Highlanders. In Highland Mary, too, the protagonist’s identity is defined through the novel; by being an orphan, Mary Macdonald’s identity is vague and undefined, because she does know nothing about her family roots. Raised in Edinburgh until she was six years old, and then moved to London, Mary is an outsider among English and Scottish aristocrats, grasping to her virtue and faith as her only support in this world. When Mary discovers her family history, she becomes acquainted with her Highland origins, which are represented as the cause of her virtues and good qualities.
Although Mary’s character does not change throughout the novel, her national identity changes as long as she discovers things about her family history, which is intertwined with the national history of Scotland. Other interesting examples of national and inner Bildung are provided in the anonymous Conirdan, in Martha Blackford’s The Scottish Orphans and Arthur Monteith, and in Andrew Picken’s The Black Watch. As in Highland Mary, the protagonists of these novels are two orphans ignorant of their family origins and whose identity develops in the course of the novels.

As to setting, none of the novels published before Waverley were set during the Jacobite Period; national tales such as Honoria Scott’s and Elizabeth Hamilton’s are set during the end of the eighteenth century, while Gothic novels such as Monteith and The Romance of the Highlands and Jane Porter’s The Scottish Chiefs are set in a remote past that spans from the thirteenth century to the sixth century. On the other hand, many among the novels published after 1814 deal with the Jacobite Risings, and some are even set during the Forty-Five, such as E.H.H.’s The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady, and David Carey’s Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden. This fact highlights how Scott’s choice to deal with a period that was neither too close to the present (as the second half of the eighteenth century) nor too remote (as the Wars of Scottish Independence) was welcomed with favour by many novelists, who saw in it the possibility to analyse the events that laid at the roots of Scottish contemporary predicament.

The feature on which Waverley probably exerted a minor influence is the spatial setting. Indeed, the Highlands were already portrayed in pre-Waverley novels, such as The Cottagers of Glenburnie and The Romance of the Highlands. Nevertheless, Scott introduced the habit to stress the moment of crossing of the Highland line. This feature is absent in the novels issued before 1814, while it appears, for instance, in Discipline, where Ellen Percy crosses this renowned cultural and linguistic border at Perth (Edward Waverley, too, crossed the Highland line in Perthshire), in The Highlander, where Johnnie Baillie crosses the imaginary line between Lowlands and Highlands in an unspecified location, and in A Legend of Argyle. In other novels, such as Allan Breck, the line is crossed, but in inverse direction, i.e. from the Highlands to the Lowlands; in this novel, the changes in landscape and nature are what strikes the protagonist most.

The couples of values and ideals here styled as “doubles” were already present in some pre-Waverley novels; in particular, in Honoria Scott’s Vale of the Clyde, the opposition between Jacobitism and faithfulness to England, Catholicism and Protestantism, aristocracy
and middle-class and Highlanders and Lowlanders play a major role in the construction of Flora Hamilton’s family history and on the development of her personality.

To sum up, Scott’s first novel represented a great novelty in the literary context of the period; it introduced new ways to deal with national identity and underlined the importance of the Jacobite period in the definition of Scottish nationality. Moreover, Scott popularised the description of Highland landscape and invested Scottish history with a halo of romance. Nevertheless, *Waverley* is consistently rooted in the literary context in which it was developed and, as such, it shares many features with the novels that were published in Scotland after 1800. Not only is the novel constructed around the concern with national identity, but it also continues the analysis of Scottish and Highland manners that was started in the national tales.

### 2. The Authors: Nationality and Geography

The first feature required to a novel for being included in the Identity and Highlands Corpus is being written by a Scottish novelist. Determining whether the author of a novel is Scottish or not is not an easy task, since most novels were published anonymously or under pseudonyms. While, in the case of many novels, the names of the novelists became known to the reading public either during their lives or after their deaths, other works remained anonymous. The analysis of the place of publication, although interesting, is not useful in determining the nationality of writers, because, especially during the first decade of the nineteenth century, most novels were published in England, even in the case of well known Scottish novelists such as David Carey and Jane Porter. The inclusion of controversial novels in the Corpus is based on the fact that not only do the plots of these novels consistently resemble the ones created by ascertained Scottish novelists, but that they also conform to the setting and thematic features of the Identity and Highlands Corpus (i.e. they are set in the Highlands or in peripheral areas of Scotland and are focused on Scottish history and national-cultural identity).

![Figure 2. Birthplaces of authors.](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unknown Birthplace</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
<th>England</th>
<th>Ireland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Rice</td>
<td>Rosalia St. Clair (Roxburghshire)</td>
<td>Martha Blackford (Salisbury)</td>
<td>Elizabeth Hamilton (Belfast)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. H. H.</td>
<td>Jane Porter (Dumfries and Galloway)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Middleton Darling</td>
<td>Andrew Picken (Paisley)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honoria Scott</td>
<td>Mary Brunton (Oarkney Islands)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexzander Sutherland</td>
<td>Christian I. Johnstone (Fifeshire)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felix M’Donough</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mary Johnston  
The author of *Glencore Tower*  
The author of *The Towers of Lothian*  
The author of *Conirdan* and *Reft Rob*  
The author of *Bannockburn*  

|-----------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|

In Figure 2, I divide novelists according to their birthplace. Noteworthy, the birthplace of most novelists involved is uncertain (11 out of 23), while only ten were born in Scotland. About the novelists whose birthplace is known, remarks can be made on the fact that none of them was born in the Highlands. Indeed, Rosalia St. Clair was born in the Borders, Jane Porter, Andrew Picken, Christian I. Johnstone, and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder in the Lowlands, Mary Brunton in the Oarkney Islands, Robert Mudie, Alexander Balfour and David Carey in Angus, and George R. Gleig in Stirling. This is a rather significant fact, because it provides some evidence supporting one of the basic assumptions of this dissertation, that is to say, that the image of the Highlands provided in the Identity and Highlands Corpus is a literary representation, not only due to the fact that most novelists attempted to portray the Highlands as they imagined they were in the past, but also because they were not native Highlanders.

As non-native Highlanders, these Scottish novelists are likely to have known the Highlands either through literary representations provided in famous works set there, such as the poems of Ossian and Sir Walter Scott’s poems and novels, or through tours and travels. In Chapter V, I focus on the influence exerted by Macpherson and other late-eighteenth-century novelists on the Identity and Highlands Corpus, highlighting how they consistently partook in the creation of the so-called Highland myth. According to this myth, the Highlands are represented as the site of virtue, honesty, humbleness and of the capacity to live in contact with nature.

1. **Anonymous and Pseudonymous Novelists**  
The difficulty in determining the nationality of the novelists studied in this dissertation is mainly due to the fact that most novelists published their works in anonymous form, i.e. *Glencore Tower* (1806), *The Towers of Lothian* (1808), *Conirdan* (1817), *Reft Rob* (1817) and *Bannockburn* (1821), or under a pseudonym, i.e. *Monteith* (1805), *The Highlander*
(1819), *The Scottish Orphans* (1822), *Arthur Monteith* (1822) and *The Doomed One* (1832). *Glencore Tower*, *The Towers of Lothian* and *Bannockburn* are all set in peripheral Scotland and partly in the Highlands; they are Gothic novels set in the remote past of Scotland (XII, XIII and XIV century) and dealing with Scottish history from a Scottish perspective. In *Glencore Tower* and *Bannockburn*, two Scottish heroes, King Robert de Bruce and William Wallace, are extolled for their courage and their function in preserving Scottish independence, while in *The Towers of Lothian*, the narrator and the characters complain about the battles of Alnwick (fought in 1093 and 1174), which Scotland lost against England and which ended in a loss of independence for Scotland. *Bannockburn*, moreover, was published in Edinburgh by John Warren.

*Conirdan* and *Reft Rob* were written by the same novelist, known after his first novel, *Hardenbrass and Haverill; or, The Secret of the Castle*, published in London by Sherwood, Neely and Jones in 1817, as “The Author of Hardenbrass and Haverill”. The identity of this novelist is still unknown, despite some attempts to identify him with David Carey; these attempts are based on the similarity between the titles of *Hardenbrass and Haverill; or, The Secret of the Castle* and Carey’s *Secrets of the Castle; or, The Adventures of Charles D’Almaine* (1806).\(^2\) The Author of Hardenbrass and Haverill published two other novels in London: *The History of Julius Fitz-John*, in 1818, and *Normanburn; or, the History of a Yorkshire Family*, in 1819. The decision to include *Conirdan* and *Reft Rob* in the Identity and Highlands Corpus stems from the way in which the author deals with Scottish history in *Conirdan*, where the Glencoe Massacre is represented as an open wound in the heart of Highlanders and Scots.

Among the works published under a pseudonym there are *Monteith* and *The Highlander*. *Monteith* was written by Mrs Rice, the author of *The Deserted Wife. A Tale of Much Truth*, published by the Minerva Press in London in 1803. *Monteith*, instead, was published in Gainsborough. Both of Mrs Rice’s novels were not published in Scotland, but the subject story of *Monteith* is concerned with Scottish history at the times of Mary Queen of Scots. Noteworthy, this novel was written before the fashion for Scottish history was spread by Sir Walter Scott’s Waverley Novels, suggesting that Mrs Rice was truly interested

in Scottish history. Moreover, Monteith is the first novel whose subtitle suggests that she was willingly dealing with history: *Monteith. A Novel. Founded on Scottish History.*

The identity of E. H. H., the author of *The Highlander; or, a Tale of My Landlady,* is still a mystery. Nevertheless, the novel was included in the Identity and Highlands Corpus due to both the subject of the novel (the misadventures of a young Highlander some months after the Forty Five) and to the fact that the narrator introduces himself as a Scot. Possibly, the nationality of the narrator does not coincide with that of the novelist; nevertheless, the novel was written as a clear attempt to imitate the Waverley Novels, it is consistently concerned with Scottish history and deals with national and cultural issues.

*The Scottish Orphans* and *Arthur Monteith* were written in 1822 by Martha Blackford. Noteworthy, Martha Blackford is only a pseudonym, the real name of the writer being Isabella Wellwood-Moncrieff (1774-1846). Isabella was born in Salisbury, in England, but she was the daughter of Sir Henry Wellwood-Moncreiff, 8th Baronet of Moncreiff, a Scotsman educated in Glasgow and Minister in Aberddenshire and Edinburgh. Isabella Welwood wrote many works under the name of Martha Blackford, all aimed at instructing young readers, as the title of her first novel suggests: *The Eskdale Herd-Boy; a Scottish Tale, for the Instruction and Amusement of Young Persons* (1819). She also wrote *Annals of the Family M’Roy* (1823) and *William Montgomery, or, the Young Artist* (1829), all published in London by Wetton and Jarvis.

Rosalia St. Clair, the author of *The Doomed One,* was also using a pseudonym. Her real name was Agnes C. Hall (1777-1846) and was born in Roxburghshire, in Southern Scotland. Under the name of Rosalia St. Clair, Agnes published several novels, all with the Minerva Press in London: in 1819 she issued *The Son of Donnel,* in 1820 the *Highland Castle and the Lowland Cottage,* in 1822 *Clavering Tower,* in 1824 *The Banker’s Daughters of Bristol; or, Compliance and Derision: a Novel,* in 1827 *The First and Last Years of Wedded Life: a Novel,* in 1827 *Fashionables and Unfashionables: a Novel,* in 1828 *Ulrica of Saxony; a Romantic Tale of the Fifteenth century,* in 1829 *Eleanor Ogylvie; the Maid of the Tweed: a Romantic Legend,* in 1830 *The Sailor Boy; or, the Admiral and His Protegé,* in 1831 *The Soldier Boy, or, the Last of the Lyals* and in 1834 *The Pauper Boy, or, the Ups and Downs of Life.* Rosalia St. Clair wrote novels of several genres, from the Gothic to the domestic tale. In *The Doomed One,* she deals with the Glencoe Massacre, representing it as the triggering

---

3 On Lady Isabella Wellwood’s family history see [http://thepeerage.com/p51548.htm#i515474](http://thepeerage.com/p51548.htm#i515474).
event that led to the 1715 and 1745 Jacobite Rebellions and condemning not only the short-sightedness of the English government, but also their ruthlessness.

2. Unknown Birthplaces

Difficulties in determining the nationality of authors are encountered also when the (supposedly) real name of the writer is known. This is the case of novelists whose birthplace is unknown, such as Peter Middleton Darling, the author of *The Romance of the Highlands* (1810), Honoria Scott, the author of *Vale of the Clyde* (1810) and *Strathmay; or, Scenes in the North* (1813), Alexander Sutherland, the author of *Macrimmon; a Highland Tale* (1823), and Felix M’Donough, the author of *The Highlanders* (1824). Peter Middleton Darling’s birthplace, as well as the dates of his life, are unknown. Nevertheless, the fact that *The Romance of the Highlands* was published in Edinburgh in 1810 by George Ramsay and Co. suggests that Darling was probably a Scotsman, because, at the time, the Edinburgh printing industry was not developed enough to publish the works of unknown English writers.

Honoria Scott’s nationality is a mystery as well; possibly, her name may be a pseudonym. Her best known novels, such as *Vale of the Clyde* (1810), *Amatory Tales of Spain, France, Switzerland and the Mediterranean* (1810), *A Winter in Edinburgh; or, the Russian Brothers* (1810) and *Strathmay* (1813) were all published in London by J. Dick. Besides the surname sounding typically Scottish, Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde* deals with Scottish national, religious, political and cultural identity in an in-depth way, exploring the divisions between Highlands and Lowlands, aristocracy and middle-classes, Catholics and Presbyterians, Jacobites and supporters of England.

Alexander Sutherland’s identity is problematic as well. His surname is that of one of the most important Scottish clans, but no information about his life is available. Certainly, Sutherland knew the Highlands, because he visited them and wrote an account of his travels in 1825 in *A Summer Ramble in the North Highlands* (published in Edinburgh by William Hunter), describing his journey from Aberdeen to Fort William and backwards. In *Macrimmon*, that area is painstakingly described, also paying attention to the relationship between landscape and tourism.

Felix M’Donough’s name suggests that he was a Scot, but no evidence can be found. In some online archives, such as [www.worldcat.org](http://www.worldcat.org), M’Donough is said to have been born approximately in 1768 and have died in 1836. In 1824, M’Donough was certainly in London, where he was tried for pocket picking at the Old Bailey of London and judged not guilty. In the acts of the process, M’Donough is called both “the Hermit in London” and “Captain
Duncan”. Possibly, M’Donough was a Scotsman serving in the British Army and living in London, where he had the possibility to behold English manners and habits and to portray them in his first work: *The Hermit in London, or, Sketches of English Manners*, published in London by Henry Colburn. M’Donough wrote two other novels of the Hermit’s series: *The Hermit in the Country; or, Sketches of English Manners* (1820) and *The Hermit in Edinburgh* (1824). Uncertainties about M’Donough’s national identity were here ignored, due to the usefulness of including *The Highlanders* in the Identity and Highlands corpus. In this novel, indeed, the perspective under which the Highlands and London are portrayed is definitely pro-Highland and against London, while the opposition between centre and periphery supports the periphery, identifying it with the site of virtue and honesty, and setting it into opposition with the centre, London, the capital of vice and danger.

Mary Johnston (1770-1835), the author of *The Lairds of Glenfern; or, Highlanders of the Nineteenth Century* (1816) is probably a Scottish novelist, although no information about her life and birthplace can be gleaned. *The Lairds of Glenfern* and her later work, *Domestic Tales* (1822), were published in London by the Minerva Press. Despite the uncertainty about Mary Johnston’s nationality, I included her novel in the Identity and Highlands Corpus not only because her name and surname sound Scottish, but also because her novel perfectly conforms to the features of the corpus here studied, being set in the Highlands of the past and revolving around an identity and heritage plot.

**3. Known Authors and their Birthplaces**

The other novels taken into account in this dissertation were certainly written by Scottish novelists. Many among them are women. Moreover, their favourite literary genre is the national tale. Elizabeth Hamilton (1754?-1816), the author of *The Cottagers of Glenburnie* (1808) was born in Belfast, but her parents were Scottish. She spent only a few years in Ireland, moving to Scotland in 1762 and to Edinburgh later on in 1804. Hamilton wrote two renown works dealing with philosophy: *Letters of a Hindoo Rajah* (1796) and *Memoirs of Modern Philosophers* (1800).

Jane Porter (1776-1850), the author of *The Scottish Chiefs* (1810) was born in Durham, a village in the Dumfries and Galloway. Her first narrative work was a historical

---

4 The acts of the process, held at the Old Bailey on July, 15th of the 1824, are available online at the URL: http://oldbaileyonline.org/browse.jsp?id=t18240715-171&div=t18240715-171.

novel, called Thaddeus of Warsaw (1803); in 1815 she published The Pastor’s Fireside and, in 1828, Coming Out; and the Field of the Forty Footsteps (written together with her sister, Anna Maria).

Mary Brunton (1778-1818), the author of Discipline (1814), was born in Burry, in the Orkney Islands. Her other famous works are Self-Control (1811), focused on the virtues of a Highland heroine, and Emmeline (1819), a posthumous collection of fragments and autobiographical information.

Christian Isobel Johnstone (1781-1857), the author of Clan-Albin. A National Tale (1815), was born in Fifeshire and wrote in several Scottish periodicals, among them The Edinburgh Weekly Magazine and the Tait’s Magazine. She also wrote other important works about Scottish manners, such as The Saxon and the Gael (1814), and Irish manners and history, such as Elizabeth de Bruce (1827) and True Tales of Irish Peasantry, as related by themselves; Selected from the Report of the Poor-Law Commissioners (1836).

The national tale was mainly a female genre; indeed, all the national tales included in the Identity and Highlands Corpus were written by women: Elizabeth Hamilton, Mary Brunton, Christian Isobel Johnstone, Mary Johnstone and Jane Porter (if we decide to consider The Scottish Chiefs as a national tale, instead of an historical novel). The only work written by a man that can be loosely considered as a national tale is probably Glenfergus, written by Robert Mudie (1777-1842). Mudie was born in Angus and devoted most of his life to writing, both as a novelist and as a journalist and periodical editor, he edited articles for the Dundee Advertiser and The Spectator. Moreover, he wrote some works about ornithology, such as The Feathered Tribes of the British Islands (1834) and The Natural History of Birds (1834), and some articles for the British Cyclopaedia.

Gothic and historical novels, instead, were mainly the work of male writers, such as Peter Middleton Darling, David Carey, Alexander Balfour, Alexander Sutherland, Felix M’Donough, Sir Thomas Dick Lauder, Andrew Picken and George Robert Gleig. David Carey (1782-1824), the author of Lochiel; or, the Field of Culloden (1820) and A Legend of Argyle (1821), was born in Arbroath; he was known to his contemporary readers as an editor (of the

---

Poetical Magazine and the Inverness Journal Newspaper) and as a poet. He published several poetical works, among them Pleasures of Nature; or, The Charms of Rural Life, and Other Poems (1802) and The Reign of Fancy, a Poem (1803). In 1806, David Carey wrote his first novel, a Gothic story called Secrets of the Castle; his love for the Gothic genre is still present in his later works about Scottish history (Lochiel and A Legend of Argyle) while his interest in Highland landscape is expressed in his 1811 work: Picturesque Scenes; or, a Guide to the Highlands. Among the novelists taken into account in this dissertation, David Carey is the only one whose political ideas are known: he was a Whig and a Protestant. Therefore, his historical perspective on the Jacobite rebellions portrayed in Lochiel and A Legend of Argyle are unequivocally anti-Jacobite.

Alexander Balfour (1767-1829), the author of Highland Mary, was born in Angus, like Robert Mudie. Balfour wrote three novels beside Highland Mary, all published in London by the Minerva Press: Campbell; or, the Scottish Probationer (1819), The Farmer’s Three Daughters (1822), and The Foundling of Glenthorn; or, The Smuggler’s Cave (1823).

Sir Thomas Dick Lauder (1784-1848), the author of Lochandhu; A Tale of the Eighteenth Century (1825), was born in Edinburgh. He was the 7th Baronet of Fountainhall, was a friend of Sir Walter Scott’s and wrote several works, among them a romance called The Wolfe of Badenoch (1827) and a series of works about the Highlands, such as Highland Rambles (1837) and Legendary Tales of the Highlands (1841). He published his novels and works in Edinburgh.

Andrew Picken (1788-1833), the author of The Black Watch (1834), was born in Paisley, near Glasgow. He is best known for his first two works, The Secretarians; or, the Church and the Meeting House (1829) and The Dominie’s Legacy (1830), while The Black Watch and his 1833 novel, Waltham, are less famous. In The Black Watch, Picken conveys a deep interest in Scottish history and a desire to investigate into the causes that led many people to join the Jacobites in the Forty-Five. All his works were published in London.

George Robert Gleig (1796-1888), the author of Allan Breck (1834), was born in Stirling. Both a military man and a minister, he drew constant inspiration from his profession: The Subaltern’s Logbook; Including Anecdotes of Well Known Military Characters

---

(1828), *The Chelsea Prisoner* (1829), and *The Country Curate* (1830). Gleig’s works were all published in London.

### 3. The Authors: Gender and Genre

In Figure 3, I sorted novelists according to their gender. Out of the 26 writers involved, 9 are women and 9 are men, while the gender of the remaining 5 writers is unknown.

**Figure 3. Authors sorted by gender**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peter Middleton Darling</td>
<td>Mrs Rice</td>
<td>E. H. H.⁹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexander Sutherland</td>
<td>Honoria Scott</td>
<td>The author of <em>Glencore</em> Tower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felix M’Donough</td>
<td>Mary Johnston</td>
<td>The author of <em>The Towers of Lothian</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Mudie</td>
<td>Martha Blackford</td>
<td>The author of <em>Conirdan</em> and Reft Rob</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Carey</td>
<td>Rosalia St. Clair</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Robert Gleig</td>
<td>Jane Porter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexander Balfour</td>
<td>Mary Brunton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sir Thomas Dick Lauder</td>
<td>Christian Isobel Johnstone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Picken</td>
<td>Elizabeth Hamilton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, male and female writers are quite balanced. Indeed, the Highlands were employed as a symbol of national and cultural identity in early-nineteenth-century Scottish literature by both men and women. This fact supports the idea that the concern with national identity was a widespread one during the romantic period and that many people, despite their gender, felt a sort of nationalistic urge to partake in the shaping of Scottish modern identity through writing.

Interesting observations can be made when gender is set into relationship with genre. In Figure 4, I categorise the novels according to both their genre and their authors’ gender.¹⁰

---

⁹ If we identify E.H.H. with the editor of the manuscript who introduces himself at the beginning of the novel, we can assume that E.H.H. is a man. Nevertheless, since this figure may be fictive and the letters used to sign *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady* suggest no precise gender identity, I decided to group this author in the category of those whose gender is unknown to us.

¹⁰ For the sorting of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus by genre see Chapter III, Figure I.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Tale</th>
<th>Gothic Novel &amp; Romance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Discipline (Mary Brunton)</td>
<td>-Glenfergus (R. Mudie)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Clan Albin (Christian I. Johnstone)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The Cottagers of Glenburnie (Elizabeth Hamilton)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Vale of the Clyde (Honoria Scott)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Strathmay (Honoria Scott)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The Lairds of Glenfern (Mary Johnston)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Monteith (Mrs Rice)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The Romance of the Highlands (Peter M. Darling)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Lochandhu (Thomas D. Lauder)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Novel</td>
<td>Moral Tale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The Scottish Chiefs (Jane Porter) [also national tale]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The Doomed One (Rosalia St. Clair)</td>
<td>-Lochiel (David Carey) [also Gothic]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-A Legend of Argyle (David Carey) [also Gothic]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-The Black Watch (Andrew Picken)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Macrimmon (Alexander Sutherland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Allan Breck (George R. Gleig) [also historical]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Highland Mary (Alexander Balfour)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-The Highlanders (Felix M’Donough)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Conirdan (anon.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-The Highlander (E.H.H.) [also historical]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most women devoted themselves to the national tale: Elizabeth Hamilton, Jane Porter, Mary Johnston, Mary Brunton, Christian Isobel Johnstone and Honoria Scott produced novels that aimed at the representation of Scottish manners and ways of life.¹¹ By

¹¹ According to William St. Clair, during the romantic period, men and women devoted themselves to different genres: “With prose fiction, as with verse, a broad division can be seen between domestic novels of the kind written by ‘a lady’ most notably of the kind written by Austen, seen as predominantly a women’s genre, and historical romances of the kind popularised by ‘The author of Waverley’, which were rightly assumed to have been mainly written by men” (W. St. Clair, op. cit., p. 220.) The national tale is focused on the role played by the domestic sphere (manners, habits, marriage, etc.) in the development of national identity; therefore, it is quite clear why, in the first chapter of Waverley, Scott rejected the idea of writing a novel about manners: he
contrast, only one national tale was written by a man, that is to say, Robert Mudie’s *Genfergus*. Instead, historical novels and moral tales were written more by men than women: David Carey, Alexander Sutherland, and Andrew Picken wrote historical novels, while George Robert Gleig, Alexander Balfour and Felix M’Donough wrote moral tales (in which, however, the historical component plays a significant role). A few women devoted themselves to the historical novel; if we consider *The Scottish Chiefs* an historical novel, Jane Porter should be named as the first Scottish historical writer. Rosalia St. Clair, too, wrote a historical novel: *The Doomed One*. Two moral tales addressed to young readers (*The Scottish Orphans* and *Arthur Monteith*) were written by a woman, Martha Blackford. Discussing the relationship between gender and the Gothic genre is more complicated, because most Gothic novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus were published anonymously. The only two whose gender is known, are Peter Middleton Darling and Mrs Rice.

To conclude, the Identity and Highlands Corpus collects works written by both men and women, who were equally interested in identity issues and who represented the Highlands as a symbol of national identity in their novels. The national tale was the genre chosen by most women, while men tended to write more historical and moral novels.

possibly preferred to avoid writing a novel belonging to a “female” genre. It may be argued, however, that the historical novel created by Scott, especially in the case of Waverley, features many elements typical of the national tale, from the attention to manners and habits, to marriage decision-taking (as in most national tales, in the end of the novel Edward Waverley has to choose his wife among two women coming from two different areas of Britain).
CHAPTER III

Genre and Identity

1. Introduction

This chapter is devoted to the relationship between literary genre and identity. In it, I provide an account of the way in which genres develop the issues connected with individual and national identity. I shall explore the history of some narrative genres, making their main aims and structures known.

The main genres involved with identity in early nineteenth century Scottish literature are the Gothic novel, the national tale and the historical novel. While some of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus distinctly belong to a certain literary genre – *Reft Rob*, for instance, is clearly a Gothic novel – other works are less easy to group under a single genre. Many novels of the period, indeed, are characterised by the presence of multiple plots that intertwine throughout the narration and that, actually, belong to different literary genres. This happens in Sir Walter Scott’s novels, as well as in the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus.¹ Among the novels discussed in this dissertation, some genre combinations emerge as dominant, such as a hybrid form combining the Gothic and the historical plots in David Carey’s novels and in *Bannockburn*; a combination of historical and didactic plots in *Conirdan, The Highlander, The Scottish Orphans and Allan Breck*; or a mixture of Gothic elements and features typical of the national tale in Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay*.

In Figure 1, I sort the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus by genre. When multiple plots intertwine, I group the novels according to the plot that is most structured and fraught with identity and cultural meaning.

¹ In *Waverley*, elements typical of the national tale are present, such as the description of the manners, ways of life and costumes of the Highlanders, while the presence of such supernatural elements as the *bodach glàs* recall the Gothic novel.
2. The Scottish Gothic: The Supernatural, History and Identity

Among the novels here studied, only a small number are examples of canonical Gothic novels: Monteith, The Towers of Lothian, The Romance of the Highlands, and Reft Rob.² Other novels feature the Gothic as a secondary genre, intertwining with the national tale, as in Honoria Scott’s Strathmay, or with the historical novel, as in Glencore Tower, Bannockburn, A Legend of Argyle, Lochandhu and Macrimmon, or with the moral tale, as in Conirdan and Highland Mary.

In these novels, many of the features of canonical Gothic novels are present. The Gothic canon can be exemplified in six main works: Horace Walpole’s The Castle of Otranto (1764), Clara Reeves’s The Old English Baron (1777), Ann Radcliffe’s The Romance of the Forest (1791) and The Mysteries of Udolpho (1794), Matthew Lewis’s The Monk (1796) and Mary Shelley’s Frankenstein, or, the Modern Prometheus (1818).³ Walpole’s The Castle of

---


³ Many critics focused on the individuation of a series of canonical novels best representing the Gothic genre. In the first chapter of his Gothic Literature, Andrew Smith points to four main works constituting the original canon of the genre: Horace Walpole’s The Castle of Otranto (1764), Ann Radcliff’s The Mysteries of Udolpho(1794), Matthew Lewis’s The Monk (1796) and Mary Shelley’s Frankenstein (1818), see A. Smith, “The Gothic Hayday, 1765-1820”, in Gothic Literature, Edinburgh, Edinburgh UP, 2007, pp. 18-41. In The Gothic,
Otranto is the first Gothic novel, the one establishing the paradigm of the genre. The original title of the novel, The Castle of Otranto. A Story. Translated by William Marshall, Gent. From the Original Italian of Onuphrio Muralto, Canon of the Church of St. Nicholas at Otranto, presents two most important features of Gothic novel writing, namely, anonymous publishing (as it appeared under the pseudonym of William Marshall) and the fiction of the documentary truth, expressing the desire to root the events related, however unbelievable they may be, in reality, by tracing the sources of the story in a manuscript preserved through centuries by a churchman. The second edition of the novel was published in the following year, and was called The Castle of Otranto. A Gothic Story (1765), fixing the canon for the Gothic genre.4

In his preface to the second edition of The Castle of Otranto, Walpole claims that his novel is “an attempt to blend the two kinds of romance, the ancient and the modern”.5 Walpole explains that while in the ancient romance “all was imagination and improbability”, in the modern kind “nature is always intended to be, and sometimes has been, copied with success”.6 His intention, therefore, is that “of leaving the powers of fancy at liberty to expatriate through the boundless realms of invention” and of conducting “the moral agents of his drama according to the rules of probability; in short, to make them think, speak and act, as it might be supposed men and women would do in extraordinary positions”.7

Walpole’s remarks are crucial in order to understand the growing connection between the Gothic and history. Intertwining improbable events with facts that are generally acknowledged as having really occurred becomes a common practice, which sometimes substitutes the manuscript expedient in many Scottish Gothic novels. In the Gothic, history is the structural element that helps to blend improbable events with reality. Noteworthy, Walpole wrote in a period in which the novel in its modern form was still at a developmental stage. Only few important novels had been published before 1764, all devoted to the

David Punter and Glennis Byron add to these novels five other works that they consider as the “key-works” of the genre: William Beckford’s Vathek (1786), William Godwin’s Caleb Williams (1794), Charles Maturin’s Melmoth the Wanderer (1820), James Hogg’s The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (1824) and Emily Brontë’s Wuthering Heights (1847) [for the list see the Contents page of D. Punter, G. Byron, The Gothic, Oxford: Blackwell, 2004]. The writers mentioned by Punter and Byron are from the periphery of the United Kingdom; Maturin was a Irishman, while Hogg and Bronte came from Scotland. This proves that while the first Gothic novels were written in England, i.e. in the centre of the kingdom, the genre rapidly spread to peripheral areas.

7 Ibidem, p. vii.
realistic portrait of nature and man: Daniel Defoe’s *Robinson Crusoe* (1719) and *Moll Flanders* (1722), Samuel Richardson’s *Pamela* (1740) and *Clarissa* (1747-51), Henry Fielding’s *Tom Jones* (1749) and Laurence Sterne’s *Tristram Shandy* (1759-1767). These novels are in tune with what Walpole calls “modern romance”; they stand opposed to the “ancient” romance, as in them realism and truth to reality dominate over imagination, and reason over passions. Walpole’s definition reveals an attempt at reconciling imagination and improbability with realism and truth to reality, the former ones ruling the plot, the latter affecting characterisation and setting.

Walpole’s novels set the canon for many Gothic novelists, both in England and Scotland. Nevertheless, according to Ian Duncan, the Gothic developed differently in different areas of the United Kingdom. Duncan claims that the Scottish Gothic is a variant different from the English Gothic due to its “thematic core”, which “consists of an association between the *national* and the *uncanny* or *supernatural*”. Noteworthy, Duncan points to a connection between the supernatural features typical of the Gothic genre and the historical and cultural predicament of late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Scotland: compromise

Scottish Gothic represents (with greater historical and anthropological specificity than in England) the uncanny recursion of an ancestral identity alienated from modern life. A series of historical disjunctions, most conspicuously Scotland’s loss of political independence at the 1707 Union of Parliaments, but also the growing social division between urban professional classes and populace and the religious and ethnic divisions between Lowlands and Highlands, informed a wholesale temporal distinction between Scottish modernity – the domain of the middle-class literary subject – and a category of cultural otherness designated as pre-modern.

In a few words, Duncan sums up the very essence of the Scottish Gothic, rooting it into the specificity of Scotland’s history and identity. The portrait of the past in Scottish

---

8 Ian Duncan refers that Walpole calls “ancient” the novels written before the 1689 revolution and “modern” the ones written after it (see I. Duncan, *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel*, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992, p. 20). The choice of the date of the revolution as a divide between the novel as the domain of imagination and the novel as the domain of realism and reason suggests that it was due to the birth of modern Britain that British literature underwent such change.

9 The compromise between romance and realism is at the basis of the historical novel à la Scott; according to Martin Green, Scott’s success among his contemporaries is due to the fact that he “incorporated a great deal of romance into fiction, and did not fall into moral or intellectual nonsense – that is, he contained that material by means of suitable categories of sense and sensibility” (M. Green, *op. cit.*, p. 99). According to David H. Richter, the historical novel is less rooted in “fantasy” than the Gothic novel, although “they share a family resemblance – the avoidance of contemporary realism, the chronotope [...] of an exotic time/place” (D. H. Richter, *op. cit.*, p. 28).


11 *Ibidem*, p. 70.
Gothic novels is aimed, in fact, at the recovery of that “ancestral identity” that was lost after the great changes that involved Scottish society during the eighteenth century: the Union of the English and Scottish Parliaments, the rise of the middle-classes and the changing relationship between Highlands and Lowlands. As a consequence, the historical setting in Scottish Gothic novels is fraught with relevant meaning, because it oftentimes attempts at bridging the fracture between modern and historical Scotland.

According to Duncan, the main writers partaking in the development of Scottish Gothic are not proper Gothic novelists: James Macpherson, Robert Burns and Walter Scott. While Macpherson and Burns “established decisive patterns for the association of national and uncanny themes”, Scott stressed the importance of the past as a force affecting the present and drew attention to the Jacobite rebellions as “the disruptive resurgence of a pre-revolutionary past (Catholic, absolutist, feudal, tribal, pagan) into a still raw and uncertain modern dispensation”.

In the Gothic novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the connection between the supernatural and identity is significantly present. There are three main novels in which the connection between the uncanny and identity issues is most evident: Peter Middleton Darling’s The Romance of the Highlands, 1810; the anonymous 1817 novel Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-muir and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s Lochandhu, 1825. The Romance of the Highlands is a classic Gothic tale; in it, the supernatural is mysteriously combined with a plot of usurped heritage rights and unknown origins. Kenneth, the young protagonist, is raised by a family of poor cottagers; he is a perfect hero, kind, humble, brave and generous. At the end of the novel, Kenneth finds out that he is not the son of Duncan the cottager, but of the late Viscount of Dunbary, who was poisoned and murdered by his brother Alexander, the villain of the novel. Both Kenneth and his friend Archibald, Earl of Strathallan, are visited by the ghosts of their murdered fathers, asking them to revenge their deaths by punishing Alexander. The apparitions are real spirits, conjured by a group of witches, which the narrator describes as follows:

But on a nearer approach, they beheld a large fire; several uncouth female figures appeared, with wands in their hands, dancing round the blaze. The uncommon gestures of this hideous group, the lateness of hour, the dismal prospect of the surrounding scenery, and the red glare of the fire, tinged the ground with a sanguine hue – appalled the hearts of the beholders.

---

Noteworthy, not only are these apparitions typical of the Gothic genre, but they also recall two most famous Shakespearian plays: *Hamlet* and *Macbeth*. The resemblance is striking, especially with *Hamlet*, where the protagonist is visited by his father’s ghost, telling him that he was murdered and asking him to avenge his death. These literary echoes suggest that Darling was exploiting the everlasting presence of the supernatural in English literature, aware of the successful impact of unsettling circumstances and atmospheres on the audience. Indeed, some of the feelings exploited in Gothic novels are the same that characterise Shakespeare’s most renown dramas.\(^{14}\)

The two other novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus featuring supernatural elements are *Reft Rob* and *Lochandhu*. In both works, supernatural Gothic plays a major role in the development of the plot; nevertheless, the apparitions of supernatural beings are eventually provided with rational explanations, so that, at the end of the novels, they no longer appear as supernatural at all. In both works, the spirits visiting the characters are two old women, with a weird outlook and the capacity to appear in most impervious and unpredictable Highland locations. In *Reft Rob*, the old woman people calls “the witch of Scot-muir”, actually is the eponymous hero’s mother and Laird M’Mac’s first wife; therefore, her son is the true heir to the M’Mac estate. The woman, whose real name is Jemima, lives with her son in the wilds surrounding M’Mac castle; they dwell in caves and natural shelters, showing themselves to the people of the place only for specific reasons. Reft Rob is considered a brave and honourable man by people, even though he lives outside society and supports himself on freebooting. When Reft Rob is restored to his title of laird of the M’Mac castle and estate, people welcomes him with affection and love.

Like *The Castle of Otranto*, *Reft Rob* starts with a prophecy, delivered by the Witch to Florinda, the heroine of the novel:

> Warn him of the coming foe;  
> Warn him of the unseen blow;  
> Warn him of the man of might;  
> Warn him of the lawful right.\(^{15}\)

---

\(^{14}\) The likeness of certain Gothic features with the works of William Shakespeare has been noted by Robert B. Hamm, “Hamlet and Horace Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto*”, in *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900* (49, no. 3, 2002), pp. 667-672. Hamm focuses on the likeness between Walpole’s novel and *Hamlet*, stressing the importance attached to the supernatural.

The prophecy is referred to Florinda’s brother, Flatburn East, the worthy and honest heir to the M’Mac ands. The prophecy remains obscure until the end of the novel, when Reft Rob and Jemima reveal their identities and claim the estate.

In *Lochandhu*, another mother protects her child and helps her to gain her rightful inheritance. Amherst Oakenwold, an Englishman travelling through Scotland, lands on the Western coast with his friend, Captain Cleaver. The two spend some time in the area, making friends with the inhabitants. They repeatedly see a weird figure moving swiftly around the cliffs and rocks with supernatural agility. She is an old, dwarfish woman, whom the superstitious locals call “the Dwarfish Carline”. Amherst refuses to believe in her supernatural nature, being convinced that there must be some rational explanation. His faith in reason leads him to accept Carline’s help and to eventually learn that she is his bellowed Miss Malcolm’s mother. Carline reveals Miss Malcolm’s true identity of rightful heir to the Delassaux possessions in Kent.

The three novels just discussed share a crucial feature: the plot hinges upon a story of unknown or uncertain family roots and usurped heritage rights. This plot is already present in *The Castle of Otranto*, where not only does the protagonist find out who his father is, but he also discovers that he is the rightful heir to the Otranto castle and lands. I calle this structure “origins and heritage plot”, in order to emphasise the connection between the discovery of the protagonist’s family roots and the resulting inheritance of his/her family possessions. It can be observed that at the core of the origins and heritage plot there are identity issues connected with national, social and cultural identity. In *The Romance of the Highlands*, the discovery of the hero’s identity determines a change in his social status from peasant to Viscount, while in *Reft Rob*, Robert M’Mac is restored to his role of Highland chief, after many years spent as an outsider in England and on the Scottish mountains.

This origins and heritage plot is present in 13 out of the 26 novels discussed in this dissertation. This plot is present in literary works of all genres, from Gothic novels (such as *The Romance of the Highlands* and *Reft Rob*), to national tales (such as Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde* and *Strathmay*), to historical novels (such as David Carey’s *Lochiel* and *A Legend* 16

16 Origins and heritage plots are present in the anonymous *The Towers of Lothian* (1809), Peter Middleton Darling’s *The Romance of the Highlands* (1810), Honoria Scott’s *The Castle of Strathmay* (1813), the anonymous *Reft Rob* (1817) and *Conirdan* (1817), David Carey’s *Lochiel*; or, *The Field of Culloden* (1820) and *A Legend of Argyle* (1821), Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans* (1822) and *Arthur Monteith* (1822), Alexander Sutherland’s *Macrimmon* (1823), Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu* (1825), Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary* (1826), Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch* (1834)
of Argyle), to moral tales (such as Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans* and Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary*).  

The fact that many writers concerned about national identity decided to include the origins and heritage plot in their novels suggests that they considered family roots as closely connected with national identity, as well as with social status. Indeed, this kind of plot draws attention to the protagonist’s origins, his/her family and national roots, his/her rights and, sometimes, his/her political stand, stressing the connection between identity and history. This relationship is developed according to two main patterns. In the first, the true heir’s rights have been usurped by some relative (often an uncle), who took advantage of a moment of historical crisis to plot against the protagonist’s father. Such pattern can be found, for instance, in *The Romance of the Highlands*, in *The Scottish Orphans*, and in *Macrimmon*.

In the second case, it is the involvement in some major historical event that leads the protagonist to discover his origins. Two interesting examples are David Carey’s *Lochiel* and *A Legend of Argyle*. In *Lochiel*, Charles Edward Stuart’s page, Evan, discovers he is the son of “gentle” Lochiel, the chief of the clan Cameron and one of the supporters of Charles Edward, while he is partaking in his master’s campaign in 1745. In a similar way, the protagonist of *A Legend of Argyle*, General Gordon, finds out his true origins while fighting in the 1715 Jacobite rebellion. General Gordon is helped in his quest for family roots by the Duke of Argyle, the eponymous hero of the novel, portrayed as the saviour of civility and peace against the Jacobite attempt to restore feudalism and barbarism. As in Ann Radcliffe’s first novel, *The Castles of Athlyn and Dunbayne* (1789), two sides of feudalism are embodied in two rival chieftains; the Earl of Ronay represents the abuses of power typical of a tyrant lord, while the Lord of Haddo represents that portion of aristocrats who embraced democracy and Presbyterianism. Gordon, in his strife against Ronay, discovers he is the son of the Lord of Haddo and, therefore, the heir of a moderate and democratic chieftain.

Gordon’s discovery can be read as a hint to the modern tendency to consider the feudal Highlands as a source of national identity. Carey warns against the evils of feudalism, opposing to the favourable portrait of the “Haddo feudalism”, the despotic and cruel

---

17 The origins and heritage plot is at the core of Scott’s *Guy Mannering* (1815), in which Captain Vanbeest Brown, a soldier grown up in the Netherlands and who served in India under General Guy Mannering, visits the Bertram estate, in Galloway. After a series of mysterious events and picturesque adventures, Brown learns that he actually is the heir to the Bertram family, Henry, who disappeared at the age of five.
feudalism embodied in the Earl of Ronay.\(^\text{18}\) Though fighting with the Jacobites, Gordon is actually the son of a Presbyterian and Whig lord; therefore, his new identity as Alexander Gordon of Haddo is a compromise between his Jacobite attachment and his inherited Presbyterian values.

General Gordon’s is just one out of many examples, in which the development of the protagonist’s identity symbolises the shaping of national identity. Like Scott’s Waverley, General Gordon is a common man, caught in historical events that overwhelm him. If, unlike young Waverley, Gordon is fit for the endeavour and proves a matchless soldier in battle and military organisation, he is nevertheless characterised by an unsteady identity and a sense of outsidersness. Not only was he abandoned on the shores of France and raised by a French general as a “Regiment child”, but he also knows nothing about his roots and origins, only supposing that he comes from Scotland due to his name, Gordon. He has no social class, no clan attachments nor family kinship. His eventual discovery locates his roots in the Highlands of Scotland. His aristocratic identity brings with itself duties and responsibilities towards his people, while as the son of a Gael, he becomes the heir of a proud people who preserved their manners and habits uncontaminated from modern logics of trade and moneymaking until the period of “improvement”.

General Gordon exemplifies the Gothic hero of early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels. He is a perfect hero, created to arouse the reader’s sympathy. His story epitomises identity dynamics and is devised to partake in the nationalist debate. This function is fulfilled by Gothic heroes in several novels of the period. The origins and heritage plot is oftentimes employed in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, in order to increase the reader’s interest in

\(^\text{18}\) David Carey was known to be a Whig, as Anderson remarks in his biographical article in *Scottish Nation* (1859-1866): “The ability he displayed in advocating the measures of the Whig party, whose side he had espoused, gained for him the notice of Mr. Wyndham, who offered him a situation at the Cape of Good Hope, which he declined” (W. Anderson, *op. cit.*, p. 587). Carey’s novels, therefore, can be included in the tradition of Whig writing referred to by Martin Green for Scott’s novels: “[...] Scott’s adventures, though less directly than Defoe’s, translated the Whig interpretation of history into fiction” (M. Green, *op. cit.*, p. 124. According to Green, who quotes Herbert Butterfield’s *The Whig Interpretation of History* (1951) as the source of this concept, Scott’s adventure novels fit into a tradition that supports Protestantism, progress and the present, over Catholicism, feudalism and the past. Despite being a supporter of the Tories, Scott did actually support a united vision of Britain and, therefore, he indirectly supported the political decisions that led to the present situation, such as the improvement of the Highlands and the eradication of feudalism. Although these elements emerge in many among Scott’s novels, some critics believe that Scott was not supporting progress and improvement. In “Scott and the Image of Scotland”, Christopher Harvie claims that some of the stories contained in *The Chronicles of the Canongate* and *The Tales of a Grandfather*, actually show the negative consequences of progress on Highland society, as well as the “failure of integration” of Scotland in the United Kingdom (See C. Harvie, “Scott and the Image of Scotland”, *cit.*, pp. 34-40). If Scott did not always, as Harvie suggests, support the Whig agenda of improvement and union, David Carey decidedly did it and can be certainly be considered as a Whig writer and a Whig historian, who extolled the eradication of feudalism and the modernisation of the Highlands and of Scotland.
the novel, by titillating his/her curiosity, also serving as a source of social commentary and critique on the state of past and present society. By doing this, novelists establish a close connection between identity and history, as Ian Duncan claims in *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel: The Gothic, Scott, Dickens* (1992):

Gothic fiction is not then ‘historical’, in the sense associated with the philosophical historians of the Scottish Enlightenment and with Walter Scott; that is to say, it does not attempt a scientific depiction of past cultural stages under changing material conditions. Instead, it invokes historical contingency in order to dramatize its reduction under persistent forms of sexual and familial identity. In this way, then, the other time and place is also our own.\(^\text{19}\)

According to Duncan, the forms of identity that are the most relevant in the Gothic fiction are “sexual and familial identity”. While these forms dominate Scottish early Gothic novels, such as the ones written by Helen Craik, they lose power with the passing of time, dimmed by the growing concern with national and cultural identity. The Scottish Gothic becomes more and more characterised by what Duncan calls “a broken historical descent”, manifesting itself in the origins and heritage plot. Questions of gender are rarely dealt with; the main protagonists of the novels concerned with national issues are both male and female. What is crucial is not who represents Scottish modern identity, but *how* and *why* he/she represents it.

Scottish Gothic novels are built around two opposite poles: the hero/heroine and the villain. This structure allows further space for the description of national manners; while, indeed, the hero represents all the virtues and positive endowments of the good Scotsman and Scotswoman, the villain embodies the foibles, vices and mistakes that should be avoided. Examples are manifold. In *The Romance of the Highlands*, there is a clear-cut opposition between Alexander Viscount of Dunbarny and Kenneth. As a villain, Alexander features the worst characteristics ever: he is vengeful, proud to an exasperate extent, vicious, envious, lustful and, last but least, tyrannical and despotic. His despicable conduct and his abuses of power over his people epitomise the faults of the old feudal system, while his vices and slavery to passions are condemned on both religious and rational grounds. To Alexander stands juxtaposed Kenneth. Kenneth is a very humble youth, proud of his cottager origins, generous, kind, courageous, brave in battle, loyal to his friends and family. Kenneth represents social mobility, because the permission to marry Lady Elizabeth is granted to him by Archibald before knowing about his aristocratic origins. The nobility of the heart is more

important than that stemming from social ranks. Kenneth embodies the best virtues and invites the reader to identify with him, while Alexander represents the faults of the past to be avoided in the future.

The Romance of the Highlands provides an instance of the imaginary communities and social systems envisioned by Scottish Gothic novelists. The worlds they represent, though being set in the past, are topical to Scottish contemporary predicament. Nationalist novels feature the defeat of faulty feudalism and barbarous manners, drawing attention to social mobility based upon the nobility of the heart, not of lineage. The heroes and heroines of Scottish Gothic novels are granted access to higher social classes not out of treacherous plotting, but out of their pure feelings and undaunted hearts. Sometimes, as in Glencore Tower, skill in battle and a honourable behaviour are the only credentials needed by the protagonist – an orphan and a cottager – to marry the chief’s daughter and to climb the social ladder. Duncan’s identity, indeed, remains the same throughout the novel, and is summed up in his self-introduction to Robert de Bruce:

- Duncan, my liege, is my name, born of humble parents in Dunrae’s peaceful vale. An orphan early left, I knew not a mother’s tender care, but in the goof and venerable Ethwald have I found a friend. 

I have emphasised the words suggesting the main sources of identity in Duncan’s self introduction: family (“humble parents”), birthplace (“Dunrae”) and clan (“Ethwald”, his chieftain). By determining Duncan’s background, the anonymous author of Glencore Tower is also drawing attention to the elements that partake in the development of personal and, therefore, national identity. Indeed, it is for his family, land and clan that Duncan is supporting King de Bruce and fighting against the English.

By claiming the importance of the role played by these three features in the development of personal and national identity, the anonymous author of Glencore Tower suggests that, whenever one of these features is removed, people will experience feelings identity loss. Noteworthy, the changes brought about by the English on the Highlands after the 1745 Jacobite rebellion entailed the eradication of the clan-system and, consequently, of

---

20 By emphasising the importance of the nobility of the heart, instead of hereditary titles, early nineteenth century writers such as Peter Middleton Darling, looked back to the tradition of the novel of sensibility that developed during the eighteenth century in Britain and that sees in Henry Mackenzie’s The Man of Feeling (1771) one of its most important Scottish works.

one of the sources of identity highlighted in *Glencore Tower*.\textsuperscript{22} English improvement and the measures aimed at crashing rebellions in Scotland relied upon this principle – by wiping out the already existing social structure founded upon feudlalism and clanship, reshaping landscape and, indirectly, causing the emigration and the division of families, the English deprived the Highlanders of their traditional sources of identity, substituting them with their economical and social system.

In *British Identities, Heroic Nationalism, and the Gothic Novel, 1764-1824*, Toni Wein offers a social and political analysis of the main themes that, in British Gothic fiction, can be related to nationalism. About Gothic heroes and heroines, Wein remarks that they bear a close resemblance to “romance heroes”, being “honest, courageous, disinterestedly interested (another version of impartiality), chivalrous to women, humble and handsome”; by being the embodiment of all that is good and noble, the hero/heroine becomes the “necessary pole around which a national identity can be constructed”.\textsuperscript{23}

Moreover, according to Wein, the exploration of identity issues is often connected with the “question of membership”:

[the Gothic] is the genre of choice for members of groups who were marginalized either because they occupied the liminal affective ground of female genre or ‘deviant’ sexual orientation, or because they inhabited the contested geographical ground of Ireland and Scotland.\textsuperscript{24}

Wein’s remark draws attention to the function of the Gothic as a means of expression for minorities and people “at the borders of the dominant order”.\textsuperscript{25} This may account for the growing interest in the Gothic as a genre to comment on national and cultural identity.

3. The National Tale: Manners, Geography and Marriage

While the Gothic genre was born in England, the centre of the empire, and moved to the peripheries, the national tale is a genuine product of the peripheries of Great Britain.\textsuperscript{26} As such, the concerns with nationalism and cultural identity are not masked and

\textsuperscript{22} Many critics dealing with Highland history highlighted the fact that, at the core of the measures enforced by the English government on the Highlands after the Forty-Five, there was a desire to avoid further rebellions. Robert Clyde, for instance, observes: “The rights of property had supplanted the ties of clanship, and new cultural values were imported from the Lowlands and England. Before ‘improvement’ could begin, however, the Highlands and Islands had to be tamed as a political threat” (R. Clyde, *op. cit.*, p. 21).

\textsuperscript{23} T. Wein, *op. cit.*, p. 8.

\textsuperscript{24} *Ibidem*, p. 17.

\textsuperscript{25} *Ibidem*, p. 18.

\textsuperscript{26} The national tale has become an object of study only recently. The major experts on this genre are considered Peter Garside, Katie Trumpener and Ina Ferris, see I. Duncan, A. Rowland and C. Snodgrass,
disguised through such devices as the origins and heritage plot, but overtly constitute the main theme and structural force.

The national tale was first created and developed in Ireland; afterwards, it spread to Scotland. According to Miranda Burgess, the Irish national tale

thrives in the stretch of time between the 1801 Act of Union, which dissolved the Irish Parliament [...] and Catholic Emancipation in 1829, which put a final end to political disabilities by allowing Catholics to sit in Parliament.27

Burgess’s remark highlights the importance of religious issues in the development of the genre, stressing how the granting of rights to Catholics in 1829 determined the end of the genre. In Scotland, the Union of Parliaments occurred in 1707 and religious issues were not a major concern, since Presbyterians had their rights preserved with the Union. Noteworthy, the concern with religion can represent a possible explanation of the choice of the Highlands as a location for some Scottish national tales, such as Christian Isobel Johnstone’s Clan-Albin. A National Tale.28 In fact, the Highlands presented with a predicament similar to the Irish one: not only were the Highlanders a Gaelic people (like the Irish), but among them, especially before the age of improvement, there were many Catholics.29 By drawing attention to the Highlands, Scottish writers of national tales

28 For a comparison between Irish and Scottish literatures see T. Webb, “Impulsive Aeronauts and Railway Rationalists: Irish and Scottish in the Romantic Dictionary”, in D. Duff and C. Jones (eds), Scotland, Ireland, and the Romantic Aesthetic (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2010). Despite recognising the presence of a “nexus” between Scottish and Irish literatures, Webb attempts to provide a sketch of the Scottish and the Irish character, claiming that they are essentially different due to their different outlook on reality: while the Irish are more impulsive dreamers, the Scots are more sensible and rational. Webb also advances the idea that early-nineteenth-century Ireland represented a standard of comparison to understand Scotland’s level of modernisation: “For Malthus and for others, the lesson was political as well as economic, and the agreeable and prosperous appearance of modern Scotland showed how far the Scots had come, especially when compared with the contemporary Irish, who represented both an index of Scottish progress and a terrible warning to those who continued to resist the benefits of such a system” (T. Webb, op. cit., pp. 32-54, p. 38).
29 It is difficult to establish how many Catholics there were in Scotland. It would be reductive to consider the Highlanders as Catholic and the Lowlanders as Protestant; this would mean ignoring, for instance, the presence of many Episcopalians. Among them, some became loyal to George I, while others, called “non-juring Episcopalians”, refused to do it and supported the Stuarts. According to A.J. Youngson, “between ten and twenty percent of the strength of the Jacobite army came from the substantially Episcopalian shires of Aberdeen and Banff” (A.J. Youngson, op. cit., p. 21).
preserved the original Irish character, which drew its force from feelings of oppression and rebellion.\textsuperscript{30}

The mother of the genre is Sydney Owenson, later called Lady Morgan (1781?-1859). Sydney Owenson is the authoress of several novels, the first was published in 1803 (\textit{St. Clair; or, the Heiress of Desmond}) and the last in 1827 (\textit{O’Briens and O’Flahertys}). Her most important work is her third novel, \textit{The Wild Irish Girl. A National Tale} (1806), which is considered as the prototype of the genre. A peep into its plot and characters will be helpful to illustrate the main features of the genre. \textit{The Wild Irish Girl} is structured mostly as an epistolary novel, a structural feature that did not become a dominant one in Scottish national tales, being probably considered as an old device, typical of eighteenth-century literature. The reasons at the core of the success gained by Owenson with this novel lay in its content.

The novel revolves around the figure of Horatio M***, an English nobleman who, on visiting the Irish castle of the Prince of Inismore, falls in love with the Prince’s beautiful daughter, Glorvina. The connection between the two families is a conflicting one: Horatio’s forefathers usurped the Castle of Inismore during Cromwell’s campaign in Ireland. Horatio’s eventual marriage with Glorvina provides a most significant commentary on Irish history; not only does the marriage constitute the essence of the reconciliation between the two families, but it also represents the union between England (Horatio) and Ireland (Glorvina). As this successful union wipes away family conflicts stemming from past historical events, the Union of England and Ireland should be able to efface national enmities and cancel the memory of old injustices.

\textsuperscript{30} In her last national tale, \textit{Elizabeth de Bruce} (1827), Christian Isobel Johnstone overtly highlighted the likeness of early-nineteenth-century Ireland and the Highlands of the Forty-Five, as the following lines epitomise:

- How many unhappy gentlemen were there in the same situation in our country a few years back”, said Wolfe, “whose personal honour no one durst attaint-the friends of the exiled Stuarts! How many bitter enemies were there among honest Scotsmen to our own national \textit{Union} – noble true-hearted fellows, that would nevertheless have \textit{fought} against over boots in blood!- (C.I. Johnstone, \textit{Elizabeth de Bruce}, Edinburgh: William Blackwood, 1827, Vol. I, p. 221).

Significantly, Wolfe stresses the fact that the Act of Union of the Irish and English Parliaments resembles the 1707 Act of Union of the Scottish and English Parliaments; he deprecates civil war and violence, but at the same time he expresses admiration for those who fought in the name of their loyalty to the Stuarts. The Jacobites, in fact, were Catholic, like the Irish; Catholics in Scotland supported the Stuarts because they represented the Catholic royal line, and rejected King George, because he was a Protestant. Nevertheless, while the Jacobites rebelled in order to have their own king sit on the throne, the Irish rebelled to have their religious rights granted.
The description of national manners is at the core of Owenson’s patriotic novel and characterises Horatio’s movement from the centre (London) to the periphery (Ireland). Horatio’s letters from the capital provide a scarcely flattering portrait of London; the capital of England is represented as a place of vice, where Horatio spends his life seducing married women, gambling and growing more and more indebted. By contrast, Ireland is portrayed as the place of virtue; Glorvina and her father’s proud tales about Irish history and traditions, as well as their own virtuous conducts and their honesty, convince Horatio of the good qualities of the Irish people.

*The Wild Irish Girl* introduces a set of issues largely spread in Scottish national tales: the juxtaposition of centre and periphery, usurped rights, the praise of national events and manners, the final marriage reconciling two opposed parts. The first Scottish national tale is Elizabeth Hamilton’s *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, published in 1808. Hamilton was born in Belfast, probably in 1756, from Scottish parents, moving to Scotland when still a little child. In 1808, Hamilton was already an active writer, having issued *The Letters of the Rajah* in 1796 and *Memoirs of Modern Philosophers* in 1800. *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, however, is her first novel concerned with Scotland and its manners and traditions. This short novel mirrors her interest in education, aiming at teaching people to improve their domestic lives through work and constant efforts, without falling into idleness. The plot is simple and revolves around the teachings imparted by a Lowland (or possibly English) governess, Mrs Mason, to the inhabitants of an imaginary small village, Glenburnie.

Mrs Mason teaches the villagers to keep their houses clean, to cultivate a comfortable, as well as useful, garden, to turn children and youngsters from idle loiterers into active partakers in the village welfare. Her lesson is so very well learnt that, at the end of the novel, the village of Glenburnie is an utterly different place, clean and comfortable at the visitors’ eyes. In *Scott’s Shadow. The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh*, Ian Duncan hypotheses that Mrs Mason’s “Hygienic intervention” can be seen as “an idealised, compensatory version of the Clearances [...] at the very moment these were entering an intensified, violent phase on the Sutherland estates”. Undoubtedly, *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*...
*Glenburnie* is concerned with the measures of improvement imposed by the English government on the Highlands after the 1745 Jacobite Rising.

Mrs Mason, a foreigner in Glenburnie, actually transforms not only the inhabitants’ manners, but also the landscape of the place. The new, reformed Glenburnie is a tidy, ordered village conformed to the English taste. During the transformation, the village loses not only its supposed faults (dirtiness, disorder, idleness), but also its peculiarity. Landscape is no longer sublime, but domesticated, as the repaired road testifies. Mrs Maclarty’s daughters learned to spin and are now independent. Nevertheless, the reformed Glenburnie may not be as idyllic as Mrs Mason considers it. The Maclarty family, for instance, are not so happy as they were at the beginning of the novel; in few years, the daughters went to work in towns and wasted their money away, one of them disappeared and possibly ruined herself, and the eldest son fell in a mischievous marriage.

In Hamilton’s novel, we cannot find many of the general features of the national tale; for instance, there are no marriages to close the novel, nor plots of usurped rights. Nevertheless, *The Cottagers of Glenburnie* is deeply concerned with national manners and peripheral differences from the centre. Whether the effacement of these differences and the reformation of the Highland manners is desired or opposed by the author, is still open to debate.

The national tales written after 1810 are more adherent to the paradigm established by Sydney Owenson’s *The Wild Irish Girl*. According to *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Romanticism*, the canon of the Scottish national tale is constituted by six novelists: Sir Walter Scott, Elizabeth Hamilton, Jane Porter, Mary Brunton, Susan Ferrier, and Christian Isobel Johnstone, “with Scott at its core, whereas these five writers occupy the periphery”. In this dissertation, I analyse works of two other authors, namely, Honoria Scott and Mary Johnston. In their novels, in fact, the typical features of the national tale are evident; in Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde* (1810) and *Strathmay, or Scenes in the North* (1813), for instance, identity issues are explored through marriage and origins and heritage plots.

Honoria Scott set her first novel in the valley of the Clyde, a Lowland river touching Glasgow in its flow. The juxtaposition of manners is epitomised in the contrast between Flora Hamilton, born in the vale of the Clyde and the daughter of a Highland mother and a

---

Lowland father, and her suitor, Sir Archibald Campbell, the son of a rich Glasgow lor. Flora is poor; both her parents were isolated from their families for having married a member of the opposite faction (Highland Jacobites Vs. Lowland Whigs) and unjustly deprived of their inheritance rights. Flora’s father died of an infective fever in India, leaving his family unsupported. In spite of all hardships, Flora is an extremely worthy and virtuous young woman; in her person, Scott portrays all the qualities and manners desirable in a Scotswoman. Her suitor, Archibald, is a libertine and a seducer, a man of base principles who, after having seduced Ellen M’Roath, one of Flora’s best friends, asks Flora to marry him. Flora is clever enough to understand what kind of man he is and rejects his proposal, eventually getting married with another Lowlander, George Dalzel. Throughout the novel, Flora is readmitted as a member of both families: that of her father, represented by her uncle, and that of her mother, represented by an old Aunt living in the Highlands. Her identity is granted as a union of Highland and Lowland virtues, portraying the manners and qualities of the modern Scot.

In Vale of the Clyde, India appears as a far, distant place, where Flora’s father goes as a member of the British Army and where he dies of malarial fevers. England’s colonies and former colonies appear in two other important national tales: Christian Isobel Johnstone’s Clan-Albin (1815) and Mary Johnston’s The Lairds of Glenfern (1816). In Clan-Albin, Johnstone provides a thorough portrait of the manners of Highland people, of Highland landscape and of the aftermath of the measures adopted by the English government after the Forty Five. The novel opens in Glen Albin, a small village in the western Highlands. Several inhabitants are compelled to leave their homes and to sail to America, to try their fortune away from the poverty and destitution to which they are condemned in Scotland. The hero of the novel, Norman, decides instead to join the British Army and is sent to fight in the Continent. As usual in these novels, Norman discovers his noble origins and marries Monimia (the relative of a pin-maker – Mr Montague – who

35 In “From Family Roots to the Routes of Empire”, Juliet Shields explores the relationship between domesticity and national identity in the national tale, providing a detailed analysis of Clan-Albin. Shields also compares the national tale with Scott’s historical novel (therefore rejecting Monnickendam’s inclusion of Scott in the genre, see A. Monnickendam, “The Scottish National Tale”, op. cit., p. 100), claiming that the national tale is more accurate in exploring the role of domestic life in the construction of national identity: “To a greater extent than Scott’s historical novels, national tales position domesticity as central to Britain’s national and imperial interests: they explore the conflicted relationships between metropolitan England, its Celtic peripheries, and an expanding British empire through marriage plots and family histories” (J. Shields, op. cit., pp. 919-920).
belongs to the middle classes).\textsuperscript{36} The over-sea territories here represent an alternative to life in poverty at home, although real happiness cannot be found abroad, but only at home, as Norman and Monimia show.

As in \textit{Clan-Albin}, in Mary Johnston’s \textit{The Lairds of Glenfern, or, Highlanders of the Nineteenth Century}, the Continent is represented as the place of fight, where the protagonist goes as a member of the British Army. By joining the British service, both Norman in \textit{Clan-Albin} and Charles in \textit{The Lairds of Glenfern} accept their British identity. At the same time, they still identify themselves with the Highlands and their clans. In \textit{The Lairds of Glenfern}, the Highlands are not \textit{the} periphery, but a \textit{relative} periphery, a land caught in a sort of liminal stage, in which the echoes of feudalism and clan feuds are still present, but, at the same time, life has changed completely. The novel is set in the early years of the nineteenth century; during this period, the Highlands were no longer an exotic and barbarous cradle of rebels and Jacobites, but a part of the British Empire.\textsuperscript{37} As such, the Scottish mountains were still at the periphery if compared to London or Edinburgh, but they were also at the centre, if compared to the Indies and over-sea colonies. In \textit{The Lairds of Glenfern}, Charles’ sister, Helen, gets married with a rich merchant, Mr Whitmore, who made his fortune in the West Indies. They leave Scotland for the Indies, but Helen soon becomes willing to go back to Scotland. Helen cannot live far from where her roots and family are; moreover, she believes that national manners and values are more important than money. Therefore, she wants her son to grow up in Scotland, and not in the Indies, where she believes there is none of “the purity and simplicity of manners which marked her countrymen”.\textsuperscript{38}

In both \textit{Clan-Albin} and \textit{The Lairds of Glenfern}, Highland and Scottish national manners are located on a wider map than the one of early national tales. Fictional space is no longer dominated by the juxtaposition between Highlands and Lowlands, Scotland and

\textsuperscript{36} Monimia is the name of the heroines of two famous eighteenth-century novels: Tobias Smollet’s \textit{Ferdinand Count Fathom} (1753) and Charlotte Smith’s \textit{The Old Manor House} (1793).

\textsuperscript{37} Many critics dealing with the national tale and the relationship between England and Scotland during the late-eighteenth and the early-nineteenth centuries employ the term “empire”. The use of such terminology is present in the titles of many critical works, such as, for instance, Katie Trumpener’s \textit{Bardic Nationalism} (1997), Janet Sorensen’s \textit{The Grammar of Empire in Eighteenth-century British Writing} (2000) and Kenneth McNeil’s \textit{Scotland, Britain, Empire. Writing the Highlands, 1760-1860} (2007). In this dissertation, I employ the word “empire”, in order to better characterise the contrast between peripheral territories and the centre of power, London. Nevertheless, I am grateful to Professor Francis O’Gorman for having made me aware of the inaccuracy of considering early-nineteenth-century Britain as an empire. In fact, while Britain was undoubtedly a colonial power during that period, it had not developed an imperial structure yet; according to O’Gorman, it was only in the 1850s that Britain developed such government departments.

England; instead, a set of complex centre-periphery dynamics involving the territories of the British Empire is present.  

![Diagram of world extension in National Tales]

---

39 This structure characterises many later novels that, though not belonging to the national tale genre, feature over-sea colonies and territories as structuring areas, endowed with certain meanings. The clearest examples are provided in Alexander Sutherland’s *Macrimmon; A Highland Tale* (1823) and Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary* (1826). In Chapter IX, I shall provide a full analysis of the extension and function of the fictional worlds portrayed in early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels concerned with identity.
As the instances provided so far suggest, the plot of the national tale is a “spatialization of political choices”, “a journey of discovery and homecoming through the peripheries”.\textsuperscript{40} In the national tale, geographic movement plays a major role in the development of the plot; travelling among different areas of Britain and, sometimes, of the developing British empire, characterises all the national tales of the Identity and Highlands.

\textsuperscript{40} K. Trumpener, \textit{Bardic Nationalism}, cit., p. 138.
The protagonists of such novels as *Clan-Albin* and *The Lairds of Glenfern*, but also of *Vale of the Clyde* and *Strathmay*, travel around either Great Britain or the world, always to go back to their native Scotland. The national tale portrays national manners and settings comparing them with foreign countries; in the end, the protagonists choose to go back to their country and enjoy their recently found identity as adults, getting married and setting in life.

From a structural viewpoint, the national tale endows space with specific social meaning: London and great towns are characterised as places of vice and debauchery, the Highlands as the repository of virtues and hospitality, friendship and bravery, the Continent as a war-ground, where the hero shows his fighting skills and Highland courage, the over-sea territories as markets where smart money-makers can enrich themselves, or places where a new life can be started by those needing a second possibility.

The national tale emphasises the juxtaposition between different areas of Scotland, Great Britain and the world. As a consequence, travelling from one area to another is charged with national and cultural meanings that make border-crossing a crucial practice. The differences in scenery and manners are most evident when the border between one area and another is crossed. One of the most beautiful descriptions of border-crossing between Lowlands and Highlands – besides the impressive portraits given by Walter Scott in *Waverley* – is provided by Mary Brunton, in her 1814 *Discipline*. Published just a short time after *Waverley*, Brunton’s novel is much indebted to the national tale. The main aim of the novel is moral, but the depiction of national manners, the opposition between London, Edinburgh and the Highlands, and the final marriage between an Englishwoman and a Scotsman, make it a true national tale.

---

41 The crucial importance attributed to geography in the national tale appears as a continuation in the eighteenth-century literary tradition inaugurated by Daniel Defoe. In *Dreams of Adventure, Deeds of Empire*, Martin Green compares *Robinson Crusoe* with *Waverley*:

> But what one might call the axis of sensibility has rotated through perhaps 90°, from geography to history; whereas Defoe’s motto might have been “‘Tis a Thousand Miles Hence,” Scott’s was “‘Tis Sixty Years Since.” And therewith the place of nature (the alien conditions with which Crusoe had to struggle) has been taken by culture: the mode of life of the Highlanders. And so naturally the interest in technology has been replaced by an interest in ethnography. The form has also developed toward an interest in larger historical units; larger units of time, and larger institutions; the armies are larger and the battles last longer. (M. Green, *op. cit.*, p. 102)

By comparing the works of Defoe and Scott, Green compares the spirit of two centuries: the rationalist eighteenth century, interested in progress, technology and the control over nature, and the romantic nineteenth century, attentive to cultural differences and nature.
The heroine of the novel is Ellen Percy, a spoilt and insensitive Londoner; Ellen is the daughter of a rich tradesman who, after going bankrupt, commits suicide and leaves his daughter unprotected and almost unsupported, threatened by the dangers of a great city. Decided to support herself by becoming a governess, Ellen moves to Edinburgh, where she ends up leading a life of poverty and destitution. Her fortune changes when she meets with Charlotte Graham, a Highland lady inviting her to her father’s castle on the Highlands. Compelled by need, friendship and curiosity, Ellen heartily accepts her invitation. During their journey from Edinburgh to Glen Eredine, descriptions of the changing natural scenery are accompanied by Charlotte’s enthusiastic exultation at their crossing the Highland line:

Towards evening, the mountains which had once seemed as soft in the distance as the clouds which rested on them, began to be marked by the grey lights on the rock, and the deep shadow of the ravine. The morning brought a complete change of scene. Corn fields and massive foliage had given place to dull heath, varied only by streaks of verdure, which betrayed a sheep-trail or the path of a nameless will; while here and there, a solitary birch “shivered in silver brightness”.  

Ellen Percy’s is the most interesting border-crossing, because it is related in first person narration. Her first impressions on the Highlands and their inhabitants are not quite flattering, but once she has spent some time in Glen Eredine, she begins to understand Charlotte’s enthusiastic ejaculation while crossing the Highland line: “You are welcome to the Highlands! [...] To the land where never friend found a traitor, nor enemy a coward!”.

Structured like a pilgrim’s progress, Discipline follows the inner growth of Ellen Percy from an English spoilt coquette into a Highland wife and mother. Not only does Ellen marry Mr Graham, but she also learns to speak Gaelic, embracing Highland language, culture and traditions. This dramatic change is brought about by Highland landscape; it is the warm beauty of Highland spring that eventually manages to tender her heart and to make her willing to abandon herself to the joys of true love.

To conclude this section, I provide a brief analysis of the terms “centre” (or “core”) and “periphery”. The terms refer to two categories that are crucial in order to understand not only the structure of the national tale, but also the whole literary production of the early nineteenth century. The father of the dichotomy core/periphery is an American sociologist, Immanuel Wallerstein, who articulated the concepts in The Modern World System, published in 1974. About core and periphery, Wallerstein remarks:

43 Ibidem, p. 198.
World economics are divided into core-states and peripheral areas. I do not say peripheral states because one characteristic of a peripheral area is that the indigenous state is weak, ranging from its non-existence (that is a colonial situation) to one with a low degree of autonomy (that is, a neo-colonial situation). There are also semi-peripheral areas which are in between the core and periphery on a series of dimensions.44

Scotland has sometimes been considered as a colonial state, and, therefore, its literature has been equalled with that of Ireland.45 The success reaped by the national tale in Scotland seems to support such a view. During the early eighteenth century, Scotland and Ireland experienced a peripheral situation similar to that of colonies: while London was the centre of power (the core state is England), in the periphery no important decisions could be taken. The measures applied by the British government in order to prevent rebellions in both countries were those proper of a colonialist state, featuring military occupation and the eradication of local culture (especially in the Highlands).

Nevertheless, it must be pointed out that the 1707 Union of the Parliaments was approved by the majority of the Scottish MPs. The decision was taken on grounds of economical advantage, but a large part of the Scottish people did not welcome it. This agreement makes Scotland a less evident case of colonialism, even though it can be called an “internal colony”.46 Moreover, at the time, Scotland was still internally divided: while the Lowlands enjoyed a sort of semi-peripheral condition, the Highlands were treated by the English government as a foreign territory to colonise. Therefore, the Highlands can be comfortably labelled as a peripheral area, deprived of local authority and controlled from a foreign country, England.

---

45 In *Bardic Nationalism*, Katie Trumpener equals Ireland, Scotland and Wales as internal colonies of England. She also deals with the late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century literatures of these countries as informed by the same loss of national independence that characterises the literature of a colonised state.
46 M. Fazzini (ed.), *Alba Literaria*, Venezia: Amos, 2005, p. xiii. In the introduction to *The Grammar of Empire* (2000), Janet Sorensen explains that the idea of “internal colonialism” was articulated by Michael Hechter in his 1975 *Internal Colonialism: The Celtic Fringe in British National Development, 1536-1966* (Berkeley: University of California Press). Sorensen explains that this concept relies upon the ideas of core and periphery created by Wallerstein and that it describes a specific relationship of contiguity in which the core is the “dominant cultural group which occupies territory extending from the political center of the society [...] outward to those territories largely occupied by the subordinate, or [the] peripheral cultural group” (H. Michael, *op. cit.*, p. 18, as quoted in J. Sorensen, *The Grammar of the Empire in Eighteenth-century British Writing*, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000, pp. 16-7). Sorensen underlies some of the faults of this model, such as the fact that it is strictly dependent “on notions of spatial hierarchization” (J. Sorensen, *op. cit.*, p. 18); nevertheless, the concept is still in use in works about English colonialism such as Mark Netzloff’s *England’s Internal Colonies; Class, Capital and the Literature of Early Modern English Colonialism* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003).
4. The Historical Novel

The historical novel, in the form we are used to today, is considered to have been invented by Sir Walter Scott. The main supporter of this theory is Georg Lukács, whose *The Historical Novel* served to spread the theory among literary critics.Obviously, Lukács did not mean that novels concerned with history were not written before *Waverley* was. In 1814, for instance, Jane Porter had already published two historical novels, *Thaddeus of Warsaw* (1803) and *The Scottish Chiefs* (1810), while in Ireland Maria Edgeworth had published *Castle Reckrent* (1800), a family saga in which history plays a major role. What, according to Lukács, makes Scott’s *Waverley* so innovative, is the perspective from which history is dealt with. Scott is extolled as the first writer who structured his historical novels around a more modern idea of history, in which the focus is not on great men changing the course of events, but on how events disrupt the course of common people’s everyday life.

In tune with this historical perspective, Scott structured *Waverley* around the way in which a young Englishman, completely ignorant of the world, experiences the events of the Forty Five. The difference between this perspective and the one provided in *The Scottish Chiefs* is evident – in Jane Porter’s novel the focus is on the life of William Wallace, one of Scotland’s greatest heroes, while in *Waverley* the historical leader of the 1745 Jacobite Rebellion, Prince Charles Edward Stuart, is featured only as a secondary character.

It is not the interest in history that makes Scott an innovator, but his new perspective on it, as George Lukács explains:

> What matters therefore in the historical novel is not the re-telling of great historical events, but the poetic awakening of the people who figured in those events.

Lukács also points to the crucial role played by characterisation; characters must be derived “from the historical peculiarity of their age”, that is to say, they must think and act as they would have done in the historical period in which the novel is set. The consequent question is: what are the aims and merits of this perspective, and why was it so successful? Lukács partly answered the question, claiming that what matters in the historical novel “is

---

47 Despite Lukács’s importance as one of the first critics who extolled Scott’s innovative role in literature, his approach to Scott’s works does not take into account national issues as, instead, this dissertation does. According to Katie Trumpener, Lukács considered Scott as an English writer, who “mirrors at once the cumulative history of the English novel, the proto-industrial state of English society, and the new European collective consciousness at the end of the Napoleonic Wars” (K. Trumpener, “National Characters, Nationalist Plots: National Tales and Historical Novel in the Age of Waverley, 1806-1930”, cit., pp. 685-6).


that we should re-experience the social and human motives which led men to think, feel and act just as they did in historical reality”.

The ultimate aim of this new form of historical novel is not truth to reality in itself, but truth to reality as a source of knowledge of the present through the re-experiencing of the past.

Interest in the past is one of the typical features of romanticism, according to Hans Eichner’s *The Rise of Modern Science and the Genesis of Romanticism*. Eichner focuses on the roots of the nineteenth-century ideas of science and of romanticism, highlighting the philosophical, scientific and cultural issues at the core of this phenomenon. About the growing interest in the past, Eichner claims that it is an “immediate consequence of the concept of an evolving universe”:

The Romantics, who had done away with the notion of an unchanging universe, also abandoned the concept of unchanging human nature. As they did so, not only the preoccupation with but also the admiration for the timeless, the universal, and the general made way for a decided preference for the temporal, the local, and the individual: and the most obvious, indeed the only, explanation for the temporal, local, and individual seemed to them history.

Modern science determines a shift from ideas of immutability to ideas of progress; the world is no longer described as a mechanic system, but as an evolving entity. In such a system, the past contains the seeds of the present. The historical novel and, more at large, all the literary genres concerned with history, tend to employ literature as an instrument of analysis of the past, in search for answers about present society and culture. In *Waverley*, the 1745 Jacobite Rising is explored in its cultural, national and political implications, in order to account for the political and cultural predicament of early-nineteenth-century Scotland.

John Ruskin explained Scott’s success by claiming that his point of force was that of embodying the spirit of his age. In fact, Scott answered to modern people’s desire to explore their past in search for the causes of the present. According to Ruskin, this desire is accompanied by an aesthetic need to escape from the present and, more in particular, from the alienating existence of modern life, spent in industrial towns: “With this romantic love of beauty, [man is] forced to seek in history, and in external nature, the satisfaction [he] cannot find in ordinary life”.

__________

52 *Ibidem*, p. 16.
53 J. Ruskin, *op. cit.*, p. 326. The spreading interest in history is typical of two eighteenth-century genres: the Gothic novel and antiquarianism. The Gothic novel is primarily an exploitation of the aesthetic appeal of historical settings and descriptions on readers, while antiquarianism is rooted in a more scientific approach.
In the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, both history and landscape play a major role, confirming Ruskin’s perspective. History is primarily explored in relation to the development of Scottish national identity; like Scott’s *Waverley*, many among the novels concerned with national identity are set in periods of strife between Scotland and England, and revolve around the adventures of a common person who, either due to his young age or to political and social reasons, has neither a place in society, nor a clear identity. The function of re-experiencing such historical events as the Wars of Scottish Independence or the Jacobite Risings through the actions and ideas of an outsider or an in-between (for such most heroes and heroines are) is that of turning their adventures into a source of identity. The connection is clear; in a period characterised by the quest for cultural and national identity, writers set their attention on the past as a source of knowledge of their roots and origins. This knowledge can be derived by readers when they identify themselves with the heroes and heroines of the historical novel; it is through sympathy with characters that we understand their motives for action; therefore, history must be portrayed through the eyes of a common person, with whom most readers can identify themselves. The reader is an outsider in the world of the past; as a consequence, it is easier for him/her to identify themselves with young Waverley, rather than with William Wallace or with Charles Edward Stuart.

The historical novels written after *Waverley* are numerous; the first novel clearly inspired by Scott’s innovative historical perspective is *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My*
Landlady, published anonymously in London in 1819. Due to the writer’s unknown identity, who signed himself or herself as E.H.H., it is difficult to determine whether the author was a native of Scotland or not. Nevertheless, the novel is here considered as Scottish, due to the function attributed to Scottish history, also believing to the fictive editor’s claim that he is a Scotsman. While the title contains the first and most evident hint to the Waverley novels, the plot reveals a full understanding of Scott’s vision of history. Structured as a cautionary tale, the novel tells the story of young Johnnie Baillie, the son of a cottager, living in a fictive valley placed along the Highland line. Johnnie is an impulsive young man; his disobedience to his family leads him to destruction and brings sorrow and misfortune on his family. Johnnie’s greatest mistake is not rooted in disobedience, but in ignorance. Like Waverley, Johnnie joins the Macleods out of romantic ideas of freedom and life on the mountains. What he does not understand is that he is a Lowlander, not a Highlander; he has nothing to do with the Macleods and is appalled by their vengeance on the Baron of Owenclew because, unlike them, he received no offence.

The focus of the novel is on Johnnie’s moral experiences and on his inner growth; as a moral tale, The Highlander is aimed at teaching the reader about the terrible consequences of disobedience. The writer employs some strategies to increase the reader’s identification with Johnnie: his unfortunate story, his growing awareness of his own mistakes and his feelings of dejection and repentance are devised to arouse the reader’s pity and sympathy. Johnnie’s personal story intertwines with the historical events that involved Scotland after the Battle of Culloden. Johnnie meets with Charles Edward Stuart and shares with him the lonely life of the outsider and the pursued, hiding among the Scottish mountains. Johnnie is eventually apprehended by the government and sentenced to death.

Johnnie Baillie’s story is not just a moral tale against disobedience, but it is also a commentary on identity, and a sort of warning against the adoption of cultural and national habits belonging to other peoples. The ultimate aim of the novel, therefore, is opposite to that of Waverley – while Scott focused on the union of Highlands and Lowlands in a unique nation, E.H.H. seems to be still defending the long lasting division between Highlands and Lowlands.

David Carey’s two historical novels, Lochiel and A Legend of Argyle, or, ’Tis a Hundred Years Since, combine the Gothic origins and heritage plot with a thorough account of historical events. There is a striking similarity between the two novels and some passages
in *A Legend of Argyle* even appear as adaptations from *Lochiel*. The narrative perspective varies consistently from a novel to the other, though.

In *Lochiel*, Carey produces a sort of “polyphonic” novel, where there is not a unique protagonist, but a group of people whose actions and viewpoints are developed.\(^5^4\) The uniting element is the 1745 Jacobite Rebellion, and the focal point around which these characters unite is Prince Charles Edward Stuart, called by the Scots “Bonnie Prince Charlie”. Despite his crucial function, Bonnie Prince Charlie is not the protagonist of the novel; instead, he is only one of the many people involved in the rebellion. Prince Charlie is not a leader; he is described as being too young and inexperienced of the world to be free from the influences and pressures of other characters.\(^5^5\) Real and fictive characters enjoy the same status in the novel, showing how major historical events oftentimes overwhelm people, shattering their peaceful existences and compelling them to action.\(^5^6\)

The eponymous hero of the novel is a real historical character. Lochiel is not the protagonist of the novel, but his scruples about joining Prince Charles’s campaign without the support of France, followed by his giving up his doubts in the name of loyalty and honour, are representative of the human incapacity to avoid getting involved in major historical events. When Lochiel eventually decides to join the Prince, it is with a sense of unavoidable duty to his liege and a feeling of overhanging destruction:

> Though I foresee the disastrous termination which is likely to crown this premature enterprise, I swear by this dirk to follow your Royal Highness’s fortunes through good and through evil to the last.\(^5^7\)

*A Legend of Argyle* is not a polyphonic novel, being focused on the adventures of a single character, Colonel Gordon, a foundling of obscure origins raised by a French officer in

---

\(^5^4\) The term “polyphonic” was first used by Michail Bakhtin to describe the structure of Fedor Dostoevsky’s *Crime and Punishment*, in order to draw attention to the coexistence of manifold perspectives, endorsed by the different characters partaking in the action of the novel. *Crime and Punishment* was published in 1866 and I think that David Carey’s attentive treatment of several and oftentimes opposed political outlooks and ideas can be considered as innovatively “polyphonic”.

\(^5^5\) In *Lochiel*, Prince Charles Edward Stuart is represented as a passive character and a man devoid of the necessary mental strength to lead a rebellion: “He had an engaging aspect, and an air of grandeur; in short, he possessed every personal advantage, but in regard to mental accomplishments he was not so highly favoured [...] his mind had not been enlarged by the beneficial results of experience. He had few opinions but such as he derived from others (D. Carey, *Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden*, London: G. and W. Whittaker, 1820, Vol. I, p. 117).

\(^5^6\) The influence exerted by major historical events on characters is clearly a Scottian feature. In *Lochiel*, Carey overtly draws inspiration from Scott’s *Waverley*, both in the choice of the historical setting and in the importance delivered to history.

France. Gordon’s quest for his origins, together with major historical events, lead him to Scotland, his native country; as a bearer of a commission from King Louis of France, Gordon has to help the Earl of Mar to raise an army, in order to support the Pretender’s attempt to regain the throne. Gordon experiences 1715 Scotland as an outsider; he is a supporter of the Jacobites, but not a Jacobite, he deals with aristocrats but belongs to no social rank, he comes from France, but his name sounds Scottish. Gordon’s identity is complex – history makes the Duke of Argyle his enemy, but esteem and similarity of disposition make him a friend.

In Carey’s novel, identifying with Gordon means experiencing the uneasiness of a man who has no home nor identity, until history leads him to his birthplace in Scotland. Gordon’s real origins suggest Scottish modern readers that identity should be looked for in those illuminated chieftains of the Highlands, such as the Duke of Argyll and Gordon’s father, the Lord of Haddo. Carey’s position is clearly a pro-Whig and pro-Protestant one; he is openly criticising the Jacobites and condemning their anachronistic attempts to restore the Stuarts to the throne. Nevertheless, in Lochiel, Carey pays the due respect to honest Jacobites endowed with more virtues than faults.

Later historical novels, such as Macrimmon. A Highland Tale (1823) and The Black Watch (1834), show the desire to keep the focus on common people and their involvement in history. Other novels, instead, show the persistent interest in great historical characters, such as John Paul Jones in Allan Cunningham’s Paul Jones. A Romance (1826) and Perkin Warbeck in Alexander Campbell’s Perkin Warbeck. The Court of James the Forth in Scotland. A Historical Novel (1830).

---

58 The full title of Carey’s second novel (A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since) is clearly inspired to two of Scott’s novels: Waverley; or, ‘Tis Sixty Years Since, and A Legend of Montrose (1819).
CHAPTER IV

History and Identity

The Union with England and the Loss of Independence

1. Introduction

Why were early-nineteenth-century Scots so interested in national issues? The answer should be looked for in their interest in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Scottish history. It is after the Union of the English and Scottish Crowns, happened in 1603, that the national status of Scotland changed from an independent nation to the member of the United Kingdom. In this chapter, I explore the historical events that characterised Scottish history from the Union of the Crowns to the Jacobite Risings and the modernisation of the Highlands. During this period, Scottish people learned to feel British citizens, rather than Scots; by recognising themselves as the members of a recently-created society, many people felt a sense of detachment from their national past of independence. This is at the root of the cultural nationalism characterising the Identity and Highlands Corpus: it is in history that Scottish romantic novelists looked for their roots and, therefore, for a stronger sense of belonging. In this chapter, I also provide some references to the novels of the corpus, providing explicit commentary on these decisive historical events.

2. The Union of the Crowns

Geographically, Scotland coincides with the northern part of Great Britain; politically, it has been an independent nation until the beginning of the seventeenth century. The border between England and Scotland follows the ridge of the Cheviot Hills and runs from the river Tweed on the east, to the Solway Firth on the west. Scotland’s defence of its own independence from England has always been the cause of many wars and battles, from the Wars of Scottish Independence fought during the fourteenth century, to the Battle of

---

1 Ann Rigney defines the interest in history typical of romantic Scotland as “romantic historicism”, attempting to comprehend antiquarianism, cultural and identity issues: “I use “romantic historicism” to designate broadly the historical culture of this period and the convergence of influences by which it was characterised: a radicalised awareness of the alterity of the past and the historicity of experience, picked up on the Enlightenment interest in culture and eighteenth-century antiquarianism and fed into emergent rationalism with its “identity politics” and interest in folk-culture” (A. Rigney, Imperfect Histories. The Elusive Past and the Legacy of Romantic Historicism, New York: Cornell UP, 2001, p. 8).
Culloden, the last battle ever fought on British soil, which put an end to Scottish Jacobite rebellions in 1746. The preferred term to describe the conflicts between Scotland and England before the Union of the Crowns is “war”, because the whole Scottish nation was involved, while after the Union, “rebellion” is privileged, since only a part of Scottish people rebelled against the British government.

The Union of the English and Scottish Crowns sanctioned in 1603 was not a traumatic event for Scotland. When Queen Elizabeth I died heirless, it was established that the English crown would be given to James VI of Scotland, her closest relative. The union was a formal one: although ruled by the same monarch, Scotland and England preserved their national independence. Rather interestingly, the fact that a Scottish Stuart was governing over both England and Scotland gave no advantage to Scotland. James I of England and Scotland, in fact, visited his native country only once, in 1617, showing a certain lack of interest in it. During James I’s reign, Scotland preserved its economical, cultural and military independence from England.

Scotland’s problems began to arise with the English Civil Wars (1642-1651) and the establishment of the Commonwealth. Scottish Royalists reacted in favour of Charles II, under the lead of the Marquess of Montrose, supported by some Highland clans. Montrose lost the Battle of Carbisdale and was captured and sentenced to death. Charles II allied himself with the Covenanters and tried to hinder Cromwell’s plans, but his army was defeated at Dunbar in 1650. As a reaction, Cromwell decided to prevent Scotland from being of further hindrance to the Commonwealth, occupying it and delivering it into the hands of a military governor. By this time, Scotland’s national independence declined progressively, until it was ultimately loss during the eighteenth century.

3. William III and the Glencoe Massacre

With the restoration of Charles II and the reign of James II, Scotland enjoyed a return of political independence. Stuart sovereigns did not devote much attention to their native country, leaving it under the control of its Parliament. Problems came back with the Glorious Revolution and William of Orange’s crowning in February 1689. William was a Dutch and a Protestant, while the Stuarts were Catholic. In Scotland, some Protestant clans, like the Campbells, welcomed the new king with enthusiasm, while others, who were either Catholic or Episcopalian, remained faithful to the exiled Stuart sovereign.

Some of these chiefs, led by John Graham of Dundee, rose against William, in the attempt to restore king James II to the throne. This rebellion, also known as the first Jacobite
Rising, ended in the Jacobite defeat at Killiecrankie in 1689 and in other Jacobite capitulations in the following year. In answer to these rebellions, William asked the Highland chiefs to pledge their allegiance to him before the end of 1691. Among the many rebellious clans, one tarried in giving the oath of allegiance: the Macdonalds of Glencoe. The government’s measures were drastic and consisted in an appalling act of violence which should have served as an admonition against all further rebellions. The exemplary punishment which fell upon the Macdonalds of Glencoe is generally known as the Massacre of Glencoe, and was inflicted on the inhabitants of the Highland valley at the end of January 1692. William III had authorised the killing of many innocent people, in order to dissuade other Jacobites to rebel against him, but the massacre turned out to be one of the most powerful motives for people’s joining the rebels.

The Massacre of Glencoe is fully portrayed in Rosalia St. Clair’s 1832 novel, The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon. Although her novel is the first full account of the 1691-2 events, the massacre is present in two previous novels: Conirdan; or, The St Kildians (1817) and Highland Mary (1826). In Conirdan and Highland Mary, the events of Glencoe are portrayed as past events whose influence on the present is still dramatic. In Conirdan, about twenty-one years have passed from 1692; Conirdan’s parents were massacred at Glencoe and the little orphan was brought to the solitary and remote island of St Kilda, to be raised from the natives of the island.

Conirdan is aware that he comes from outside St Kilda, but knows nothing about his origins. On the island, young Conirdan feels an outsider; he is unhappy, and feels as though only the natives could partake in the happiness of the utopian society founded on love and mutual support which characterises the island. Conirdan’s crisis of identity is rooted in his having been removed from his native place, due to the Massacre of Glencoe. It was after that terrible event that some Highlanders brought him to the island, in order to protect him.

Conirdan leaves St Kilda in quest for happiness and identity. He travels with a friend, Mr Robertson, who adopts him and provides for him. During the tour of Scotland they undertake together, aimed at teaching Conirdan something about the world, they visit Inverlochy, near Glencoe. Here, Conirdan asks a local whether people living there are happy. The old man stares at him: “Good Lord! [...] and did you never hear of Glencoe?” When Conirdan asks Mr Robertson what had happened at Glencoe and who could have “such a great dislike to the poor people in the glen” to commit such an appalling crime, his friend

---

tells him that the culprit is King William III. In *Conirdan*, no mention of the Campbells is made, while the full blunt falls upon King William III.

In *Highland Mary* too, the Massacre of Glencoe is the primary cause of the protagonist’s unhappy situation. Mary Macdonald is an orphan. When still a little child, she was given to an Englishman, Benjamin Wilmot, who received a sum for her boarding by Captain Bruce, a friend of her father’s. When Wilmot receives the will of the deceased Bruce, naming Mary the heir to the Burnfoot manse, Wilmot forges the will naming himself as the heir and keeping Mary with his family as a governess. Mary is a very virtuous girl and embodies all the best features generally attached to Highland heroines in novels. Mary is a victim of the Wilmots – not only is she mistreated by the women of the family, but she is also persecuted by George Wilmot, Benjamin’s son, a debauched libertine determined to seduce her.

Mary’s misfortunes are rooted in her family’s unlucky history. Everything began in 1692, when her great-grandfather was killed in Glencoe. Mary’s grandfather swore vengeance against the English government and embraced the Jacobite cause, joining the 1715 Jacobite Rising. He also asked his son, that is to say, Mary’s father, to keep faithful to the Jacobites for his sake and that of his family. When the Jacobite preparing for the 1715 Rising began, Angus Macdonald had just married Mary, a beautiful orphan woman. Angus joined the rebels reluctantly and only out of filial duty. In battle he saved an Englishman’s life, Captain Bruce, who, out of gratefulness, became his friend and took charge to provide for little Mary, his mother having died and her father having abandoned Great Britain to escape legal persecution. The plot of *Highland Mary* well illustrates how major historical events can affect the lives not only of the people directly involved in them, but also those of their offspring.

Rosalia St. Clair’s *The Doomed One* opens on the events of the 1691, focusing on the massacre and on the final revenge, taken in duel a couple of decades later, by Ewan Macdonald, chieftain’s son. *The Doomed One* explores the causes of Jacobitism, as these remarks exemplify:

> In their detestation of the cold heartless Dutchman, whose alien sway proved so grievous to their proud spirits, they wholly forgot the political tergiversation and tyranny which had brought Charles to the block, and driven his imbecile besotted successors to seek safety in the land of the stranger. Misfortunes, like the grave, had thrown their veil of oblivion over the crimes of legitimacy, and gladly would

---

3 *Conirdan*, op. cit., p. 125.
they have periled everything dear to man to free themselves from the galling yoke of foreign domination. [...] But King and Courtiers are not amongst those who profit by the lessons of experience; and the massacre of Glencoe, as might have been foreseen, instead of repressing the spirit of Jacobitism, only diffused it more widely, and induced many, who had previously wavered, to embrace the cause of James.4

St Clair points to the Massacre of Glencoe as the trigger of Jacobite success among many Highlanders. William III was not just a stranger and a Protestant, he was also the responsible for the killing of more than thirty innocent people, perpetrated by a regiment led by a Campbell Captain. William III’s short-sighted policy was the main cause of many Highlanders’ decision to support the exiled Stuarts. Their loyalty to James II was transferred to his son, James Francis Edward Stuart.

4. The 1707 Union of the Parliaments

William III died in 1702, after the issuing of the Act of Settlement, which sanctioned that only Protestants could be crowned. In 1702, Queen Anne succeeded to the throne, as the sister of William’s wife, Mary. Anne was the last member of the Stuart dynasty to reign in Great Britain; she was a Protestant and could, therefore, access the throne. It was during her reign that the Union between the English and the British Parliaments was sanctioned with the 1707 Union Act. The Scottish Privy Council agreed to the union in the hope to improve Scotland’s financial predicament after the “economic disaster of the 1690s”, which brought about “two years of crop failure and famine”, also expecting that this manoeuvre would have prevented the spreading of Jacobitism.5 As a result, Scotland lost its decisional powers and became a province of the United Kingdom.6

Despite the financial advantages derived from the entrance into the domestic and international trade of England, the union had its shortcomings, especially from a cultural perspective.7 The relationship between centre and periphery was utterly reshaped: the Lowlands lost their centrality and became only a region in a larger kingdom, while the Highlands continued to be at the periphery, even more than before. The most striking event affecting the Highlands was not the union, but the so-called stage of “improvement”, a series of measures adopted by England after the Jacobite Risings of the 1715 and 1745, in order to prevent the development of further rebellions in that area. Improvement entailed

---

5 C. Harvie, Scotland and Nationalism, cit., p. 11.
the levelling of the differences between England and the remotest parts of Scotland, turning them into an English province characterised by English culture.  

5. The Jacobite Risings of 1715 and 1745

The main catalyst for the English campaign of improvement in the Highlands is Jacobitism. Due to the Act of Settlement, when Queen Anne died, her closest protestant relative was crowned – George of Hannover. George was Anne’s second cousin on the female line of parentage; born in Hannover, he was a German and a Protestant. Despite the Jacobites’ loss of representation in Parliament after the 1707 Act of Union, the supporters of the exiled Stuarts were still numerous in Scotland and, in particular, in the Highlands. The Jacobites believed that the true heir to the throne of Great Britain was James II’s son, James Francis Edward Stuart. Many opponents of the new German king gathered under the lead of John Erskine, 6th Earl of Mar. Mar raised an army of Highlanders and set it at the orders of his liege, James Francis Edward Stuart, also known as the “Old Pretender” or the “Old Chevalier”. The rebellion led by Mar rose in 1715 and was soon defeated by government troops in the Battle of Sheriffmuir; although the results of the battle were balanced, the Old Pretender gave up his claims to the throne and abandoned Scotland and his Highland army, repairing to France and – afterwards – to Italy.

The 1715 rising is portrayed fully only in one of the novels studied in this dissertation – David Carey’s A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since (1821). The novel conveys Carey’s Whig convictions and his anti-Jacobitism; therefore, his historical account of the rebellion is written in order to extol the crucial importance of the defeat of the Jacobites in Scottish history. For Carey, Scottish identity is rooted in Whig ideals and Protestantism; consequently, he chooses to call his novel after John Campbell, 2nd Duke of Argyle, the leader of the regiments that defeated the Earl of Mar at Sheriffmuir. In Chapter I, Carey provides the reader with a sort of historical introduction to the events narrated; in it, he focuses on Scotland’s “singular and interesting anomaly”, a predicament stemming from the fact that while “the feudal institutions had long been banished before the light of civilisation […] they subsisted among the Scottish mountains in their pristine and native vigour”.  

Carey’s analysis of Scotland’s eighteenth-century situation obviously reminds the reader of Sir Walter Scott’s “A Postscript Which Should Have Been a Preface”, the closing

---

8 See R. Clyde, op. cit., p. 21.
chapter of *Waverley*, where the historical peculiarity of the Highlands is highlighted. As a modern Whig and a supporter of the Enlightenment, David Carey condemns feudalism and Catholicism as the greatest faults of the Highlands and the main cause of their supporting the “obsolete claims of the exiled House of Stuart”. Among other causes of the spreading of Jacobitism among Highlanders, Carey highlights “the recollection of the perfidious massacre of Glencoe” and the fact that “the union with England remained a bleeding sore which had not yet been cemented by the balsam of mutual protection and community of interests.”

Carey’s portraits of the two main historical characters involved in the 1715 rebellion is aimed at supporting his political and national ideas. The Duke of Argyle is represented as the champion of civilisation, an enlightened chieftain aware of his own historical importance; in his monologue, delivered on top of one of the towers of his castle of Inveraray, surrounded by a most affecting sublime scenery, John Campbell of Argyle exclaims: “The civil and religious liberties of one of the fairest and most interesting portions of the civilised world are at stake […] its enemies are in motion, its defence is entrusted to my hands”.

To Argyle stands opposed the Earl of Mar, the leader of the Jacobite rebels. Mar is characterised as an ambiguous character; although he is endowed with a certain sense of justice, which he manifests exculpating General Gordon from the Earl of Ronay’s false charges, he is a man moved by self-interest rather than idealism. To support his little flattering portrait of the Earl of Mar, David Carey quotes extensively from a letter which John Erskine of Mar sent to George I right after the king’s crowning in 1714. The quotations from the letter are aimed at shedding light on “the real character and views of this powerful, but mercenary noble and chieftain”. The letter was written by Mar to offer his services to the new king, as his family “had the honour [to do] for a great tract of years”. Noteworthy, the closing lines of the letter highlight not only Mar’s mercenary character, but also the

11 Ibidem, p. 3.
12 Ibidem, p. 17.
13 The letter is authentic and was really written by the Earl of Mar. Scott mentioned this letter as well, nine years later, in the third series of *The Tales of My Grandfather* (1830).
15 Ibidem, p. 52.
perfidiousness of his rebellion: “Your Majesty shall ever find me as faithful and dutiful a subject and servant”.\textsuperscript{16}

The Earl of Mar’s letter is effective in showing how, as in the case of the Massacre of Glencoe, the short-sightedness of the King and of his Counsellors were the cause of the spreading of Jacobitism. Indeed, it is possible that if Mar’s services had been accepted, the 1715 rebellion would have never happened. Another possible symptom of English short-sightedness was the laxity of the measures adopted to pacify the Highlands after the Fifteen. The most relevant measure, the Disarming Act, was issued in 1716. The act imposed the disarming of all Highlanders and the disbanding of the Independent Highland Companies (the Highland regiments of the British army). The enforcement of this act, as well as the improvement of roads and bridges, was entrusted to General Wade and his English regiment. The aim of road- and bridge-building was to make the remotest parts of the Highlands more accessible, and, therefore, easier to be controlled by the English soldiers who, unlike the members of the Black Watch and of the Independent Companies, were unaccustomed to Highland territory, its wilderness and impracticability.

Actually, road-building did not prove that relevant to gain effective military control over the Highlands; many Highlanders, for instance, continued to employ their old paths and shortcuts, which the English soldiers were not always able to check. As to the disarming, in 1724 General Wade himself commented on its ineffectiveness, in a report he sent to King George:

\begin{quote}
The number of Men to carry Arms in the Highlands (including the inhabitants of the Isles) is by the nearest computation about 22,000 Men, of which number about 10,000 are Vassals to the Superiors well affected to Your Majesty’s Government; most of the remaining 12,000 have been engaged in Rebellion against Your Majesty, and are ready, whenever encouraged by their Superiors or Chiefs of Clans, to create new Troubles and rise in Arms in favour of the Pretender.\textsuperscript{17}
\end{quote}

General Wade wrote two reports to King George, one in 1724 and one in 1727. Both provide a detailed description of the Highlands in the 1720s, portraying Highland culture and society. His observations on the clan system convey the sense of fracture between the Highlands and the rest of Great Britain, as seen through the eyes of an English military man:

\begin{quote}
They have still more extensive adherence one to another as Highlanders in opposition to the people who inhabit the Low Countries, whom they hold in the
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{16} D. Carey, \textit{A Legend of Argyle}, cit., p. 52.

\textsuperscript{17} General Wade’s report to King George can be found in: Colonel J. Allardyce (ed.), \textit{Historical Papers Relating to the Jacobite Period, 1699-1750}, Aberdeen: New Spalding Club, 1895, pp. 131-176, p. 132.
utmost Contempt, imagining them inferior to themselves in Courage, Resolution, and the use of Arms, and accuse them of being Proud, Avaricious, and Breakers of their Word.\footnote{General Wade’s report, op. cit., pp. 132-3.}

Wade goes on, remarking on how, despite the Disarming Act, the Highlanders were well armed and ready to be employed by the Stuarts, getting involved in a new rebellion:

[the Disarming Act] had been so ill executed, that the Clans the most disaffected to Your Majesty’s Government remain better Armed than ever, and consequently more in a Capacity not only of committing Robberies and Depredations, but also to be used as Tools or Instruments to any Foreign Power or Domestic Incendiaries who may attempt to disturb the Peace of Your Majesty’s Reign.\footnote{Ibidem, p. 136.}

Wade’s report made it evident to the English government that “only the ‘loyal’ Whig clans were complying with the Disarming Act [...], leaving the rest equipped for another attempt”.\footnote{R. Clyde, op. cit., p. 2.} Such an attempt was actually made in 1745, when the Jacobites crossed the border between Scotland and England and marched towards London led by Prince Charles Edward Stuart, the Old Pretender’s son. Charles Edward, called by Scots “Bonnie Prince Charlie”, due to his handsome looks, became a symbol of the Forty-Five and of the Scottish desire of independence from the Hannovers.

The period going from the first to the second Jacobite rising is not significantly present in the Identity and Highlands Corpus. Only one novel does feature the few years before the Forty-Five as a setting, i.e. Andrew Picken’s \textit{The Black Watch} (1834). Picken’s novel opens with a definition of the years between 1715 and 1745 as a “discontented and lawless period in Scotland”.\footnote{A. Picken, \textit{The Black Watch}, London: Richard Bentley, 1834, Vol. I, p. 2.} \textit{The Black Watch} is focused on the 1743 Mutiny of the Black Watch, one of the events which, according to the narrator, represented the occasion for another of those government mistakes that increased Scottish discontent with the Union. The Black Watch, deriving its name from the dark hue of the soldier’s uniform, was a Regiment of the British Army founded in 1738 by General Wade. The 43\textsuperscript{rd} Regiment was composed of six independent companies established by the King’s order in 1725, with the aim of patrolling the Highlands to prevent robberies, crime and, above all, rebellions against the government. Other Independent Companies have been raised in the Highlands for more than 50 years, but they were disbanded in 1716 as an effect of the Disarming Act.

The mutiny occurred in 1743 is a renown episode in Scottish history and is symptomatic of Scottish uneasiness in being ruled by the British Government. The main
events are described in a pamphlet published in 1893, recording the proceedings of the trial to the deserters. According to the author of this pamphlet, the Duke of Athole, as well as to the narrator in *The Black Watch*, the mutiny happened in London; a regiment of the Black Watch was called to the capital, in order to be inspected by the king. Once there, the Scottish soldiers were informed that their actual destination were the battlefields of the Flanders. Some people even rumoured that their final target were the West Indies. About a hundred men felt betrayed by the King, thinking that he was now breaking the “contract” according to which their charge was to patrol the Highlands, and not to fight abroad. These men gathered by night and marched northwards, abandoning the army in order to go back to their native country. They were stopped and captured in Northampton. Once led to London Tower, they were all tried for treason and sentenced to death. Among the victims there were two brothers, Malcolm and Samuel M’Pherson, appearing in *The Black Watch* as the leaders of the mutiny. In Picken’s novel, the punishment is represented as excessive and its cruelty as the cause of many Scottish people’s dislike for the English government. Picken also represents the Black Watch as a loophole from the prohibition to wear arms sanctioned by the Disarming Act.

If the execution of more than a hundred Scotsmen appalled many Jacobites, the long lasting involvement of Britain in the Continental War for the Austrian Succession (which raged in Europe from 1740 to 1748) was another cause of complaint among the supporters of the exiled Stuarts. For them, France was not an enemy, but a potential ally in the attempt to defeat King George’s army and to restore the Old Pretender to the throne of Great Britain. Indeed, France did not support Prince Charles’s claims, as the Jacobites had hoped. Instead of providing them with troops, France limited itself to take advantage of England’s recalling its troops from continental battlefields, in order to put down the 1745 Jacobite rebellion. This measure entailed a British defeat and its withdrawal from the Continental War, highlighting the anxiety cause by the rebellion in England.

The events of 1745, from the gathering of the clans to the Jacobite defeat at Culloden and the flight of Bonnie Prince Charlie, are a major theme in early-nineteenth-century Scottish literature. The first historical novel, *Waverley*, was set during the Forty-Five, turning it into one of the most exploited historical events in the literature of the period, besides the deeds of William Wallace and King Robert de Bruce. David Carey provides a rather technical account in *Lochiel*, where all stages of the rebellion are painstakingly reconstructed. The Forty-Five is also portrayed in Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch*, in
George Robert Gleig’s *Allan Breck*, and in E.H.H.’s *The Highlander, or, A Tale of My Landlady*. Other novelists dealt with the Forty-Five as a crucial past event, the consequences of which are still visible and dramatic after some decades; among these novels we find Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans. A Moral Tale* (1822) and *Arthur Monteith. A Moral Tale* (1822), and Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary*.

6. **After the Forty-Five**

Most novels set in the second half of the eighteenth century are not focused on the events determining the failure of the rebellion, but on its aftermath for Scotland and the Highlands. England’s measures to avoid any further rebellion rising in the Highlands were proportioned to the anxiety, if not panic, which the Jacobites’ march towards London aroused in English people and the government. The earliest symptom of the merciless approach held by the British government against the rebels was the violence with which they fought at Culloden. The English slogan was “No quarter”, because no one who took part in the rebellion should be spared; the following quotation, excerpted from Peter and Fiona Somerset Fry’s *The History of Scotland* (1982), illustrates the English approach:

> Many hundreds of fallen were shot where they lay. Some were burned alive. Many prisoners were shot out of hands [...] Those that were not killed were pushed into gaols, many with their wives and children, there neglected to the point of death from starvation and disease. More than 1,000 were sold as slaves to American plantations. Cattle, sheep, and deer were cut down, crops ravaged and burnt [...]. Cottages, farms and houses were burnt down in every district of the Highlands.  

The measures adopted after the end of the rebellion were equally merciless. The British approach was a colonialist one, aimed at the complete eradication of Highland cultural identity. The underlying idea was that, once forced into new ways of life, eliminating feudalism and Catholicism, Highlanders would stop supporting the Stuarts. According to Robert Clyde, English and Lowland Whigs believed that the cause of the Highlanders’ warlike spirit and, therefore, of their attachment to the exiled Stuarts, flowed in their very veins. The Highlanders have Gaelic origins; they do not belong to the Anglo-Saxon ethnicity and lived in a primitive society, still informed by feudal principles and rules. Moreover, they were Catholics, another threat to the Protestant establishment.

The feature of Gaelic society the English considered the most dangerous was clan-ship; Highland people were divided into clans, each governed by a chieftain endowed with

---

23 See R. Clyde, *op. cit.*, p. 17.
certain powers. People respected their chiefs and followed them in battle when needed. At English eyes, these chiefs behaved like “feudal tyrants, each with a standing army ready to steal and murder at command”. Such a system was evidently in clear contrast with the very idea of Great Britain, representing a form of local authority slipping from the hands of the government set in London. Not only did clanship have to disappear, but also everything specifically “Highland”:

The clan chiefs were left with no powers, no pride, no purpose. The wearing of tartans and kilts, the playing of pipes, and the owning of weapons of any kind, were all forbidden on pain of death or long-term imprisonment. Even the speaking of Gaelic was prohibited. It was a systematic attempt to obliterate the Celtic mode of life, a policy followed by England also in Ireland and Wales.

Once these specific Gaelic traditions and cultural features were effaced, England wanted them to be replaced with its culture. For this purpose, schools were established in the Highlands, not only to improve literacy, but also to teach English and to eradicate Catholicism. These were the main aims of the SSPCK, the Society for Propagating Christian Knowledge. Members of the society used to travel through the Highlands with their circulating schools, teaching people basic knowledge and Protestant religious principles only in English. The use of Gaelic was strictly forbidden and this prohibition lasted until 1767, when the first Gaelic New Testament was published. The society understood that the differences in language represented an obstacle to religious teaching and decided to take advantage of Gaelic as the Highlanders’ native language, in order to better spread religious knowledge.

As to clanship, the English government tried to “break the power” of the chiefs by assimilating them “with the rest of the British aristocracy and to manage their estates more along the lines of a commercial enterprise. Only then could ‘improvement’ come to the region, and with improvement, the pacification of the Highlands". The shortcomings of imposing a modern trading system on Highland society soon became evident. Many people could live of their land anymore, because they could not be commercially competitive with the rest of Britain. Agriculture proved to be a scarcely rewarding activity for improvers, who turned farms into sheep-farms. As a consequence, tenants could no longer support themselves on agriculture and were compelled to leave the Highlands, moving either to great towns in order to get employed in factories, or to the New Continent, in search for a

---

24 R. Clyde, op. cit., p. 17.
26 R. Clyde, op. cit., p. 17.
better fortune. Improvers often welcomed emigration, deeming it “an obvious solution to the problem of overcrowding and scarcity”. In some cases, landowners refused to renovate the tenants’ leases and evicted them from their native lands; this happened more consistently between 1780 and 1855, originating a phenomenon called “Highland Clearances”. The clearances were still occurring when the novelists of the Identity and Highlands Corpus were active; nevertheless, only Christian Isobel Johnstone features the Clearances in the plot of her novel, Clan-Albin.

The whole of these changes was described by the English government and the Lowlanders who partook in it as “improvement”. The changes brought about by the English government in the Highlands reshaped local culture and identity, as well as landscape. Such measures as the forbidding of Gaelic and of the tartan were a clear attempt at destroying a culture that the English government identifies as threatening to the unity of the kingdom. The replacing of farms with sheep-farms and the creation of fishing villages reshaped Highland landscape significantly. This process lasted until about 1788, when Charles Edward Stuart died, and with him every possibility of a Stuart succeeding to the throne. However, the Acts issued after the Forty-Five to reform the Highlands were already repealed in 1782. Among them we find the Proscription Act, sanctioning the disarming of the Highlanders, the Dress Act, sanctioning severe penalties for the wearing of the tartan, such as imprisonment and transportation, and the Heritable Jurisdictions Act, depriving the chiefs of their authority over clansmen.

27 R. Clyde, op. cit., p. 31.
29 In many historical textbooks, such as Youngson’s After the Forty Five, Whittington and Whyte’s An Historical Geography of Scotland, Peter and Fiona Somerset Fry’s The History of Scotland, Robert Clyde’s From Rebel to Hero, and others, the measures adopted by the English government in Scotland are named “improvement”, a term that emphasises the discrepancy between the intended focus on modernisation and the actual function of political control. Although the great majority of improvements carried out in the Highlands follow the end of the Jacobite Risings and are at the core of the taming of the peripheries of Scotland (as remarked by Youngson), according to David Turnock the modernisation of the Highlands had already begun long before 1746: “By stressing the events of the 1745-6 as a turning point in the economic fortunes of the Highlands there is a tendency to suppose that the defeat of the Jacobites was somehow a precondition for effective modernization [...]. However, changes were occurring before 1745, and it could be argued that heavy-handed military methods of suppression, together with subsequent sanctions against Highland culture, increased hostility to the alien forces of capitalism” (D. Turnock, “The Highlands: Changing Approaches to Regional Development”, in G. Whittington, I. D. Whyte (eds), op. cit., p. 195). Turnock, also author of The Historical Geography of Scotland since 1707, is particularly attentive to the dynamics of modernisation in the Highlands and stresses the fact that the main difference between pre-Forty-Five modernising measures and post-Forty-Five improvement is that improvement was imposed from the outside, for instance in the forfeited estates that were set under the control of English or Lowland landowners (See D. Turnock, op. cit., pp. 195-6).
Scottish less-known romantic writers focused extensively on the effects of improvement on Highland life and landscape, exploring identity dynamics and highlighting the genuine essence of pre-improvement Highland culture. The union had reshaped Scotland considerably, depriving the Lowlands of the centrality and originating that feeling of identity loss that lays at the basis of the literary interest in Highland culture, seen as a possible source of identity for the whole nation.\(^\text{30}\)

The shaping of an independent cultural identity, in fact, was the main aim of national writers. Such national tales as *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, *Discipline*, and *Clan-Albin* are set in the second half of the eighteenth century, when the effects of improvement were already evident on society as well as on landscape. Hamilton, Brunton and Johnstone explore the consequences of improvement on Highland society, dealing with emigration, the Clearances and the British army. In Mary Brunton’s *Discipline*, criticism is aimed against the measures that effaced true Highland manners to a great extent:

> I was not aware of how much the innovations and oppressions of twenty years had defaced the bold peculiarities of Highland character; how, stripped of their national garb, deprived of the weapons which were at once their ornament, amusement and defence, this hardly race had bent beneath their fate, seeking safety in evasion, and power in deceit. Nor did I at all suspect how much my ignorance of their language disqualified me from observing their remaining characteristics.\(^\text{31}\)

Ellen’s final remark stresses how, in Brunton’s opinion, Gaelic continued to represent the strongest hindrance to the English understanding of Highland manners. Her view is in tune with the SSPCK decision to teach religion employing a Gaelic version of the Scriptures.

The changes brought about by improvers in the Highlands are a matter of interest for many historical writers. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, many landscape descriptions are aimed at highlighting the differences between the Highlands before and after improvement. As this issue will be thoroughly studied in Ch. VII, which is focused on landscape, I here only quote a striking passage from Felix M’Donough’s *The Highlanders. A Tale*, in which an old man, Duncan Macgregor, returns from his long exile in France. On beholding his native valley, the man finds that everything has changed:

---

\(^{30}\) In the next chapter, I will focus on the connection between this loss of identity and the “invention” of a new culture, in which the specific features of Highland and Gaelic traditions and ways of life were rescued and incorporated in a romantic image of the past, in which modern Scottish people could identify themselves.

It was the steep and shelvy mountain path no more. The rock had been cut down
and broken by the hammer, to form a safe and smooth carriage road; and the ford
of the river, at which he had so often been obliged to pause, was spanned by the
arch of a handsome bridge. [...] 
The glen was, in short, so much metamorphosed by the arts of modern
improvement, that he knew it not; and when he came to the village, he hoped to
find the same persons with whom he had sported in the light hours of childhood,
permanent in old age as himself; in this he was likewise sadly mistaken. A single
farm-house contained the whole population; the village was swept away to the
last stone, the people were in their graves, or in the wilds of America; and in the
farm-house to which he bent his steps, he found the family of a sheep farmer
from the south.³²

M’Donough is here highlighting most of the effects of the English measures on
Highland landscape. Wild nature has been domesticated through road and bridge building;
villages have been replaced with sheep-farms led by Lowlanders, while the natives have
been compelled to emigrate to America. Old Duncan’s sense of confusion at seeing his
birthplace utterly changed and the sorrow stemming from the impossibility to meet with his
family and friends are dramatically representative of what the loss of connection with one’s
roots can mean to people.

Other novelists, such George Robert Gleig, preferred to portray the immediate
effects of the English vengeful measures adopted after the battle of Culloden. When Allan
Breck comes back from his short exile in France, probably just a few years after 1746, he is
dismayed by the effects of English retaliations:

There was not a settlement belonging to the rebel clans which the sword and
flame had been permitted to pass over [...]. Detachment troops were sent abroad
with express orders to pillage and destroy; the cattle were driven off or wantonly
slaughtered; the shielings were committed to the flames; the men, insulted,
beaten, and forced to seek safety by wandering homeless among the hills,
perished of hunger, while the very women, in more than one instance, were
exposed to the grossest outrages. In a word, no species of violence which a
commission of fire and sword even in the most barbarous times was understood
to warrant, was omitted, till the very instruments of tyranny grew weary of their
office, and ceased by degrees to exercise it.³³

Gleig’s dramatic description is aimed at reporting the terribly violent approach that
the British government adopted against the rebellious clans and arousing the reader’s
sympathy with a people who suffered such a ruthless treatment. Nevertheless, in the second
volume of Allan Breck, Gleig also highlights the violent plundering made by the Jacobites
during their retreat from Derby. What emerges, in this as well as in other novels, is a concern

with war as the cause of unjustified and disproportioned violence. Although, during the early nineteenth century, wars were increasingly fought on the Continent, many novelists focused on their national history as an example of the aftermath of war on society, identity and landscape.

7. The Past, Experience and Identity

The analysis of the major historical events that involved Scotland during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, as well as the way in which romantic novelists represented them in their works, shows the importance played by Scottish history in the literature of the period. The very act of writing on Scottish history represents an act of self-identification, in which national past is turned into a source of identity. The connection between identity and past becomes evident in the individual’s inner dimension and in the construction of experience, as Yi Fu Tuan highlights in *Space and Place. The Perspective of Experience* (2001): “People look back for various reasons, but shared by all is the need to acquire a sense of self and of identity”. 34 This acquisition happens through the rescuing of the past and its becoming accessible, especially through the contemplation of objects and symbolic events. 35 According to Tuan, the need for certainty and stability lay at the very core of man’s looking to the past as a source of identity. 36 The past is something fixed and unchangeable; therefore, it represents a certain dimension which every individual is attached to and conditioned by.

The construction of national identity occurs the same way, passing through the interpretation of past decisions, events, choices and deeds. If studied from a psychological perspective, societies behave like individuals. National past is exploited as a source of identity, selecting those events and deeds considered as most symbolic by a people. This is the cause of Scottish interest in Highland history after the Union; the treatment suffered by the Highlanders was considered as a symbol of Scotland’s national fortune. Before romanticism, Gaelic culture had never been deemed as a part of Scottish national identity. This change in perspective occurred due to specific historical and cultural conditions, leading modern Scots to identify themselves with the symbol of their lost independence - the Highlands. It was there that the effects of the English dominion were more evident. Highland culture was rescued and turned into a national symbol only once it had been effaced.

34 Y. F. Tuan, *Space and Place*, cit., p. 186.
36 Ibidem, p. 197.
Therefore, what modern Scots revered as Highland culture was a romantic reconstruction, deeply affected by late-eighteenth-century ideas such as the myth of the good savage and the taste for the sublime and the picturesque.
CHAPTER V

Cultural Invention and Identity in Scotland

1. Introduction

The construction of national identity is a cultural operation that can be fully understood only by focusing on cultural mechanisms. At their core, all feelings of national belonging are human constructs, developed by societies around certain symbols. The choice of the most representative symbols of a nation is a cultural operation, very much alike the choice that each individual makes of the events and experiences that partook in the shaping of his/her present self. Therefore, national identity, like the image that everyone has of him/herself, is a construction. Anthropologists call this process the “invention of culture”; the term was initially limited to ethnographic and anthropological studies, but it was later transferred to cultural, historical and literary studies, as the title of two most important books about Scotland witness: Hugh Trevor Roper’s The Invention of Scotland and Murray G. H. Pittock’s The Invention of Scotland. The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present.¹

2. Literary Nationalism

Since all the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are characterised by an explicit endeavour to create and shape national identity, they can be considered as truly “literary nationalist”. According to The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Romanticism, the national tale is an “example of what is often referred to as conservative romanticism”, because it:

¹ The Invention of Culture is also the title of one of the most important works about anthropology. The book was written by Roy Wagner in 1975 and focuses on the relationship between culture and the “invention” of the self and of society. In this dissertation, I deal with novelists who actively partook in the invention of Scotland, highlighting the power of literature when employed as an instrument of cultural construction. Ann Rigney highlights that not only can fiction tell some stories about the past, but it can make history more appealing to readers: “[...] there is already evidence to show that “inauthentic” versions of the past may end up with more cultural staying power than the work of less skilled narrators or of more disciplined ones who stay faithful to what their personal memories or the archive allow them to say” (See A. Rigney, “The Dynamic of Remembrance: Texts Between Monumentality and Morphing”, in E. Erl, A. Nünning (eds), op. cit., pp. 345-353, pp. 347-8). Rigney’s remark is crucial to understand the success of the historical novel and its cultural function; compared to a history book full of facts and dates, a historical novel enacts a story that, despite its fictive nature, is more interesting and, therefore, more memorable. It is not by chance that a writer like Scott, so interested in national issues, decided to deal with a period of transition, the 1745 Jacobite Rising, which he considered as more interesting than either a distant past or the present.
[e]mphasises the communal over the more individualist, rebellious Byronic strand [...] [and] stresses national as opposed to classical origins: its focus turns to ancient myths and legends – Ossian, William Wallace, for example – as the essential cultural roots that should not only be conserved but cultivated in language, art and in accounts of history.²

This definition can be attached to the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus; because they are all more concerned with the community than with individualism, focusing on Scottish history as a repository of collective identity. The titles of most novels published before Waverley reveal their authors’ interest in dealing with communities and groups of people; these novels are called after either places (Glencore Tower, The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of the Carron, The Romance of the Highlands, Vale of the Clyde, Strathmjay) or groups of people (The Cottagers of Glenburnie, The Scottish Chiefs). Waverley, instead, is named after an individual, young Edward Waverley; even though the adventures narrated are connected with Scottish history, the focus remains on the protagonist. This novelty was welcomed by some novelists active after the issuing of Waverley (Reft Rob, The Highlander, Lochiel, A Legend of Argyle, Highland Mary, Lochandhu, Macrimmon, Allan Breck), but many continued to call their novels with collective names (The Scottish Orphans, The Highlanders, The Black Watch) or with place-names (Glenfergus, Bannockburn).

The interest in the collective history of Scotland emerges as a significant issue in the Identity and Highlands Corpus. The desire to rescue not only official history, but also ancient myths and stories, turning them into the material for nationalist novel writing, has been called by Katie Trumpener “bardic nationalism”. The term stems from the fact that, in Celtic communities living in the peripheries of Great Britain, the bard represented the storyteller, the man charged with preserving knowledge and transmitting it to the next generation.

The bard is the embodiment of an independent culture, definitely different from the English one: “Each group uses the bard to express its very different yearnings for

² A. Monnickendam, op. cit., p. 100. The category of “conservative romanticism” is generally employed for philosophers and politicians (as Schelling, Disraeli, Edmund Burke, Thomas Malthus), who opposed the French Revolution and industrialisation: “Conservative romanticism aims not to re-establish a lost past but to maintain the traditional state of society (and of government) to the extent that it has managed to persist from late-eighteenth-century Europe into the second half of the nineteenth century; it seeks to restore the status quo that had obtained before the French Revolution” (“Conservative Romanticism”, in M. Löwy, R. Sayre (eds), Romanticism against the Tide of Modernity, C. Porter (transl.), Durham/London: Duke UP, 2001, pp. 63-5, p. 63). Scottish cultural nationalism can be considered as a specific variant of conservative romanticism in which the French Revolution plays a minor part, and in which, instead, the conservation of traditional Scottish manners, myths and culture is privileged. The nationalist writers of the novels here discussed are not so much interested in European politics, than they are in national culture. Improvement and the introduction of new economic systems (such as the sheep farms in the Highlands) are considered, by many novelists, as the dividing line between the traditional Scottish past and a present deeply affected by the English influence.
independence and for lost feudal unity – and each located the bard at a different moment of cultural and literary crisis”. From a nationalist perspective, the bard gives vent to people’s desire to save their own regional identity from the centralising tendency of the modern world, in which the centre (London) gains more and more power over the periphery (internal and external colonies). In Scotland, the bard par excellence is Ossian, but a likewise function is performed by the narrators of many late-eighteenth-century and early-nineteenth-century novels. As a consequence, the idea of bardic nationalism should be extended to literary nationalism, in order to include also works in which, although the figure of the bard is not present, his function is fulfilled by other means.

In society, the bard was charged with preserving knowledge and cultural memory; his stories were aimed at remembering the past and at shaping present identity. In early-nineteenth-century Scottish society, the function of the bard was fulfilled by nationalist writers, that is to say, by those novelists and poets whose main aim was to recall past events and highlight their potential as symbols of modern identity. In this context, “nationalism” is a current of thought set in dialectical opposition to colonialism, because while colonialism tends to centralise power in the core state, nationalism tries to restore the independence of peripheral areas, by highlighting their cultural and traditional differences from the core state.

Scottish literary nationalism is above all cultural and emerges in response to “Enlightenment programs for economic transformation and to Enlightenment theories of historical periodization and historical progress”. In Scotland, the rejection of the idea of history as a linear progress towards improvement is symbolised by the criticism against improvement. While many improvers came from England, others where native Scotsmen believing in the necessity to modernise the Highlands. This conviction is deeply rooted in the eighteenth-century stadial theory developed by the philosophers of the Scottish Enlightenment. In “The Four Stages Theory”, Johnson K. Wright points to Adam Ferguson

---

3 K. Trumpener, Bardic Nationalism, cit., p. 7.
4 In Writing and Orality. Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth-century Scottish Fiction, Penny Fielding focuses on the way in which orality and written literature were considered by people in Scotland during the nineteenth century. About the figure of the bard, Fielding writes: “Bards, supposedly the bearers of primitive orality, were not in fact the primary voice of nature, but embodied the desire of most eighteenth-century poets to be publicly acclaimed and materially supported” (P. Fielding, Writing and Orality. Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth-century Scottish Fiction, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996, p. 10). Fielding’s remark seems to hint to the way in which eighteenth-century poets such as James Macpherson exploited the figure of the bard, in order to gain more attention among other poets. More than the reproduction of a real ancient bard, Ossian is a character embodying the spreading interest in local traditions and manners.
5 K. Trumpener, Bardic Nationalism, cit., p. 23.
and Adam Smith as the founders of this theory, explaining that, according to this theory, “‘modes of subsistence’ evolved from a hunter-gatherer society, to pastoral, agricultural and commercial successors”, and synthesising it as a shift “from ‘savagery’ to ‘barbarism’ to ‘civilisation’”.  

Improvers believed that while the English and Lowland societies were at the last stage of progress, having developed a system founded upon trading and industry, the Highlanders were stuck at a lower level of development. Therefore, their efforts were aimed at modernising the Highlands, eradicating feudalism and all the structures connected with it. While agreeing with the improvers about the necessity to eradicate outdated habits connected with feudalism, romantic nationalists disagreed with the violent enforcement of changes upon the Highland society.  

For Scottish nationalist writers, the Highlands represented the more blatant example of the imposition of progress on less developed societies, highlighting the cultural shortcomings connected with modernity. They believed that improvement and progress are good, but only when they do not entail the effacement of traditions and manners that, however obsolete, constitute the very identity of a people. The following quotation from Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* exemplifies this perspective, by describing the good improving measures adopted by the Grahams at Glen Eredine:  

> They were minute and practicable, rather than magnificent. No whole communities were hurried into civilisation, nor districts depopulated by way of improvement; but some encouragement was to be given to the Schoolmaster; Bibles were to be distributed to his best scholars; or Henry would account to his father for the rent of a tenant who, with his own hands, had reclaimed a field from rock and broom.  

Henry Graham’s approach towards improvement is a moderate and sensible one, aimed at small changes made through the reward of efforts and not the forcing of a new system over the old one. Positive improvement is brought about by the inhabitants of the

---

7 In the Identity and Highlands Corpus some novelists criticise outdated feudal habits: David Carey, Elizabeth Hamilton, Honoria Scott. Nevertheless, all the authors of the novels gathered in the canon here discussed show deep sympathy towards the Highlanders and understand the shortcomings of improvement. In *After the Forty-Five*, Youngson explains that the “standard of living in the Highlands […] was even falling” during the 1750s and 1760s, when improvement measures were being applied (A.J. Youngson, *op. cit.*, p. 40). He also stresses that, despite the optimistic halo of the term, improvement is not necessarily welcomed as a change for the best: “It is always a mistake to suppose that those changes will be universally welcomed which some people term improvement. The work of the improvers threatened the influence of some and the security of others; this was obvious where tenures were at stake. But nothing is neutral in a conflict between a commercial and a feudal society” (*ibidem*, p. 41).  
periphery, while the imposition of progress from the outside, with its total disregard of local specificity and culture, is condemned.

Literary nationalism arose as an important phenomenon during the second half of the eighteenth century; thanks to the success reaped by James Macpherson’s songs of Ossian, Highland culture was rescued from the oblivion to which the English improvers were condemning it.⁹ According to Kenneth McNeil, Macpherson’s forged translations are part of a tradition of cultural nationalism:

This cultural – as opposed to political – nationalism, however, often staked its position on artefacts like Macpherson’s translations precisely because its supporters had forsaken the assertion of Scottish autonomy in other areas of public life.¹⁰

Literary nationalism is more cultural than political, and consists not just in the antiquarian recovery of past manners and traditions, but also in a cultural operation, through which certain Gaelic features were chosen to become representative of Scottish identity, while others were discarded. Most strikingly, while the first writer to recover Highland culture and to endow it with national value – James Macpherson – was a Highlander, the majority of early-nineteenth-century writers involved in nationalist writing came from the Lowlands. Therefore, their approach to Highland culture was from outside; they did not know how the Highlanders did really live before the Forty-Five, because they were no members of their society. Imagination filled the gaps created by the lack of direct experience and produced a new version of Highland culture that was deeply affected by contemporary cultural, political and aesthetic ideals.

3. Intangible Cultural Heritage and Cultural Memory

The focus of literary nationalism was the creation of a cultural and national identity as different as possible from English culture. In order to realise their aim, Scottish nationalist writers focused on Highland culture as a source of non-English identity. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus this interest for Scottish Northern mountains is evident; not only is Highland landscape significantly present, but the character, manners and habits of the Highlanders are oftentimes described. One of the possible motives at the basis of the increasing interest in the Highlands as a source of national identity can be that, due to their long-lasting isolation from England and the Lowlands, the Highlands were considered as the place where ancient Scottish manners and ways of life survived uncontaminated by English

---

culture for a longer time. Consequently, national writers attempted to rescue some features of Highland culture, turning them into a part of Scottish specific identity.

The desire to define Scottish modern identity is particularly evident in the national tale, a genre that aimed at highlighting national manners, habits and characters, as its name suggests. The national tale exemplifies how, according to national writers, after the union Scotland needed to abridge internal cultural difference and to create a new, united identity. The internal division between Highlands and Lowlands lost importance, as the plot of some national novels narrate. For instance, in Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde*, Highland and Lowland culture are united in the person of Flora Hamilton, whose character and manners sum up all the best qualities and virtues expected in a modern Scotswoman.

Noteworthy, Scottish modern culture is a compound of two different cultures that have been separate for centuries. When the Lowlands ceased to be at the core of the Scottish nation (the royal capital was in the Lowlands) and became a peripheral area, they joined in the Highlands’ peripheral predicament and became just a region in a wider kingdom. Nationalist writers partook in the creation of a united identity, in which every Scotsman and Scotswoman could feel as a member of a nation that, although politically deprived of its independence, still asserted its specific cultural identity.

The endeavour to rescue some features of old Highland culture from oblivion and to turn them into a part of Scottish modern identity can be seen as a form of cultural preservation. In “Canon and Archive”, Aleida Assman calls this act “active remembering”, because it consists in an active operation: the collection of selected pieces of cultural

11 Highlands and Lowlands are ideally divided by an imaginary line, called “Highland Line”, that follows the Grampians and marks not only a geographical divide (plains and mountains) but also cultural one. According to Margaret Connell Szasz, the Highland line performs a cultural function, because it divides two distinct societies (the Gaels from the Scots); therefore, it may be compared to the Border in the United States (M. Connell Szasz, *Scottish Highlanders and Native Americans: Indigenous Education in the Eighteenth Century Atlantic World*, University of Oklahoma Press, 2007). Connell Szasz provides an analysis of the origins and role of the Highland line and claims that the origins of this division date back to the period “between the late fourteenth and sixteenth centuries” (*Ibidem*, p. 43). According to Alexander Welsh, the Highland line is at the core of many among Scott’s novels, in particular in *Rob Roy* (A. Welsh, *op. cit.*, p. 56). In the introduction to this novel, Scott explicitly mentions the Highland line: “It is this strong contrast betwixt the civilized and cultivated mode of life on the one side of the Highland line, and the wild and lawless adventures which were habitually undertaken and achieved by one who dwelt on the opposite side of the boundary, which creates the interest attached to his name” (W. Scott, “Author’s Introduction”, in *Rob Roy*, London: Everyman’s Library, 1962, p. 385). Scott considers the Highland line as a boundary region, where Rob Roy gained importance because he lived beyond the rules of the Lowlands. The differences between the social and economic systems of the Highlands and the Lowlands that are at the core of this novel are explored by Ian D. Whyte in “Lowland Rural Society c1500-c1750” (pp. 150-164) and “Highland Society and Economy c1500-c1750” (pp. 251-271), in I.D. Whyte, *Scotland Before the Industrial Revolution. An Economical and Social History c1050-c1750*, New York: Routledge, 1995.
Noteworthy, these writers attempted to create a “canon” of Scottish cultural identity, i.e. a collection of national features, such as manners, character, habits, ways of life, traditions, historical events, etc., aimed at defining Scottishness. This endeavour can be considered as an early manifestation of what is nowadays called the preservation of intangible cultural heritage. Like modern organisations such as the UNESCO, national writers focused on the culture of a people whose habits, manners and character either had already disappeared or were on the verge to do it.

The definition of intangible cultural heritage was at the core of a convention gathered in 2003 by the UNESCO. In an article about the convention, Richard Kurin provides a clear definition of the concept as “the culture that people practice as part of their daily lives” and sets it into contrast with “tangible objects of culture” such as monuments, or paintings, books or artefacts”. 13

If the ways of life, manners and habits of the Highlanders rediscovered by national writers belonged to Highland intangible cultural heritage, the act of portraying them in novels entails their transformation into a form of tangible culture. National writers chose to preserve only some among the features of Highland culture, that is to say, only those aspects that they considered as most representative of specific Scottish identity.

Like monuments and artefacts, novels belong to the tangible cultural heritage of a people. According to Jan Assman, societies have some institutions aimed at the preservation of tangible cultural heritage, such as libraries, archives and museums. Such institutions existed for centuries and worked to gather people’s knowledge and to preserve it. The tangible products of a society are generally considered as products of its culture and, therefore, as something worthy of being preserved and transmitted to the next generation.

These institutions actively partake in the construction of national culture and identity. Nevertheless, the knowledge they record and preserve is not the whole of a people’s culture, but a select choice of features that a group of people consider as worthy of being preserved. Assman calls the product of this selective operation “cultural memory” and highlights how “mnemonic institutions” such as museums, archives and libraries are the

12 A. Assman, “Canon and Archive”, in E. Erll, A. Nüning (eds), op. cit., pp. 97-108, pp. 98-9. Aleida Assman claims that forgetting and remembering, the two operations at the core of cultural memory, can be both passive and active. Passive forgetting consists in losing information out of neglect or disregard, while active forgetting coincides with willing acts of destruction (such as the damnatio memoriae); active remembering consists in collecting and selecting cultural information and creating a “canon”, while passive remembering is a form of unselective accumulation, i.e. an “archive”.

means through which a group of people create their own memory. In other words, mnemonic institutions are aimed at reminding a community about their culture and identity through the preservation of certain objects.

Assman’s cultural memory is a most important concept, because it establishes a connection between culture and memory, highlighting the role played by experience and heritage in the development of national identity. The collective memory of a nation can be considered as a sum of its people’s experiences. In the individual, memory is the faculty that, according to Assman, makes the “synthesis of time and identity”. In fact, memory is aimed at the management of one’s experience of the world, playing a major role in the construction of the individual’s identity both as an individual and as a “member of a family, a generation, a community, a nation, or a cultural and religious tradition”.

On the collective level, memory gathers the experiences of the members of a group of people. Collective memory keeps the individual and the community connected with one another, creating a complex system of interactions. As a consequence, any change occurring on one level of identity can affect the others. From an historical viewpoint, the theory of collective memory provides some explanation to the influence exerted by major historical changes on the identity of people on more levels.

Noteworthy, one of the aims of the historical novel as Walter Scott formulated it is to portray the impact of history on common people’s everyday lives and on the construction of their identity as individuals as well as members of a nation. Major events such as wars,
revolutions, scientific and technical innovations, do impact considerably on people’s lives, affecting their identity. The union between England and Scotland, for instance, redefined Scottish people’s national identity; no longer the citizens of an independent nation, with its own institutions and culture, the Scots had to adopt a new identity and accept being British subjects.

The union entailed a sense of loss of identity for both Lowlanders and Highlanders. On the Highlands, the loss was more consistent, due to the repressive measures adopted by the English government. Because of this loss, some Scots adopted English culture as their own, while others, such as the national writers, attempted to create themselves a new identity.

4. The Intangible Made Tangible: National Writers and the Novel

The Scottish national writers’ attention was focused Highland culture as they imagined it must have been before the Union. Before the Jacobite Risings and the repressive measures adopted by the English government, Highland society was organised in a primitive system founded upon hunting, while agriculture and trading were scarcely developed. Knowledge was transmitted orally from a generation to the next and there was no written literature. Such a social organisation can be called an “ethnicity”. This concept is well explained by Adrian Hastings in *The Construction of Nationhood. Ethnicity, Religion and Nationalism* (1997). In this work, Hastings focuses on the elements that partake in the shaping of a nation and of its identity. According to Hastings, cultural and national identity are connected with one another in a close relationship that represents the very basis of the nation. The connection between culture and identity is, in fact, at the core of society in each of the three levels of development pointed out by Hastings: the ethnicity, the nation and the nation-state.

The ethnicity is a “group of people with a shared cultural identity and spoken language. It constitutes the major distinguishing element in all pre-national societies, but may survive as a strong subdivision with a loyalty of its own within established nations”. Nation is an evolution of the ethnicity and represents a more self-conscious state of identity;

past which are taught, embraced, and referred to as their collective autobiography [...] To participate in a national memory is to known the key events of the nation’s history, to embrace its symbols, and connect to its festive dates” (A. Assman, op. cit., p. 101).


20 Ibidem, p. 3.
a nation has its own literature, traditions, established territories and borders. The nation-state is a further development of the nation, in which there is an identity of character between the state and the people.

Hastings’ definition of ethnicity is in tune with the predicament of Highland society before improvement. Highlanders distinguished themselves from the Scots due to their different intangible cultural heritage and their language. Moreover, they survived as a separate group inside the Scottish nation for centuries. Despite being geographically a part of Scotland, the Highlanders retained their traditions and language uncontaminated from Scottish and English manners until the eighteenth century. Moreover, the Highlanders had loyalties of their own, because they were organised in a clan-system according to which people obeyed their chief.

As an ethnicity, the Highland people had no written literature; in fact, Macpherson’s poems and songs are the first works published by a Highlander and were issued after the Jacobite Risings and the improvement of the Highlands. In other words, Highland culture relied upon intangible cultural heritage. When national writers decided to turn some features of old Highland culture into a part of Scottish modern culture, they made an endeavour to rescue and preserve the Highland intangible heritage that had been consistently eradicated by the English government.

National writers managed to record something that was intangible into a tangible form: the novel. The Identity and Highlands Corpus provides significant instances of this cultural endeavour and of its results. In fact, most of the novels here discussed feature interesting representations of Highland culture. The aspects that are most emphasised by national writers are people’s character and manners. Rather interestingly, the environment in which people lived is also consistently portrayed in the form of landscape views and elements.

Highland character and manners are mostly explored in national tales, but they play an important role in Gothic and historical novels as well, affecting the characterisation of heroes and heroines. As other tangible expressions of culture, literature is a highly codified means of communication, with its rules and conventions. Therefore, when intangible features are recorded into literature, they necessarily become stereotypical. From a semiotic viewpoint, literature is, like culture, a “system of signs”. According to Lotman and Uspezký, culture is an artificial product and represents the collective memory of human experience; as

21 J. Lotman, B.A. Uspezký, G. Mihaychuk, op. cit., p. 211.
such, culture is the result of a process of “selection of memorizable facts” that depends upon the “semiotic norms of the given culture”. Culture is the product of a selection of historical facts, considered most representative of a people’s experience of the world; it is the product of a deliberate act of remembering and forgetting.

The theory of culture as a set of symbols allows the establishment of a most interesting parallel between culture and literature, as literature too consists in a codification of the world. Consequently, the Identity and Highlands Corpus can be considered as a source of poignant instances of the way in which old Highland culture was codified not only in literature, but also in modern Scottish society.

The figure of the bard, so crucial in Trumpener’s analysis of Scottish, Irish and Welsh literatures, is a perfect example of the process by which culture is recorded and codified by both oral and written means. Ancient bards transmitted the knowledge of a generation to the next, choosing to teach them only about those events, people, manners and life-ways that they considered the most representative of their society. By such a selection, the bards decided what was worthy of being transmitted as their intangible cultural heritage. Likewise, eighteenth-century writers such as James Macpherson made a selection of the events, characters, and landscape features that, in their opinion, best represented Highland culture. In the early nineteenth century, the role of the bard was fulfilled by the national writers; they performed a further step, choosing some of the Highland features immortalised by Macpherson and turning them into a part of modern Scottish identity.

23 The relationship between the artificial nature of culture and the construction of national identity has been noted by Rien T. Segers, “The Underestimated Strength of Cultural Identity between Localising and Globalising Tendencies in the European Nation”, in J. Kupianen, E. Sevanen, John A. Stotesbury (eds), Cultural Identity in Transition: Contemporary Conditions, Practises and Politics of a Global Phenomenon, Delhi, Atlantic Publishers, 2004, pp. 64-93. Segers opens his 2004 paper by giving an account of the two main theories of culture existing in ethnographic studies today. The first is the systemic theory, according to which culture is “a system consisting of a number of subsystems, such as economic, educational, religious, technological and artistic” subsystems, each of them “based on all activities as performed by the participants in that system” (Ibidem, pp. 65-6). This theory deals with culture as a pragmatic reality, characterised by a set of activities proper of a certain group of people; it is focused on their actions.

The second theory sees culture as a construct; in it, attention is focused on the representation of certain features and activities made from an outsider’s or an insider’s perspective. A cultural construct is, in fact, the product of the dynamic interaction among three main elements:

1. “the statistics concerning that nation or group at a given time in history” (number of inhabitants, geographical information, etc.);
2. “the programming of the mind within a particular community on the basis of which cultural identity by the in-group is being constructed” (self-representation);
3. “the way in which people from outside conduct a process of selection, interpretation and evaluation concerning the specificity of the in-group” (representation from the outside, ethnographic approach) (Ibidem, p. 75).
5. The Invention of Scotland: Highland Warriors and Virtuous Heroines

The cultural endeavour to create modern Scottish identity was called by some critics “the invention of Scotland”. In the 1970s, when Roper began writing his *The Invention of Scotland*, the idea that Scottish national identity was the product of a cultural operation was beginning to spread. Roper claims that Scottish identity has always been the product of some act of invention, and points to three main levels on which the cultural and national invention of Scotland took place: the political, the literary and the sartorial. Each of these levels partook in the creation of an image of Scotland that, instead of being rooted in real facts and events, is mythical and artificial.

The political myth mentioned by Roper refers to the invention of Scottish ancient history. Instead of acknowledging that Scotland was founded by a Gaelic people, the Scots, who came over from Ireland in the fifth century, some Scots invented the legend that the Scots were an ancient biblical people, who left Egypt and reached Scotland passing through Spain and Ireland.

While the political myth was created during the middle ages, the literary and the sartorial myths were invented during the eighteenth century. The father of the literary myth, according to Roper, is James Macpherson – he changed the image of the Highlanders in the Scottish imagery from an isolated people, despised by the Lowlanders for their life-ways and barbarism, into a proud people of brave warriors and virtuous women. This myth is largely present in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, where culture is codified through a set of stereotypical features affecting the representation of the Highlanders from their character to the environment they live in.

Highland character is the aspect that is more widely portrayed in the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, where Highland heroes are represented as honest, kind,

---

24 This phrase is the title of two interesting studies about Scottish culture: Hugh Trevor Roper’s *The Invention of Scotland* and Murray G. H. Pittock’s *The Invention of Scotland. The Stuart Myth the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present*. 
generous, hospitable, brave and skilful in battle and Highland heroines as virtuous, delicate, kind, patient and faithful.

The following table provides a list of the heroes and heroines of the novels here discussed, highlighting their birthplace, their social rank and their profession or occupation.

Figure 1. Heroes and heroines of the Corpus sorted by gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heroes and heroines discussed</th>
<th>Novels with a male hero</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Novel</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Hero</th>
<th>Birthplace</th>
<th>Social class</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Novel</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Heroine</th>
<th>Birthplace</th>
<th>Social class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1805</td>
<td>Monteith</td>
<td>Gothic</td>
<td>Donald Monteith</td>
<td>Island in Northern Scotland</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Defeats the villain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1810</td>
<td>The Scottish Chiefs</td>
<td>National Tale</td>
<td>William Wallace</td>
<td>Highlands</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>warrior</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1810</td>
<td>The Romance of the Highlands</td>
<td>Gothic</td>
<td>Kenneth</td>
<td>Highlands (Grampians)</td>
<td>Low &gt; High</td>
<td>(adopted by cottagers)</td>
<td>Peasant, Warrior</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1813</td>
<td>Strathmay</td>
<td>National Tale</td>
<td>Alfred Douglas</td>
<td>Northern Scotland (Caithness) (raised abroad)</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Traveller, Good society</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1817</td>
<td>Conirdan</td>
<td>Moral Tale</td>
<td>Conirdan / Mr. Mac Lindhal / Charles Robertson</td>
<td>Highlands (Glencoe) (raised on the Isle of St Kilda)</td>
<td>Low &gt; Middle</td>
<td>Traveller, Student</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1819</td>
<td>The Highlander</td>
<td>Historical /Moral Tale</td>
<td>Johnnie Baillie</td>
<td>Highland line</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Outsider</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1820</td>
<td>Lochiel</td>
<td>Historical /Gothic</td>
<td>Evan / Evan Cameron</td>
<td>Highlands (raised in Italy)</td>
<td>Low&gt; High</td>
<td>soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1821</td>
<td>A Legend of Argyle</td>
<td>Historical /Gothic</td>
<td>General Gordon / Alexander Gordon of Haddo</td>
<td>Highlands (raised in France)</td>
<td>Low &gt; High</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1822</td>
<td>The Scottish Chiefs and Arthur Monteith</td>
<td>Historical /Moral Tales</td>
<td>Arthur Monteith</td>
<td>Highland line (raised in the Lowlands)</td>
<td>Low &gt; High</td>
<td>Student, Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1823</td>
<td>Macrimmon</td>
<td>Historical Novel</td>
<td>Charley Clifford / Charles Macrimmon</td>
<td>Lowlands (Highland father, English mother)</td>
<td>Low &gt; High</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1825</td>
<td>Lochandhu</td>
<td>Historical Novel</td>
<td>Amherst Oakenwold</td>
<td>England (Kent)</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Traveller</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1832</td>
<td>The Doomed One</td>
<td>Historical Novel</td>
<td>Ewan Macdonald</td>
<td>Highlands (Glencoe)</td>
<td>High&gt; Low</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1834</td>
<td>The Black Watch</td>
<td>Historical Novel</td>
<td>Hector Munro / Hector Lamont</td>
<td>Northern Scotland</td>
<td>Low &gt; Middle</td>
<td>Traveller, Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1834</td>
<td>Allan Breck</td>
<td>Moral Novel</td>
<td>Allan Breck / Macdiarmid</td>
<td>Western Highlands</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Outsider, soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novels with Male + Female heroes</td>
<td></td>
<td>1806</td>
<td>Glencore Tower</td>
<td>Gothic</td>
<td>Duncan</td>
<td>Highlands</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|                                |                         | 1809 | The Towers | Gothic | Donaldbert / Marion Dunrae | Highlands | High | Heroine in distress | Traveller, Student,
Most male heroes are warriors, soldiers or travellers; heroines, instead, are compelled to endure hardships and to escape from libertines. Possibly, the most representative instance of the Scottish hero is Jane Porter’s William Wallace, the protagonist of *The Scottish Chiefs*. Not only is Wallace a great hero in Scottish history and a symbol of national independence and courage, but he is also endowed with the virtues and qualities expected by national writers in modern Scots: he is generous, brave, willing to sacrifice for his people and nation’s sake, unable to either perpetrate or stand injustices. Despite his powerful desire to avenge his wife’s death, Wallace is portrayed as a rational person; his strong emotions are justified by the injustices he suffered and do not impair his presence of mind, as his organising and fighting skills prove. An example of stereotypical Highland heroine is provided in Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary*, a novel completely focused on

---

25 Although some writers of the period (such as Henry Siddons, the author of *William Wallace; or, The Highland Hero*), portrayed Wallace as a Highland hero, actually, he was a Lowlander. Wallace was born in Elderslie (the Ellerslie of Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs*), a village in the western Lowlands. Despite being a Lowlander, Wallace led many Highlanders in the War of Scottish independence; he was brave and honest, and became a great national symbol in Scotland. In *The Scottish Chiefs*, Wallace is endowed with all the features attached to Highland heroes in the Identity and Highlands Corpus and was one of the first literary examples of that set of virtues and qualities that were attached to Highlanders in the Identity and Highlands Corpus.
Mary Macdonald’s character. Mary’s generosity, kindness, chastity, courage and endurance of hardships characterise her as a symbol of Highland virtue.

The heroes and heroines of the majority of the novels here discussed resemble William Wallace and Mary Macdonald. These characters are the product of a cultural operation and conform to contemporary myths about the Highlands and their inhabitants, such as the myth of the Highland warrior, created at the times of the Wars of Scottish Independence and reinforced by the songs of Ossian. The emphasis laid by national writers on the Highlanders as good warriors is also a symptom of their desire to extol the role played by the Highlanders in Scottish history, from the times of William Wallace, when they fought against the invader, to the early nineteenth century, when they joined the British army and fought against Napoleon. Charly Clifford and Charles Grant are the evolution of William Wallace; although they fight side by side with English soldiers, rather than against them, they continue in the fighting tradition of their forefathers.

Not all nationalist novelists represented the Highlanders under such a favourable light. In such novels as The Cottagers of Glenburnie and Lochandhu, Highlanders are not portrayed as great heroes; nevertheless, their image is not a definitely negative one, because they are endowed with certain good qualities compensating for their faults. The core difference between these novels, which are few in number, and the great majority of the ones discussed in this dissertation, is that the Highlanders are not portrayed as a people of heroes and heroines, but as a people of good and bad people, of heroes and criminals.

In Elisabeth Hamilton’s The Cottagers of Glenburnie, the inhabitants of the small village of Glenburnie are criticised for being dirty, idle and disorganised but, at the same time, they are appreciated for their kindness and hospitality, as well as for their desire to learn from Mrs Mason’s teachings. Like the inhabitants of Glenburnie, the Highland hostess met by Ellen Percy in Perth embodies dirtiness and carelessness:

26 While most novelists of the Identity and Highlands Corpus adhered to the myth of the good savage and decided to portray the Highlanders under a favourable light, others adopted the improvers’ perspective, rejecting the application of this myth to the inhabitants of the Highlands. However, most of the writers here discussed were born in the Lowlands and, therefore, considered the Highlanders as a stranger people. The contrast between two major perspectives on savages are explored by R.L. Meek in his Social Science and the Ignoble Savage (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1976). Meek claims that while “It is well known that contemporary notions of savagery influenced eighteenth-century social science by generating as critique of society through the idea of the noble savage. It is not quite so well known [...] that they also stimulated the emergence of a new theory of the development of society through the idea of the ignoble savage” (Ibidem, pp. 2-3). These two perspectives emerge in the Identity and Highlands Corpus: while the myth of the noble savage is at the root of the Highland Myth, some novelists (such as David Carey and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder) were more prone to consider pre-improvement Highlanders as ignoble savages.
The good woman, however, who was doing the honours, rectified the disorder seemingly to her own satisfaction, by taking up the corner of her apron, and sweeping the rubbish from the table to the floor. 27

In spite of this apology, however, I was so thoroughly disgusted, that I heard with great joy the trampling of our horses at the door. 28

In *Discipline*, Highland manners are not only disgusting to Ellen, but also “savage”, as her remark about the Highland costume shows:

I was prepared to expect the savage nakedness of legs and feet, which was universal among these little barbarians. 29

Despite this scarcely favourable impressions, Ellen Percy learns to appreciate the Highlanders and to consider their virtues and qualities as more important than what, from her English perspective, are faults. In Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*, Highlanders and their life-ways are embodied in Lochandhu’s family. In this novel, criminality dominates life on the Highlands: Lochandhu is a cattle-lifter, while his brother is a rogue, a robber, a kidnapper and a murderer. Nevertheless, Lochandhu is a honourable and grateful man, who helps and protects Amherst Oakenwold in reward for Amherst’s father having saved his life when he was young.

Unlike in the great majority of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, in *Lochandhu* the Highlands do not represent a source of identity; instead, they are only a place for adventure to happen, a lawless region where the protagonist learns how to behave in the world. It is on the Highlands that Amherst saves his lover’s life and learns about her true identity. Moreover, no character discovers his origins there, as it happens, for instance, in *A Legend of Argyle* or in *Lochiel*. Nevertheless, the adventures experienced by Amherst on the Highlands helps his inner growth and partake in the development of the origins and heritage plot in which Eliza Malcolm is involved.

Criminality characterises another Highland character, the hero of George Robert Gleig’s *Allan Breck*. Allan’s bent to vicious behaviours, gambling and indulging in unleashed passions leads him to commit various immoral actions and crimes. Despite Allan’s despicable temperament, other Highlanders are honest, virtuous and honourable, such as Allan’s father, his cousin and Parson Neil Macpherson.

---

28 *Ibidem*, p. 204.
CHAPTER VI

The Literary Myth

1. Introduction

In Chapter V, I focused on Roper’s *The Invention of Scotland* and on his idea of the “literary myth” as the product of an act of cultural invention that, on its turn, influenced successive literature, in particular that concerned with nationalism. In this chapter, I provide an analysis of this literary myth, highlighting the way in which it contributed to change the image of the Highlands and of the Highlanders. The change was above all evident in literary representations of the Gaels produced during the second half of the eighteenth century. James Macpherson is the key figure, but other writers partook in the reshaping of the Highland image; here, I focus on James Beattie, Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott. I will also provide some quotations from the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, stressing the influence exerted by major literary works on Scottish minor authors.

2. The Re-evaluation of the Highlands

The image of the Highlands in literature underwent significant changes during pre-romanticism, when Gaelic culture, history and landscape began to be exploited in poetry. In *From Rebel to Hero*, Robert Clyde focuses on this process of romantic rehabilitation, highlighting how the Highlanders were turned a group of bandits, Jacobite rebels and indolent Celts, into a brave and heroic people, endowed with many of the virtues that, according to the romantics, were rapidly disappearing, due to the spreading of modern social system founded upon trading, money-making and self-interest.¹

It has been pointed out that the romanticisation of the Highlands happened according to two main patterns, the one based on substitution and the other on coexistence.² Substitution entails an utter change, in which the contempt for Highland ways of life is completely wiped out by romanticised representations; coexistence, instead, represents a partial change, in which old views and outlooks survive alongside with new systems of thought. These models are both present in Scottish romantic literature, the first being embodied in James Macpherson’s works and poems, the latter in most early-

¹ R. Clyde, *op. cit.*, 1998.
nineteenth-century novels. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, dislike and diffidence for the Highlanders – due to their feudal system and their Jacobite allegiance – find place in the characterisation of Highland villains. The most representative instance is probably the Earl of Ronay, in A Legend of Argyle. Ronay is endowed with the worst features that a feudal lord can possess, as his planned punishment to the people of Haddo for their disobedience well exemplifies:

> These refractory slaves, who care not for the glory of their liege and chief, shall at least be taught to dread his displeasure. King James once places on the throne, and my hands at liberty, every cot, that owned the sway of Haddo, shall blaze to celebrate the glorious event.\(^3\)

Ronay’s portrait is that of a cruel lord, vengeful, violent and greedy. David Carey spared no faults in describing this character, turning him into the Gothic villain *par excellence*, a kidnapper and a would-be murderer. Carey is here obviously giving vent to his own anti-feudal and anti-Jacobite convictions.

In Lochandhu, A Tale of the Eighteenth Century, Sir Thomas Dick Lauder provides the reader with a different species of Highland villain, developed not on the ideas of feudalism, but on those of banditry and criminality. While no mention is made of Jacobitism, Lochandhu’s brother embodies the idea of the Highland criminal, robber and merciless murderer. Alexander MacGillivray, or “Sandy”, as his clan calls him, is a very dangerous man, for whom a purse of coins is far more valuable than human life.

The romanticised idea of the Highlander, instead, informs most Highland heroes and heroines. Some are developed around the idea of humbleness (as Kenneth in *The Romance of the Highlands* or Duncan in *Glencore Tower*), while others embody courage in battle (Charles in *The Lairds of Glenfern*, Charly Clifford in *Macrimmon*) or virtue (like Mary Macdonald in *Highland Mary* and Flora Glenmore in *The Highlanders. A Tale*). In many instances, banditry and lawlessness are turned into a romanticised version of outsiderness, so that many characters acting beyond the bounds of the law shows important virtues such as sympathy, kindness, friendship and bravery. These “friendly” rogues appear in many works, from Keelie Baun in *Bannockburn* to Robert M’Mac in *Reft Rob*.

The category of the outsider is also the one in which the romantic hero falls. Indeed, there are very few romantic heroes in the Identity and Highlands Corpus; the only two evident instances are Ian Dhu in *Bannockburn* and Allan Breck in the homonymous novel by G. Robert Gleig. Ian Dhu is an ambiguous figure; in him, the desire to help Clementina and to

---

behave nobly come into full contrast with his extremely passionate and lusty temperament. Once rescued Clementina from the hands of the villains Gordon, Aberdeen and Invercauld, Ian Dhu initially falls a victim to his own desire for her, attempting to lead her in his cave, instead of delivering her into the arms of her beloved Monaltry. The following quotation is from one of the most Byronic inner struggles present in early-nineteenth-century national novels:

As Ian Dhu pressed to his bosom the inanimate body of Clementina, his wild and fierce passions shook his heavy frame. They were like a volcano, which, after furious throes, at last burst out, deluging the adjacent country with a torrent of liquid fire, and darting up its storm of smoke, flame and scoria. [...] He clasped her close to his throbbing heart, but respect still withheld his daring to violate her lips.4

3. Ossian: Sympathy and Sublime

The first and most important writer dealing with the Highlands after Culloden is James Macpherson; his works contributed consistently to the popularisation of the myth of the Highlands, so that Macpherson may be considered as Scotland’s first national writer. By rescuing old Gaelic traditions and culture before they were condemned to utter oblivion, Macpherson ended up in dramatising “the refusal of a nation to give up its culture in support of the empire”.5

Unlike the authors of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, Macpherson was a Highlander. He was born in Ruthven (Inverness-shire) in 1736 and studied at King’s College, in Aberdeen. At the end of his studies, he went back to Ruthven, where he undertook the career of teacher. Since he was a student, Macpherson always showed a deep interest in poetry. His first published work is Fragments of Ancient Poetry Collected in the Highlands of Scotland (1760), a collection of poems that he claimed to have gathered from Highland oral tradition and to have translated into English. Encouraged by the success of his first work and by the support of High Blair, Macpherson left Ruthven for a tour of the Highlands at the end of which he claimed to have discovered an epic saga about Fingal, a Gaelic hero also present in Irish mythological tradition. In 1761, he published what he said was the translation, from Gaelic into English, of a long poem written by a third century bard. The title of the work, Fingal, an Ancient Epic Poem, in Six Books; Together with Several Other Poems, Composed by Ossian, the Son of Fingal: Translated from the Gaelic, hints to the (fictional) circumstances

5 K. Trumpener, Bardic Nationalism, cit., p. 8.
connected with the creation of the poem. The authenticity of the poem, however, was immediately questioned.

Samuel Johnson decided to take a tour of the Highlands, in order to find – if they existed – the originals of Macpherson’s *Fragments* and *Fingal*. His conclusions were against the author, whom he considered as an impostor and a forger; although, in fact, he “found people with a knowledge of Ossianic poetry as it existed in the tradition”, these oral fragments were completely different from Macpherson’s version. A later inquiry, carried out by the Highland Society of Scotland in 1805, led to the final opinion that, although Macpherson’s poems were inspired to really existing poetical fragments, his editing and implementing had been so consistent that his work must be considered not as a translation, but as an invention.

Despite the lack of any evidence supporting the authenticity of the Ossian saga, some contemporary thinkers considered Macpherson’s poems as authentic. The most renown supporter of the Ossianic authenticity is Hugh Blair, one of the men who economically supported Macpherson’s tour of the Highlands in 1760. Hugh Blair was an important author of the Scottish Enlightenment; he lectured at Edinburgh University and published sermons and essays. About Macpherson’s poetry, he wrote *A Critical Dissertation on the Poems of Ossian, the Son of Fingal* (1763), a praising essay that became the preface to successive editions of *Fingal*.

In the *Critical Dissertation*, Blair provides several arguments in support of the authenticity of *Fingal*; most of them founded on Blair’s personal aesthetic taste and convictions, rather than on evidence. According to Blair, each people in their earliest stages of civilisation begin to represent reality by songs and poems focused on the praise “of their gods, or of their ancestors; commemorations of their own warlike exploits, or lamentations over their misfortunes”.

In archaic societies, poems are the means by which the memory of the past is kept alive, preserved and transferred to future generations. The person in charge for preserving these memories was the bard, who conveys his wonder for unintelligible things through a densely metaphorical language. The poems of Ossian embody all these features; moreover, they give vent to the ancient attachment of man to nature, typical of

---

6 R. Clyde, *op. cit.*, p. 118.
7 *Ibidem*, p. 119.
the “first and earliest [...] life of hunters”, living at the first stage of social development, according to the Scottish Enlightenment four-stage theory.\(^9\)

Despite his naïve belief in the authenticity of the poems of Ossian (possibly moved by a desire to take advantage of Macpherson’s talents), Blair pointed to the very features which made the songs of Ossian so popular among his contemporaries and which, therefore, exerted a strong influence on following generations of writers. These features are “tenderness and sublimity”,\(^10\) the former meaning the presence of a general “delicacy of sentiment, greatly predominant over fierceness and barbarity” in the heroes’ temperament, whose pre-eminent features are “magnanimity, generosity and true heroism”,\(^11\) the second referring to both the seriousness and gravity of the events told, and to the “wild and romantic scenery” in which they are set:

> The extended heath by the seashore; the mountains shaded with mist; the torrent rushing through a solitary valley; the scattered oaks, and the tombs of warriors overgrown with moss; all produce a solemn attention in the mind and prepare it for great and extraordinary events [...] His poetry, more perhaps than that of any other writer, deserves to be styled, *The poetry of the Heart.* It is a heart penetrated with noble sentiments and with sublime and tender passions; a heart that glows, and kindles the fancy; a heart that is full, and pours itself forth.\(^12\)

Blair’s analysis highlights the presence of two leading currents in eighteenth-century literature, i.e. sensibility and the sublime. Blair admits that these features distinguish Ossian’s poems from Gothic ancient poetry, dominated by violence and fierce bravery, and from Greek epics, where irony often dominates over sublimity. Sensibility in literature was typical of the sentimental novel; the most renown instances of this genre written before the poems of Ossian are Samuel Richardson’s *Pamela, or Virtue Rewarded* (1740), *Clarissa* (1748) and *The History of Sir Charles Grandison* (1853). Although Richardson’s novels constitute no source for the songs of Ossian, their great success was symptomatic of a growing interest in the description of feelings and sentiments capable of giving a touching account of the mechanisms of the human heart.

---

\(^9\) Blair clearly adopts the four-stage theory, applying it to the songs of Ossian and trying to use it as a proof of authenticity: “There are four great stages through which man successively pass in the progress of society. The first and earliest is the life of hunters; pasturage succeeds to this, as the ideas of property begin to take root; next agriculture, and, lastly, commerce. Throughout Ossian’s poems we plainly find ourselves in the first of these periods of society; during which hunting was the chief employment of men, and their principal method of their procuring subsistence. Pasturage was not indeed wholly known [...] and of agriculture we find no traces” (H. Blair, *op. cit.*, p. 103).

\(^10\) *Ibidem*, p. 108.

\(^11\) *Ibidem*, p. 97.

\(^12\) *Ibidem*, pp. 108-9.
Sensibility, or tenderness, as Blair calls it, was at the core of the reshaping of the Highlanders’ change of image from barbarians to heroes. The idea of the Gaels as a people of bandits and freebooters was substituted, in Macpherson’s poems, for an image apt to encounter people’s growing taste for sensibility; therefore, literature portrayed the Highlanders as endowed with hearty virtues like magnanimity and generosity, the desire for freedom supplanted the idea of banditry, and fierceness in battle was turned into a gentler form of courage and bravery. These characteristics became the paradigm for Highland heroes and heroines in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century writings.

The sentimentalisation of the ancient Gaels is connected with the development of a literary stock figure typical of the eighteenth century, which is at the core of the later interest in primitivism: the noble savage. This literary figure is the embodiment of the myth of the good savage, a philosophical theory according to which the causes of man’s fierceness and viciousness do not lay in his intrinsic nature, but are the products of the corrupting powers of civilisation. This theory is clearly a derivation of the Earl of Shaftesbury’s theory of moral sense, developed as a reaction against Hobbes’ pessimistic theories about man’s nature, generally summed up in the Latin phrase *homo homini lupus*. Shaftesbury’s moral sense theory laid the basis for Adam Smith’s *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* (1759), which was published only two years after the issuing of *Fingal*.

Shaftesbury’s moral sense theory was the embryo of Scottish Enlightenment. Therefore, Scottish Enlightenment theorists may have not agreed with the enforcement of civilisation on Highland society. The impulse to improve the area came from outside and was adopted by those who could take economical advantage from it. From a philosophical perspective, dramatic improvement was a deliberate act of interference with the natural process of social evolution described in stadial theories. The four-stage theory was initially developed as a descriptive account of the different stages of social development; it was politics that turned it into the basis of the enforcement of progress on peripheral areas. If seen from a Shaftesburian viewpoint, which privileges the idea of man as intrinsically good, the first stages of social development cannot be considered as morally inferior to the latter. Therefore, sentimental writers adopted Shaftesbury’s theories as a basis for their description of human nature. In the case of Macpherson, this sentimental bias tinged the representations of primitive Gaelic society with virtues and qualities that English improvement policies were eradicating. Magnanimity and generosity were the dominant features of ancient Gaels’ temperament, if compared to “civilised” Highland chiefs, whom
improvement turned into plain land owners, focused on profit and uninterested in the hardships endured by their tenants.

Blair highlighted the presence of another dominant theme in the songs of Ossian: sublimity. The “sublime” gained dramatic importance during the years before the issuing of Fingal, thanks to the publication of Edmund Burke’s A Philosphic Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful (1757). If the sublime was a rhetorical structure employed since the times of ancient Greece to increase the listener’s attention, as Samuel H. Monk explains in the first chapters of The Sublime: a Study of Critical Theories in Eighteenth Century England (1935), Burke highlighted the aesthetic importance of the sublime conceived as the source of man’s most powerful emotions. Whatever is able to strike man with terror is a source of the sublime: danger, obscurity (because it conceals danger), power (potentially used to cause pain), privations and hardships, infinity, magnificence, greatness.

What is shared by all these causes of the sublime is their potential to inflict pain and man’s impossibility to gain control over them. The channel through which these elements, instead of causing fear, originate sublime feelings (such as astonishment) is sympathy. Sympathy is a key-concept in eighteenth century philosophy and describes man’s natural bent to feel for his fellow-creatures. When man observes someone in danger, or in pain, he becomes struck with a powerful emotion, astonishment, which is akin to fear in its power to paralyse reason and to arouse a sense of horror. What distinguishes the sublime astonishment from fear is that sympathy mingles horrified feelings with a certain degree of pleasure, stemming from man’s secure position: man feels as if he were in his fellow-creature’s predicament, but he knows he is not.

In the songs of Ossian, the sublime is largely present and, as Blair pointed out, it informed not only the plot but also the setting. Violent battles, for instance, are a source of the sublime, as well as mournful situations. Landscape can be employed to increase the sublimity of the plot, creating an affecting scenario characterised by powerful natural elements that, due to their unpredictability and untameable nature, can be sources of danger.

The sublime was at the core of Ossian’s success, laying the foundations of all successive portraits and descriptions of the Highlands. The elements emphasised in sublime landscape representations are the mountains, in all their tremendous impracticability and forbidding paths, their deep chasms, their high waterfalls and deafening cataracts. Weather, too, was considered by Burke as a source of the sublime, especially when manifesting itself
in terrible storms, noisy thunders and deluge-like rains. These features are largely present in early-nineteenth-century novels set on the Highlands. Some novels, for instance, open with raging storms, such as Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay*. In the first chapter, the protagonist, Douglas, is led ashore by the furious waves of the sea in front of Caithness - a region placed in northern Scotland - during a storm that has caused the ship he was embarked on to shipwreck. The sublimity of the storm mingles with Douglas’s sorrow at his discovering that none of his fellow travellers reached the shore alive.

Raging storms also appear in *Bannockburn*, *Reft Rob*, *Lochandhu* and *The Doomed One*. In *Lochandhu*, Sir Thomas Dick Lauder produced an astonishingly sublime passage, in which Amherst Oakenwold, the English protagonist of the novel, gets lost during a nighttime storm and is compelled to take shelter in a small hut he finds on the cliffs of the Western coast:

His situation was now a very strange one: housed in a little frail building about three feet by four [...], perched within fifteen or twenty yards of the brink of a cliff three or four hundred feet in perpendicular height above the raging ocean; the blast howling through the furze bushes, the rain lashing on the sandy downs, the thunder rattling over his head, and even overpowering for a time the roar of the waves, and every now and then the lightning blazing forth with splendour so dazzling, as to show the smallest bush that quivered on the wild waste.\(^{13}\)

Identification with Amherst in such a predicament brings about the most sublime response in the reader, investing him with astonishment. The effectiveness of this passage lays in the presence of many of the elements listed by Burke among the most common and powerful sources of the sublime: a dangerous situation, the fury of natural elements, loneliness, darkness, deafening thunders and blinding lightning.

If storms are generally characteristic of the northern seacoasts, deep ravines and cataracts characterise proper Highland landscape, as these landscape descriptions from *Bannockburn* and *The Romance of the Highlands* exemplify:

Behind them fell a fierce and rapid torrent, from various ledges of rocks, with an astounding noise, till one vast street of white foam formed the awful waterfall. Rocks mounted upon rocks were covered with carious creepers; the weeping birch hung her pendent branches into the stream, along with the willows [...].\(^{14}\)

Three high rocks appeared; their black and dismal colour, added greatly to the grandeur of the landscape. A heavy torrent over these crags came rushing, with

---


dreadful rapidity, dashing from rock to rock, till it reached the bottom with a thundering noise [...] .

The connection between such landscape representations and danger is implicit in the forbiddingness to human access to such areas of the Highlands, as Ellen Percy openly remarks in *Discipline*: “My eyes were involuntarily fixed upon a dell which had no interest except what it gained from the certainty that a single false step would bring me a hundred fathoms nearer to it”. The merits of Macpherson’s poems lay not only in his capacity to create works able to fully convey the ethic and aesthetic theories of his contemporaries, but also in the fact that, thanks to him, the Highlands became an object of general interest. Many travellers decided to tour the mountains of Scotland, in search for those majestic and sublime sceneries and for the heroic people portrayed by the bard Ossian. In *The Search for the Picturesque* (1989), Malcolm Andrews labels the obsession with Ossian’s poems “Ossianic Mania”, observing that the songs of Ossian “accompanied nearly every picturesque tourist into the Highlands, and provoked rapturous recitations by the sides of waterfalls, or on the mountain tops”. The love for Highland landscape led many travellers to have a less critical approach towards Gaelic society, so that post-Ossian travel accounts are less characterised by the bias and contempt that, for instance, lay at the core of Samuel Johnson’s approach. Katie Trumpener chooses the definition of “oats” given by Johnson in his 1750 *Dictionary* to exemplify his biased perspective on Scotland: “A grain which in England is generally given to horses, but in Scotland supports the people”.

If the landscape, the “loneliness of the route” and the weather of the Highlands fully embodied the principles of the sublime, the old traditions of the Gaels had already disappeared. When James Macpherson published *Fingal*, fifteen years had elapsed from the 1745 Jacobite rising. During the 1760s, the process of improvement had already exerted a strong influence on Highland culture, destroying most of its traditional features. Therefore, landscape acquired the features of a sort of monument to ancient Gaelic culture, becoming endowed with symbolic importance. In late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth-century representations of Highland landscape, the sublime and the myth of the good savage merge. Explicit formulations of this thematic overlapping between ethic and aesthetic features are

---

16 M. Brunton, *op. cit.*, Vo. III, p. 121.
quite hard to be found in early-nineteenth-century national novels. One example is the following remark, made by General Gordon while beholding the border between the lands of Ronay and Haddo in *A Legend of Argyle*:

This is the march or boundary of the Earl’s extensive domains, how different from the trimmed hedges and ditches which separate the lands of the Lowlander; here, such futile and nicely drawn lines would appear, to the eyes of the Highlanders, as preposterous as locks on their leather *dorlachs*, or wallets [...] here the broad and indelible traces of Nature’s own hand are alone suffered to bound the possessions of the Lordly Baron of Caledonia.19

General Gordon’s remark interestingly connects Highland lack of “futile” refinement with Nature’s role as the only element destined to divide estates and, therefore, to shape landscape. The dominion of Nature over human ideas of property and bounding is here set in contrast with the Lowland habit to divide lands through human works such as hedges and ditches. The identification of the Highlands with the lost virtues and qualities typical of pre-improvement (Ossianic) Gaelic culture becomes more evident when we analyse the functions attributed to the different parts of the British Empire in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, endorsing a geocritical approach capable to explore the relationship between places and history, myths, values and ideals.

4. Late Eighteenth-century Poets: Beattie and Burns

Macpherson’s compound of “tenderness” and “sublimity” in the representation of the Highlands exerted a remarkable influence on the works of two major late-eighteenth-century Scottish poets: James Beattie (1735-1803) and Robert Burns (1757-1796).20

James Beattie was primarily a philosopher and a Professor of Moral Philosophy and Logic at Marall College. One of his most interesting poems is a two-volume work called *The Minstrel; or, The Progress of Genius* (1771-1774). Beattie’s poem is focused on the...
adventures of a young Highlander, Edwin, travelling among the Scottish mountains in search of poetical inspiration, meeting with a hermit and being finally compelled to become a minstrel. As Jean Pittock remarks in “James Beattie: A Friend to All”, this poem “offers an account of the growth of all awareness at once romantic and moral”. Edwin’s growth from boy to man passes through two main stages, each described in its volume. In the first stage, Edwin’s sensitivity is “nurtured as he experiences nature in her different aspects”, while in the second stage, Edwin gains knowledge of culture and literature through the teachings of the Hermit.

The first book, focused on Edwin’s inner growth through the contact with nature, represents a beautiful example of magnificent wilderness, in which echoes of Ossianic sublimity are often present, as the following quotation shows:

Lo! Where the stripling, wrapt in wonder, roves  
Beneath the precipice o’erhung with pine;  
And sees, on high, amidst the encircling groves,  
From cliff to cliff the foaming torrents shine:  
While waters, woods, and winds, in concert join,  
And Echo smells the chorus to the skies.  
Would Edwin this majestic scene resign  
For ought the huntsman’s puny craft supplies?  
Ah! No: he better knows great Nature’s charms to prize.

If Beattie focused on the beauties of Highland scenery as a source of moral teaching and refinement, Robert Burns advanced a further development of Macpherson’s Highland myth, producing a sentimental and nostalgic image of Jacobitism in which the virtues and bravery of Ossianic ancient Gaels are embodied in the courageous and loyal Highland Jacobites perishing at Culloden in 1746. Robert Burns was born in Ayrshire; he was a Lowlander, but appreciated Highland landscape and scenery, as some of his songs highlight. Burns’s poetry can be considered pre-Romantic due to both his sentimental approach to the past and the lyric expression of inner feelings.

Burns played a major role in the development of the last stage of what Murray G.H. Pittock called “the Stuart Myth”. After the defeat at Culloden, the accomplishment of improvement and the death of Charles Edward Stuart in 1788, Jacobitism ceased to be regarded as a major political threat and became a sentimentalised and romanticised symbol

---

22 Ibidem, p. 65.  
24 Burns appreciated the Highlands and toured them in 1787.
of national identity and dissent to the establishment that could do no real harm to the government anymore. Therefore, Burns’s nostalgia for the Jacobite days of rebellion against the English and his mythisation of the figure of Charles Edward Stuart were not considered as a danger by the government. One of the most representative songs written by Burns about Prince Charles is *The Chavalier’s Lament*, published in the same year in which Prince Charlie died – 1788. The song is divided into two stanzas; the first devoted to the incapacity of nature to rescue the Prince from his sorrowful despair, the second giving vent to the Prince’s lament over the death of his brave followers:

[...]

No birds sweetly singing, nor flowers gaily springing,
Can soothe the sad bosom of joyless despair.
The deed that I dared, could it merit their malice?
A king and a father to place on his throne!
His right are these hills, and his right are these valleys,
Where the wild beasts find shelter, tho’ I can find none!
But ‘tis not my suff’rings, thus wretched, forlorn,
My brave gallant friends, ‘tis your ruin I mourn;
Your faith proved so loyal in hot blood trial, -
Alas! I can make it no better return!

This lament is an attempt at describing what emotions may have agitated the bosom of Charles Edward Stuart when a fugitive after the battle of Culloden. Burns’ sentimental account of Charles Edward’s lament immediately entered the tradition and influenced many novelists, from Sir Walter Scott to Robert Louis Stevenson. Among the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, E.H.H.’s *The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady* is the most clearly affected by Burns. After the battle of Culloden, the Prince takes shelter among the mountains where the Macleods dwell. Prince Charlie’s sorrow for his deceased Highlanders is highlighted in a conversation between George, the son of the Baron of Owenclew, and a mysterious stranger. George advances the idea that the real responsible for the death of so many sturdy and brave Highlanders is Prince Charles Edward, a most unfeeling man who led them to death in order to accomplish his political designs. To George’s charges, the stranger answers: “Who knows that Charles Edward did not feel?”

After this exclamation, the stranger reveals his identity to George, asking him for help in finding his way back to his shelter: he is Prince Charles! The Prince’s sorrow for his Highlanders is thoroughly portrayed in a touching lament delivered by the Prince towards the end of the novel, when Johnnie finds him alone in a cave, almost starved to death:

---

I gave myself up to death; hunger came upon me, and I lay down here to die. [...] I have ruined many, but they did not fall alone; we were all buried in one mass of destruction. Those who saw me once a joyful victor, a prince rich in power, little through I should have to endure the extremities of cold, hunger and starvation. Yet, I am not quite forsaken. Would to God they could have crushed only me! But I lived to hear my nobler friends were paid for their loyalty and attachment to me by ignominious and cruel deaths. Till I die, Johnnie Baillie, will I remember you; and if God takes me now, I shall bless that I died in the arm of a Highlander. 26

This long quotation from Charles’s lament shows how much successive literature got inspired from Robert Burns, whose poems and songs became symbols of national identity. Burns, in fact, is probably Scotland’s most celebrated writer, as the Robert Burns Day demonstrates (25th of January, Burns’ birthday). Another novel studied in this dissertation is clearly indebted to Burns for the picture of the Highlands and the protagonist’s sorrow in abandoning her birthplace: Felix M’Donough’s The Highlanders. A Tale. In this novel, Flora, is compelled by poverty to abandon her dearest native mountains. When leaving Glenmore, the “snow-drop of innocence” (as the author calls the protagonist of the novel) sings part of a song by Burns, called My Heart’s in the Highlands (1789): 27

Farewell to the Highlands, adieu to the North,
The birthplace of valour, the country of worth;
Wherever I wonder, wherever I roam,
My heart’s in the Highlands, my heart’s with my home. 28

Flora’s singing this song is not only an outlet for her sorrow in leaving her birthplace, but it also establishes a connection between this song and the Clearances. Flora is compelled to move to London due to economic ruin following her family’s debts and their incapacity to cope with the new economic system. Moreover, the novel is set in the very period of the Clearances, the turn of the eighteenth century. The song is significant in its power to give vent to the feelings of everyone who is leaving his beloved mountains, being he/she a Jacobite rebel escaping from post-Culloden measures, or a financially ruined Highlander during the Clearances. What Flora finds in London, as the figure of the libertine Gerald De Brook foretold, is an aristocratic society devoted to vice and debauchery, to which “the birthplace of valour, the country of worth” stands in open contrast.

The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady and The Highlanders. A Tale are both indebted to Burns’s sentimental and nostalgic poetry, highlighting the survival of his romantic perspective in the hearts of many Scottish writers.

26 Ibidem, pp. 163-5.
5. Sir Walter Scott

Both Macpherson, Beattie and Burns were poets, not novelists. Sir Walter Scott, instead, was the major literary influence in narrative. He began his career as a poet, but afterwards turned to the novel. His poems already show Scott’s deep interest in history, as well as his reliance on the poetic tradition established by James Macpherson, dominated by melancholy and sublimity of landscape. As early as 1805, Scott began to write his first novel, *Waverley*, but completed it only in 1814. According to Trumpener, *Waverley*’s success is due to its “stress on historical progress” that appealed “to nationalist, imperialist and colonialist readers alike”. Unlike Macpherson, Scott was less interested in portraying the manners and myths of old Gaeldom, than in highlighting the dramatic power of historical change.

If Scott employed the literary myth of the Highlands, it was only to implement it in his own conception of history, rooted in the effects of historical events on people’s lives. In *Waverley*, the figure of the Highlander is merged with – and inseparable from – Jacobitism. This simplified historical synthesis is best represented in the character of Vich Ian Vohr, one of Scott’s “potent and overwhelming *Sturm und Drang* figures” who “have no place in the peaceable interchange of civilised society”. Vich Ian Vohr is the embodiment of Jacobitism as a lost cause, which has always been doomed to failure.

In Scott’s novels, Jacobitism is not at the core of nationalism, as it is in Robert Burns’ songs. There is little nostalgia for an old feudal society whose obvious doom was to be wiped away by modernity. In Scott, the stress is on change; the Jacobites are not important as a symbol of struggle for national identity and independence, but because their defeat sealed the beginning of a new era for Scotland. The core of the *Bildungsroman* plot in *Waverley*, according to Pittock, is not in Edward’s growth from boy to man, but in the transition from Scottish romantic nationalism to British patriotism: “Scottish patriotism is childish, British patriotism is adult: this is the equation offered”.

The historical novel was therefore a novelty not only due to its structure, but also to the kind of social criticism it offered, looking for identity in the union with England. Scott is praised as a great innovator, even though *Waverley* is evidently the product of the influences of the surrounding social and literary environment. Edward Muir and Katie Trumpener focus on two important aspects relevant to the creation of *Waverley*. In *Scott

31 *Ibidem*, p. 84.
and Scotland: The Predicament of the Scottish Writer, Muir argues that Scott’s concerns with identity and patriotism are deeply rooted in the peculiarities of early-nineteenth-century society in Scotland – a society devoid of specific traditions and of a sense of community.

Muir points to a predicament shared by all the people living in early-nineteenth-century Scotland, stressing Scott’s crucial attempt to create a sense of community in a divided nation (the Highland/Lowland divide), creating an historical tradition for a country whose present had been severed from its past abruptly. Muir also highlights the role played by invention and memory in the development of national identity, as the following quotation shows:

A people who lose their nationality create a legend to take its place. The reality of a nation’s history lies in its continuity, and the present is its only guarantee, English history is real to us, because England as a living organic unity is real to us; its past is gathered up in that unity, and still exists in it. but where national unity is lost the past is lost too, for the connection between the present and the past has been broken, and the past turns therefore into legend, into the poetry of pure memory.33

When the connection between present and past is broken, people can no longer derive their identity from their past. Like a person victim of amnesia, Scotland lost memory of its national past due to a dramatic event – the enforcement of a new social system. Scott was aware of this, as his remarks about the subtitle of Waverley, ‘Tis Sixty Years Since, highlight that fact that, in the Highlands, the changes which involved Europe for centuries, were condensed in just sixty years. The “Scottish predicament” did not affect only Scott, but other writers before and after him. Among them, we find the national tale writers, whose importance in the development of Waverley is stressed by Katie Trumpener in Bardic Nationalism.

Trumpener claims that Waverley stems not only from social circumstances, but also from Scott’s readings, pointing to two main sources for Waverley: Charlotte Smith’s Desmond (1792) and Charles Maturin’s The Milesian Chief (1812). Desmond is an anti-Jacobin novel focused on the way in which a young Englishman travelling through France experiences the French revolution. The youth’s name is Waverley and, like Scott’s character, he is characterised by a “perennial inability to decide where he should travel and which woman he should marry”, manifesting also the incapacity to “grasp the significance of the

33 E. Muir, op. cit., p. 100.
political events going on in France”. The resemblance of plots is striking, as well as the employment of the same symbolic name.

If Desmond probably provided Scott with some plot ideas, the structure and main features of the novel are more connected with the national tale and The Milesian Chief. The scarce success gained by Queenhoo-Hall, an English antiquarian novel written by Joseph Strutt and finished and published by Scott, suggested that historical novels founded on remote events and narrated in an obsolete, antiquarian style were not what people was interested in. Instead, the success of Maria Edgeworth’s Castle Reckrent and Sydney Owenson’s The Wild Irish Girl in Ireland, and of The Cottagers of Glenburnie in Scotland, proved people’s growing interest in novels focused on past events connected with the present. What The Cottagers of Glenburnie stressed, was the role played by improvement in the transition from the past, portrayed in the dirtiness of a small Highland village, and modern society.

Therefore, Scott decided to exploit the national tale’s aim to bridge the gap between past and present, in order to develop a new version of the historical novel, no longer a mere antiquarian attempt to portray the past, but an instrument of social and historical criticism. In Waverley, Scott combined this approach with a deep interest in Scottish history and a literary myth which, as a poet, he was already familiar with: the Highland myth. The historical novel as Scott developed it is very different from the national tale, according to Katie Trumpener:

The national tale before Waverley maps developmental stages topographically, as adjacent worlds in which characters move and then choose between; the movement of those novels is geographical, rather than historical. In contrast, the historical novel [...] finds its focus in the way in which one developmental stage collapses to make room for the next and cultures are transformed under the pressure of historical events.

The stress, in Waverley, is certainly on historical change and on the importance of the Jacobite defeat at Culloden, but “geographical” movement is also present throughout the novel, and choice between different geographic areas is highlighted in Edwards’s decision to marry Rose Bradwardyne instead of Flora MacIvor. Waverley chooses the Lowlands instead of the Highlands, modernity instead of feudalism, reality instead of romantic lost causes. In Waverley, as well as in the national tale, marriage is a rite of passage leading the protagonist not only into adulthood, but also into society.

34 K. Trumpener, Bardic Nationalism, cit., p. 139.
Scott’s Waverley Novels enjoyed a great success, not only among readers, but also writers. Many hints to his works can be found in successive novels, such as E.H.H.’s *The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady*, David Carey’s *Lochiel* and *A Legend of Argyle*, Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*. Oftentimes, contemporary critics complained about the tendency, manifested by many writers, to imitate Scott. A representative example of this distaste for Scott’s imitators is provided in an anonymous review, appeared on *The Monthly Review* in July 1826, about Henry Duncan’s *William Douglas; or, The Scottish Exiles. A Historical Novel*. The novel is focused on the religious struggles that raged through Scotland during the 1680s. The reviewer repeatedly complains about the close resemblance between this novel and Scott’s *Old Mortality*, written in 1816:

> The first page of this ‘historical novel’ told us what we had to dread – another imitation of Sir Walter Scott [...].
> This novel might have been readable, if it had appeared before Sir Walter Scott presented us with his vigorous pictures of the struggles of the period, and threw over the covenanters and their foes the enchanting lights and shades of his genius; but “William Douglas” will not do after “Old Mortality” [...].\(^36\)

I conclude the discourse about Scott by remarking that, even though many writers drew inspiration from the Waverley Novels, most of them employed the settings made famous by Scott only as a means to convey their own opinions about Scottish history. In other words, if Scott was a major influence on the choice of genre and setting, most writers did not fully agree with his stress on British patriotism and on the necessity to enter modernity, looking for identity inside the boundaries of the new establishment. For some novelists, Jacobitism remained that sentimentalised symbol of lost independence that Burns had made popular with his songs (i.e. the myth of Prince Charles Edward Stuart as it is re-employed in *The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady*).

Other writers focused more on the causes than on the fate of the Jacobite cause. If David Carey endorsed Scott’s idea of Jacobitism as a lost cause, even at the eyes of those who supported it, other novelists, such as Andrew Picken in *The Black Watch* and Rosalia St. Clair in *The Doomed One*, laid the stress on the unavoidability of the development and spreading of Jacobitism. These writers tried to shed light on the mistakes made by the government in the management of the Highlands and of Scotland, highlighting the role played by the massacre of Glencoe and the execution of more than a hundred deserters of the British Army in 1743 in the breaking out of the Jacobite rebellions. By demonstrating

how these mistakes affected Scottish opinion, they highlighted how supporting the Jacobites was the only alternative to pledging allegiance to a king, either Dutch or German, who showed so little interest in his Northern subjects’ lives.

The protagonists of these novels are not led into Jacobitism out of banditry, greediness and lust for power; they support the Stuarts in the attempt to contrast and defeat a centralised political system disadvantaging them as periphery subjects. Therefore, we can comfortably argue that these novels are truly supporting Scottish nationalism, instead of British nationalism.
PART II
SHAPING THE NOVEL: HISTORICAL SETTING, LANDSCAPE AND GEOGRAPHY
CHAPTER VII

Identity and Historical Setting

1. Introduction: Identity and the Chronotope

Identity is one of the major issues in Scottish early-nineteenth-century novels; it is present not only as an explicit commentary on society, but also as a structuring element. In this chapter, I provide an analysis of the importance of identity in the choice of the historical setting of a novel. Most novels written from 1800 to 1835 are set in the past; although this setting is part of the literary paradigm of such genres as the Gothic novel and the historical novel, it also serves as a clue to explore identity issues. The historical setting chosen by an author can, indeed, cast light on his political ideas and his approach to history as an instrument for nationalist writing.

As pointed out in Chapters IV and V, the past is a source of identity both for individuals and for groups of people. Experience and past events are selected in a mnemonic process that privileges some events on others on grounds of their supposed capacity to represent the individual or the national present identity. From a cultural viewpoint, this process often entails a good deal of invention, turning national history into myth and idealising present identity.

Late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century novelists partook in the process of creation of Scotland’s modern identity, idealising the character of present Scots and romanticising the past, in order to justify their present qualities. Moreover, since for nationalist writers Scottish modern culture had to be as different as possible from the English one, they tended to emphasise habits, manners and traditions belonging to a different ethnicity, the Gaels. Therefore, Highland virtues are oftentimes stressed and set into contrast with the vices of London and Edinburgh. In many novels, history is closely connected with views either supporting or opposing Jacobitism, the union or imperialism. The setting in certain historical periods is the most eye-catching symptom of the writer’s convictions.

One of the most rewarding approaches to the study of the setting of a novel is Mikhail Bakhtin’s chronotope. In his 1937-8 essay, “Forms of Time and the Chronotope in the Novel”, Bakhtin defines the chronotope as “the intrinsic connectedness of temporal and
spatial relationships that are artistically expressed in literature”. The chronotope can be considered as the frame in which the novel is set, where frame refers to both space and time. The chronotope is the very structure on which the plot develops, because it “provides the ground essential for the showing forth, the representability of events”. According to Bakhtin, each literary genre is characterised by its own chronotopes, corresponding to that genre’s fixed features, plots and events.

Bakhtin’s analysis of the chronotope is not a clear-cut one; he employs the term to describe structures that belong to different levels of literary analysis, from genre, to setting, to plot patterns. According to Bakhtin, it is the relationship between space and time that determines the plot and the characters’ actions in the novel; meeting, parting, and travelling, for instance, are common chronotopes in literature. Others are more specific of certain genres, such as the castle chronotope in the Gothic novel or the border chronotope in the historical novel. The Highland Chronotope is an attempt to gather features from these different levels and to create a comprehensive scheme. The risk is that of generalising certain features and putting others aside. But I argue that this process of generalisation is a necessary step in the discovery of shared features capable to reveal contemporary attitudes towards national and identity issues. Of course, once pointed to the common features, I will take into account also the differences, those “secondary” features that characterise the work of each single author.

Bakhtin’s chronotopes are rooted in space; they depend upon the inseparability of the tie between the “contingency that governs events” and a measurable “expanse of space” which can be quantified either by “distance” or by “proximity”. Therefore, the chronotope is not only a narrative feature, but also a cognitive scheme, in which both time and space are measurable and inseparable one from the other. In a way, the chronotope is nothing but the author’s representation into literature of our four-dimensional world; it is an attempt at catching the complexity of reality in its cultural and historical implications. As such, the chronotope can be employed as a useful instrument, in order to study the function played by history and cultural identity into romantic novels. The possibility to use the chronotope as

---

1 M. Bakhtin, op. cit., p. 84.
2 Ibidem, p. 250.
4 The chronotope rests on a concept that is closely connected not only with history, but also with literary geography, as R.T. Tally Jr claims: “Bakhtin’s chronotope is another tool both for comprehending and producing literary cartography, as the chronotope brings space, time and genre together in a conceptually integrated way” (R.T. Tally Jr, Spatiality, cit., p. 56). According to Tally, literary cartography is the process by which the
an instrument of historical and cultural analysis is made evident in such definitions of the term, as James Clifford’s, who describes the chronotope as “a fictional setting where historically specific relations of power become visible and certain stories can ‘take place’”.

2. Historical Setting

The employment of the chronotope as an instrument to study early-nineteenth-century national novels can be useful, in order to highlight the underlying concerns of the novelists of the period. Since the chronotope is a compound of two intertwined dimensions, time and space, it suggests that the most comfortable way to deal with these novels is by approaching them from two distinct perspectives, one focused on time and the other on space. Therefore, in this chapter I deal with the temporal coordinate, while in the next ones I shall focus on the spatial one.

The usefulness of this approach depends upon the fact that it allows us to focus on time and space as two distinct instruments in the hands of nationalist novelists, each highlighting different concerns. Time, in fact, is most often connected with history, because these novels are set in the past. The connection between history and narrative is at the core of the Identity and Highlands Corpus. In the introduction to *The Writer as Witness: Literature as Historical Evidence*, Tom Dunne focuses on this relationship and explains:

>This will also aid the realisation that, if all history is a form of fiction, so too, all literary fictions are a form of history, and constitute indispensable historical evidences. Thus for example, however committed the novelist may be to producing a work of the individual imagination [...] the end product will inevitably be a personal “history” of the writer’s time and place."

In the case of the canon here discussed, the stories and plots told are affected by contemporary national ideas, which emerge in the choice of specific historical settings, such as the Wars of Scottish Independence or the Jacobite Risings. This choice is clearly

---

6 T. Dunne (ed.), *The Writer as Witness: Literature as Historical Evidence*, Cork: Cork UP, 1987, p. 3. Dunne claims that “this symbiotic relationship between history and fiction [...] was eroded gradually by romanticism, which sought to transform rather than reflect reality, and which [...] became ‘a comfortingly absolute alternative to history itself’” (*ibidem*, p. 3). In the case of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the separation between literature and reality supposed by Dunne to be at the core of romantic writings, is not as evident as in other quarters of romantic literature. In fact, in the canon here discussed, as well as in the more famous historical novels by Scott, literature appears as closely related to reality; rather than a real alternative to contemporary reality, it represents an endeavour to change it by literary means, affecting people’s historical and national ideas.
connected with collective memory and its function of selecting most representative events neglecting the least representative ones. Therefore, in order to see which periods were considered as most concerned with the development of modern national identity, we should arrange these novels in chronological order, according to their setting.

Figure 1. Novels of the Corpus arranges by historical setting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publ.</th>
<th>Title:</th>
<th>Period of Setting:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1809</td>
<td>The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of Carron</td>
<td>c1212-c1235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>The Scottish Chiefs</td>
<td>1296-1305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1806</td>
<td>Glencore Tower</td>
<td>1314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821</td>
<td>Bannockburn; a Novel</td>
<td>1314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>The Romance of the Highlands</td>
<td>1314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-muir</td>
<td>1550s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1805</td>
<td>Monteith. A Novel. Founded on Historical Facts</td>
<td>1568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1832</td>
<td>The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon</td>
<td>1692-c1710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>Conirdan; or, The St Kildians: A Moral Tale</td>
<td>1692-c1713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821</td>
<td>A Legend of Argyle; or, 'Tis a Hundred Years Since</td>
<td>1714-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1834</td>
<td>The Black Watch</td>
<td>1741-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1834</td>
<td>Allan Breck</td>
<td>1715-1789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden</td>
<td>1745-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819</td>
<td>The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady</td>
<td>1746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>The Scottish Orphans. A Moral Tale</td>
<td>1764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>Arthur Monteith. A Moral Tale</td>
<td>1764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1826</td>
<td>Highland Mary</td>
<td>1766-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1814</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>c1770s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1815</td>
<td>Clan-Albin. A National Tale</td>
<td>c1780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1808</td>
<td>The Cottagers of Glenburnie</td>
<td>1788</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1825</td>
<td>Lochandhu; a Tale of the Eighteenth Century</td>
<td>Late XVIII century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>The Vale of the Clyde</td>
<td>Late XVIII century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1813</td>
<td>Strathmay; or, Scenes in the North</td>
<td>Late XVIII century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td>The Highlanders. A Tale</td>
<td>Late XVIII century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1816</td>
<td>The Lairds of Glenfern; or, Highlanders of the Nineteenth Century</td>
<td>1800s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td>Macrimmon</td>
<td>c1810-12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Noteworthy, there is at least one novel set in each century from the XIII to the IX, suggesting that for early nineteenth century writers concerned with identity the roots of modern Scotland reach back to the thirteenth century. Nevertheless, the dramatic predominance of eighteenth century settings highlights how it is the period after the union that most novelists employ as sources of national identity.

These novels can be divided into three main groups, according to the historical period in which they are set:

- Novels set between the XIII and the XVI century (Wars of Scottish Independence and Anglo-Scottish Wars);
- Novels set after the 1603 Act of Union of the English and Scottish crowns (Massacre of Glencoe and the Jacobite Risings);
- Novels set after 1746 (lost cause, improvement, Clearances).

The third group is the most numerous one (Figure 3), showing that most nationalist novelists regarded the second half of the eighteenth century as the one most concerned with the loss of national identity.
This tripartite periodisation highlights the presence of a different relationship between Scotland and England. In the first period, which out of expediency I will call remote past, Scotland and England were two distinct nations, each with its boundaries and institutions. Novels set during this period portray the wars between the two nations as a symbol of Scottish national independence and autonomy, highlighting the qualities and virtues of a perfect modern Scot. In the second period, which we can call *middle-way past*, Scotland is no longer an independent nation. Nevertheless, it is not yet entirely united to England yet, as the power of the Parliament before 1707 and the Jacobite risings prove. Novels set during this period focus on the Massacre of Glencoe and the Jacobite risings, searching identity in the political dynamics of Whig and Jacobite supporters, as well as in the causes which led Jacobitism to spread. Noteworthy, the stress is no longer on national war, but on internal rebellions aimed not to the restoration of Scotland’s independent status, but to the imposition of a (Scot) Stuart on the throne of the United Kingdom. Identity is claimed through the analysis of events concerned with the political predominance within to Great Britain.

The third period, which I call “recent past”, starts with the defeat of the Jacobites at Culloden. This stage is characterised by a powerful endeavour, made by the English government, to prevent any further rebellion in the kingdom and to establish their predominance over Scotland once for all. By means of improvement and the eradication of Gaelic culture, considered as a threat to centralised power, the English spread their own culture through Scotland, in a process of internal colonisation. Novels set during this period are less concerned with history than those set in previous periods; the stress is laid more on the description of manners and habits, than on historical events. Identity is searched for in those habits and traditions which characterised late-eighteenth-century Scotland and, therefore, were at the root of the early-nineteenth-century process of invention of national identity and culture.

In this chapter, I focus on these three periods, devoting a section to each of them and providing an account of the novels set in them, of their concerns and their peculiarities.

3. The Remote Past

The novels set from the thirteenth to the sixteenth century can be further divided into two groups – the ones set during the Wars of Scottish Independence and the ones set during the Anglo-Scottish Wars. The Wars of Scottish Independence were two; the first was fought from 1296 to 1328 and the second from 1332 to 1357. Both were provoked by the
English, who crossed the border with Scotland and invaded it, in the attempt to annex it to their kingdom. In both cases, Scotland succeeded in maintaining its independence as a nation, retaining its king and institutions. Nationalist writers do not deal with the second war, but only with the first. The reason is easy to explain: the first War of Scottish Independence had entered Scottish mythology long before the nineteenth century, thanks to the celebration of two major heroes in Scottish tradition, William Wallace and King Robert de Bruce. Both historical characters are portrayed in early-nineteenth-century literature, but the myth attached to Wallace later spread also in England.

William Wallace is the protagonist of Jane Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs*, an 1810 novel which has been considered both as a national tale and as an historical novel. *The Scottish Chiefs* is focused upon the life and exploits of William Wallace from the breaking out of the first War of Scottish Independence to Wallace’s death in 1305. Porter provides a faithful account of the battles fought and the circumstances of Wallace’s death – he was seized near Glasgow, sentenced to death for high treason by the English government and hanged. Wallace, therefore, became a mythical figure not only due to his heroic exploits as commander of the Scottish army at Stirling Bridge, but also as a martyr, undeservedly killed by the English in the attempt to preserve the independence and liberty of his country and people.

Wallace is probably Scotland’s greatest hero; despite the defeat suffered at Falkirk, in 1298, people regarded him as a hero and turned him into a mythical character, creating legends about him and transmitting them orally to the future generations. The first written account of Wallace’s deeds is a 1477 (circa) poem called *Actes and Deids of the Illustre and Valleyant Campioun Schir William Wallace*, generally referred to as *The Wallace*. This poem was written by Blind Harry, a minstrel who, despite historical inaccuracy, contributed significantly to the spreading of the myth of Wallace.

Jane Porter’s choice to write a sort of romanticised biography of Wallace is significant for several reasons. As a first thing, she attempted to establish a connection between modern and ancient Scotland, suggesting a sort of parallel between them; modern Scotland has been “invaded” by the English as it happened in the past, but this time the English managed to gain possession of it, depriving it of its independence. The cause of Scotland’s loss of independence is in the character of its people; the comparison established between ancient and modern Scots implies that while ancient Scots, like Wallace, devoted

---

themselves to the defence of their country, modern Scots preferred economic advantage and commodities to national independence and autonomy. The terms on which the Union was accepted — that is to say, to enter England’s domestic and colonial trade — are a clear instance of the modern interest in money-making.

This parallel makes sense, if seen from the perspective suggested by Murray Pittock in his *The Invention of Scotland*; according to him, the first War of Scottish Independence and the historical characters of William Wallace and King Robert de Bruce are part of that Jacobite Stuart myth that was developed after the union, in order to compensate for the spreading sense of loss of independence and national identity:

Wallace became a designer-hero appealing to the radical, while Bruce appealed to the loyalist in Jacobite image projections. Their struggles for independence were adopted as one of the central chapters in a story of Scotland based on struggle, and their achievements and aims were aligned with those of the Stuarts. As I shall argue, since only the Jacobites had a developed ideology of response to Scotland’s loss of political power, their projection of Scotland’s historical struggle with England is the one we inherit.⁸

Murray Pittock’s remark offers an interesting approach which can help us to find an explanation to the creation of a sort of nationalist parallel between the Wars of Scottish Independence and Scotland’s modern loss of identity. Moreover, he draws attention of the fact that, for the supporters of the Stuart myth, the history of Scotland is characterised by an ever lasting conflict with England. By endorsing and applying Pittock’s theory to the novels set in the remote past, I do not entail that Jane Porter was a Jacobite, but that, like many of her contemporaries, she belonged to a tradition of writers who, like Robert Burns, tended to romanticise the past and turn historical characters into mythical heroes whose image had been influenced by the political ideas of the supporters of the Stuart myth.

Possible evidence of the connection of the myth of Wallace with Jacobitism is provided by the fact that the English writers begun to pay attention to Wallace and to include him in their literary works only after 1788, when Charles Edward Stuart died. The end of any possibility of a Stuart restoration on the throne represented the end of Scottish rebellions; therefore, extolling the virtues of a hero of the Wars of Scottish Independence became a safer practice under English eyes. In 1791, for instance, Henry Siddons – an English writer and dramatist – wrote *William Wallace; or, the Highland Hero*, while William

⁸ M.G.H. Pittock, *op. cit.*, p. 27.
Wordsworth included some lines about Wallace in his *Prelude*. In Scotland, Wallace continued to be not only an historical hero, but also a literary hero, as Porter’s novel confirms.

The second reason at the basis of the importance of *The Scottish Chiefs* is its romantic interest in history and, in particular, in the figure of the hero. In her novel, Porter seems to endorse the idea that history is the product of great deeds performed by great heroes, clearly distinguishing her approach from Scott’s vision of history as a major force overwhelming the lives of common people. Nevertheless, if seen from the Scottian viewpoint, Porter somehow shares in his view as well; despite being a great and famous hero of Scottish history, Wallace is portrayed as a honest, common man, compelled to partake in the war against England in order to avenge the murder of his wife.

There is another novel which, although written before 1814, conveys an idea of history similar to that popularised by Scott: *Glencore Tower; or, The Feuds of Scotland*. This novel was published anonymously in 1806 and deals with the 1314 Battle of Bannockburn, one of King Robert de Bruce’s most crucial victories against the English army. The battle was not decisive, because the first War of Scottish Independence lasted until Edward II’s death.

---

9 Wordsworth began the *Prelude* in 1798 and continued to work on it for the rest of his life. The work was published posthumously, in 1850. The passage here quoted extols Wallace’s importance in Scottish history and his connection with liberty and independence:

How Wallace fought for Scotland, left the name,
Of Wallace to be found like a wild flower,
All over his dear Country, left the deeds,
Of Wallace, like a Family of Ghosts,
To people the steep rocks and river banks.
Her natural sanctuaries, with a local soul,
Of Independence and stern liberty.

The following quotation from Fiona Stafford provides an analysis of Wordsworth's interpretation of the myth of Wallace:

No matter that Wallace had been fighting the English; what was important was the idea of a hero so attached to his country that his name was now part of its living texture “like a wild flower”, free for anyone who takes the trouble to look. His deeds too are like ghosts – not terrifying memories to be laid to rest, but a “family” whose presence may be felt forever among the rocks and riverbanks. The “local soul” of independence is a collective power, nourished by centuries of enthusiastic admiration, and springing initially from the special attachment of one man to his homeland” (F. Stafford, *Inhabited Solitudes: Wordsworth in Scotland, 1803*, in D. Duff and C. Jones (eds), *Scotland, Ireland and the Romantic Aesthetic*, Cranbury: Rosemont Publ., 2007, pp. 93-113, pp. 103-4).

10 Wallace was also the focus of two poems, or songs, by Robert Burns: *The Coffer’s Saturday Night and Scots who ha.*

130
and his son’s accession to the throne; Edward III signed the Treaty of Edinburgh-Northampton, which sanctioned Scotland’s independence from England.

Like Wallace, Bruce is another great hero in Scottish history, tradition and literature. Bruce is the subject of many legends and of a fourteenth century poem written by John Barbour, called The Brus (1375). In Glencore Tower, a genuine Gothic plot hinging upon the feud between two Highland clans, the Glencores and the Dunraes merges with the historical events of the 1314. The novel revolves around the adventures of Duncan, a youth left an orphan in his childhood and raised by the chief of his clan, Ethwald Dunrae, with affection and fondness. Duncan falls in love with Ethwald’s daughter, but knows that, due to his low birth, he cannot even aspire to her hand. Moreover, Ethwald wants his daughter, Marion, to marry Malcolm, chief of the clan Glencore, in order to seal the end of the long enmity between the two clans.

When Ethwald discovers Malcolm’s true identity – he is a real villain – he refuses him the permission to marry his daughter. The feud between the two clans is renewed and Malcolm abducts Marion, secluding her in his castle, called Glencore tower. Puts an end to the feud the involvement of both clans in the first War of Scottish Independence. The Dunraes and the Glencores fight together against the English at the battle of Bannockburn, in which Duncan distinguishes himself by aiding King Bruce during a fight against Gloucester. Duncan’s courage and bravery in battle become a substitute for high birth, and, though being the orphan of poor people, Ethwald allows him to marry Marion, who has always requited his affection.

In this novel history plays a major role. Heroism is portrayed as a common Scottish virtue, embodied in both an orphan – Duncan – and his king – Robert de Bruce. Bravery, courage and magnanimity are at the core of the Scottish character portrayed by Porter, suggesting the author’s idea that it is in these qualities that modern Scots must identify themselves with.

Noteworthy, in Glencore Tower, Scotland is called “injured country.” The same word (injured) is attributed to Scotland in Jane Porter’s The Scottish Chiefs, which was written four years later. In both novels, this word describes Scotland’s political situation, suggesting a parallel between the Scotland of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries and

12 \text{ Glencore Tower, cit., p. 227.} \]
that of the nineteenth. The idea that Scotland had been injured by England is in tune with nationalist nostalgia for the past and lamentations over lost independence.

*Glencore Tower* provides an interesting combination of Gothic elements and history, which makes it one of the first possible instances of historical novel. Fifteen years later, in 1821, another novel was published, dealing with King De Bruce’s in 1314, *Bannockburn*. The novel was published anonymously; its author is still unknown, despite some misattributions to Jane Porter.\(^{13}\) Contemporary reviewers received *Bannockburn* in different ways; some praised the author for his/her descriptive powers, while others complained about its being just one among the many historical novels appeared after *Waverley*.\(^{14}\)

Like *Glencore Tower*, the main plot is Gothic and hinges upon the misadventures of poor Clementina, a beautiful young woman compelled by her father to marry Gordon, a chieftain friend of his father (Invercauld) and his attendant, the villain Aberdeen. Aberdeen and Gordon have an agreement about the division of Clementina’s father’s lands after his death and are plotting against him; Aberdeen is the worst of the two, because he is planning to get rid of both Invercauld and Gordon, in order to become the sole laird of Invercauld’s lands and castle.

The novel is divided into three volumes; the first two are devoted to the Gothic plot, while the last one is more concerned with history. Many characters join king Robert de Bruce and fight at his side at Bannockburn, showing a deep hostility towards the English. The enmity with the English is due to their invasion in 1296, when the first War of Scottish Independence began. One of the main characters, Keelie Baun, has been fighting with William Wallace and lost his children in a retaliation; about the consequences of war and its


\(^{14}\) Compare two reviews appeared in 1821:

We were almost tempted to say, on the opening of these volumes, that we were perfectly weary of Scotch novels; nevertheless, there is too much merit in the work before us, to pronounce on it so hastily [...] (Anonymous, *La Belle Assemblée*, n.s. 23 (1821), pp. 279-280, p. 279)

Yet even this does not rescue the story from what we must consider to be a complete failure; and we doubt whether its deficiencies can escape the criticism of the simplest and most uncultivated readers [...] (Anonymous, *Monthly Review*, 2nd series, Dec. 1821, pp. 437-8, p. 438)
violence, the narrator remarks: “War raged hot and violent. Wallace had desperate foes; and the English soldiers sometimes forgot their brave character in rapine and lust”.

If in these novels nostalgia for the past is embodied in two mythic heroes, in other novels it takes more melancholic hues, hinting at lost battles of the past as ineffaceable events in the past of characters. Since these battles were lost by the Scottish, there are no heroes to extol. The first instance of this habit is present in The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of Carron an anonymous novel written in 1809 and set between approximately 1212 and 1235. The dates can be guessed by the analysis of the historical characters, in particular King William the Lion, his wife Ermenegarde and his children Alexander and Margaret. Nationalist complaints about Scottish lost battles are connected with King William’s disaster at Alnwick, in northern England, in 1174 and with King Malcolm’s defeat in the same town in 1093. In both cases, the kings of Scotland invaded Northern England and were defeated by the English army in Alnwick.

Malcolm III was killed in battle with his son and successor, while William was seized by the English, who occupied Scotland and asked a consistent ransom for freeing the Scottish king. In order to be restored on the throne, William the Lion was compelled to sign the Treaty of Falaise, which sanctioned the feudal superiority of the English king over the Scottish sovereign. Thanks to this treaty, England could raise taxes in Scotland and decide on important issues, such as the King’s marriage. The treaty was voided in 1181, in exchange for a great sum of money needed by England for the Crusades. In the novel no mention is made about the Treaty of Falaise, but the lost battles are mentioned by Father Andrew and Donaldbert while touching Alnwick in their pilgrimage to St. Cuberth’s shrine in Durham. Noteworthy, the lost battle of Alnwick and the Treaty of Falaise provide some sort of background to the events narrated in The Scottish Chiefs, showing that hostilities between England and Scotland were already present.

Although less important than the Wars of Independence, the Anglo-Scottish Wars occurred between the Treaty of Berwick (1357) and the 1603 Act of Union of the English and Scottish crowns. The Treaty of Berwick closed the second War of Scottish Independence in a disadvantaged predicament for Scotland, which although managing to maintain its independence, had to pay a consistent sum of money to the English king. Enmities between

16 King William the Lion got married with Ermenegarde de Beaumont, chosen for him by the English King. While in the novel Ermenegarde dies before her husband, in reality the queen outlived William of almost twenty-years, governing alone.
the two kingdoms continued, leading to the breaking out of many wars. No novel is set during one of these wars, nor does it feature any description of the battles and historical characters involved in them; nevertheless, most important battles are mentioned as events that are still important in the past of certain characters who partook in them.

Among the novels studied in this dissertation, there are two instances of this pattern, one in Peter Middleton Darling’s *The Romance of the Highlands* and the other in the anonymous 1817 novel called *Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-Muir*. *The Romance of the Highlands* was published in 1810 and follows the paradigmatic structure established in Ann Radcliffe’s Gothic novels. This pure Gothic novel is set on the Grampians chain of the Highlands during the fifteenth century. The precise year in which the events narrated occur cannot be established, but the decade in which they happen can be comfortably guessed, thanks to the Earl of Glendowan’s account of his youthful adventures. He was a friend of the late Viscount of Dunbarny; they had fought together against the English and tried to warn the Scottish king, James I, against the conspiracy set against him by the Earl of Atholl (his uncle), in 1437. The battle in which Glendowan and Dunbarny fought is likely to be the 1436 Battle of Piperdean and the novel is set about 20 or 25 years later.\(^{17}\)

In *Reft Rob* history plays a minor role. The only historical event mentioned by the unknown author is the Battle of Flodden, lost by the Scots in 1513.\(^{18}\) The battle was lost by the Scots, whose king died alongside with many of his fellow countrymen. In the novel, the battle is part of the past of Auld Weedy Paddock, an old man who, once returned among his mountains after the battle, became a wanderer and a vagabond. Weedy is a good man and a friend to Florinda and her brother; nevertheless, after Flodden he was probably unable to find his place in civil society again, becoming the symbol of that kind of outsiderness caused by war (many soldiers of every age experience a sense of outsiderness and isolation from society when they come back from battlefields).

Both novels provide a clear example of the way in which, although only in the background, lost battles were still an open wound in Scottish history which nationalist writers could not avoid mentioning in their novels. In other novels, instead, history becomes one of the major issues. *Monteith. A Novel. Founded on Scottish History* (1805) is likely to be the earliest Scottish Gothic novel in which history plays a more relevant role, as the novel’s

\(^{17}\) Kenneth, the protagonist of the novel, was raised by a cottager, Duncan, but he actually is the son of the Late Viscount of Dunbarny. He was born when the Viscount came back from the Battle of Piperdean and is now about twenty or twenty-five years old.

\(^{18}\) This battle is the subject of Sir Walter Scott’s renown 1808 poem, *Marmion; A Tale of Flodden Field*. 
title suggest. The author of the novel signs herself Mrs Rice, but her true identity is still unknown. In *Monteith*, Mrs Rice develops a typical Gothic plot, set in remote northern island of Scotland, where the evil deeds of the villain St Croix are intertwined with the religious struggles characterising the reign of Mary Queen of Scots lasting from 1542 to 1587. Some major historical events are contemporary to the plot, such as the Queen’s flight from Lochleven Castle in 1568.

Religious struggles stain the marriage of the protagonist, Henry Monteith, and his wife, Gertrude Forbes. While Monteith is a Catholic, Gertrude and her family are Protestants. In one of many religious battles, Monteith and Gertrude’s father fight against each other and Monteith wins the fight, killing Gertrude’s father. The woman wisely accepts the event as a natural consequence of war, without blaming her husband.

As this account of the novels set in the remote past shows, early-nineteenth-century writers laid the stress on Scotland’s national independence. The battles fought against the English, being won or lost, represent Scotland’s struggles to preserve its independence (the Wars of Scottish Independence) and to expand beyond their borders (Anglo-Scottish Wars). Won battles are an occasion for extolling the great qualities of Scottish character and turning them into symbols of national identity. Lost battles, on the other hand, are rarely portrayed directly and are present only as past events that belong to the past of certain characters who, like Weedy Paddock, have been significantly influenced by these events.

4. Liminal Period

By “liminal” period, I define the years from 1603 to 1746, that is to say, the period from the Union of the English and Scottish Crowns to the 1745 Jacobite Rising. The concept of “liminality” is widely used in post-colonial studies; in fact, it is a useful instrument to study the political and cultural dynamics involving colonised territories and former colonies. The idea was first developed in the field of anthropology during the early twentieth century. It appeared for the first time in Arnold van Gennep’s 1909 work, *Les rites de passage*. Van Gennep’s work was translated into English and issued in 1960. A. Van Gennep, *The Rites of Passage*, M. B. Vizedom, G.L. Caffee (transl.), Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1960.

---

19 The theory of the rites of passage was further developed and extended to Western societies by V.W. Turner, *The Forest of Symbols*, Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1967. It was then widely employed in anthropology to describe the condition of the anthropologist when he/she comes into contact with a different culture, highlighting his/her in-betweeness; see R. Wagner, *The Invention of Culture*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1975. The concept of liminality is also employed in post-colonial and feminist literary studies such as P. Dodgson-Katiyo, G. Wisker (eds), *Rites of Passage in Postcolonial Women Writers*, Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2010.

Gennep focused on the social mechanisms regulating inclusion into society in primitive social structures, such as tribes and clans. According to Gennep, a common structure controlling the development of the identity of people and their position in society exists. This structure describes the individual’s growth as a rite of passage divided into three main stages: the separation from the individual’s background, the overcoming of a situation of liminality and the eventual inclusion in society.

Liminality is the intermediate stage of the rite of passage; it is a condition of in-betweenness between a starting and an ending predicament. As such, it is at the very core of the reshaping of identity; for instance, adolescence is a liminal stage in which the identity of the person is reshaped from that of the child to that of the adult. Noteworthy, the idea of liminality can be used to describe not only the predicament of a single person, but that of a whole group of people, society or nation. In fact, major historical events such as revolutions and wars represent liminal stages in which the identity of each group is redefined. On the national scale, liminal stages are characterised by political instability, anarchy and violence.

In the years spanning from 1603 and 1746, Scotland experienced a period of liminality. In fact, political indeterminacy characterised the intermediate stage between the Union of the Crowns and the final inclusion of all Scottish territories in the United Kingdom. Before the 1707 Union of the Parliaments, Scotland was still partly independent, because it had its own Privy Council. After that final Act of Union, a large part of Scotland still escaped from the control of London. The Highlands preserved their feudal structure, according to which allegiance was primarily pledged to the chieftain, and then to the king. While some Highland chiefs immediately supported William of Orange (as the Duke of Argyle), others continued to be faithful to James II, filling the rows of Jacobite rebels deciding to restore the Stuarts on the throne. Noteworthy, these risings were not aimed at the restoration of independence, but on royal claims and, therefore, on Scotland’s desire to assert its political power within the United Kingdom.

From a political viewpoint, the accomplishment of the union deprived Scotland of its national independence and created an unbridgeable gap between the past and the present of this nation. Political instability and the spirit of rebellion took the lead with the Jacobite Risings, which well embody the potential for revolution against the establishment typical of liminal stages.

Rather interestingly, national writers dealing with the liminal stage of Scottish history decided to set their novels during the period of the Jacobite Risings, avoiding the
years from 1603 to 1689. I believe that this choice is rooted in the desire to draw attention to the Jacobite rebellions, portraying them as the core of the process that led Scotland from being an independent nation to being a region in the United Kingdom. In fact, it was only with the end of the 1745 Jacobite Rising that the Highlands were eventually annexed to the kingdom and that both Lowlanders and Highlanders eventually gave up all desires of national independence. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the failure of the Jacobite rebellions is represented as the last attempt made by Scotland to assert its detachment from English cultural and national identity in politics.

Noteworthy, the Jacobite period is a favourite choice for nationalist writers active after the issuing of *Waverley*, Scott’s novel set during the 1745 Jacobite rising. Scott’s innovative decision to set his novel in an historical period which was at the same time distant and not too remote to be detached from present Scotland’s predicament was appreciated by many novelists, who decided to follow in his steps and to set their novels during the early eighteenth century. Jacobitism became a literary subject, which every writer interpreted in his own way, according to his personal convictions and nationalist ideas. Scott had created a new chronotope, that of the historical novel, which featured the Jacobite years as a temporal setting (in *Waverley* and *Rob Roy*, for instance). Nationalist writers made use of it to investigate pre-1745 history, in order to find traces of their national identity and examples of the true Scottish character and manners.

The novels set during the Jacobite period highlight how the potential for rebellion intrinsic in Jacobitism was fuelled by some English government’s mistakes, such as the massacre of Glencoe and the execution of the Black Watch deserters in 1743 (See Chapter IV). The massacre of Glencoe is certainly connected with Jacobitism, because it happened as a sort of English retaliation for the 1689 Jacobite rising led by the Marquess of Montrose. It had all the mercilessness and cruelty of a military retaliation and was considered by many Scots, both from the Lowlands and the Highlands, as a symptom of William of Orange’s inability to govern. The event is portrayed in Rosalia St. Clair’s *The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon* (1832). The novel highlights the treacherousness of Captain Campbell of Glenlyon who, after enjoying the chief of Glencoe’s hospitality for several days, received orders to attack the chief and his family, as well as the villagers. In the novel, the son of the chief survives, goes to serve the British army in France for some years and, when he goes back to the Highlands, defies Captain Campbell in duel and kills him.
Besides pointing to the massacre of Glencoe as to one of the main causes of the further spreading of Jacobitism in Scotland, Rosalia St. Clair tries to develop a compensatory plot, giving Glencoe’s son the chance to avenge his family and clansmen. Noteworthy, young Glencoe does not take his vengeance by joining the Jacobites; instead, he faces Captain Campbell directly in duel, taking his personal revenge.

As already seen in Chapter IV, in the anonymous 1817 novel Conirdan; or, The St Kildians, the massacre represents an indelible wound in the past not only of Scottish people, but also of the English, because Mr Robertson is actually an Englishman. Conirdan is set in the years 1710 to 1713; it is during this period that the protagonist’s quest for happiness and identity leads him to Glencoe and to the acknowledgement of his true identity – he is the son of a young couple killed in the massacre of Glencoe. Conirdan’s identity entails a burden of sorrow and tragedy that symbolically represents Scotland’s sorrowful past. In the eyes of nationalist writers, this past was dense with acts of merciless violence that, like the massacre of Glencoe, whose victims were not only the rebels, but also innocent and undeserving people.

There is just one novel set during the 1715 Jacobite Rising, David Carey’s A Legend of Argyle. In this dissertation, much has already been written about the historical perspective adopted by the novelist, whose anti-Jacobitism emerges both in the celebration of the Duke of Argyle as a hero of modern Scotland, and in the attempts to discredit the Earl of Mar and the Jacobite cause by associating it with the villain Ronay. In Carey’s novel, the events of the Fifteen are carefully portrayed and intertwined with General Gordon’s quest for identity and family roots. As in Conirdan, the protagonist discovers that his origins lay in a land of injustice, although in A Legend of Argyle, the perspective is turned upside down, with the Campbells portrayed as heroes and the Jacobites as villains.

The period following the 1715 is portrayed in two novels: Andrew Picken’s The Black Watch and George Robert Gleig’s Allan Breck, both published in 1834. In both novels, the 1743 desertion of more than a hundred Black Watch soldiers is mentioned but, while in The Black Watch it is at the core of the novel, in Allan Breck it remains in the background. The Black Watch is set between 1741 and 1746; like other historical novel writers, Andrew Picken links the fate of his protagonist, Hector Munro, to the major historical events of the period. Moreover, like Edwin in the first book of James Beattie’s The Minstrel, Hector leaves his home in Inverness for the mountains, in search for romantic landscape and freedom. Besides poetical inspiration, Hector also meets with hunger, fatigue and starvation;
therefore, he is compelled to repair in Perth, were a widowed woman rescues him and procures him an employment at an important tradesman’s shop.

In Perth, Hector partakes in the rescuing of M’Naughton, a Highland outlaw imprisoned and waiting for the execution of the death sentence. In return for his support, Hector is invited by the organiser of M’Naughton’s escape, Glenmore, to join them in their journey back to the Highlands. After several events – among them the desertion and execution of the Black Watch soldiers, and Hector’s ineffective attempts to save his Black Watch friends from the death sentence – Hector enters the Black Watch and is sent to fight at Fontenoy, in France. Towards the end of the 1745 Jacobite rising, he is sent back to the Highlands and ordered to pacificate the riotous valley of Corrie-Vryn (the very place where his friends, M’Naughton and Glenmore lived). Hector preserves the defenceless Highlander from the fury of his commander. Moreover, he discovers his true identity – he is the son of a wise and moderate General of the British army.

As in The Doomed One, despite pointing to the sentencing to death of the deserters in 1743 as a cause of adherence to Jacobitism, Picken does not turn his hero into a Jacobite, keeping him even outside Scotland during the 1745 rebellion. Hector has many Jacobite friends, but he is never compelled to decide which side to stand, whether with the Jacobites or the Whigs. His last mission (that is to say, to get Corrie-Vryn free of all rebels) shows that his sympathy with the Jacobites stems from their dejected and disgraced situation.

At the end of the novel, Hector discovers that his father is General Lamont. Lamont is a wise man, and provides a balanced analysis of Glenmore’s behaviour, also claiming that many people’s discontent with the English government is not rooted in Jacobitism, but in oppression and dejected way of life:

“[Glenmore] no more deserves to be fastened upon him the opprobrious term Jacobitism, so liberally bestowed on all occasions of difference of opinion by the party cant of this unhappy time, than I do, or than you do yourself; although, I must confess, he appears both better informed as to the facts, and more influenced by motives of humanity and justice, than many whose overflowing zeal for the strongest side is ever on the watch for occasions of accusation and exasperation, to the oppressed and necessarily discontented”. 21

General Lamont highlights the fact that many among the supporters of the Jacobites were not supporters of the Stuarts, but discontented people in search for an alternative to English policies.

Unlike Hector Munro, the protagonist of Allan Breck gets actively involved in the Forty Five rebellion, playing a major role as commander and warrior in the Jacobite army. The title of the novel is somehow misleading; to readers accustomed to historical fiction, the name of Allan Breck can hint to Allan Breck Stuart, a member of the Stuarts of Appin clan, known for his support to the Jacobites and his suspected partaking in the Appin Murder. The Appin Murder occurred in 1752, when Colin Roy Campbell, Factor of King George and responsible for tax rising in the county of Appin, was shot by an unknown murderer. Allan Stuart flew away to France, suspected to be the murderer of Colin Roy, while his foster father, James “of the Glen”, was seized, tried and sentenced to death as an accomplice in the murder. Allan always denied any partaking in the criminal act, although before the murder he used to speak against Colin Campbell with violence. Since the Appin Murder is mentioned by Scott in the introduction to Rob Roy (1817), 1834 readers of historical fiction must have immediately thought to Allan Stuart when they read the title of Gleig’s novel.22

Despite the fact that the Allan Breck of Gleig is not a literary representation of Allan Breck Stuart, certain circumstances in his life seem to be inspired to Allan Breck’s real life. Allan Stuart was surnamed “breck” because his face was pitted and scarred with the smallpox; in Gaelic, indeed, “braec” means “spotted”. Allan Breck Macdiarmid, the protagonist of Gleig’s novel, had his face completely wrecked by the smallpox during his teens; he is not just spotted, but disfigured: “The marks of that visitation were imprinted as if with brands of heated iron. The small-pox had seamed his countenance in the most loathsome manner”.23

Besides the smallpox scarring, another fault of the real Allan Breck is embodied in Allan Macdiarmid, though in an extremely exaggerated and magnified way – the vice of playing at cards. Moreover, like Allan Stuart, Allan Breck Macdiarmid joins George II’s British army, only to desert it after a short time and join the Jacobites. The Appin Murder may also have served as inspiration for MacApline’s murder and the sentencing to death of Fergus Macdiarmid, Allan’s uncle. Like the real Allan Breck, Gleig’s Allan is suspected of being the murdered and flies to France, denying having committed the crime for the rest of his life.

Despite similar circumstances, Allan Macdiarmid is a completely literary character and possibly the only romantic hero that appears as the protagonist of an early-nineteenth-century nationalist novel. Allan is a despised man, but insight into his soul stirs the reader’s

22 The Appin Murder is the core event in Robert Louis Stevenson’s Kidnapped, published in 1871.
compassion (despite his hideous deeds); what condemns Allan are not his deeds, but his conviction of being beyond the limit of repentance, a conviction which leads him in a vortex of vice that leads him further astray from the path of virtue.

Allan Breck is primarily a moral novel; nevertheless, the life of the protagonist is signed by major historical events, turning history into a quite important element. Allan was born right after the Fifteen; he fought in the Forty Five and was compelled to escape to France, where he joined the French army. Even in France, Allan cannot escape from the power of history; there, indeed, he is seized by the rebels and beheaded during the French Revolution in 1789.

Allan’s clan, the Macdiarmids, are described as a Jacobite clan, faithful to the cause and active in both risings. In the 1715 rising, which the author calls “the ill-advised rising under the Earl of Mar”, the clan partook heroically, but suffered the consequences of their allegiance to the Stuarts after the end of the rebellion, when their territories were struck by the “vengeance of the conqueror”. The Forty Five is portrayed in more detail, because Allan takes an active part in it. Gleig focuses on the feelings of the Jacobite army while retiring from Derby, describing the retreat as the event that “sealed for ever the destiny of a race, not more conspicuous for their errors that their misfortunes”.

Gleig’s justification for not “entering into all detail” while describing the Forty Five are concerned both with genre (his aim is not that of writing an historical novel) and with the awareness that his work would instantly be compared to the Waverley novels:

We have not forgotten that of the manner in which these noble games were celebrated the author of Waverley has in the first of his immortal tales given an accurate account. To that source of information, therefore, we would refer our readers, could we for a moment imagine that it is not already familiar to them; while we excuse ourselves from entering into all detail, on the obvious ground that no man would think of holding “a farthing candle to the sun”.

Gleig’s remark highlights how, twenty years after the issuing of Waverley, Scott’s novel had already become a classic and, most interestingly, an intertextual reference. Most readers, indeed, were well acquainted with Scott’s novels and minor novelists were obviously aware that their works could be compared with the Waverley Novels.

Unlike Gleig, David Carey decided to focus on the events of the Forty Five, portraying the rising in full detail. His first historical novel, Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden,
is indeed devoted to the 1745 Jacobite rebellion. It is written as an historical novel of the kind popularised by Scott, recalling *Waverley* due to its historical setting. In *Lochiel*, Carey focuses on Jacobitism as a lost cause; the novel is filled with historical characters, most of them being Jacobites: Charles Edward Stuart, Lochiel Cameron, the Lord of Keppoch, John Roy Stuart, the Lord of Glengarry and Lord Lovat. Lochiel’s character is developed in order to represent the Jacobite cause as an exploit doomed to failure from the start. Lochiel and his niece, Miss Jeannie Cameron, represent the good side of Jacobitism, while the so-called “triumvirate” (Lord of Keppoch, John Roy Stuart and Provost Mac Quick) represent the mercenary and corrupt aspects of Jacobitism. Lord Lovat, an already ambiguous figure of Scottish history, is here even turned into a debased Gothic villain, plotting against Lochiel and attempting to abduct his daughter. The approach about Jacobitism held in *Lochiel* is preserved in Carey’s second historical novel, *A Legend of Argyle*; both novels are aimed at discrediting the supporters of the exiled Stuarts.

The last novel set during the Jacobite period is *The Highlander. A Tale of My Landlady*. The novel is set in 1746, after the battle of Culloden. The main aim of the novel is moral and shows what consequences can derive from disobedience. The cause of Jacobitism is lost and Prince Charles Edward Stuart is now a fugitive, wandering among the Highlands in the attempt to avoid being seized by the British army. In the meanwhile, many Highlanders who lost their chieftains are taking shelter in the wilderness of the Highlands, hiding from the Dragoons.

In all these novels, history is connected with individual choices that lead the protagonists to partake in historical events, like Johnnie Baillie’s meeting with Prince Charles Edward Stuart, after having chosen to join the M’Leods in *The Highlander*, or Hector Munro’s joining the Black Watch as a consequence of his initial desire to go and live on the Highlands. Partaking in history sometimes allows the characters to discover more about their origins and family roots, like Evan in *Lochiel* or General Gordon in *A Legend of Argyle*.

5. Recent Past

The novels set after the battle of Culloden represent the majority of the novels studied in this dissertation. The period is the one highlighted in the second part of the title of *Waverley*, that is to say, those “sixty years since” (or, more properly, seventy years), during which Scotland and, more in particular, Scotland, changed dramatically. After Culloden, the English completed the union with Scotland by domesticating the Highlands, an area which, even when Scotland was an independent nation, was considered to be peripheral. Among
these novels, some are focused on the depiction of Scottish manners and habits, while others are more concerned with the effects of history on the present, such as Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans* and Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary*.

In the national tales set during this period, history plays a less crucial role; among the many historical events occurred, only the Clearances are directly portrayed. Instead, the wars mentioned in the novel take place in the continent, away from the United Kingdom. In the great majority of the novels set after the Forty Five, identity is more concerned with characterisation than with history; moreover, the Highland myth is often employed to show the virtues of heroes and heroines whose character should be considered as illustrative of the Scottish character.

*Clan-Albin* (1815), Christian Isobel Johnstone’s first novel, is set around 1780, in a small Highland glen (Glen Albin) and the relative village (Dunalbin). In Glen Albin, improvement entails that most lands will be devoted to sheep-farming, compelling the inhabitants to emigrate, in order to find another way to earn their living. In Dunalbin about thirty families lived in peace; improvement compels them to go to America, where they establish a new colony and begin a new life. Norman, the protagonist of the novel, chooses instead to join the British army; as a soldier, he is sent to fight in the Continent. Improvement and change are, then, the cause of people’s being sent far from their birthplace.

Christian I. Johnstone devotes the first volume of her novel to the depiction of the manners, habits and traditions of the Highlands. Jacobitism is scarcely mentioned, while feudalism is tinged with nostalgic admiration and embodied in the figure of Lady Augusta: “Embosomed in the solitude of the mountains, she appeared to them the embodied spirit of benevolence and feudal kindness”.\(^{27}\) The manners of the Highlanders and their character are frequently extolled; the following quotation is just one instance of the many praising descriptions of Highland virtue:

> The simple, unaccommodated lives of the inhabitants, their romantic virtues and enthusiastic attachment to the Chief, and to the Clan; -every pleasing peculiarity of national manners, which then marked them a distinct people, -a race which society in its progress seemed to have forgotten, -undebased by its corruptions, unimpressed by its usages, still bearing the lofty character of heroic times, -all combined to seize the imagination, and to interest the heart through its powerful medium.\(^{28}\)


\(^{28}\) *Ibidem*, p. 22.
Noteworthy, this passage also highlights Johnstone’s attention to the disappearance of Highland virtues, due to the progress of society or, as we call it, improvement.

In *The Lairds of Glenfern*, published one year after *Clan-Albin*, Mary Johnston describes the lives of two siblings, Charles and Helen Grant, the grandchildren of Duncan Grant, the decayed laird of Glenfern, in the Highlands. Like Norman in *Clan-Albin*, Charles leaves the Highlands to join the British army; he is sent to fight in Spain and Portugal during the Napoleonic Wars (the novel is set at the beginning of the nineteenth century). His sister Helen leaves the Highlands as well, moving to the West Indies with her husband, a successful tradesman in that area. Both novels highlight the hardships endured by the Highlanders after improvement. Although the heroes and heroines of these two novels manage to go back to their birthplace in the Highlands, their life is clearly affected by the union with England and the enforcement of progress. While fortune allows them to go back to the Highlands, many others were not that lucky, and were compelled to definitively abandon their lands and villages.

Another novel concerned with improvement is *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*. In her 1808 short novel, Elizabeth Hamilton seems to endorse the improvers’ perspective, describing how Mrs Mason’s activity has significantly improved the small village of Glenburnie in quite a short time. The habits and manners of the villagers are much in tune with Whiggish prejudice about Highland dirtiness and idleness, developing a sort of “anti” Highland myth.

The same anti-Highland perspective characterises also Ellen Percy’s first experiences of the Highlands in Mary Brunton’s *Discipline*. In this 1814 conduct novel, Brunton leads her heroine on the Highlands, after a long period of poverty, destitution and hardships in London and Edinburgh. Led by her friend Charlotte Graham, she undertakes the journey from Edinburgh to Charlotte’s castle in Glen Eredine. Once passed the Highland line, beyond Perth, they spend a night in a small inn, where Charlotte is perfectly at ease, while Ellen experiences a deep disgust for the dirtiness of the inn and its hostess. The scene at the inn seems a rewriting of Mrs Mason’s first meeting with Mrs Maclarty in *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*; this comparison is supported by the fact that Mary Brunton mentions Elizabeth Hamilton’s novel in the preface to her novel.29

In *Discipline*, the anti-Highland perspective is completely turned upside down in the portrait of the Grahams and their manners. Henry Graham, in particular, is characterised as

---

endowed with all the best qualities attached to the Scottish mountaineers in the Highland myth, from generosity and hospitality, to endurance of hardships and virtue. Ellen’s choice to marry Mr Henry Graham and to establish in the Highlands proves Brunton’s preference for the Highland myth over the anti-Highland perspective.

Among the novels set after 1746, the one less concerned with history is probably Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*, written in 1825. In this novel, the perspective on the Highlands is exemplified in two Highland characters: Lochandhu and his brother. While Lochandhu is an honest and hospitable man, moved to sympathy with Amherst due to his old friendship with Amherst’s father, his brother Alexander Macgillivray is a real villain, a ruthless bandit and a violent man, for whom money is the only thing that matters in life. Overall, the dominant perspective is a negative one, because the Highlands are represented as a dangerous place, inhabited by dangerous people.

Honoria Scott’s *The Vale of the Clyde* and *Strathmay; or, Scenes in the North* also show scarce interest in history. In *The Vale of the Clyde*, there are only some hints to a long lasting enmity between the heroine’s mother’s family of Jacobites and her father’s family of Whigs. In Robert Mudie’s *Genfergus*, instead, history is present in the past of an old cottager still regretting the Jacobite defeat at Culloden. In Chapter XX, the Heroine of the novel, Clarinda Bonclair, goes out on an excursion with her friend Saville. Amidst the beautiful Highland landscape they find the cottage of Duncan Livingston, the only survivor of his clan at Culloden, who also managed to save the standard of his clan from destruction in battle. The standard preserved by Duncan represents the identity of his clan, as well as the memory of the battle. Duncan is deeply patriotic, but his attachment is to old Scotland and the lost cause of Jacobitism, not to modern Scotland and Great Britain.

The Forty Five is echoed in three other novels: *The Scottish Orphans*, *Arthur Monteith* and *Highland Mary*. Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans* and its sequel, *Arthur Monteith*, are both subtitled “A Moral Tale”, drawing attention to the author’s didactic aim. Both novels were published in 1822 and are focused on the life of Arthur Monteith, a youth who discovers that his father (Hector Monteith) was sentenced to death after Culloden. In her moral novels, Blackford highlights how the real cause of Arthur’s orphanage lays not in his father’s Jacobitism, but in the cold-hearted, greedy and malicious temperament of Hector’s uncle, Colonel Monteith, who plotted against Hector, in order to take possession of his estate. The Colonel fought in the British army and was a friend of the Duke of Cumberland, who supports his plotting and officially assigns the forfeited lands of the
Monteiths to the Colonel. In Blackford’s two novels, history becomes an instrument in the hands of greedy and ruthless people, like the Colonel.

In Alexander Balfour’s novel, *Highland Mary*, the protagonist is again an orphan, whose life is decidedly conditioned by the consequences of history on common people’s lives. Mary Macdonald is, indeed, the daughter of a Jacobite Highlander, exiled after Culloden, called Angus Macdonald. Angus entrusted his daughter Mary to the care of his English friend, Captain Bruce, aware that he could not provide for her once exiled. Bruce welcomed Mary in his family and took care of her for six years; then, he entrusted her to a London family, the Wilmots, paying for her boarding. The Wilmots treat Mary more like a servant, than like a guest. When Bruce dies, he leaves his manse at Burnfoot to Mary, but Mr Wilmot forges the will and calls himself the designated heir to the manse. Eventually, Mr Wilmot’s plot is uncovered and the manse is restored to Mary, its rightful possessor. Noteworthy, the actual cause of Mary’s misfortunes is not Jacobitism; instead, it reaches back in Scottish history to the massacre of Glencoe. Mary’s great-grandfather was killed at Glencoe and his son swore to avenge his death, joining the Jacobites and asking his son (Mary’s father) to follow in his steps and to be faithful to the exiled Stuarts. In fact, Angus partook in the 1745 Jacobite rising out of filial duty, rather than a real attachment to the Stuart cause.

Alexander Balfour explicitly remarks about the massacre of Glencoe as the cause of the spreading of Jacobitism in Scotland, exemplifying his conviction (which will be shared by Rosalia St. Clair in *The Doomed One* in 1832) in Mary Macdonald’s life, showing the long-lasting consequences of historical events on people’s lives. Despite his condemnation of English mistakes, Balfour is a nostalgic Jacobite, as the following quotations prove:

> [...] the massacre of Glencoe, that indelible stain upon the character of a monarch, to whom Britain is indebted for her release from the yoke of a blind and superstitious bigot, and who confirmed the civil and religious liberty which she still enjoys.  

> Whatever might have been the motives which prompted that horrible tragedy, the consequences were such as a very short-sighted politician might have anticipated. Those who adhered to the abdicated monarch had their prejudices against his successor confirmed; and those who were wavering, or luke-warm, were afraid to place confidence in a king, who had shown himself so faithless and cruel; and it is beyond a doubt, that this event cherished and kept alive that

---

attachment to the Stuart family, which was never extinguished till every hope was lost by the race becoming extinct.  

The author of the novel tries to provide a balanced view of the events happened during the early nineteenth century, pointing out that many hardships and difficulties suffered by Scottish people during the late eighteenth century are deeply rooted in the historical events of the previous years. Balfour adopts the Highland myth in the characterisation of Mary Macdonald, by describing her perfectly virtuous behaviour and turning it into an example for Scotswomen to follow.

Mary Macdonald is an extremely upright and honest woman; her virtues and qualities characterise her as a Highland heroine, in a way much alike another Highland heroine, Flora Glenmore. Flora is the protagonist of Felix M’Donough’s The Highlander. A Tale. Flora refuses the advances of the English libertine Gerald de Brook, who takes shelter in Flora’s father’s castle during a storm. After her father’s financial ruin and arrest, Flora is compelled to leave her native glen and the Highlands to go to London. Her life in London is full of hardships and represents the life led by emigrated Highlanders who left their native soil during the Clearances. The novel takes into account improvement and its effects on Highland economy; Flora’s father being ruined shows the consequences of progress in the Highlands. The Glenmores are a Jacobite family; they still keep “a portrait of Prince Charles Edward, surmounted by a diadem, with a rosette of ribbons, which was renovated on the 10th of June, annually”. Old Glenmore likes to tell the story of his family’s active attachment to the Stuarts and its terrible consequences on Highland life:

Glenmore repeated the tale of the fidelity of his house to the favoured but fugitive Stuart, and the misfortune which their devoted attachment to his hapless cause had entailed upon them. He spoke of the brave band, which, led on by his father, had, upon the fatal muir of Drumrossie, hewed the first line of Cumberland’s army, turned the second, and stood, till but the Chief and three others, who could find no death even on that bloody field, were left remaining, to follow the fugitive and tell the tale. He spoke of the cruelties perpetrated by the conqueror upon the scattered, and the unoffending remnants of a devoted people, who had drawn their swords, not in the cause of rebellion, but in that of hospitality, not in aid of a foreign invader, but for him whom they considered bone of their bone, and flesh of their flesh. He depicted the smoking huts, and the scattered and starving inhabitants that were given over to the fury of those, who,

\footnote{A. Balfour, op. cit., p. 172.}

\footnote{F. M’Donough, op. cit., Vol. I, p. 23. The 10th of June is the White Rose Day, which celebrates the Old Pretender’s birth date (10/06/1688). The White Rose was chosen as a symbol by the Stuarts in imitation of the House of York who, during the Wars of the Roses for the English throne fought against the Lancasters, adopted the white rose as their symbol. The Lancasters, instead, had a red rose as a symbol. The war lasted more than thirty years, from 1455 to 1487, and was finally won by the Lancasters. The choice of the white rose can be seen as a bad omen, confirmed in the Stuarts’ final defeat at Culloden.}
while the sword was yet in the hand of the clans, and their strength unbroken, had sneaked, crouching and cowardly, into holes and hiding places.33

This long quotation from Glenmore’s account of his family’s fate after Culloden is one of the most interesting and accurate among the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus. Noteworthy, M’Donough employs the word “conqueror” speaking of the British army, an expression that will be used also by G. R. Gleig in Allan Breck. The use of this word provides some evidence of the nationalist novelists’ idea that conquest is at the core of the union between Scotland and England, not mutual support and interest.

6. Conclusion
The overview of the novels set between the end of the Jacobite risings and the early nineteenth century shows that history plays a minor role in these novels, if compared to that played in novels set in a more distant past. It can be concluded that the quest for national identity led writers to focus on both remote and middle-way past, while the years following the battle of Culloden are a favourite setting for novels focused on the description of Scottish character and manners. In the novel set in the end of the eighteenth century and the beginning of the nineteenth, historical events are present both as an echo of the past that still conditions the present, such as The Scottish Orphans, and Highland Mary, and a dangerous predicament external to the nation, in which the hero partakes as a member of the British army.

Joining the British army entails both an occasion to show the hero’s skill in battle and his honest and virtuous behaviour, as in Macrimmon and The Laird of Glenfern, and to accept Scottish new identity as a part of Great Britain. If during the Jacobite risings joining the rebel army was a symptom of protest against the establishment, in these novels joining the British army becomes a first step towards national integration between Scotland and England.

CHAPTER VIII

Landscape and Identity

1. Introduction

At the beginning of Chapter VII, I introduced the concept of chronotope; in this chapter, I focus on what we may call “the spatial coordinate” of the chronotope, that is to say, the representation of space in the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus. The chronotope is the structure on which the plot is developed; it is the very world in which characters move and act. As such, the chronotope is liable to certain laws and rules, which vary according to the literary genre as well as to the aims and concerns of the authors. The novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus share the same interest in national identity; therefore, this chapter is aimed at providing an analysis of the way in which this concern affects the representation of social and natural environment. Although not all the novels here taken into account seem to be aimed at the definition of Scottish manners and national character, most of early-nineteenth-century novelists convey (either aware or unaware) a certain interest in identity. In the case of less explicitly nationalist texts, traces of interest in national identity are detectable both in the historical setting and in the representation of space.

In order to better investigate the way in which social and natural environment are represented in early-nineteenth-century nationalist novels, I focus on landscape. After providing the reader with a short account of the dominant theories of landscape, I will consider the reason why the Highlands became so popular as a setting in early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels, highlighting the implicit connection between industrialisation, tourism, romanticism and the new interest in sublime and wilderness. The Highlands, indeed, became a stereotypical sublime setting, in which certain landscape features gained symbolic meaning, connected with the general concerns with nature and national identity. I will also provide extensive quotations, showing how landscape descriptions of the Highlands before the age of improvement are endowed with different meanings from those of the post-improvement period.

2. Landscape Theories: Reality and its Representations

Landscape is a quite vague idea, liable to manifold interpretations that, on their turn, give origin to a number of different theories. Originally, the word was employed to
describe a portion of space that could be represented through painting. Noteworthy, the idea of landscape was already connected with a process of choice and representation, connoting a subjective approach to reality. With the passing of time, the idea of landscape evolved into a cultural and geographical idea, stressing the link between reality and its representation.

Nowadays, landscape theories are divided into two main groups, considering landscape either as reality itself (that is to say, as a portion of the world), or as the way in which man perceives and represents the environment that surrounds him. According to the first group of theories, landscape can be considered as “a material or tangible portion of environment”.¹ “Landscape” refers to the results of the interaction between man and nature; it is employed in geography studies as a complement to the study of territory, because able to describe space as “a social product”, that is to say, the results of “a collective human transformation of nature”.²

One of the first contributors to the development of the idea of landscape as a tangible social product is the US theorist Carl Sauer.³ According to Sauer, landscape is “primarily factual and objective, it is an external, independent, material field, a unified synthesis and arrangement of material forms and objects”.⁴ For Sauer, landscape is just another word for geography, a symbiotic system in which man is influenced by nature the same way in which nature is reshaped by man. In this system, mutual influence leads to an equilibrium, in which man and nature adapt to one another.

Although this theory of landscape, which we may label as “geographical”, is not concerned with representations, it can provide us with a link between environment and identity. By being the result of a process of mutual influence, each landscape is unique and different from the others, because, besides the obviously different natural features, it also bears the effects of a certain group of people’s actions. When man adapts to a certain environment, his identity is affected by the climatic and structural features of that place, while the place itself, as long as man inhabits in and exploits it, bears the signs of man’s activity and mirrors his specific identity. Mountain landscapes, for instance, are different from coast landscapes, not only out of their different natural formation and aspect, but also

---

¹ R. Muir, op. cit., p. xv.
³ Carl Sauer (1889-1975) was born in Missouri. His most relevant work is The Morphology of Landscape (1926).
due to different architecture and the way in which people exploit territory (agriculture, fishing, hunting, etc.). Therefore, we may conclude that environment mirrors the habits and manners of the people inhabiting in it.

To the idea of landscape as a portion of physical world we inhabit, another group of theories stands as opposed, considering landscape as a representation of the world (or of geography). These theories, which can be called “representational”, focus on the mimetic powers of human imagination and, therefore, of visual and non-visual means of representation. One of the main theories describing landscape as a representation of the world is provided by Denis Cosgrove. In *Social Formation and Symbolic Landscape*, Cosgrove claims that landscape must be considered as “a way of seeing” the world, a subjective interpretation of the surrounding environment made by man to himself, in order to better understand reality.\(^5\)

As such, landscape is no longer something tangible; instead, it is a sort of cognitive paradigm partaking in the perception and representation of reality, biased by social habits and manners. Landscape representations need an observer who perceives and interprets reality, creating a sort of mental representation (or map) of the world. In this process, “complex environmental reality” is simplified into “an environmental image”, which depends upon the ideas and experience of the observer.\(^6\)

In representational theories, landscape is considered as a simplified environmental image which can either remain a mental idea, or being rendered into a tangible representation of reality through drawing, painting or other visual and non-visual means, such as writing and speech.\(^7\) This representation of the world, although being a simplification of reality, is referential, in the sense that it gains more meaning when related to the original, that is to say, to the place represented. Reality is a complex system of features that man can perceive thanks to his senses; senses mediate the perception of the surrounding world, while the mind elaborates the perceptions, selecting certain features instead of others and combining them into ideas. This process of choice is affected not only by personal experience, but also by cultural influences. Therefore, culture directly affects the formation of landscape as a representation, also setting it into relationship with identity.

---


\(^6\) R. Muir, *op. cit.*, p. 126

3. A Construct of the Mind: the Highlands Perceived Landscape

If considered as a representation, landscape is obviously a “construct of the mind”, relying upon sensorial perception, personal experience and cultural identity. Literature is one of the means through which landscape can be rendered into a tangible representation and shared with other people. Therefore, literature can be studied as a useful source of information about the way in which the environment is perceived by people during a certain period.

Landscape as a representation has also been called “perceived landscape”; in Approaches to Landscape, Richard Muir explains that “sensed and remembered accounts, and hypothesis about the real landscape” consist in a series of impressions that are selected and worked up by the observer, in order to create his/her own representation of the world, or, as Muir calls it, perceived landscape. Early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels provide important information about the way in which landscape was perceived during that period, but offer no reliable information about real landscape. Noteworthy, the study of landscape in literature only provides an insight to subjective representations of reality.

Perceived landscape is present in many novels and tends to feature a series of common elements that can be found in most of the novels here taken into account. In some works, such as Conirdan, Allan Breck and Discipline, the representations of the Highlands provide an explicit commentary on reality, because in them the novelist gives vent to his concerns about national identity, history and tradition, by overtly remarking on the cultural and historical importance of certain places and landscapes. In such novels as The Romance of the Highlands, instead, landscape descriptions are devoid of explicit comments on identity. Perceived landscape is turned into a system of stereotypical features endowed with symbolic meaning.

Late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth-century literary representations of the Highlands are mediated representations, charged with aesthetic taste and political ideas; as such, they are far from faithfully reproducing the actual landscape features of the Highlands. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, indeed, Highland landscape is codified into a series of stereotypical features. The authors of these novels portrayed the Scottish mountains drawing from a set of clichés that, over the previous century, had become typical of the

---

8 M. Johnson, op. cit., p. 3.
9 R. Muir, op. cit., p. 115.
10 The representation of landscape in literature is referential; therefore, it gains different meanings for readers acknowledged or not with the places described.
Highlands. With the publication of Macpherson’s poems of Ossian and the spreading taste for the sublime significantly partook in the establishing of the image of the Highlands as an amazingly sublime place, dominated by wilderness, rocky mountains, deep ravines, impracticable paths and a stormy weather.

During the early nineteenth century, Scottish national writers tended to conform to the idea of the Highlands that was established during the second half of the eighteenth century. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the representation of Highland landscape is assimilated to specific aesthetic categories, such as the sublime, the beautiful and the picturesque. Each novelist chose his/her favourite aesthetic category and applied it to Scottish landscape; their representations, despite not being faithful to reality, reveal the importance attached by national writers to landscape and aesthetic taste in the shaping of culture and identity.

In each of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, landscape representations share many features, but they also provide some specific aspects that make some novels more interesting than others. The following quotations show how such codified places and features as deep chasms and ravines, fast running torrents, rocky and impracticable paths, equally dominated the descriptions of the Highlands in national tales, Gothic novels and historical novels:

The different colourings of the surrounding low hills on the left, and the lowlands on the right, were particularly beautiful. Long shades of light and dark foliage of the woods stretched around the sides of the mountains; the tops of which arose in sublime majesty, over the luxuriant branches of the forest, covered with brown heath; while the eye delighted to wander from these frightful crags down the green glens, whose soft and lively verdure fell gently towards the banks of the river.\(^1\)

\(<\text{The Romance of the Highlands}\>\)

Glen Albin is about five miles in length, and one in breadth; it is situated in one of the most remote districts of the West Highlands, and encircled by some of the loftiest and most rugged of the Caledonian mountains. Rich in all the characteristic scenery of a romantic country, it cannot be described as merely

---

\(^1\) While the categories of the Beautiful and the Sublime were extensively defined by Edmund Burke in his \textit{A Philosophic Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful} (1757), the category of the Picturesque has a less clear history. The term stems from the Italian “pittor
cesco”, a pictorial adjective employed for subjects considered as worthy of being portrayed. According to Stephen Copley and Peter Garside, the Highlands were considered a picturesque subject thanks to a “combination of political repression, economic exploitation, and aesthetic sentimentalisation”; Copley and Garside agree with Hugh Trevor Roper’s idea that the modern image of the Highlands is the results of an act of cultural invention and consider it as a “hegemonic cultural manifestation of the English Colonising presence” (S. Copley, P. Garside, “Introduction”, in S. Copley, P. Garside (eds), \textit{The Politics of the Picturesque. Literature, Landscape and Aesthetics since 1770}, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994, pp. 1-12, p. 7).

\(^2\) P.M. Darling, \textit{op. cit.}, Vo. II, pp. 61-2.
beautiful, or merely sublime; but from a felicitous combination of picturesque beauty, wonderful magnificence, and gloomy grandeur, often bordering on horror, results a whole which seems the favourite finishing of nature; a chosen spot where she has compiled all her charms.\textsuperscript{13} 

(\textit{Clan-Albin})

Clifford’s glance wandered up hill and down dale, till it got fatigued with gazing on a prospect full of so much sublimity and grandeur; to form which wood and water, rock and mountain, each contributed their share; while, at the junction of the three great valleys [...] sat Inverness, the radiant nucleus of the whole.\textsuperscript{14} 

(\textit{Macrimmon})

Despite the fact that Christian I. Johnstone, Peter M. Darling and Alexander Sutherland are all describing a mountain landscape, these quotations reveal how, in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, aesthetic categories are differently employed in each novel. I quote from these three novels because they belong to different literary genres and were written in different periods, in order to provide a more comprehensive analysis of the use of aesthetic categories in the novels here studied. \textit{The Romance of the Highlands} was published in 1810 and is a Gothic novel; \textit{Clan-Albin} was issued in 1815 and is a national tale and \textit{Macrimmon} was published in 1823 and is a historical novel.

In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the aesthetic categories that are the most present are the beautiful, the sublime and the picturesque; not only do they characterise the description of prospects and scenes, but they are also explicitly mentioned. Representations of the Highlands in these novels are generally dominated by the sublime, as the passages here quoted show. In each of the novels taken into account, the emphasis is on lofty and rugged mountains (\textit{Clan-Albin}), frightful crags (\textit{The Romance of the Highlands}) and rocks (\textit{Macrimmon}); mountains and rocks are, indeed, at the very core of every literary representation of the sublimity of the Highlands in the Identity and Highlands Corpus.

National writers interested in emphasizing the uniqueness of Highland landscape as a distinctive element of Scottish national identity highlighted the sublimity of the Scottish mountains by portraying natural elements that they considered as typical of the Highlands, possibly in the attempt to instil in the reader the idea that such unique scenes and prospects could be found only in Scotland. Notwithstanding the fact that all writers emphasise the sublimity of Highland landscape, each novelist suggests the aesthetic tone of his/her own representations by directly mentioning the categories he/she is employing. In \textit{The Romance of the Highlands}, Peter M. Darling mentions two categories - the beautiful and the sublime –

\textsuperscript{13} C.I. Johnstone, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 17. 
and sets them into juxtaposition with one another: the “low hills on the left and the lowlands on the right” are “particularly beautiful” and stand as opposed to the tops of the Grampian mountains that “arose in sublime majesty”.\(^{15}\) In Darling’s representation of the landscape visible from the Southern part of the Grampians, it is the proximity of beautiful and sublime scenes that makes the prospect particularly pleasant to the eye when it wanders from the sublime mountains to the beautiful dales and lowlands.

Noteworthy, Darling’s novel is set on the mountains, that is to say, in the region of the sublime, while the lowlands and, therefore, the beautiful, are only beheld from the distance. *The Romance of the Highlands* is a Gothic novel; the sublime is perfectly in tune with the supernatural atmosphere created by the apparition of spirits and witches. In this novel, as well as in other Gothic novels gathered in the Identity and Highlands Corpus (such as *Glencore Tower, The Towers of Lothian* and *Reft Rob*), the aesthetic category of the sublime is the dominant one and significantly adds to the Gothic ambience created by the plot.

In *Clan-Albin*, the narrator suggests that the West Highland landscape he is portraying cannot be dismissed as “merely beautiful, or merely sublime”, but that it is the “felicitous combination” of a series of specific elements that makes the prospect particularly appealing to the eye.\(^{16}\) The features the narrator considers as essentially distinctive of a “romantic country” such as the Highlands are “picturesque beauty, wonderful magnificence, and gloomy grandeur, often bordering on horror”.\(^{17}\)

Remarkably, in Johnstone’s novel the emphasis is not just on the sublime, but on a combination of sublime, beautiful and picturesque features. The author is aware of the use she makes of these aesthetic categories and produces a landscape representation in which they are all present. In so doing, Johnstone is creating a romantic image of the Highlands, dominated not only by the sublime (as it happens in the Gothic novel) but also by the beautiful and the picturesque. *Clan-Albin* is a national tale; as such, it is explicitly concerned with the shaping of national identity. Johnstone avoids categorising her country as merely sublime or merely beautiful, but gives a literary representation in which the Highlands emerge as a unique place characterised by a great variety of landscape features.

\(^{16}\) C.I. Johnstone, *op. cit.*, p. 17.
\(^{17}\) *Ibidem*, p. 17.
In addition to this, the function played by landscape in the national tale is significantly different from that played in the Gothic novel. While in *The Romance of the Highlands*, for instance, the sublimity and wilderness of nature are employed to increase the suspense and tension created by the plot, in such national tales as *Clan-Albin* and *Discipline*, Highland landscape has to favourably impress the reader. Noteworthy, the analysis of landscape descriptions in the Identity and Highlands Corpus shows how novelists employed different aesthetic categories according to the literary genre of their novels. Landscape descriptions in the Gothic novels are more conformed to the canons of the sublime, because this category adds to the creation of the unsettling atmosphere typical of the genre. Differently, in the national tale and in the historical novel landscape representations are more balanced; the sublime is present, but it is generally combined with the beautiful and the picturesque, in order to produce a reassuring image of the Highlands.

Notwithstanding the fact that each writer produced a different aesthetic representation of the Highlands, all the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are characterised by an eye-catching tendency to emphasise the sublimity, the grandeur and the wilderness of the Scottish mountains. This tendency can be interestingly set into relationship with the theories of James Holloway, Malcolm Andrews and Simon Shama, who believe that this passion for the sublime affected not only literary representations of the Highlands, but also pictorial ones, turning these mountains into a perfect picturesque location.\(^\text{18}\) According to these critics, during the second half of the eighteenth century a dramatic change in the way in which the Highlands were represented occurred, leading to the stressing of sublime features over beautiful elements. The most significant example they point to is represented by the engravings made by Paul Sandby. Paul Sandby (1731-1809) was an Englishman involved in the mapping of Scotland after the 1745 Jacobite Rebellion. He worked for the army and provided them with maps and portraits of Highlands paths, roads and landscape.\(^\text{19}\) With the passing of time, he became a landscape painter, producing several engravings and watercolours.

\(^{18}\) This issue is explored by James Holloway and Lindsay Errington in *The Discovery of Scotland: the Appreciation of Scottish Scenery through Two Centuries of Painting* (Edinburgh: National Gallery of Scotland, 1978), by Simon Schama in *Landscape and Memory* and by Malcolm Andrews in *The Search for the Picturesque*.

\(^{19}\) According to Michael Charlesworth, the mapping of regions from foreign governments is an act of conquest that passes through the gaining of knowledge about the topography of a place and ends up in a better capacity to control the territory: “The exercise of power and domination of subjugated people demands knowledge, which is essential for control. The main instrument for gathering knowledge of topography is sight, aided by tools such as compass and theodolite, and maps and pictures are the main records of the knowledge gained” (See M. Charlesworth, “The Ruined Abbey: Picturesque and Gothic Values”, in S. Copley and P. Garside, *op. cit.*, pp. 62-80, p. 71).
According to Holloway, the paintings of Highland landscape made during the late 1740s, drawn for military purposes only, are different from the ones painted during the 1780s, where the aesthetic taste for the picturesque and the sublime dominate. The reason lays in the fact that while in the 1740s the need was to be faithful to reality, in the 1780s Sandby’s aim was to please the eye; therefore, the same view could be changed, in order to conform to the dominant taste for the sublime. In The Discovery of Scotland, Holloway discusses about the difference between a 1747 and a 1780 engraving of Taymouth:

[...] the view was not thought to be sufficiently “Highland” and several additions were made to dramatise the landscape; the mountains were heightened and their outlines made more rugged, fir trees and a kilted onlooker were introduced.20

Paul Sandby’s decision to represent the Highlands in conformity with the spreading taste for the sublime, even altering some fixed features such as the height of mountains, is representative of the general eighteenth-century tendency to idealise Highland landscape into an abstract set of stereotypes. With the passing of time, these stereotypical features became canonical, so that most early-nineteenth-century novelists portrayed the Highlands as a sublime location. According to Simon Schama, Paul Sandby’s perceived Highland landscape was biased by his tour of northern Wales, taken in 1771. The areas Sandby toured were extremely sublime and romantic, and his watercolours gained great success among the lovers of the picturesque. His representations were in tune with the sublime portrait of Celtic lands in literary works, such as the poems of Ossian and Thomas Grey’s The Bard.

If Paul Sandby’s engravings and watercolours of the Highlands were influenced by his increasing interest in the sublime and the picturesque, literary representations of the Scottish mountains shared in the same tendency. James Beattie’s extensive descriptions of sublime mountain landscape in The Minstrel provide evidence that the habit to portray the Scottish mountains as a sublime location was already in vogue in late-eighteenth-century Scottish literature. The Minstrel was issued in the period 1771-4, when Macpherson’s poems of Ossian had been known to the great public for more than a decade. As a consequence, during the 1770s people were already acquainted with the sublime literary representation of the Highlands provided by Macpherson.

James Beattie’s poem is not explicitly set in the Highlands, as the songs of Ossian are. Nevertheless, the protagonist of the poem, young Edwin, is a shepherd living “on

Scotia’s mountains” (possibly on the Highlands). Mountains play a major role in the poem, due to the strong relationship between Edwin and the environment he lives in. Noteworthy, the young shepherd loves both the “gentle” and “dreadful scenes” of nature, making of him one of the first and most outstanding examples of literary hero attached to picturesque and sublime nature. The poem opens with a eulogy of reason and nature, followed by an introduction to Edwin’s situation and family. While portraying Edwin’s character, Beattie focuses on his special attachment to nature and to his mountains, highlighting how the youth’s affection stems not only from the contemplation of the beautiful, but also from the direct contact with picturesque and sublime elements:

And oft the craggy cliff he loved to climb,
When all in mist the world below was lost.
What dreadful pleasure! there to stand sublime,
Like shipwreck’d mariner on desert coast,
And view th’enormous waste of vapour, tost
In billows, lengthening to th’horizon round,
Now scoop’d in gulphs, with mountains now emboss’d.
And hear the voice of mirth and song rebound,
Flocks, herds, waterfalls, along the hoar profound?

This stanza is rather representative of the spreading tendency to highlight the sublimity of the Scottish mountains and of the Highlands more in particular. Beattie’s emphasis on the sublime emerges not just in the natural elements he chooses to describe (the craggy cliffs, the mist, the waste of vapour), but in the very feelings that the contact with such elements arouses in his heart: the boy feels a dreadful pleasure in observing the misty vale from the top of a craggy cliff, he feels “sublime” like a man shipwrecked man on a desert coast.

The solitude and remoteness typical of a sublime scene are here interestingly juxtaposed with the lively and joyful sounds produced by animals and waterfalls, producing an interestingly picturesque representation. This landscape description provides some evidence of the fact that, after the issuing of Macpherson’s songs of Ossian, sublime representations of mountains in Scottish literature became increasingly conformed to a stereotypical image characterised by the emphasis on the sublime.

Noteworthy, as in later works such as Clan-Albin, in The Minstrel, the sublimity of nature is not detached from beauty and picturesqueness; in such representations, the

23 Ibidem, Stanza XXI, p. 13.
sublime is domesticated into a less dangerous and scaring entity, something able to stir powerful emotions without producing awe and disgust. The sublime Highlands portrayed by Johnstone are similar to the mountains where Edwin grew up: they are a source of dreadful feelings but at the same time they comfort the heart of the protagonist, filling his heart with peaceful feelings. Even in Scottish Gothic novels, where sublime features are used in order to increase the suspense and tension of the plot, sublimity and grandeur oftentimes occur as united with beautiful elements. The use of the sublime made in Gothic novels, instead, is quite different from the one made by Beattie. Reft Rob, for instance, opens with a compound of beautiful and sublime features; the lovely colours of autumn are, in fact, threatened by an incoming storm:

It was about three in the afternoon in the month of October, when the vivid green livery of nature's summer pomp is mellowed into the mingled brown, yellow, and red, that preludes the fall of those leafy honours she is pleased to be stow on the tenants of the forest. The farming breeze that had tempered the burning sun at noon, had now subsided, and a death-like stillness, sure prelude to a storm, made the wild inhabitants of the mountains and vallies pant, and cast their eyes to earth in despair.²⁴

The aesthetic debate of the eighteenth-century exerted a strong influence on early-nineteenth-century Scottish literature, as the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus show. Noteworthy, in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the literary representations of Highland landscape gained significant cultural meaning, becoming a means to extol the specific identity of Scotland and the uniqueness of its people and territory. Therefore, in many of the novels here studied, mountain landscape is not just intended to please the reader, but also to arouse his/her interest in a land and people whose history and culture are consistently different from the ways of life introduced by the English government during the age of improvement. In fact, in the wake of romanticism and Scottish nationalism, sublime features in landscape representations of the Highlands became strongly connected with identity, culture and history. The connection between nature and culture developed into a set of symbolic and stereotypical features, while a faithful representation landscape became less important.

One of the most outstanding examples of the link between Scottish unique cultural identity and Highland landscape is provided in C. I. Johnstone’s Clan-Albin. In this novel, indeed, the heritage of the clan MacAlpin is preserved in the figure of Lady Augusta, an old

woman who, once returned from her post-Culloden exile in France, establishes on a remote island in a lake among the Western Highlands:

Many years before this period, Lady Augusta had returned from France, and fixed her lonely residence among the poor, nominal retainers of her ancestors. Embosomed in the solitude of the mountains, she appeared to them the embodied spirit of benevolence and feudal kindness. Her virtues, her misfortunes, and her rank, in a country were almost idolatrous respect is paid to hereditary greatness, had thrown a mysterious veil around her, which curiosity never ventured to withdraw. 

This passage is interestingly revealing about the importance of Lady Augusta as the embodiment of her people’s heritage. In Clan-Albin, Lady Augusta is revered as a defender of her people, as well as the repository of old traditions and knowledge. This woman lives “embosomed in the solitude of the mountains” as her people did for centuries, standing in contrast with her fellow clansmen, who are leaving the Highlands and migrating to Northern America. In Johnstone’s novel, Lady Augusta represents the good qualities and virtues of Highland culture; even feudalism is extolled as a form of kindness on the verge of being destroyed by improvement.

By the end of the 1780s, when the first stage of improvement was accomplished, Highland landscape had been significantly reshaped through the building of new roads and bridges, the creation of sheep-farms and fishing villages, the depopulation of certain areas and the colonisation of others. These changes effaced most traces of Highland landscape as it was before the Forty-Five, possibly leading to a loss of knowledge of the way in which Highland landscape used to be before improvement. Since scarce artistic and visual representations of the area had been made before this period, people accepted the literary representations produced during the second half of the eighteenth century as a trustful testimony of old Highland landscape. Nevertheless, literary representations rarely reproduce reality as it really is; more often do they provide examples how the world is perceived and interpreted by writers and novelists. The authors of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, in fact, tend to emphasise such features and elements they consider the most representative ones of their cultural and national identity; this tendency is evident not only in the representation of manners and habits, but also in landscape descriptions, where specific features emerge as typical of the Scottish territory. This tendency can be at the root of the habit, common to the authors of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, to

---

emphasise the sublime aspects of Highland and Scottish landscape, turning these features into symbols of their national specificity.

4. Highland and Lowland Perspectives: Ethnographical Interest and Remarks on Colonialism

Perceived Highland landscape tends to extend to the whole Highlands features that belong, more properly, only to the remotest areas of the Scottish mountains. Nowadays, indeed, sublimity and grandeur can be still found in certain areas, which are preserved in national parks and attract many tourists. Interest in the Highlands as a tourist location began in the eighteenth century, in coincidence with the spreading of stereotypical representations of these mountains thanks to Ossianic poetry. According to Malcolm Andrews, the picturesque Highlands portrayed by James Macpherson became famous throughout the Continent and attracted many visitors from both Britain and abroad. Andrews speaks of a real “Ossianic mania”; tourists visiting the Highlands brought the poems with themselves in their tour and read passages in sublime and wild locations.26

Macpherson’s descriptions of the Highlands tend to emphasise certain landscape features that he considered as more in tune with the sublime atmosphere of his poems. Moreover, he cleverly appealed to the aesthetic taste of eighteenth-century people and satisfied their thirst for sublime descriptions. According to Fiona Stafford, Macpherson produced “a powerful yet elusive, image [of the Celtic world] that contributed greatly to later Romantic perceptions of Scotland”.27 The influence exerted by the songs of Ossian on the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus is undeniable and consistently partook in the shaping of the modern national identity of Scotland, turning the Highlands into the living proof that Scotland, thanks to its Celtic inhabitants, dramatically differed from England.

The success enjoyed by Macpherson’s poems is due not only to the fact that, when it was issued, it met with the readership’s aesthetic taste for the sublime, but also to the fact that it appeared as a real testimony of the past culture and society of the Highlands, being the translation of Highland traditional poems transmitted orally from one generation to the next. Even though the authenticity of Macpherson’s works immediately became an object of debate, many people welcomed his representation of old Highland society and landscape as a reliable and fascinating portrait.

Despite the fact that the songs of Ossian were not the translation of real fragments of Highland poetry, they represent the first literary representation of the Scottish mountains published by a Highlander. James Macpherson, in fact, was born in 1736 in the Highlands, and grew up there, “experiencing the devastation surrounding the 1745 Jacobite Rising”; therefore, not only was he a Highlander, but he also lived in the mountains before Culloden and improvement. Consequently, Macpherson’s representation of the Highlands is not necessarily the artificial romanticisation of sublime mountains, but the product of his experience there as a child. His emphasis on the sublimity and grandeur of the Highlands can be not only a way to attract the readers’ interest to his works, but also the literary reproduction of the way in which he perceived the Highlands when he lived there. Obviously, there is no way to confirm that the landscape representations provided by Macpherson coincide with pre-improvement Highland landscape, but I am convinced that his works provide significant evidence of the importance attached by Highlanders to their lost culture, language and landscape, and of their nostalgia for a lost era.

In Macpherson’s works, the connection between sublime landscape and Celtic identity is quite evident. During the early nineteenth century, the romantic image of the Highlands provided in the poems of Ossian became a conventional narrative feature, employed by the authors of the Identity and Highlands Corpus in order to emphasise the connection between Scottish people and their land. Noteworthy, most of these writers came from the Lowlands: Christian Isobel Johnstone and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder were born in Edinburgh, while David Carey in Arbroath and Andrew Picken in Paisley, near Glasgow. Elizabeth Hamilton, instead, was born in Ireland. Since many among the novels here studied were published anonymously, it is not possible to know the birthplace of their authors. Nevertheless, the great majority of the ones we know were not Highlanders.

As Lowlanders living many years after the end of improvement, the approach to the Highlands held by the authors of the Identity and Highlands Corpus is essentially different from Macpherson’s. They had no idea of the way in which Highland landscape appeared before improvement, apart from the representations provided by Macpherson. Their emphasis on the sublimity of mountain landscape as a peculiarity of Scotland is directly related to the works of Macpherson and represent a further step in the establishment of the connection between landscape and identity.

In people’s imagery, the Highlands portrayed in the poems of Ossian became something belonging to the past, and more in particular, to pre-improvement years. This identification of the sublime Highlands with the Highlands of the past led to two important consequences. The first is that the Highlands became a common setting for novels set in the past, such as Gothic and historical novels. The second is that Highland landscape was turned into the symbol of pre-Union Scotland, that is to say, of the way people imagined Scotland before its union with England. Noteworthy, the fact that the Highlanders were the last people in Scotland to be, in actual fact, “annexed” to the United Kingdom made the Highlands a sort of repository of old Scottish manners, unaffected by English culture.

The approach to Highland culture entertained by Lowland writers was not the expression of nostalgia or remembering, as in the case of Macpherson. Instead, they looked at Highland culture from the outside, as visitors or travellers. Their experience of the Highlands was not genuine as that of a native, but based on stereotypes that corresponded exactly to those features emphasised by Macpherson. From an anthropological viewpoint, Lowland writers dealing with Highland culture, manners and landscape (such as David Carey, C. I. Johnstone, Susan Ferrier, Andrew Picken), played the part of the ethnographer visiting a foreign place. This approach is quite evident, for instance, in the two historical novels written by David Carey, _Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden_ (1820) and _A Legend of Argyle_ (1821).^29^ 

Besides being a Lowlander, Carey spent many years in London; it was there that, anonymously, he published _Lochiel and A Legend of Argyle_. The fact that these novels were published in England and not in Scotland suggests that they were mainly aimed to the English public. In fact, Carey could have published them in Scotland, where he was already known as a journalist. The literary representations of the Highlands provided in these novels

---

^29^ Robert Crawford highlights that anthropological interest is at the very core of Scott’s _Waverley_: “Scott’s deployment of footnotes about language, lore, and the history of the societies with which he is dealing gives his text an anthropological feeling, so that we read in a suspension between creative writing and historiography” (R. Crawford, *Devolving English Literature*, cit., p. 126). According to Crawford, Scott’s anthropological style was appreciated by many Scottish writers and anthropologists active after him, such as Andrew Lang (1844-1912) and James George Frazer (1854-1941). Andrew Lang wrote extensively about tales and mythology (*Custom & Myth*, 1884; *Modern Mythology*, 1887); his passion for Scott’s works emerges in his 1910 biography of Scott, called _Sir Walter Scott and the Border Minstrelsy_. According to Crawford, Frazer’s activity as a writer (including his most famous novel _The Golden Bough_, 1890) was consistently affected by Scott’s treating of landscape: “All through his career, Frazer delighted in presenting landscape set pieces and relating those to local practices and beliefs. [...] The craggy mountains, the solitary lakes, the waterfalls, and the sunset over imposing hills, as well as the desolate expanse that fill Frazer’s texts, are all developments of the Scottscape he knew from childhood both from his reading and from the historically rich landscape around Helensburgh – sites such as Dunbarton castle [...]” (*Ibidem*, p. 159).
are the product of a foreigner writing for foreigners. As such, they represent some sort of ethnographic document, in which the culture of the people portrayed is seen from the outside.

Carey’s approach to Highland culture appears, in many passages, as parallel to that of the ethnographer. At the beginning of Lochiel, for instance, Carey provides extensive descriptions of the manners of the Highlanders, as well as of Highland landscape. In these parts, he uses words in Gaelic and explains to the reader the habits of the Highlanders, as the following quotation shows:

The Colonel was now shewn to the culaist, or parlour, which was destined to be his dormitory for the night; here he found a bed of fragrant mountain heather spread for him, as is the custom in the Highland cottages where the inmates lie upon the ground, laying between them and it, brackens, or heather, the roots of which are turned down, and the tops up, and so dexterously laid together that they are soft as feather beds and much more wholesome, for the tops themselves are of a dry nature [...] 30

In this passage, the narrator focuses on a traditional Highland habit, that of sleeping on beds made up of heather. The peculiarity of this habit is emphasised by the narrator who, like the modern author of a travel guide, describes in the detail unusual local habits in detail, in order to stir the reader’s curiosity. This quotation is an instance of the endeavour made by Carey to meet the non-native reader’s interest in the Highlands as a foreign and exotic place, introducing him/her to an unfamiliar place and providing him/her with some sort of guide-like descriptions helping the reader to relate to the place represented. Not only is Carey reconstructing the historical events of 1745, seasoning them with some romance, but he is also giving an account of Highland culture that is in tune with the ideas and tastes of his readership.

In fact, Carey’s political approach to the events narrated in his novels is explicitly anti-Jacobite and, therefore, in tune with the English audience. For instance, many among the supporters of Charles Edward Stuart (such as the Lord of Keppoch, John Roy Stuart, Provost MacQuick and the Laird of Glengarry) are portrayed as ruthless people, interested in the Jacobite cause only as a source of richness and fame. If in Lochiel, the image of the greedy Jacobite is redeemed by the honesty of the Lochiel family, in A Legend of Argyle Jacobitism is embodied in a Gothic villain, the Earl of Ronay. Moreover, the feudal system is criticised in both novels and in A Legend of Argyle the Highlanders of the 1715 are called

“demi-savages”, meeting with the idea of the Highlanders as noble savages popularised by the poems of Ossian.31

Carey’s novels are just one among many examples of the way in which the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are concerned with the spreading phenomenon of using the Highlands as a setting or backdrop for action. Historical novels such as Lochiel, The Scottish Chiefs, Bannockburn, A Legend of Argyle, and The Black Watch, and national tales such as Clan-Albin and The Lairds of Glenfern, are set in the Highlands because the action occurring there is a non-avoidable stage in the development of the plot; in other words, the setting is connected with the plot and the Highlands appear as a logic place for the novel to develop, because the events narrated are historically connected with these mountains. In other novels, such as Highland Mary, the scenes set in the Highlands are not strictly connected with the plot. In fact, the protagonist of the novel never visits the Highlands; nevertheless, the author includes the Highlands as the setting of a flashback-episode narrating how Mary’s great-grandfather, grandfather and father got involved in the Jacobite rebellions. The Highlands and sublime nature are also the site of excursions, as in Glenfergus and Vale of the Clyde, where Flora visits her old Aunt in the Highlands.

The importance attributed to Highland life and landscape in the Identity and Highlands Corpus can be considered as an early symptom of the anthropological and ethnographical interest shown by the Victorians when dealing with the primitive peoples of over-sea colonies. Indeed, this approach can be seen as a typical outlook of nineteenth-century British society, involving both internal and external colonies. This attitude is evident in such novels as Christian Isobel Johnstone’s Clan-Albin and Mary Johnston’s The Lairds of Glenfern and continued to be an important feature of Scottish literature for the whole century. Many Victorian novelists dealt with the Highlands in their works, in particular several women writing during the second half of the nineteenth century: some of them employed the Highlands as a romantic location for love stories and intrigues (such as Julia

31 D. Carey, A Legend of Argyle, cit., Vol. II, p. 174. The narrator extols the qualities of demi-savages (or barbarians), considering them as humane, sympathetic and humble as the most civilised people, and setting them into opposition with those peoples that are at an intermediate stage between barbarism and civility:

It had been often demonstrated that the highly civilised and the barbarous, or demi-savages of society, have more points of approximation to each other than the intermediate gradations of social life. The cultivated mind acquires from philosophy that true estimate of the limited powers of its nature, which the savage had proved from his daily experience. These two classes are therefore found to possess more real humility and sympathy with their fellow men in their woes and their pleasures, more of generous and romantic enthusiasm, than the other gradations of mankind can boast (Ibidem, pp. 174-5).
Bosville Chetwynd in Janie. A Highlands Love Story, 1869), while others focused on the Jacobite risings (for instance: Lady Barbarina Dacre in Winifred, Countess of Nithsdale: a Tale of the Jacobite Wars, 1869; Thomasine Maunsell in Legends of the Jacobite Wars, 1873) and the clearances (Mathilde Blind in her poem The Heather on Fire: A Tale of the Highland Clearances, 1886). Male writers also continued to employ the Highlands as a setting for their novels, drawing inspiration from early-nineteenth-century novelists such as Sir Walter Scott. The most important examples are George Macdonald and Robert Louis Stevenson. Considered as writers of books for children, they set their novels in eighteenth-century Highlands before the age of improvement. However, while George Macdonald’s Sir Gibbie (1879) hinges upon adventures and is more truly aimed at a young readership, Robert Louis Stevenson’s Kidnapped (1886) and its sequel Catriona (1893) are characterised by a deeper interest in Highland history and seem to imply an adult readership. The conviction that these novels were aimed at a young readership derives primarily from the fact that Kidnapped was originally issued on a children journal, called The Young Folks Paper as Kidnapped, or, the Lad with the Silver Button.

Sixty years before Stevenson wrote Kidnapped, Martha Blackford produced two moral novels in which Highland adventures connected with Jacobitism are endowed with a didactic function: The Scottish Orphans and Arthur Monteith. Such novels as Sir Gibby and Kidnapped, therefore, can be seen as the heirs to Martha Blackford’s novels, because they too attempt at exploring the didactic potential of adventure tales as a teaching instrument. Since all these novels hinge upon the Forty-five and their effects on the Highlands and Scottish identity, they are an interesting sub-genre of children’s literature possibly aimed at increasing young readers’ awareness of ideas of national and cultural identity.

The colonialist attitude held by the English government towards the Highlands is highlighted in Kidnapped, where the core event of the novel, the murder of a Factor of the English King in the Highlands in 1751 is represented as a consequence of the policy and measures enforced by the English upon Highland people. According to Richard Ambrosini, Stevenson felt that “he could establish a comparative link between the Scottish Highlands in the eighteenth century and the Pacific Islands, thus ethnologizing his country’s past while historicizing the colonial present”. Stevenson’s interest in the Highlands manifests a great

---

awareness of the political dynamics underlying the growth of the British Empire. The Highland myth is consistently present in *Kidnapped* and *Catriona*, even though the protagonist’s perspective is that of a Lowlander and, therefore, of a man whose culture, political allegiances and religion are definitely different from those of the Highlanders. In these novels, the accent is laid on the injustices suffered by the inhabitants of the Highlands after the Forty-Five, openly condemning the English government’s policy.

5. The Highland Beaten Track

The Jacobite risings and the aftermath of the measures and policy adopted by the English government on the Highlands after the Cattle of Culloden were already present in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, where consistent remarks about the political situation of the Highlands are present for instance, in Christian Isobel Johnstone’s *Clan Albin*, Rosalia St. Clair’s *The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon*, and Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch*. In these novels, the interest in the Highlands is more historical than cultural; the authors, indeed, try to highlight the chain of historical events that partook in the development of early-nineteenth century Scottish society.

In other novels, such as those written by David Carey, the interest in Highland society is more ethnographical, because the main aim is to create a literary representation of the Highlanders and their mountains for a non-Highland reading public. Attention, therefore, is paid to peculiar manners and ways of life typical of the Highlander. David Carey published his novels in London; therefore, he needed to meet the English readership’s tastes, representing a subject they were interested in: the sublime mountains of Scotland. Since the issuing of the poems of Ossian in the second half of the eighteenth century, the Highlands began to attract the interest of many visitors and travellers from outside Scotland. Thanks to the roads and bridges built after the 1715 Jacobite Rising and the “Anglicisation” of the Gaels occurred after the Forty-Five, travelling among the Scottish mountains became easier for Lowlanders and English people.

Noteworthy, the interest in the Highlands and the peripheral areas of Scotland had spread in England long before the issuing of David Carey’s *Lochiel*. Already in 1794, Elizabeth Helme published her first novel set in the Highlands: *Duncan and Peggy; A Scottish Tale*. Other peripheral areas of Scotland were associated with the sublime and the Gothic genre in English literature, as the 1809 novel by Francis Lathom, called *The Romance of the Hebrides*:

33 *E. Helme, Duncan and Peggy; A Scottish Tale*, London: printed for J. Bell, 1794, 2 vols.
or, Wonders Never Cease! shows.\textsuperscript{34} While Lathom’s novel, like Ann Radcliffe’s \textit{The Castles of Athlyn and Dunbayne} (1798), tends to highlight the connection between the Highlands and the Gothic genre, in Elizabeth Helme’s novel the Highlands are a beautiful place, where the two protagonists fall in love and eventually get married; she extols the hospitality and honesty of Highlanders and sets it into opposition to the vice of the city, as many authors of the Identity and Highlands Corpus do (for instance, Alexander Balfour in \textit{Highland Mary} and Felix M’Donough in \textit{The Highlanders}). The novel opens in Argyllshire, in the castle of Colonel Campbell; noteworthy, the descriptions of the landscape surrounding the castle are dominated by the beautiful, rather than the sublime:

\textit{[...] the seat of Colonel Campbell [...]} was an old castle situated on a hill, and had withstood the united efforts of war and time: some of the stones that composed the fabric had been shattered by ball; but the friendly ivy, which almost covered the structure, hid those defects. Around was a spacious park, in which nature had been lavish of her beauties; the boundaries of the north side being marked by a ridge of hills, and the bottom watered by numberless serpentine rivulets that fell down the rocky slopes in natural cascades; the scarlet strawberry clothing the humble glen, and the towering fir the mountain top: and though the castle was on one side rather exposed to the eastern blast, yet did its chill influence never perforate the Colonel’s hall: hospitality and universal philanthropy keeping the mansion as warm as the bosom of its master.\textsuperscript{35}

Notwithstanding the fact that nature around the castle is portrayed as beautiful, the narrator interestingly stresses the coldness of Highland climate, hinting at its inhospitality and setting it into opposition with the comfortable atmosphere inside the castle. The Highland myth is here present, because the Colonel, a native Highlander, is extolled for his “hospitality and universal philanthropy”. The castle is represented as a fortress that resisted to the attacks of “war and time”. A touch of picturesque tinges the description of its walls: ivy hides the damages done by the cannon ball.

\textit{Duncan and Peggy} is a rather interesting example of an English novel set in Scotland; its subtitle “\textit{A Scottish Tale}” reveals the author’s intention to conform her novel to the image of Scotland and the Highlands held by English people at the end of the eighteenth century. Elizabeth Helme endorses the Highland myth when describing the Highlanders and employs the origins and heritage plot; moreover, she focuses on cultural and social

\textsuperscript{34} F. Lathom, \textit{The Romance of the Hebrides: or, Wonders Never Cease!}, London: Minerva Press, 1809, 3 vols. Francis Lathom was a quite renown Gothic author; his 1798 novel, called \textit{The Midnight Bell}, is mentioned in Jane Austen’s \textit{Northanger Abbey} (1818). Noteworthy, Lathom did move from England to the Highlands and spent there the last part of his life; for more information about Lathom see “Francis Lathom (1777-1832)”, in D. Punter, G. Byron (eds), \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 136-7.

\textsuperscript{35} E. Helme, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 13-5.
oppositions that are consistently present in the Identity and Highlands Corpus: the one between city and periphery, that between aristocratic, rich people and poor cottagers and that between Presbyterians and Jacobites. What is extraordinarily interesting about Duncan and Peggy is that it was published in 1794, before all the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus. This fact suggests that the literary image of the Highlands was affected not only by Scottish writers like James Macpherson and Sir Walter Scott, but also by certain English novelists like Elizabeth Helme.

The increasing presence of the Highlands as a setting in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Scottish and English literature is a proof of the fact that the Highlands were becoming a more and more “visited” location in literature. The reading public, composed both of Scots concerned with national identity and of English people in quest for the sublime and the picturesque, enjoyed reading literary representations of the Highlands. From a cultural viewpoint, this phenomenon can be considered as a form of literary. From the last years of the eighteenth century onward, indeed, the fashion of visiting the places where famous novels were set and, on the other hand, the habit of setting novels in locations particularly loved by travellers, were spreading in Britain. Noteworthy, the way in which the Highlands are portrayed in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, as well as the plots narrated, tend to be similar. The Highlands are most often the place where the origins and heritage plot develops and is eventually solved, for instance in Peter M. Darling’s The Romance of the Highlands, the anonymous Conirdan and Reft Rob, David Carey’s Lochiel and A Legend of Argyle, or the site of an excursion among picturesque and sublime prospects.

In such novels as, for instance, Robert Mudie’s Genfergus and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s Lochandhu, the relationship between the Highlands and tourism is explicitly stated. Indeed, the protagonists of these novels visit the Highlands as English travellers interested in the landscape of the Scottish mountains. In Glenfergus, the young Clarinda Bonclair compares the Highlands with London and extols the sublime beauty of a Scottish winter in the mountains; she makes several excursions in the Highlands with her friend, Saville, with whom she shares the love of picturesque and sublime landscape.36 In Lochandhu, one of the main causes of Amherst’s accepting MacGillivray’s invitation to spend some time at his

36 One of the most interesting excursions of Clarinda and Saville is narrated in Chapter XX, where the two travellers meet with an old cottager still attached to the Jacobites. Such landscape features as a “frightful precipice” deep “at least three hundred feet”, “silent nature” and “treacherous” moss highlight the attention paid to sublimity and the picturesque (R. Mudie, op. cit., pp. 262-3).
estate in the Highlands is the young Englishman's desire to visit the Scottish mountains and to admire their sublime wilderness.

Tourist attitudes are present in other novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus; in *Macrimmon*, for instance, Charly Clifford joins the British army and is sent to Fort George (in Inverness-shire); there, he makes several excursions in the surrounding area. Together with his fellow-soldiers and friends, Charly visits what we may consider “classical” tourist sites: the lake of Lochness, the Falls of Foyers and the field of Culloden. Rather significantly, these places belong to two distinct categories; while Lochness and the Falls of Foyers represent the natural attractions of the Highlands, and are characterised for their magnificence and sublimity, the field of Culloden is an historical location, where the spectre of the battle lost in 1745 by the Jacobites seems to be still hanging above the field. While the field of Culloden strikes Charly for its historical importance, Highland landscape makes him “highly gratified and more and more delighted with the sternly-magnificent character of Highland scenery”.

By establishing an explicit connection between Scottish landscape and tourism, many novelists stressed the fact that the Highlands were becoming an increasingly conventionalised literary setting. This connection is not typically Scottish, but affected European literature significantly during the nineteenth century. In 1993, James Buzard used the expression *beaten track* to describe this phenomenon; *The Beaten Track* is, in fact, the title of his book about tourism and its relationship with literature in Europe during the nineteenth century. According to Buzard, it “designates the space of the ‘touristic’ as a region in which all experience is predictable and repetitive, all cultures and objects mere ‘touristy’ self-parodies”. Like tourists, readers are in quest for cultural stereotypes and literary representations of places conformed to cultural and landscape commonplaces.

6. **Stereotypical Landscape Features**

The novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus provide notable instances of the way in which the Highlands were turned into a literary beaten track. The general features attached to landscape are similar in most works, from Gothic novels to national tales. Novelists guide their readers among sublime prospects, picturesque castles, bandits and hospitable natives as a tourist guide would do with a group of tourists, drawing their attention to certain features and neglecting others.

---

38 J. Buzard, *op. cit.*, p. 4.
Landscape representations are characterised by a series of fixed features, which are present in most novels. The castle is certainly the most employed element in the Identity and Highlands Corpus and plays an important role both aesthetically and historically. In such Gothic novels as *The Towers of Lothian*, *Monteith* and *Glencore Tower*, the castle is the place where the Gothic plot develops, while in Peter M. Darling’s *The Romance of the Highlands* and *Reft Rob* castles represent the centre around which characters move. In national tales such as Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay* and Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* the castle represents the heritage of the feudal past of the Highlands, which is seen either with a favourable (*Discipline*) or unfavourable eye (*Strathmay*). In historical novels, the castle is oftentimes the place where historically relevant decisions are taken, as in David Carey’s *Lochiel* and *A Legend of Argyle*, the anonymous *Bannockburn* and Jane Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs*; in some novels, ruined castles stand as picturesque symbols of something lost in the past (such as Boyd’s castle in E.H.‘s *The Highlander*, where Prince Charles Edward Stuart takes refuge from the English soldiers after the Forty-Five, and Castle Ullin in *Macrimmon*, which represents the loss of aristocratic power suffered by the Macara family).

Storms and remarks about the hostility of Highland and northern weather are also a commonplace in the Identity and Highlands Corpus. Noteworthy, most storms are at sea or on the coast; in Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay*, the novel begins with a storm at sea, near the coast of Caithness, in the extreme north of Scotland. During this storm, the hero of the novel is the only survivor to the shipwreck caused by the stormy sea. It is thanks to the storm that the identity and heritage plot starts to develop, because it is at the Castle of Strathmay that Alfred’s adventures begin. In David Carey’s *Lochiel*, Colonel Cameron has just returned from France and finds a sublime storm while attempting to reach Lochiel’s castle, while in Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*, Amherst is compelled to take shelter into a little hut on the rocks by a terrible storm raging on the western coast of northern Scotland. In other novels, such as *Reft Rob* and Rosalia St. Clair’s *The Doomed One*, storms strike on the mountains and hills of Scotland.

Lakes are also present in many novels; generally, they are near the castle and partake in the sublime and picturesque atmosphere of the Highlands. While in *Macrimmon*, the narrator mentions the lake of Lochness, where the protagonist goes on excursion, in David Carey’s *A Legend of Argyle* and *Lochiel*, and in Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* the lake is portrayed as part of the landscape that can be admired from castles; the following excerpt,
taken from *Lochiel*, is one of the most representative instances of the function attached to the lake in the Identity and Highlands Corpus:

[it was erected] on a lofty and rocky isthmus projecting into a loch or arm of the sea of immense extent. A high and rugged precipice, the bottom of which was washed by the loch, formed an impregnable defence on the north, east and west sides.  

This passage shows how the lake is oftentimes present as a natural defence for fortified castles and towers. This function echoes the national role attached to “mountains, glens, morasses, lakes” in *The Scottish Chiefs*, where the narrator of the novel explicitly remarks that these landscape features represent a natural fortress against external invasion; they “set bounds to conquest; and amidst these stands the impregnable seat of liberty”, writes the narrator.

Mountains, rocks and cliffs are constantly present in the Identity and Highlands Corpus; this is quite obvious, since these novels are set on the mountains. What is much more striking, is that many novelists consider it important to mention the plants and trees growing on the Highlands, turning them into symbols of these lands. The plant that is most present is the birch, mentioned in E.H.H.’s *The Highlander* (Vol.II, p. 195), in Robert Mudie’s *Glenfergus* (p. 8), in David Carey’s *Lochiel* (Vol. I, p. 73) and *A Legend of Argyle* (Vol. I, p. 303), in Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* (Vol. III, p. 197), in Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu* (Vol. II, p. 162) and in Alexander Sutherland’s *Macrimmon* (Vol. I, p. 77). Pines and firs are also frequently mentioned, for instance in *Conirdan*, where the young man beholds these trees for the first time in his life at page 119, in *Glenfergus* (p.8), in *A Legend of Argyle* (p. 87), in *The Romance of the Highlands* (Vol. I, p. 20) and in *The Towers of Lothian*, (Vol. I, p.1).

---

41. By focusing on plants and flowers typical of Highland landscape and of Scotland, the authors are attempting not only to establish a closer contact between the reader and the landscape prospects portrayed, but also to create a relationship between the Highlands and a series of natural elements directly connected with them. According to Sten Pultz Moslung, this connection becomes evident when the critic adopts a *topopoetic* approach to the text: "In a topopoetic reading, a simple place name may unleash a rush of presence effects [...] the same goes for any other vocabulary feature such as names of place-specific plants and animals, geological and topographic features, names of climatic characteristics and weather phenomena, names of rain and rock [...]" (S. P. Moslung, “The Presencing of Place in Literature”, in R.T. Tally Jr (ed.), *Geocritical Exploration*, cit., pp. 34-5). In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the word “Highlands” evokes a series of features, such as specific plants (the Scottish pine, the birch, the ivy, etc.), animals (the stag) and weather conditions (storms at sea, tempests) that were attached the Scottish mountains in the people imaginary. The attention paid by novelists is a hint to their endeavour to create what Moslung calls a “panperceptual” image, that is to say, a representation that appeals “to the full bodily sensorium” (*Ibidem*, p. 35).
42. Sir Walter Scott, too, pays attention to plant varieties of the Highlands, as the following landscape description of Highland landscape in *Waverley* shows: “Advancing a few yards, and passing under the bridge which he had viewed with so much terror, the path ascended rapidly from the edge of the brook, and the glen
Rather surprisingly, heather is not a commonplace in these novels and is described only in David Carey’s *Lochiel* (Vol. I, p. 23) and *A Legend of Argyle* (Vol. I, p. 87). At the beginning of the nineteenth century, heather was probably not a symbol of the Highlands yet, while the birch and the pine (also called “Scottish pine” in some novels) seem to have been considered as more characteristic of the Scottish mountains. It was during the nineteenth century that the interest in heather as a typical plant of the Highlands developed; in Stevenson’s *Kidnapped*, for instance, this flower plant is oftentimes mentioned.43

7. Authenticity, Alienation and Wilderness

At the core of people’s rise of interest in the Highlands – both in effective travelling and literature – is the quest for sublimity and wilderness. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, sublimity is connected not only with aesthetic canons and tastes, but also with a romantic tendency to consider nature as a source of authenticity. After the spreading of industrialisation in Lowland Scotland and the clearances in the Highlands, more and more people moved to towns and cities, leaving the country and the mountains. These people experienced significant changes in their lifestyles, which produced feelings of alienation from nature.

According to John Glendening, author of *The High Road: Romantic Tourism, Scotland, and Literature, 1720-1820*, tourism represents the answer to this phenomenon, because it tends to turn the natural world into an attraction capable of drawing people out of their bored and alienated lives and setting them into contact with the true essence of nature and life: “what tourists sought in their readings and their own journeys was something that seemed more real and substantial, and thus, more moving than what they had known in their increasingly tense and disrupted lives”.44

Undoubtedly, industrialisation consistently changed life during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, affecting both travelling and literature. The importance attached to the Highlands in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, as well as in nineteenth-century Scottish and English literature, is a symptom of the growing desire to explore new areas of Britain that were less affected by man and, therefore, more truly natural. The endeavour to find in

---

43 For instance, “heather bushes” are mentioned at pages: 85, 155 and 187; noteworthy, these heather bushes always occur as shelters or hiding places from the English dragoons and, therefore, as a protective natural element. The heather is even more explicitly associated with the Highlands in the title of Mathilde Blind’s poem, *The Heather on Fire: A Tale of the Highland Clearances* (1886).

44 J. Glendening, op. cit., p. 3.
nature what was missing in everyday-life is typical of the romantic approach to nature that, according to Glendening, stems from “the same social developments” that produced tourism (i.e.: industrialisation and the movement from the country to the towns); this connection between tourism and romanticism is at the basis of the spreading interest in the Highlands, because, “like modern tourism, romanticism helped to promote the Highlands as the real thing, a genuine, exotic and commodifiable otherness that writing had already rendered familiar”.  

The relationship between wilderness and authenticity is not an easy issue to explore in literature; on the one hand, it stems from the reader’s desire to find in literature what he/she misses in their everyday lives, while, on the other hand, nature can be actually proposed as a source of authenticity by the novelist. In the Identity and Highlands Corpus, many novelists attempt to meet their readers’ desire to enjoy natural descriptions in which the essential and authentic features of nature are extolled. In most novels, such as Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch*, Robert Mudie’s *Glenfergus* and Christian Isobel Johnstone’s *Clan-Albin*, the novelist stresses the authentic essence of Highland nature and landscape by using certain words able to trigger the reader’s interest in wild nature, making him/her believe that their portrait is faithful and able to convey the true essence of Highland landscape and existence. This technique involves the form more than the plot, and does not affect the structure of the novel significantly. For instance, quite commonplace descriptions as the following one, can be interpreted as a hint to the connection between Highland landscape and the very essence of life:

> All these shews the fair hand of uncultivated nature – deep glens and hollow cavers, and a small stream which trickled into the lake, were its wild and simple beauties.

The phrase “wild and simple beauties”, employed by the narrator in E.H.H.’s *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady*, in fact, stresses the fact that the beauty of Highland landscape is in its wilderness and simplicity, a combination hinting to the uncultivated and, therefore, unrefined nature of Highland landscape. The lack of cultivation suggests that landscape in Glenrannoch (the place being described by the narrator) was not contaminated by man’s works; instead, it is as it has been for thousands of years: a wild and simple, authentic, Glen of the Highlands.

---

45 J. Glendening, op. cit., pp. 7-8.
In other novels, such as Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* and Felix M’Donough’s *The Highlanders*, the endeavour to promote the Highlands as a source of authenticity is made by creating a clear-cut opposition between the Highlands and life in London. In both novels, in fact, the capital of the Empire is the site of vice, moneymaking, danger and hardships, while the Highlands are the site of virtue, honesty and life spent in contact with nature. The most interesting example is provided by Mary Brunton in *Discipline*, where first-person narration strengthens the effect of opposition between the centre, identified with vice, and the periphery, identified with authenticity and virtue. The protagonist of the novel, Ellen Percy, is the daughter of a rich middle-class merchant; she lives in prosperity and comfort, but is unaware of the real value of love, friendship and work. Ellen represents the modern British person, who lives in towns and cities, is focused on money and shallow amusements and has lost contact not only with nature, but also with feelings. Life in the Highlands is able to melt Ellen’s hard heart, and to utterly transform her from a spoilt Londoneer into a virtuous Highlander. The words with which she closes the novels well represent her spiritual growth:

> Having in my early days seized the enjoyments which selfish pleasure can bestow, I might now compare them with those of enlarged affection, of useful employment, of relaxations truly social, of lofty contemplation, of devout thankfulness, of glorious hope. I might compare them! - but the Lowland tongue wants energy for the contrast.\(^{47}\)

The opposition between life in the Highlands and life in London is clear and gains moral hues, as Ellen highlights her inner change and her eventual understanding of what really matters in life: “enlarged affection”, “useful employment”, “lofty contemplation”, “devout thankfulness” and “glorious hope”. Getting to know how life in the Highlands changed Ellen, teaching her to rediscover true feelings, is an example of the healthy effects of life in contact with nature on alienated people. Landscapes descriptions of the Highlands in the novel hint to Ellen’s eventual change, underlying the primeval and uncontaminated essence of Highland wild nature and comparing spring in the Highlands to the garden of Eden: “Spring came; and never, since the first spring adorned Eden, did that season appear so lovely!”.\(^{48}\)

*Discipline* is the most representative instance of the way in which the plot was employed in order to guarantee not only the authenticity of Highland nature, but also its healthy effect on alienated, modern people. This novel, as well as many others in the

---


\(^{48}\) *Ibidem*, p. 267.
Identity and Highlands Corpus, conveys a general uneasiness about post-industrialisation life; many novelists, indeed, recommend the Highlands (and, more at large, the periphery) as a place where recovering the real essence of nature and life is possible. The identification of the Highlands with the “real thing”, to use Glendening’s words, explains the spreading interest in the Highlands both as a place to visit and to set novels in. The Highlands, like other non-industrialised regions, represented a place where nature could still be contemplated in its primeval wilderness, helping to bridge the gap between man and nature occasioned by industrialisation.

According to Denis Cosgrove, all industrialised societies are characterised by the alienation of man from nature. By “alienation”, Cosgrove means the loss of man’s link with nature, which characterised life in the olden times:

In a natural economy [such as feudalism] the relationship between human beings and land is dominantly that of the insider, an unalienated relationship based on use values and interpreted analogically. In a capitalist economy it is a relationship between owner and commodity, an alienated relationship wherein man stands as outsider and interprets nature casually.49

Cosgrove continues his analysis by observing that landscape painting gained its success when society switched from feudalism to capitalism, through industrialisation. In modern society, the relationship between man and nature is based upon the principle of commodity, according to Cosgrove. In such a society, people leave the periphery for the town, undertaking a completely different lifestyle, in which nature and its rhythms become irrelevant. This change is at the core of man’s alienation from nature and, therefore, of his desire to regain a connection with the natural world. Romanticism, tourism and landscape painting are all consequences of this loss of contact with nature, because – although in different ways – they all attempt at re-establishing a closer relationship with the natural world.

49 D. Cosgrove, Social Formation and Symbolic Landscape, cit., p. 64. In his essay about the connection between nature and romanticism, Helmut J. Schneider points out that it is the deprivation of something (“be it of classical antiquity, be it of an external landscape, be it of childhood”) that creates the impulse at the basis of romanticism. See H. J. Schneider, “Nature”, in M. Brown (ed.), The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism, Vol. 5: Romanticism, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2010, pp. 92-114, p. 94.
CHAPTER IX

Landscape and Meaning

1. The Highlands before Improvement

In the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus landscape descriptions of the Highlands occur either as an explicit commentary on Scottish society and history, or as a set of symbols hinting at specific meanings. In Chapter VII, I divided the novels into three main groups, according to their historical setting – those set in the remote past, those set in the liminal period and those set in the recent past. The first two groups provide descriptions of the Highlands as the authors believe they were before the age of improvement, while the novels set in the recent past portray the Highlands after the changes brought about by the English in that area. Noteworthy, authors tended to attach different meanings to pre- and post-improvement Highland landscape, as I will prove in the next paragraphs.

The novels set before the age of improvement provide descriptions of the Highlands that are oftentimes endowed with certain symbolic meanings. In this dissertation I focus on some of the meanings attached to the stereotypical features of Highland landscape, in particular wilderness and sublimity, which are oftentimes connected with ideas of independence and liberty. These novels, as seen in Chapter VII, are set during the Wars of Scottish Independence, the Anglo-Scottish Wars and the Jacobite Risings, that is to say, in periods in which Scotland manifested its cultural difference from England either by preserving its independence or by trying to restore the Stuarts on the British throne. The historical setting, therefore, is crucial not only from an historical point of view, but also from a spatial viewpoint. The representations of space, indeed, serve the specific purpose of emphasising the peculiarities of Scottish national character.

The Highlands are oftentimes chosen as a setting for at least a part of the plot, not only out of their sublimity and picturesqueness, but also as a symbol of cultural difference from England. As a result, the features typical of sublime Highland landscape – such as the impracticability of paths and the discouraging effect of wilderness and hostile nature on travellers – were employed by novelists as a symbol of national independence and liberty. Noteworthy, in these novels, descriptions are focused on natural elements, while handiworks are generally neglected.
In many novels Highland wilderness is defined as a discouraging force that only the natives of the Highlands (either aware or unaware of being Highlanders) can overcome. In both of David Carey’s novels, for instance, impracticable paths are present; in *Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden*, in particular, the narrator describes the only passage that, from the coast, leads the Lochiel Castle. The path is called “Clash nan Banna Vuitchin”, or, “The Witch’s Vale”, and seem designed to discourage any stranger stepping through it: it is an extensive and deep ravine, the sides of which were exceedingly precipitous and covered with heath and stunted brushwood. Through the bottom of this ravine, and surrounded on each side for a considerable distance with an almost impenetrable copsewood of hazel and birch, ran a small stream, which after heavy rains suddenly swelled to the size of a river.\(^1\)

In *A Legend of Argyle*, the sublime is even more explicitly connected with horror and, therefore, exerts a strongly dissuading force: “The morning had dawned on the mountains with a grey and dusty light, and exhibited to the travellers a scene of such terrific grandeur, as might well have appalled the most resolute among them.”\(^2\)

Similar remarks about landscape and its astonishing grandeur are present in many novels, but it is in Jane Porter’s *The Scottish chiefs* that, for the first time, they are set into relationship with ideas of national independence. Jane Porter’s novel, indeed, is full of landscape descriptions in which the Highlands are portrayed as a fortress against the enemy. In the first volume, Helen Mar (the daughter of the Earl of Mar, one of Wallace’s supporters), asks that her father would retire to a remote area among the Highlands, because there he would be safe from the English pursuers:

> But mountains, glens, morasses, lakes set bounds to conquest; and amidst these stands the impregnable seat of liberty. To such a fortress, to the deep defiles of Loch Katrine, or to the cloud-curtained heights of Corryarraick, I would have my father retire”.\(^3\)

Helen’s remarks about the Highlands as the “impregnable seat of liberty” are extremely significant, because they embody the nationalist idea that sees the Highlands as Scotland’s last unconquered territory. Thanks to such landscape features as high mountain, deep ravines, morasses, etc., the Highlands were a highly impracticable territory and, therefore, an area harder to be conquered. This impracticability was obviously greater for strangers, while the natives were used to it since they were children. The following

---


quotation from *The Scottish Chiefs* describes the way in which Halbert, the old and faithful minstrel of William Wallace, manages to get through an extremely impracticable passage:

After breaking a passage through entangles shrubs that grew across the only possible footing in this solitary wilderness, he went along the side of the expanding stream, which at every turning of the rocks increased in depth and violence. The rills from above, and other mountain brooks, pouring from abrupt falls down the craigs, covered him with spay, and intercepted his passage. Finding it impracticable to proceed through the rushing torrent of a cataract, whose distant roarings might have intimated even a younger adventurer, he turned from the tumbling waters which burst from his sight, and crept on his hands and knees up the opposite aclivity, catching by the fern and other weeds to stay him from falling back into the flood below.⁴

Despite his old age, Halbert is still able to cope with hostile nature, because he is a Highlander and, therefore, he has been used to wilderness since he was a little child. Wilderness and sublimity become a sort of discriminating feature between natives and strangers – while natives have adapted to hostile nature, strangers are unaccustomed to it and, therefore, discourage to pursue their impracticable path among the Highlands. This is a proof of the fact that, in nationalist novels, the sublime is not just a rhetorical feature; instead, it is connected with human perceptions, the senses and man’s suitability to different environments.

The concept of *Umwelt*, employed in modern semiotics and coined by Jacob Von Uexkull in the 1930s, is useful in order to clarify the connection between environment (and, therefore, landscape) and man, also accounting for processes of adaptation. According to Uexkull, the *Umwelt* is the perceived world of each individual; while the world is an objective reality, the *Umwelt* is a subjective whole of the impressions, perceptions and experiences of an individual: “an Umwelt is not merely the aspects of the environment accessed in sensation. Far more interesting is the manner in which those aspects are networked together and constitute ‘objects of experience’”.⁵ Each person develops his own Umwelt, according to the environment to which he/she is accustomed.

The Umwelt is not only a form of experiencing the world, but it also accounts for man’s relationship with the surrounding environment: perception “actively structures sensation into things to be sought, things to be avoided and things that do not matter one way or the other”.⁶ Man’s perceptions control his approach to the surrounding environment,

---

⁶ *Ibidem*, p. 128.
while his Umwelt and past experiences affect his response to the real world and, alongside with it, his body’s capacity to cope with certain natural environments.\(^7\)

In my opinion, the concept of Umwelt can be employed to explain the idea of the Highlands as a fortress against foreign conquest. Since every individual develops skills and abilities apt to survive in a certain environment, he/she may not be able to adapt to an utterly different place, such as the Highlands for English people and Lowlanders. By the second half of the eighteenth century, Highland landscape had been partly domesticated; therefore, it was easier for strangers (both tourists and soldiers) to travel through the mountains. The importance of the practicability of a conquered area was fully understood by the English government that, among the measures adopted in order to avoid further rebellions after the Forty Five, decided not only to build new roads and bridges, but also to map the Highlands completely. Noteworthy, Scotland was the first area of the United Kingdom mapped by the English.\(^8\)

The concept of Umwelt can also prove useful in accounting for another common feature in national Scottish novels – the appeal of the Highlands on characters. In many novels, the natives of the Highlands, even though unaware of their true origins, feel a sort of fascination for the Scottish mountains, emerges when they visit them. The most explicit examples of this link between a Highlander and his native mountains is provided by David Carey in both his novels. In *Lochiel*, Colonel Cameron’s return to the lands of his clan in the Highlands restores his spirit, while his body proves skilful in dealing with Highland wilderness: “His path was rugged and intricate, but he seemed formed to endure hardships: his step was firm and intrepid and his port and garb indicated that he owned his birth to the land he was now revisiting”.\(^9\)

General Cameron is aware of his Highland origins; his body is adapted to endure the hardships of hostile Highland nature, but his love of his land stems from his attachment to it. In Carey’s other novel, *A Legend of Argyle*, General Gordon’s feelings on boarding in the lands of Haddo while running away from Ronay’s castle, are more difficult to be explained:

\(^7\)“True, our body, no less than the body of a snail, alligator, bee, or armadillo, determines the range and type of physical environmental aspects that we can directly objectify; and our perception, so far as it depends upon sensation, is quite bound by those limits, just as is the perception of a dog, dolphin or gorilla” (J. Deely, *op. cit.*, p. 132).
\(^8\)According to Matthew Johnson, the mapping of Scotland was accomplished in 1755, before the rest of Great Britain was mapped and, rather interestingly, before the development of tourism. See M. Johnson, *op. cit.*, p. 85.
Gordon, as he stept ashore, felt an unusual emotion, which he attributed to the influence of the strange tale related by Donald, and the consciousness that he trode the scene of this mysterious legend. A certain buoyancy of spirit elevated him to such a pitch of enthusiasm, that, like another Columbus, he immediately fell on his knees and kissed the earth that had afforded himself and the lovely fugitive the first asylum from the power of despotism.10

The author, keeping Gordon’s origins secret until the end of the novel, provides a temporary explanation to Gordon’s feelings; nevertheless, when General Gordon’s identity as the son of the Lord of Haddo and a native of that very region is revealed, the reader’s thoughts go back to this passage. Although Gordon is not aware of his origins and does not remember about those lands, his mind still retains some memory of the landscape of the lands of Haddo, which produces such strong emotions on his bosom.11

The appeal of the Highlands is powerful not only on natives, but also on strangers endowed with a romantic imagination. In such novels as The Black Watch and Glenfergus, Highland landscape exerts a magnetic force on the protagonists, who are unable to avoid it. Both Hector Munro in The Black Watch and Clarinda Bonclair in Glenfergus are extremely fascinated with the Highlands, due to the effect that their sublimity and picturesqueness exert on their imagination. The role played by Highland landscape in these novels is close to the role that it plays in reality on tourists.

The connection with tourism is most evident in Glenfergus, a national novel written by Robert Mudie in 1820. The heroine of the novel, Clarinda Bonclair, is a young woman who has spent most of her life in London; she is accustomed to life in the city, its comforts and society. Nevertheless, when Clarinda visits the vale of Glenfergus, she falls in love with the sublimity of the Highlands. Like a tourist, Clarinda mentions a series of stereotypical features of clichéd landscape, claiming that their powerful effect on her mind is not due to the features themselves, but to the picturesqueness of the ensemble, which, in its totality, deeply affects her imagination:

“How grand, - how fine, - how superlatively enchanting! Yet it is not those cliffs, mantled with ivy and shaded by the aged pine and the fragrant birch;-it is not that lake, glowing like “living gold”-that meadow carpeted with the softest velvet;-those flocks that bleat so wildly shrill, or those herds that lowe so deeply sonorous;-it is not yon plaid-covered shepherd, who stands sublime and lonely on the rock, nor yonder sunburned damsel, who wanders like a ‘fay in fairy-land’;-it is not those ancient ruins, half buried in trees, and half blazing in the sun;-it is not

11 A similar episode is present in Sir Walter Scott’s 1816 novel, Guy Mannering; or, The Astrologuer, where young Henry Bertram, abducted when a little child and raised away from his native lands in Western Scotland, is struck by the impressions that the landscape of the Western coast of Scotland produce in him.

181
that majestic river winding sweetly through the vale, nor yonder blue ocean which stretches interminably beyond, with the white sail gliding over its azure bosom. No, ah no! It is not any single feature—any abstract lineament—which pours into my heart this tide of pleasure; it is the wild congruity, the picturesque harmony of the whole”\(^{12}\)

I decided to include this long quotation from Clarinda’s reflections on the landscape of the vale of Glenfergus, because, rather interestingly, she is making a list of those features of the Highlands considered as most picturesque during the early nineteenth century: the cliffs, the trees, the flocks, the plaided shepherd, the ruins, etc. Clarinda’s craze for Highland landscape is so strong that she prefers the winter in the mountains, with its “rude gale lashing yonder lake into foam” and the snow “driving along the mountains”, to the “fog, and lamps, and chit-chat” of winter life in London.

The sublimity of the Highlands in autumn and winter is highlighted in an earlier novel, *The Romance of the Highlands*. Peter M. Darling’s novel, in fact, is rich in landscape descriptions, extolling the grandeur and sublimity of the Grampians during the cold seasons.\(^{13}\) Not only does Darling provide a clichéd description of the Highlands, but he also focuses on visual details, such as hues, shades and lights that reveal a deep pictorial sensitivity hard to be found in contemporary works:

> The dawn was beginning to streak the tops of the distant Grampians with a pale blue light, which expanded by degrees disclosed the gloomy bold outlines of adjacent crags, and surrounding features of the dusky landscape, the abrupt steeps rising in awful grandeur on every side, dimly seen through the mists covered with wood.\(^{14}\)

If, in *The Romance of the Highlands*, Darling provides a picturesque and pictorial portrait of the Highlands in the cold season, Robert Mudie sets this portrait in contrast with wintry, foggy London. Both writers, though writing at a time-lapse of ten years, focus on the very features that make Highland landscape the perfect subject for a picturesque representation. More than ten years later, in 1834, Andrew Picken decided to make Highland landscape the very core of his historical novel, *The Black Watch*. Unlike Darling, Picken does not limit himself to the description of Highland sublimity, but he tried to provide his readers with an insight in the effects exerted by landscape on imagination.


\(^{13}\) Peter Middleton Darling’s interest in portraying the Highlands in autumn and winter suggests his love of a Scottish cycle of poems, James Thomson’s *The Seasons*, published in 1730. *The Seasons* is composed of four poems, one for each season, focused on the description of Scottish landscape during the different periods of the year. It is possible that the fourth poem, *Winter*, exerted some influence on David Carey’s paying attention to seasonal details in *The Romance of the Highlands*.

protagonist of the novel, young Hector Munro, is a restless youth, endowed with a deeply romantic imagination; the engine setting the plot into motion is Hector’s fascination with the Highlands, which makes him decide to leave Inverness and to start a new life in the Highlands.

At the core of Hector’s craze for Highland landscape is his restlessness, which is continuously nurtured by a thirst for wilderness and natural grandeur. Although Hector’s first excursion among the Highlands – alone and penniless – turned out to be a failure, even setting Hector’s life at risk, the youth keeps on nourishing dreams of going to and settle on the Scottish mountains:

Even the taste he had received during his runaway excursion, of the grand and poetic impression of the mountains, increased the indefinite restlessness of his mind. The roving life, and the hardy fatigues of the free Highlander, appeared to him invested with charms irresistible – the echoing forest and the bounding roe, the craggy peak and wild glen, incessantly haunted his romantic imagination.  

The image of Highland landscape is indelible from Hector’s mind; according to the narrator, this passion is due to the effects exerted by the sublime on the human mind:

The sensations of Hector throughout his mountain journey – through some of the noblest scenery of Scotland – were often such as language does not compass the idea of, but which imaginative youth feels when first introduced into the presence of nature’s sublimest scenes; and which sometimes makes even age almost drunk with the contemplation of grandeur and of beauty.  

The drunkenness of which Picken writes in these lines is that powerful feeling of astonishment identified by Edmund Burke in the Enquiry as the strongest effect of the sublime on human mind. Hector’s restlessness is nourished by this drunkenness but, at the same time, it is also increased by his desire of freedom and independence. Indeed, Hector leaves Inverness because tired of being a servant and willing to become the author of his own fate. The narrator writes that Hector longs for joining the “free Highlander” in his “roving life and [...] hardy fatigues”. At Hector’s eyes, the Highlanders are free – they live in contact with wild nature and are independent of such constraints as servitude. Therefore, in his mind, Highland sublime landscape is not just a picturesque place, but the very symbol of freedom and liberty.

The Black Watch shows how the connection between freedom and the Highlands is not only linked to national independence, as in The Scottish Chiefs, but also to individual life.

---

and free will. In another historical novel concerned with individual independence and freedom, nature plays a similar role (although it is not Highland landscape in itself, but nature at large, that means freedom). The novel is E. H. H.’s *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady*; in it, the protagonist Johnnie Baillie eaves the paternal house to join a group of Highlanders, the M’Leods. At the beginning of his adventure, Johnnie is convinced that freedom can be pursued through leaving his family and disobeying to his parents; he believes that, by joining a group of Highland vengeful bandits, he will satisfy his restlessness.

Unlike Hector Munro, Johnnie Baillie’s story is doomed to ruin, because when Johnnie realises what the very essence of liberty is, it is too late. Indeed, it is only after having escaped from Edinburgh gaol that Johnnie realises that it is in nature that real liberty can be found: “When he fixed his eyes on dim objects, which he conjured were fields, trees and woods – when he inhaled the pure air of the country, it was then that he felt what real liberty was.”

But Johnnie is now a fugitive; he has lost the love and praise of his family forever, and the gallows are awaiting him. At the core of this historical and moral novel is the teaching that while disobedience can only lead to ruin, real liberty must be found in a life spent in contact with nature.

Liberty, both as a national and an individual concept, is the most powerful symbol connected with the Highlands in the novels here studied. Another interesting idea attached to the sublime Highlands is that of primeval nature. As a wild and non-humanised landscape, the Highlands are sometimes described as a primitive place, where modernity has not come yet; in other words, as a place free from the corruption of modern society. The two most interesting examples of this attitude are provided in two novels that are set after improvement. The novels are Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* and George Robert Gleig’s *Allan Breck*. The time lapse considered in *Allan Breck* spans from 1715 to 1789; therefore, the author provides representations of the Highlands both before and after the enforcement of improvement.

*Discipline* is a different case; the author does not reveal the year in which the novel is set, but some hints are present, suggesting that the novel is set around the 1770s. During that period, the improvement of the remotest parts of the Highlands had not been accomplished yet; Brunton, indeed, observes that the Grahams are improving the area by degrees, in a balanced way. Therefore, the Highlands represented by Mary Brunton are on the edge between the pre- and the post-improvement stage. In the novel, Highland

---

landscape is not just the backdrop to the protagonist’s inner growth, but the very force at the core of her change from spoiled London girl to virtuous and honest Highland wife. The accent is laid solitude and wilderness; the Highlands are so solitary that Ellen feels as though she were in a primeval place, where traces of human action are scarcely present:

I myself was so little more inclined to break the silence imposed by the scene. Far below our feet lay a lake, motionless as if never breeze had ruffled its calm. All there was still as yet unpeopled earth, except the gliding shadow of a solitary eagle sailing down the vale.\(^{19}\)

In *Discipline*, too, the stress is laid on seasons; this time, it is spring that mostly affects the protagonist of the novel. The hint that the Highlands are a sort of heavenly place is made explicit by Ellen, who exclaims: “Spring came; and never, since the first spring adorned Eden, did that season appear so lovely!”\(^{20}\) If in *Discipline* the Highlands gain some Eden-like hues, in George Robert Gleig’s *Allan Breck* it is wilderness that recalls the early days of the earth:

The whole scene, indeed, exhibits Nature in her wildest and most magnificent aspect; for there is not a feature in it that fails to carry the imagination back to the time when chaos first began to give place to order throughout the world.\(^{21}\)

Both novelists lay the stress on the primeval wilderness and solitude of the Highlands. Noteworthy, this kind of representation emphasises a contrast between primeval Highlands and the Highlands of the early nineteenth century. In fact, by portraying the Scottish mountains as a primitive place, inhabited by noble people (on the model established by James Macpherson in the Songs of Ossian), not only did early-nineteenth-century novelists embrace the romantic taste for primitivism, but they also concealed their criticism about the present situation of the Highlands. The introduction of a more modern social system, based on trade and industry, affected not only the lives of people, but also landscape.

### 2. Improvement and Change: The Effects of Modernity on Highland Landscape

The contrast between pre- and post-improvement Highlands implicitly suggested in landscape representations of the Scottish mountains as a primeval environment, inhabited by noble savages, is explicitly dealt with in novels set after the enforcement of improvement. In fact, in the novels set during the end of the eighteenth and the beginning of the

\(^{19}\) M. Brunton, *op. cit.*, Vol. III, p. 212.


nineteenth centuries, the stress is no longer laid on wilderness and sublimity as symbols of independence and freedom. Instead, novelists employ landscape descriptions as explicit commentaries on Scottish history, society and identity. In their novels, the representations of the Highlands are dominated by remarks on the changes brought about by improvers, on the differences between modern and old Highlands and on the effect of war on landscape.

Improvement and change are undeniably the dominant theme. Although being set in America for the greatest part, Allan Cunningham’s historical novel, *Paul Jones*, (1826), opens on the western coast of northern Scotland. Cunningham’s remarks about landscape in Scotland and, in particular, in the Highlands are extremely interesting. The narrator writes of a lapse of fifty years, the flight of which “wrought a change upon the hills and dales of Caledonia”. The change described by the novelist involves many aspects of life, from the introduction of sheep-farms to the cultivation of corn. In the following quotation, the narrator in Cunningham’s novel highlights how landscape has been significantly affected by improvement:

The rivulet, which meandered at will over the haughs and holms, and raced about like a young colt, forming many curious turns and leaps between walls of stone, and runs its career in a straight and undeviating line. Trees, instead of being sown by the winds, and scattered about in the careless and happy haste of nature, are now dabbled out / by the line and measure; while the abodes of men are no longer sheltered on the sunny side of the hill, and clustered together according to the caprice of a shepherd or a ploughman, but are perched upon on some picturesque point of view, where they are visited by all the storms of heaven.

In these lines, attention is paid to the introduction of order as the instrument employed to take control over nature, which is no longer an independence force, but it has been domesticated through straight lines and precise measurements – trees are now sown by men in rows, while water is no longer left free to flow where it used to, but it is channelled into straight canals. Noteworthy, the narrator’s voice also stresses the effects of modernity on buildings; while in the past houses and huts were built in strategic paces chosen on grounds of comfort, now they were built in most picturesque, but definitely scarcely comfortable locations.

---

22 This novel is not included in the Identity and Highlands Corpus because the Highlands and Scotland are present only in the first chapters, while the historical facts narrated are more concerned with American independence from Great Britain, than with issues of Scottish national identity. Nevertheless, the opening pages of the novel provide a peculiarly rich and significant description of the situation of the Highlands after improvement.


The reshaping of landscape through the introduction of order and straight lines is at the core of the improving project carried out by Mason in the small Highland village of Glenburnie. The narrator, indeed, stresses the changes brought about by Mason’s teachings on Glenburnie’s landscape, a place where no straight lines were present before the woman’s arrival:

The meadows and corn-field, indeed, seemed very evidently to have been encroachments made by stealth on the sylvan reign: for none had their outlines marked with the mathematical precision, in which the modern improver so much delight. Not a straight line was to be seen in Glenburnie.25

The lack of “mathematical precision” is associated with natural chaos and lack of modernity; the implicit message here seems the opposite of the one conveyed by Gleig and Brunton; while they extolled the primeval character of the Highlands, Hamilton seems to be critical about it, invoking the introduction of improvement and order, to domesticate wilderness. After Mrs Mason’s work there, Glenburnie is no longer a wild, dirty, and primitive village, but it “present[s] such a picture of neatness and comfort” which could not be found anywhere else in the Highlands.26

Interestingly, Hamilton’s is the first Scottish novel directly dealing with the Highlands and improvement. In it, there is no trace of the Highland myth, nor of later Highland stereotypes and commonplaces. Hamilton’s perspective on the Highland predicament is quite complex in this novel. Indeed, while the narrator’s extols the improvements brought about by Mrs Mason’s in the village of Glenburnie, the ending of the plot tends to devoid improvement of the benefits praised by the narrator. Mrs Maclarty’s daughters and son, in fact, do experience no significant emotional and economic progress in their lives; although learning the value of work and exertion, they dilapidate their earnings and lose contact with their family.

In my opinion, the separation between the Maclarty’s family members and their incapacity to cope with life in town is a proof that they drew no significant benefits from Mrs Mason’s teachings; before her arrival, they are represented as dirty and idle, but they live happily and united; after improvement, they are clean, tidy and active, but at the same time alone and incapable of managing the fruits of their exertion. In The Cottagers of Glenburnie happiness and improvement are inversely proportional one to the other: when such features

---

26 Ibidem, p. 397.
as cleanliness and dedication to work increase, life quality decreases, suggesting that Hamilton was not possibly writing in support of improvement, but against it.

Cunningham hints to changes in the choice of the locations for building houses. Other novelists emphasise the changes in architecture involved by the coming of modernity on the Highlands. In this case, novelists do not impute the change to improvement, but to modernity. Eighteenth-century changes made to ancient buildings are oftentimes reported by writers as a damage to the aesthetics and, sometimes, to the very nature, of those buildings. The impenetrable castles of the past were erected in such places and according to such principles that made them a part of the surrounding natural environment. An example of the harmonious relationship between ancient castles and nature is provided in The Romance of the Highlands, set during the sixteenth century. Darling describes the castle of the Earl of Strathallan as in tune with the wilderness that surrounds it:

It was situated in one of the wildest glens of the Highlands. On one side, a large deep forest extended its gloomy limits for many miles; beyond which, high and craggy summits, towering in awful grandeur, covered with heath, appeared peeping above the dark foliage of the woods. On the other side of the castle, was seen the Allan, murmuring gently through the green sloping banks.

Strathallan castle is well inserted in nature; the wilderness of the environment is not diminished by its presence, preserving its “gloomy grandeur”. In other novels, the effects of modernity on ancient architecture are described as a source of damage to the original essence of the buildings. Such remarks about the modern reshaping of ancient castles are not exclusive of novels set after the enforcement of improvement, but can be found also in novels set before it, like Conirdan, or during its spreading, like Discipline. In Conirdan, the narrator openly remarks on the damage done to the old tower in Glen Anna by its modernisation:

It was a singular looking pile of building, the most elevated part being a tower of ancient date, and having a more modern but ill-contrived and clumsy house added to its bone. [...] The appearance of the place was spoiled by alteration, the tower losing that air of venerable antiquity that is always interesting to the feelings.

The unknown author of Conirdan explicitly criticises the modern attachments added to the old tower, which deprived the ancient building of its “air of venerable antiquity”. In Discipline, too, modern attachments and reshaping deprive castle Eredine of its dignity,

---

28 Conirdan cit., pp. 250-1.
arousing no strong emotions in the heart of Ellen on her first visit there. Therefore, it can be observed that according to early-nineteenth-century novelists, the modernisation of ancient buildings is a harmful practice that can deprive the building not only of its original purpose (Castle Eredine is no longer a fortress, and the only witness of his past function is provided by the “narrow arched door-way”), but also of its artistic potential. The loss of venerable antiquity, in fact, can be seen as a loss of aesthetic value, because the building is no longer able to arise such emotions considered as a part of the picturesque experience.

At the core of this change in architecture is the change in function of buildings, to which Mary Brunton slightly hints. With the end of feudalism, castles were no longer built as military fortresses. Instead, their new priority was that of being comfortable places, suitable for the needs of modern landlords. As a consequence, the way in which castles and towers are described in early-nineteenth-century novels depends upon the function attached to the building. In fact, in the novels where the castle is the place of Gothic adventure, no modernisation is present, even though the novel is set after improvement, the clearest instance is provided by Honoria Scott in The Castle of Strathmay:

Superstitions would have marked the Castle of Strathmay as the habitation of a supernatural being, delighting in the wildest scenes of nature, - some genius of the storm – Rising many hundred feet from the surface of the ocean, the dark, wild, architecture of the ancient edifice, as the shades of a stormy day, fell on the walls and turrets blended with the craggy basis on which it stood.

In other novels, like Discipline, the castle has no Gothic function; instead, it is a comfortable place, where the protagonist is well at ease. Castle Eredine is an example of a modernised building that, despite having been deprived of its ancient feudal function, is still immersed in nature. The reshaping of ancient towers and castles, indeed, represents an attempt to create a compromise between the past and the present. Modernised buildings, in fact, are still surrounded by nature, so that their inhabitants keep on enjoying a life in contact with nature. Moreover, they continue to live where their forefathers lived, keeping the connection with the past alive.

In the case of emigration, instead, the connection with nature and past is lost. In Cunningham’s novel, for instance, attention is drawn on those “rich and noble people” who “have left their mooted castles, [...] the places consecrated by the memory of five hundred

29 “A square tower, with its narrow ached door-way, was the only trace which remained of warlike-array; and a range of more modern building [...] gave me no exalted idea of the accommodation of Castle Eredine” (M. Brunton, op. cit., Vol. III, p. 214).
years, and all that can link men’s heart to inanimate nature”. By moving either to towns or to new palaces in less remote locations, landlords and rich people severed their link not only with the wild nature of the Highlands, but also with the buildings were their families lived for centuries. In other words, the lords abandoned the vestiges of their past, rooted in feudalism, to embrace modern commodities and comforts.

The same happened in the case of poorer people, like the peasants compelled to leave their farms during the clearances; they abandoned their native lands and villages, moving to newly rising industrial towns or to the colonies. In Clan-Albin, for instance, C. I. Johnstone emphasises the sense of loss felt by Highlanders during the clearances and their sorrow in leaving the lands of their fathers.

The turning of wilderness into a commodity can be detected in several novels. The heroes of both of Carey’s novels, General Gordon and General Cameron, enjoy making drawings of Highlands landscape, while Amherst Oakenwold in Lochandhu spends lots of time with Eliza Malcolm, enjoying walks in nature and making sketches of the most picturesque prospects. In Highland Mary, the domestication of nature is closely connected with its turning into a commodity. In fact, in the wild and sublime places visited by Mary during her solitary walks, benches have been introduced; sublime prospects are now something to be enjoyed by the inhabitants of the parish, that is to say, a commodity:

Ascending the bank, she seated herself on one of the benches interspersed in the walks; this was one more sequestered from the rest – behind and on each side it was surrounded with thick and luxuriant shrubbery, almost overshadowed by tall and spreading beeches; in front was a precipice, overlooking a deep and dark chasm in the valley, above which the river fell from a cascade, in a pool completely overshadowed with weeping birch, hazel, and other tangling shrubs, while the opposite bank rose precipitously, clad with the varied and majestic garniture of the forest.

In this passage – one of the very few landscape descriptions present in the novel – the narrator portrays a perfectly sublime landscape, with “a deep and dark chasm” and a bank that rises “precipitously”, and turns it into a symbol of the modern approach to nature, according to which natural prospects are a commodity, something to be enjoyed as a pastime.

Alienation from nature is not the only consequence of modernisation and improvement. The movement from ancient Highland castles to new palaces and towns described by Cunningham, as well as the emigration caused by the Highland clearances

highlighted by Johnstone, entailed a growing detachment from the past. Indeed, by abandoning the places where their forefathers lived for centuries, meant for many Highlanders leaving behind a piece of their personal history and, therefore, of their identity not only as individuals but also as a people.

The tendency to regard places as a concretisation of the past, of man’s origins and history, has been considered as connected to a rather interesting concept: heritage. Heritage can be described as the “use or understanding of the past through remembrance, memorialising, and even celebration, often including the use of representational landscapes”. Heritage is not history; instead, it is a form of memorial focused on the events that a certain group of people considers most significant and representative. Heritage is like a monument to the past, an attempt to bridge the gap between the past and the present. Therefore, it is not objective; instead, it is mediated by emotions and culture.

It can be noted how the concept of heritage is strictly connected with that of identity. When a people celebrates certain places, buildings and monuments as symbols of their past, they are also identifying with that past, inheriting their present character, manners and culture from their forefathers. The ancient castles of the Highlands represent a kind of heritage for their inhabitants, because it was in those very walls that their families lived for centuries. The same can be said for Highland landscape in the case of all the poor people who were compelled to leave their native valleys.

Heritage is generally connected with battlefields, castles and places made famous by certain historical events. In the novels here studied typical heritage symbols, like battlefields, are oftentimes present. Not only they are portrayed as the settings of action – when the characters fight in a certain battle – but they are also represented through the eyes of characters who, many years after the battles were fought, interpret them emotionally. The most visited battlefields are the field of Culloden and that Bannockburn.

The field of Culloden, due to the events following the battle of the 1746, rapidly began to be regarded as a symbol of Scotland’s loss of independence. Although the Union had already been granted in 1707, it was only after Culloden that it was completed, with the pacification of the Highlands. Therefore, the field were the battle was fought became a part of the heritage of Scotland and, as such, it bears witness of the ruthless fights that occurred there. In Alexander Balfour’s Macrimmon, the protagonist, Charlie Clifford, visits the field of

---

Culloden for the first time during an excursion with his fellow soldiers on a free day from service. Charlie is deeply affected by the landscape of the plain:

Clifford saw, in those patches of verdure, a more affecting memorial of the slain [...]; for it seemed to his imagination as though, in keeping them perpetually green, Nature had stamped on that black moor an imperishable record of her aversion to strife existing between men born on the same land. Considerably more than half-a-century elapsed since human blood irrigated those heart-speaking spots, yet their hue is as rich as though it had been only shed one year; and bright and unfading will it remain, till the last trumpet shall call upon Culloden to give up its dead.\textsuperscript{34}

This passage proves how, already in 1823 – when \textit{Macrimmon} was written, people were aware of the possibility to regard certain landscapes a “memorial” of the past and, consequently, of history. Culloden, as the narrator remarks, is not just a field; it is the place where two armies, made up of people coming from the same nation, fought one against the other in a sadly fratricide battle that nature is still unable to accept. The verdure of the field is supposed to last until the end of times, to remind man of the vile evils of civil war.

As a symbol, the field of Culloden represents the spot where Jacobitism was definitely defeated; after 1746 the Highlands were reshaped – feudalism eradicated and modernity introduced. Due to its undeniable historical importance, the field of Culloden appears in many historical novels of the period (especially in those set during the 1745 Jacobite rising), from the most famous Scott’s \textit{Waverley}, to David Carey’s \textit{Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden}, to George Robert Gleig’s \textit{Allan Breck} and Andrew Picken’s \textit{The Back Watch}.

Noteworthy, other battlefields are employed as heritage landscapes connected with the past of Scotland and its loss of independence and identity. In Gleig’s \textit{Allan Breck}, for instance, the eponymous hero of the novel meets with three Jacobite ladies deeply devoted to the cause. Allan spends some days as a guest in their house, placed in the neighbourhoods of Stirling. From the casements, Allan can behold the field of Bannockburn, where the glorious 1314 battle between Scotland and England was fought. At Bannockburn, King Robert de Bruce defeated the English army, demonstrating the Scottish capacity to resist to foreign invasions; therefore, the battle is extremely important in terms of national identity. One of the ladies, while speaking with Allan about the surrounding landscape, highlights the symbolic meaning of that spot which, according to her, is the very remnant of Scotland’s independent past:

You see before you a landscape [...] upon which true-bred Scotchmen cannot gaze without experiencing a strange mixture of proud and debasing emotions. Far

\textsuperscript{34} A. Balfour, \textit{op. cit.}, Vol. I, p. 58.
down in the bottom, where the stream makes a bend to the north, is the field of Bannockburn – the scene of Bruce’s immortal triumph, and Scotland’s temporary escape from bondage. That hill to the left is the same from which his camp-followers advanced, bearing their blankets on the tops of poles as banners, and striking dismay, by the sound of their bagpipes, into Edward’s chivalry. But what matters all that now? The memory of those illustrious deeds remains only to cover with disgrace the fallen and degraded descendants of those who wrought them.35

Most significantly, the lady speaks of “landscape” and stresses its capacity to arise, in the true-Scotsman’s heart, contrasting feelings of pride for the ancient victory and shame for the present dependence from England, which the lady calls “bondage”. The field of Bannockburn represents the heritage of Scotland, bearing memory of a distant past, when England was an enemy kingdom, and not the leader of the United Kingdom. In these lines, Balfour endows the lady with a truly Jacobite spirit, making her speaking as a Jacobite is likely to have done, when beholding the field of Bannockburn.

Both Macrimmon and Allan Breck are historical novels written in the Scott-like fashion. Therefore, one may be led to believe that heritage landscapes are typical of historical novels. Actually, heritage landscapes were already present in older novels, such as, The Towers of Lothian; or, The Banks of Carron, published in 1806, and Vale of the Clyde (1810). In The Towers of Lothian, a Gothic novel, it is the town of Alnwick that, due to its historical importance, become a heritage landscape, able to arise sorrowful feelings in the hearts of Donaldbert and his fellow traveller, while, in Honoria Scott’s Vale of the Clyde, the young protagonist, Flora, visits the area surrounding Lanark, highlighting its importance in the first War of Scottish Independence.

Among the category of heritage we can include also other landscapes that, despite being not famous in history, are charged with historical and emotional importance – the landscapes affected by war. In the novels studied in this dissertation, indeed, war is generally condemned as a destructive force that, besides entailing the death of many innocent people, transforms natural and human-made landscape. Remarks about war and its ruthless violence are present in many novels and mostly focused on the effects of the Forty-Five on the Highlands.

In some works, the criticism about war becomes merged with landscapes able to bear the visual signs of the passage of armies, of military retaliations and punishments. The most eye-catching instances are provided in Allan Breck, where the signs of ravage and war

are visible both in the Highlands and in England. While retiring from Derby, Allan Breck observes the Lowland landscape of the areas where battles have been fought; the places clearly testify that was has visited the place:

It was no hard matter to discover that the district which he was now traversing had witnessed the evolutions of hostile armies [...]. As far as the eye could reach, marks of rapine and havoc were everywhere discernible. The farm-houses and cabins, indeed, were generally entire, though even these had not wholly escaped the visitations of the spoiler; but of the gentlemen’s seats there wee few which failed to exhibit manifest tokens that the foot of the marauder had recently defiled their vicinity. Fences broken down and gardens devastated – with here and there a window smashed, and a hall-door torn from its hinges, told a tale of passions irritated or malice let loose.\(^{36}\)

The effects of the passage of the army are well visible on the Lowland landscape, but the representation is not as dramatic as the description of Highland landscape after the English retaliations following the battle of Culloden:

[...] much more terrible, because much more frequent, were the marks of royal vengeance discernible among the straths and glens of the highlands. There was not a settlement belonging to the rebel clans which the sword and the flame had been permitted to pass over. [...] Detachments of troops were sent abroad with express orders to pillage and destroy; the cattle wee driven off or wantonly slaughtered, the shielings were committed to the flames [...]\(^{37}\)

3. Conclusion

To conclude, landscape is strictly connected with historical and cultural issues. The visual representation of space gains a critical function, becoming an instrument in the hands of the novelist, employed to comment on national and cultural identity. The Highlands are the most described location in these novels; their importance is connected not only to their historical role of last area annexed to the United Kingdom, but also to the late-eighteenth-century fashion for touring them. The Highlands are oftentimes portrayed as a symbol of the past; people visited them in quest for primitive peoples, uncorrupted manners and astonishing landscapes. The spreading of the taste for the sublime and the picturesque overlapped with this interest, turning certain aesthetic features into symbols of national identity.

In the novels of the early-nineteenth-century, the concern with national and cultural identity merges with the taste for the sublime and the Highlands. As a consequence, these novels are rich in landscape descriptions that are not only endowed with picturesque appeal, but that bear witness of Scotsmen’s desire to define their own identity. Highland


landscape, with its peculiarities, is employed as a symbol of Scottishness, and many visual features become stereotypical; they are present in most novels and are endowed with further meaning that transcends mere aesthetic evaluation.
CHAPTER X

Literary Geography and National Identity

1. Introduction

In the last chapter, I dealt with landscape as a representation of space in the novels here studied, highlighting the role played by national ideas in the creation of certain clichés employed in the description of the Highlands. Landscape, in fact, is not just a representation of the social and natural environment in which man lives, it is also a cultural representation, because it is endowed with further meaning hinting at the moral values of the novelist and his ideas. Nevertheless, landscape is not the only element employed in literature to represent the spatial coordinate of the chronotope; the other important means is geography.

In this chapter, I provide an analysis of the literary worlds in which the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are set. In other words, I will provide an account of the space where characters move, establishing a connection between the representation of space and the plot. I will point to the presence of some dominant patterns, according to which the novels are structured. The main patterns are five, and result from the analysis of the direction in which the heroes and heroines move. For instance, the dominant pattern is the one in which a Highlander goes abroad to either the Lowlands, or England, or over-sea colonies, and eventually goes back to his native land.

The aim of this analytical approach is to highlight the function played by identity issues in the construction of the fictional world in which the heroes and heroines of the Identity and Highlands Corpus move. In fact, the concern with national and cultural identity affected not only the temporal setting of novels, but also the representation of the world in which action occurs. In the novels here studied, each place has a precise function; places significantly affect the development of the plot and its eventual resolution. In a certain region, the hero or heroine can find love, liberty, friends, richness, etc. while in other places he or she can be forced to face dangers, hindrances, difficulties and hardships. By studying what happens in each place visited by the protagonists and what kind of people they meet there, we can learn if a place has a positive, negative or neutral function.
2. Geocriticism and Literary Geography: Mapping and Literature

The approach endorsed in this chapter consists in the application of geography to literature. This is no innovation, however. In fact, this method has received more and more attention over the last decades. Among the leading critics who have applied geography to literature we must mention Franco Moretti, famous for his studies about the novel, and Robert T. Tally Jr. According to Moretti, there are two ways in which literary studies can merge with geography – the study of the areas in which novels are written (focusing on the spreading of literary production), and the study of the geographical worlds described in novels.¹ In such works as The Atlas of the European Novel (1998) and Graphs, Maps, Trees. Abstract Models for a Literary Theory (2005), Moretti provides interesting examples of both methods.

In this chapter, I will apply the second method described by Moretti, that is to say, the study of the geographical space as it is represented in novels. This approach is at the core of a form of literary criticism called geocriticism. Geocriticism consists in an innovative methodology of analysing literature, focused on the study of the way in which novelists represent the world in their works. Geocriticism is a combination of cultural and literary studies; it is an interdisciplinary approach aimed at the analysis of society and culture through the study of literature. Due to its intrinsic aims and features, geocriticism proves consistently useful to this dissertation; in fact, the study of the literary representation of space in the Identity and Highlands Corpus provides important information about early-nineteenth-century Scottish culture and the Scots’ cultural ideas about national identity.

In his introduction to Geocritical Explorations. Space, Place and Mapping in Literary and Cultural Studies (2011), Bertrand Westphal defines the four main features of geocriticism.² At first, geocriticism is focused on the geographical area represented, not on the single representations given by a certain novelist; in this chapter, for instance, I do not deal with the spatial representations provided by one novelist in his or her novels, but with the literary representations of the Highlands, Scotland and the British Empire provided in the Identity and Highlands Corpus. It is only by studying and comparing more perspectives on the same geographical areas that we can develop some reliable hypothesis about the general ideas held by early-nineteenth-century Scots interested in national identity issues.

The employment of geocriticism, in fact, provides a privileged angle on the way in which a certain region is represented in literature. The advantages of this “broader range of vision” are consistent, because thanks to them the critic becomes aware of different viewpoints that, when compared, can lead to the identification of certain clichés or stereotypes. In addition to this, geocriticism, although being focused on the literary representation of space, takes into account the role played by all the senses through which man perceives the reality, not just of sight. Lastly, the possibility to study different representations of the same place, either produced or set in different periods, enables the critic to create a sort of “spatio-temporal scheme” in which places are “located [...] in a temporal depth in order to uncover or discover multilayered identities”.

In the case of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, the connection between the representation of space and time is reinforced by the wide range of periods in which the novels are set; the values and meanings attached to a certain region, indeed, may vary according to the period in which the novel is set. For instance, in novels set during the Wars of Scottish Independence, such as Jane Porter’s The Scottish Chiefs, the Highlands are represented as a fortress against the English invaders; their wilderness is a threat only to the enemy, not to their natives. The function of the Highlands is different in the novels set during the late eighteenth century. In Thomas Dick Lauder’s Lochandhu or Honoria Scott’s Strathmay, in fact, the Highlands are no longer a stronghold against the invader, but the remnant of a barbarous past. The comparison among these novels reveals how the Highlands were endowed with different identity meanings; in the case of nationalist novels extolling Scottish independence, the Highlands and their inhabitants are portrayed as heroes involved in the effort to defend their nation; they represent the very spirit of Scotland. Instead, in such novels as Lochandhu and Strathmay, the Highlands and the periphery of Scotland are portrayed as a place were barbarous habits are still present, were feudalism, injustice and criminality still reign. In these novels, the Highlands and their inhabitants do not represent modern identity; instead, they represent a burden of habits and manners that the modern Scot should avoid.

This comparison shows the novel just mentioned shows how the historical setting of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus is affected by the author’s ideas about national identity. The analysis of the way in which a region is represented in different novels

---

helps to identify a series of patterns, in which each region plays a different function and conveys different cultural meanings.

Noteworthy, comparing different literary representations of the same regions proves useful also in the study of the dynamics between Self and Otherness and centre and periphery. Thanks to the presence of several perspectives, it is possible to compare a number of opinions, developing a more comprehensive view of the role played by national and cultural concerns in early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels. Each of the six patterns proposed in this chapter, in fact, is characterised by different relationships between centre and periphery and between Self and Other. For instance, in some novels such as Mary Brunton’s *Discipline* and Felix M’Donough’s *The Highlanders* there is a neat opposition between centre and periphery, represented in the contrast between the Highlands and London; while the Highlands are the place of virtue and honesty, London is the site of vice and hardships. In other works, such as Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde*, centre and periphery, embodied in the Highlands and the Lowlands, are two complementary regions symbolically reconciled in the perfect figure of the heroine, Flora Hamilton, whose parents came one from the Highlands and the other from the Lowlands.

The idea underlying a geocritical approach is that, when a novelist creates the world in which characters move and act, he or she is creating a literary map of that world, which is very much similar to the maps of reality created by geographers.\(^5\) This operation of map-making is not always a “self-conscious mapping”, as Tally observes in *Spatiality*.\(^6\) Instead, map-making is a typical operation of storytelling:

- Like a mapmaker, the writer must survey territory determining which features of a given landscape to include, emphasise, or to diminish. [...] The writer must establish the scale and the shape, no less of the narrative than of places in it.\(^7\)

In practice, when a writer plans his novel, the heroes and heroines’ movements, the extension of the space in which they move and act and the functions played by places, they are creating a map; the plot itself, according to Tally, is a plan and, therefore, a map.\(^8\)

Literary geography is the science that allows to study these maps, while the writer who creates them is a sort of literary cartographer. Noteworthy, the study of the maps implied in the novels is always interpretative, because the literary geographer has to analyse

\(^7\) *Ibidem*, p. 45.
\(^8\) *Ibidem*, p. 49.
the plot and the setting (that is to say, the map), in the attempt to discover what ideas and concerns have affected the creation of the map. The role of the writer as a mapmaker has been explored by Peter Turchi in his *Maps of the Imagination: The Writer as Cartographer* (2004), a sort of guide for novelists and writers about the way in which a work should be planned. In this work, Turchi, himself a writer, highlights the impossibility for the writer to be objective:

> We might set out intending simply to describe what we see – to open the curtains beyond our desk and report on the landscape outside our window – but even then we describe what we see, the way we see it. [...] No matter how hard we work to be “objective” or “faithful”, we create.⁹

The most obvious consequence of the impossibility to be an objective portrayer of reality, is that literature can be employed as an effective means in the study of culture.

### 3. Plot and Space: Extension of the World in the Identity and Highlands Corpus and its Meaning

The novels studied in this dissertation are dense with clues and hints to their authors’ national and cultural convictions. Even in Gothic novels, which are the least politically involved, many features suggest the importance of the role played by topical issues such as identity and culture. In the novels taken into account in this dissertation, the plot develops in fictional worlds that represent the real world. Noteworthy, these representations are not always faithful to the original; like other features of the setting, such as the historical period and the landscape, the construction of the narrative world in which the characters act and travel is deeply affected by the contemporary clichés and stereotypes to which the novelist willingly conforms his or her work.

In order to better reconstruct the geographical structure of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus, I have mapped the movements and travels of heroes and heroines. Thanks to the creation of some simplified maps, I was able to draw some relevant conclusions about the way in which the novelists concerned with identity issues structured the spatial coordinate of their works. As a first thing, the literary map of each novel can be overlapped with a real map of the globe. In fact, despite the presence of some fictive topographical names, the area in which novels are set is always clear to the reader. Instead,

⁹ P. Turchi, *op. cit.*, p. 14. Moreover, literature is doubly subjective, in the sense that not only is the writer conveying his own opinions and ideas, but the reader interprets them and, by doing this, her/she unavoidably modify them. Therefore, the representations of space in the novels here studied are not only affected by the writers’ personal ideas about national identity and culture, but they are also mediated by my own aims and theories (despite my attempts to always keep objective).
the extension of the world represented varies consistently; while in some novels the plot is limited to the Highlands (Peter M. Darling’s *The Romance of the Highlands*, for instance), in others it extends further to the West Indies and the Americas (Alexander Sutherland’s *Macrimmon*, Christian I. Johnstone’s *Clan-Albin*, Mary Johnston’s *The Lairds of Glenfern*).

Fictive names are oftentimes employed, especially for villages and estates. Nevertheless, these fictive places can be located on real maps quite comfortably; for instance, the valley of Owenclew, in E.H.H.’s *The Highlander*, is a fictive valley but it is also easily recognised as a glen placed on the Highland Line. In *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, Hamilton never reveals that the novel is set on the Highlands, but she scatters several clues in the narration, which makes the reader aware the Glenburnie is a Highland Village; for instance, the very name of the place suggests Highland origins, because, in Gaelic, “burn” means “small river”.

The world as it is represented in these novels is oftentimes not the early-nineteenth-century one; instead, it is a reconstruction of the world as the authors believe it was in the period in which the novels are set. Quite obviously, a novel set during the first War of Scottish Independence cannot feature the Americas as a setting, because they were still to be discovered. Nevertheless, the choice of the extension of the world in which a novel is set is interestingly significant. In fact, novelists, in their attempt to fit the world to the period in which they set their novels, are creating a fictional representation of the past in which history, culture and clichés play a major role. Rather obviously, the fourteenth-century Scotland described by Jane Porter in *The Scottish Chiefs* is not a faithful historical reconstruction of the Scotland of the past, but a stereotypical representation that emphasises some features, neglecting others.

In the novels set in more recent times, such as the second half of the eighteenth century, the representation of the world is significantly different from that of the novels set before. The extension of the world, in particular, grows with the advancing of the historical setting of novels. In other words, the novels set in the remote past are characterised by a smaller spatial extension, generally limited to Scotland and England, with some rare hints to the Continent (France, for instance, is present in novels dealing with the Jacobite rebellions). Instead, novels set after the second half of the eighteenth century tend to include the peripheries of the British Empire, reaching to the West Indies, over-sea colonies as the Indies, and former colonies as certain American territories.
From a cultural viewpoint, the change in the extension of the spatial world in which novels are set is very interesting, because it is symptomatic of the novelists’ awareness of the changes occurred in political dynamics during the eighteenth century. The Union between Scotland and England is only the first step in a long process of globalisation that radically reshaped the relationship between centre and periphery within the British Empire. In novels set in the remote past, characters move between Scotland and England, while in those set in more recent times they move among Scotland, England, the Continent, the Indies and the Americas. In fact, we can observe a shifting of the role of centre from Scotland to England, with the advancing of the period in which novels are set. I here provide a table illustrating the relationship between temporal and geographical setting in the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus:

Figure 1. Geographical setting of the novels of the Corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>XIII</th>
<th>XIV</th>
<th>XV</th>
<th>XVI</th>
<th>XVII</th>
<th>XVIII</th>
<th>XIX</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conirdan, The Highlanders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB + Europe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Doomed One</td>
<td>A Legend of Argyle, The Black Watch, Allan Breck, Lochiel, Lochandhu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Empire + Europe</td>
<td>The Scottish Orphans, Arthur Monteith, Highland Mary, Discipline, Clan-Albin, The Vale of the Clyde</td>
<td>The Lairds of Glenfern, Macrimmon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
is limited to Scotland. England is present as a threatening, bordering kingdom that characters do not visit. Scotland is the centre, because it is the English army that crosses the borders and enters into Scotland. Moreover, in such novels as The Romance of the Highlands and Reft Rob, action always occurs among the Highlands, with no centre-periphery relationship with England.

In the novels set during the Jacobite Risings, especially in those written by David Carey, there is a neat juxtaposition between centre and periphery, embodied in the clash between the British Army and the Highland Jacobites. In both Carey’s A Legend of Argyle and Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden, the Highlands are the periphery of the United Kingdom; moreover, they are a threatening force attempting to deprive the establishment of its rightful powers. Noteworthy, Carey does conform his portraits of the Highlands and the Highlanders to the Highland Myth; in his novels, the Highlands are a peripheral area, inhabited by savages, not by “noble” savages. In these novels, we can observe a shift in the position of the centre, which is no longer in Scotland but in London, the place were decisions are taken, the core of the United Kingdom. The aim of the Jacobites is, in fact, not the restoration of Scottish independence, but the restoration of the Stuarts on the British throne, leaving London at the centre of the Empire.

In novels set after the period of improvement, the tendency to portray London as the centre of the narrative world is even more evident. In Mary Brunton’s Discipline, London is the centre of the Empire, the seat of the modern social system founded upon money-making and trading. The Highlands, instead, are the periphery, the place where old virtues and values are still alive. In these novels, the Highlands become a relative periphery, because more peripheral areas, such as the Indies, are present. The Highlanders are described as a noble people and stand in contrast to the savages of the colonies. In Mary Johnston’s The Lairds of Glenfern, for instance, Helen Grant (a native Highlander) settles in the West Indies with her husband, Mr Whitmore, a rich tradesman. Despite her wealthy life in the Indies, Helen feels that the place is not virtuous enough for raising their son, and goes back to the Highlands. In Alexander Balfour’s Highland Mary, it is northern America that is inhabited by savages. In fact, in the long chapter devoted to the narration of the history of her family, Mary’s father, after partaking in the Forty-Five, emigrated to America, giving his child, Mary,

10 See Argyle’s opening monologue on the tower of Inverara Castle: “Heaven, in thy mercy, ward off from my country’s political horizon the clouds, which in portentous gloom announce the coming storm, and threaten to return worse than Gothic barbarism” (D. Carey, A Legend of Argyle, cit., p. 6).
to his friend Captain Bruce. In America, Mary’s father endures several hardships; it is enough to say that when, some years later, Captain Bruce meets him there, he is a prisoner in the hands of the Indians.

Another important feature of the Identity and Highlands Corpus is the quantity of details provided about different regions. While the Highlands and Scotland are usually described in depth, England, the Continent and the colonies are scarcely described. In practice, the further a place is from Scotland, the least its descriptions are detailed. This is especially true about landscape representations, probably due to the hegemony of the picturesque and the sublime, generally portrayed as something typical of the Highlands. On the other hand, foreign places like the Continent, the Indies and the Americas are scarcely described; the periods spent there by heroes and heroines are summed up in a few paragraphs, even when they spend there many years.

From a cultural viewpoint, this lack of balance in the attention devoted to place descriptions stems from two main causes, namely: the general interest in visiting the peripheries of the United Kingdom, and the concern with national identity. Indeed, the increasing interest of British travellers in the Highlands, their landscape and their inhabitants, played a major role in the development of late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Scottish literature. Scotland, and the Highlands in particular, were one of the privileged locations by both Scottish and English travellers; therefore, not only were the writers more acquainted with the Scottish mountains than with the wild forests of the Indies or the vastness of the Americas, but such descriptions also worked as a magnetic attraction for readers. Noteworthy, after the French revolution, France and the Continent lost their pre-eminence as a tourist attraction, due to the increasing dangers represented by war. Many people, therefore, focused their attention to Great Britain, exploring its most peripheral areas and enjoying its landscape.

This shift in role of the Continent from the route of the Grand Tour to a place of danger and war, is mirrored in the plot of many of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus. Characters do not go to France, nor Spain, nor Italy, to admire art or to take a tour of the beauties of the Continent, as it was the habit before the French Revolution; instead, they often leave home for Europe as members of the British Army or as Jacobite exiles. In Mary Johnston’s *The Lairds of Glenfern*, Charles Grant joins the British army as a member of the Highland regiments and fights in Spain and Portugal during the continental war of the 1810s. The same happens to Charlie Clifford, the protagonist of Alexander Sutherland’s
Macrimmon. In Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch*, Hector Munro joins the Highland Watch and is sent to fight in France in the 1746; after the British loss at Fontenoy, he is sent back with his regiment to pacify the Highlands. In other novels, the Continent is the place of exile; characters are compelled to spend several years abroad, due to their involvement in the Jacobite Risings and, therefore, as a consequence of war (for instance, George R. Gleig’s *Allan Breck*).

More distant places, like present and former colonies such as the Indies and the Americas, were not considered as tourist routes. Despite their affected interest in primitivism, tourists would rather visit semi-savage places, such as the Highlands, which had already been domesticated and significantly improved. On the other hand, tourists were not interested in truly savage places, at least in the early-nineteenth-century. The novels here studied are interestingly revealing about the role attached to the Indies and the Americas. In fact, the Indies are considered as a market-place, a source of money-making through international trade. In *The Lairds of Glenfern*, for instance, Helen Grant’s husband, Mr Whitmore, has become rich thanks to trading in the West Indies. In *Discipline*, too, the Indies are the place were Ellen Percy’s father has enriched himself, although his richness is not firm, as his running bankrupt proves. In other novels, the dangers of the Indies are highlighted. In Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde*, in fact, the heroine’s father has died in India, while he was there as a soldier of the British Army, due to malaria.

The Americas are, instead, seen as a place where people can start a new life. In *Clan-Albin*, for instance, the inhabitants of the small village of Glen Albin are compelled to leave their native lands due to the Clearances and move to Northern America, where they settle into a new colony. In *Macrimmon*, Charlie Clifford’s father, Ranald Bane, has left Scotland many years before and has started a new life in Southern America, where he got married with a Spanish Creole, Inez, and has changed his name into Rinaldo Marina. Ranald Bane was compelled to leave Great Britain right after Charlie’s birth; due to their poverty, Ranald moved to the Americas to settle in a colony and to build the house where his lover, Helen Clifford, would have joined him with their child. Things went differently; Rinaldo believed his son was dead and decided to remain in the Americas, where he left his old life completely behind.

The preference for describing Scotland and the Highlands is oftentimes concerned with national identity. In fact, many novelists, above all the writers of national tales, were interested in the delineation of national manners and habits. Therefore, they tended to
describe not only the people of Scotland, but also the land itself, in all its pros and cons. The Highlands, with their picturesque and sublime sceneries, were considered as a symbol of the Scottish character; therefore, they were worthier of attention than other areas. By focusing on their region, national writers attempted to highlight their differences from England, as well as their cultural importance; landscape was simply one of the many ways in which Scotland differed from England and, consequently, was employed as a symbol of independence.

The quantitative analysis of landscape descriptions in the different areas of the world in which the novels here studied are set, thus, reveals a desire to focus on the writers’ native country, turning it into the centre of their own culture. Despite being at the periphery of the United Kingdom, a region in a wider nation, early-nineteenth-century Scottish writers focused on their culture and land, making of them the focus of their descriptions. Other areas, such as England, are described more thoroughly only when a comparison is established between them and Scotland or the Highlands.

Comparison between the different areas of the world as they are described in the Identity and Highlands Corpus, will be one of the major traits I consider in my analysis of the relationship between plot and space provided in the following section. By observing the movements pursued by the main characters of the novels, as well as their travels and experiences in different areas of the world, it is possible to draw some patterns of movement, each characterised by different plot and characterisation features. The aim of this approach is to study the different perspectives on geography and politics provided in the novels here studied, focusing on the role played by the concern with national identity in the shaping of the fictional world in which novels are set.

4. Patterns of Movement and their Meaning

As Westphal has highlighted, geocriticism differs from other literary approaches because it focuses on the areas represented, rather than on the way in which a singular author represents the world. In this section, I apply geocriticism to the Identity and Highlands Corpus in order to prove the importance of the role played by cultural and national identity in the structuring of early-nineteenth-century Scottish novels. My first step is to map the novels and to sort them according to the way in which place and plot are interrelated. More in detail, I provide an analysis not only of the extension of the world represented, but also of the function played by different areas in the development of the plot. Some places represent home, the place where the protagonist feels most at ease and
goes back at the end of the novels, some others are a source of danger, or of love, or of revenge.

The study of the role played by places in the development of the plot is extremely interesting, because it allows the critic to learn about the writer’s perspective on the world in which he/she lives – for instance, it can help to highlight the presence of nationalist or globalising tendencies. Noteworthy, all the novels are set in a world which, more or less precisely, represents the real world. Therefore, the roles attached to each place are easier to be analysed than in, say, a utopian novel.

Each novel is built around a different pattern of relationship between plot and space. By mapping the movements of characters, their travels and experiences, I have found that there are five patterns, each characterised by a different movement in space; I have considered the extension of the world in which characters move as a discriminating feature, I only focus on the direction of the movement and the positive, negative, or neutral function played by places in the advancement of the plot. The main regions among which characters move can be seen as concentric circles, each inscribing a wider portion of the world: the Highlands, Scotland, Great Britain, the British Empire with its colonies and former colonies:

Figure 2. Regions considered as centre and periphery in the Corpus
The movements of the main characters can be mapped, creating some patterns that describe their travels. Among the novels here studied, there are five main patterns of movement:

- No relevant movement is present: the novel opens, develops and ends in the same region (either the Highlands or the Islands);
- Movement is mono-directional (from the periphery to the centre): the protagonist leaves the Highlands to never coming back;
- Movement is mono-directional (from the centre to the periphery): the protagonist comes either from the Lowlands, England or other areas of the world, visits the Highlands and decides to establish there;
- Movement is bi-directional (from the periphery to the centre –or to other peripheries – and back): the protagonist comes from the Highlands, is compelled to go abroad but eventually goes back to his native mountains;
- Movement is bi-directional (from the centre or other peripheries to the periphery): the protagonist comes from outside the Highlands, visits them but decides to go back to his native land.

Noteworthy, each of these patterns is characterised by a series of common plot features that are oftentimes endowed with further cultural meaning. In the next paragraphs, I will deal with each pattern, providing examples from the novels and focusing on the features that are most concerned with identity.

**Figure 3. Main patterns of movements in the novels of the Corpus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pattern I:</th>
<th>Pattern II:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PERIPHERY</strong></td>
<td><strong>PERIPHERY</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CENTRE (death)</td>
<td><strong>CENTRE</strong> (death)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3 novels:</strong></td>
<td><strong>3 novels:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Mrs Rice’s <em>Monteith</em></td>
<td>-Jane Porter’s <em>Scottish Chiefs</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Peter M. Darling’s <em>The Romance of the Highlands</em></td>
<td>-E.H.H.’s <em>The Highlander</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-<em>Reft Rob</em></td>
<td>-R.G. Gleig’s <em>Allan Breck</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gothic novels</td>
<td>Historical novels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pattern III:

CENTRE

PERIPHERY

(identity, inheritance, marriage)

6 novels:
- Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay*
- Mary Brunton’s *Discipline*
- Conirdan
- David Carey’s *A Legend of Argyle*
- Alexander Sutherland’s *Macrimmon*
- Alexander Balfour’s *Highland Mary*

National tales and historical novels

Pattern IV

PERIPHERY

CENTRE

(fight)

PERIPHERY

(identity, inheritance, marriage)

10 novels:
- *Glencore Tower*
- *The Towers of Lothian*
- C.I. Johnstone’s *Clan-Albin*
- Mary Johnston’s *The Lairds of Glenfern*
- David Carey’s *Lochiel*
- *Bannockburn*
- Martha Blackford’s *The Scottish Orphans*
- Martha Blackford’s *Arthur Monteith*
- Rosalia St. Clair’s *The Doomed One*
- Andrew Picken’s *The Black Watch*

Gothic tales, national tales and historical novels

Pattern V

CENTRE

PERIPHERY

(adventure, danger, dirtiness)

3 novels:
- Elizabeth Hamilton’s *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*
- Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde*
- Thomas D. Lauder’s *Lochandhu*

National tales and historical novels
**Pattern I: no relevant movement**

In three out of the twenty six novels studied in this dissertation, the plot starts, develops and ends in the same region: Mrs Rice’s *Monteith*, Peter Middleton Darling’s *The Romance of the Highlands* and the anonymous novel *Reft Rob; or, The Witch of Scot-Muir*. These novels belong to the Gothic genre; they revolve around a specific place, where most of the heroes’ and heroine’s adventures occur. *Monteith*, the first nineteenth-century novel concerned with history written in Scotland, is set on an island in the extreme north of Scotland; no specific information about the island is given, so that we suppose it to be a fictive place. Noteworthy, this novel is an early blend of the Gothic plot and Scottish history; therefore, it is not as structured as later novels.

The island is a peculiarly sublime place, with craggy rocks, stormy ocean waves and a stereotypical Gothic castle, placed almost on the top of a mountain and featuring a web of secret passages leading to the coast. All action occurs on the island, which is the focus of narration and description; there is no comparison among different regions, while both positive and negative events (treason, murder, falling in love, etc.) occur in the same place. In this novel, the first example of Gothic/historical novel, space is not employed as a means of dealing with identity; only such historical facts as the religious wars occurred during Mary Queen of Scots’ life are culturally relevant.

In *The Romance of the Highlands*, action occurs on the Highlands. More in detail, the novel is set on the Grampian mountains, beyond the Highland line. Some hints are made to the Allan Water, which may be the River Allan that flows in the neighbourhoods of Stirling. The characters move around a well structured world that can be mapped quite comfortably. In fact, there are three main poles around which the plot develops, namely: a) Campbell’s cottage, were the hero was raised as the son of a cottager; it is the place of honesty, kindness, pride in poverty and generosity; b) the Castle of Dunbarny, dominated by the Viscount Alexander of Dunbarny, a usurper, murderer and would-be seducer; it is the place of vice, anger, revenge and villainy; c) the Castle of Strathallan, where the hero meets with a friend, the young Earl of Strathallan, and falls in love with Lady Elizabeth: it is the place of friendship and love, but also of aristocratic pride.

Each of these poles plays a specific function in the advancement of the plot; moreover, the areas surrounding the castles and the cottage are important too, because it is there that supernatural entities appear, affecting the development of the events. In the woods between the Castle of Dunbarny and the Castle of Strathallan, not only does the Late
Viscount of Dunbarny and the Earl of Strathallan’s ghosts appear, but Kenneth beholds the most Gothic and sublime scene of the Witches.

The historical and cultural clash with England is present in the tales of the Earl of Glendwan’s partaking in the Anglo-Scottish wars, but it is in characterisation that identity emerges as a most relevant issue. Indeed, it is in the clash between Kenneth, the hero of the novel, and the Viscount of Dunbarny, that Peter Middleton Darling attempts at creating a sort of portrait of the virtues of the perfect Scotsman who, like Kenneth, should be proud of his humble origins, generous, virtuous and brave in battle. Although, like in Monteith, no comparisons among different regions are present, identity structures space in the opposition among the main poles of development of the novel.

In Reft Rob, instead, no hints at real places are present, making it impossible to know where the novel is exactly set. We only know that action takes place on the mountains, probably the Highlands. Here, too, the plot develops not only in castles (the M’Mac Castle, of Flatburn East and the Castle of M’Spaul), but also in the space in-between them. Rather interestingly, it is the in-between space that plays a major role in the development of the novel. The novel opens on the road from the castle of M’Mac and that of Flatburn East; the heroine is going to her brother’s castle to warn him about a prophecy delivered to her by the Witch of Scots-muir. The path, 5.5 miles long, is fatiguing and immersed in wilderness; it is here that the Witch of Scots-muir appear to the reader for the first time.

The space in-between the castles is the place where the victims of injustice take shelter; in fact, both Reft Rob and his mother, the Witch, live in the woods around the castles. They have been deprived of their rightful possessions (the castle of M’Mac), and live hidden in the wood and caves. At the end of the novel, they are restored to their estate. In this novel identity is a minor issue; nevertheless, the use of space in the development of the plot is rather interesting. The accent is, indeed, laid on the in-between space; the hero giving the title to the novel, Reft Rob, is an in-betweener, a man deprived of his rightful possessions and compelled to live in the wilds like an outlaw. The connection with identity lays in the fact that this in-between condition is typical of those who, like Reft Rob, have been deprived of their identity, their inheritance and their rights (like Scotland when it lost its independence and the Highlanders during improvement, according to the Highland myth and the Jacobite ideology). This novel, indeed, is a proof of the role played by identity issues
even in novels that are scarcely concerned with Scottish history, exemplifying the general interest in identity as a crucial cultural concept.

**Pattern II: moving away from the Highlands**

Three novels have in common this movement pattern, according to which the protagonist leaves the Highlands and dies abroad, unable to go back to his native land. The novels are: Jane Porter’s *The Scottish Chiefs*, E.H.H.’s *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady*, and George Robert Gleig’s *Allan Breck*. The three protagonists of the novels, William Wallace, Johnnie Baillie and Allan Breck, share in the same destiny: they die away from their homes, sentenced to death by the law system of a foreign country (or region).

In Fig. 2, I provide a scheme of the movement of the protagonists, showing how, in each of them, movement in mono-directional. In *The Highlander*, Johnnie Baillie remains inside the borders of Scotland; he is sentenced to death by the law system of his own country, but not of his region, the Highlands. In this novel, in fact, the stress is laid on internal division, showing how different the ideas of justice and law were, according to the anonymous novelist, in the two areas in the early eighteenth century.

![Figure 4. Movement from the periphery to the centre](image)

In *The Highlander*, Edinburgh represents the place where the law is applied; Johnnie is seized by the British Army and led to the Scottish capital, where he is imprisoned, tried and executed. Johnnie is charged with murder, because considered as an accomplice in the

---

11 *The Highlander* is included in this category because I consider Johnnie Baillie as a Highlander. Although his identity as a mountaineer is declared in the title of the novel, Johnnie may not be a Highlander. No clear hints to his Highland origins are made; instead, the narrator writes that the Baillies live in the lands of the Baron of Owenclew, and that their ways of life are different from those of the M’Leods, which are proper Highlanders and live on the mountains surrounding the valley of Owenclew. The likeliest hypothesis is that Johnnie comes from a bordering area, placed on the Highland line. Nevertheless, he is considered as a Highlander in the novel because he embraces Highland culture, religion, manners and habits. He leaves his cottage to go and live in Kenneth’s Fern, the mountains where the M’Leod outlaws dwell; he converts to Catholicism and swears loyalty to the clan.
killing of the Baron of Owenclew. Lowland law, therefore, is similar to English law; the culprit is tried and executed. On the Highlands, instead, law is represented as an act of revenge. The clan M’Leod, out of their sorrow for the loss of their chieftain, decide to punish the Baron of Owenclew, that is to say, the man who reported the chieftain to the English army at the end of the 1745 Jacobite Rebellion, causing his death. The Baron is portrayed as a good man, but his behaviour is not defended by the novelist; indeed, the chief M’Leod was a honest man and had never damaged him or his properties. Therefore, the M’Leods’ revenge is not unjustified, because the Baron is guilty of moral treason to their clan; nevertheless, the novelist draws attention to the horror of their methods, to the ruthless way in which they apply justice, by hanging the man without a trial.

In this novel, there is a contrast between the Highlands and Edinburgh, that is to say, between the periphery and the centre of Scotland. Apparently, the periphery is portrayed as a barbarous place, where justice coincides with revenge and punishment; on the other hand, the centre is more civil, because the prisoner has the right to be tried before being sentenced to death. Nevertheless, the results are the same; both the Baron and Johnnie are hanged for their mistakes; both people are not murderers, but have partaken in a system that caused the death of a man. The author’s perspective seems to be a balanced one, in which both the Highlands and the Lowlands are places of injustice and death.

The author’s outlook on early-eighteenth-century Scotland seems to be one aimed at criticising civil war, internal differences and antagonisms, highlighting the barbarism of both the parts involved in the conflict. Therefore, the novel appears as an invitation to peace, union and the acceptance of the predicament in which Scotland was in the early nineteenth century, when things had considerably improved from the times of the Jacobite risings.

A sharp contrast between the periphery (the Highlands) and the centre (London) is also present in The Scottish Chiefs, but the meanings attached to this opposition are strikingly different. Jane Porter identifies the Highlands and Scotland with the figure of William Wallace, one of Scotland’s greatest heroes. He partook in the defence of his country from the English invaders and was sentenced to death by an English court in London. The hanging of Wallace for high treason is an act of injustice that, though being carried out following the rules of English law, infringes the laws of justice and honesty. Due to his being a Scotsman, Wallace cannot be tried for treason, because he has not betrayed his country – instead, he defended his own nation, Scotland.
This act of injustice acquires further meaning, if read in a nationalist context. Indeed, Wallace represents the best of the Scottish character – he is generous, honest, humble, brave and virtuous. His killing, consequently, can be read as a symbol not only of the English hegemony on Scotland, but also of the Scottish loss of independence. Wallace represents Scottish manners and virtues, his death represents the suppression of Scottish culture.

In Allan Breck, the hero of the novel is eventually compelled to leave Scotland and takes shelter in France. Allan becomes an exile after the end of the 1745 Jacobite Rebellion, when he is charged with having murdered a factor of King George, Mac Alpine of Duart. Allan denies his partaking in the murder, but is compelled to go abroad. Despite his possible innocence in the killing of Mac Alpine, Allan is guilty of other crimes, such as the murder of Hatfield. Nevertheless, his eventual death on the scaffold is unrelated to his crimes – Allan is sentenced to death by a revolutionary court during the French revolution, due to his being a soldier in the King’s army.

Despite the presence of major historical events, which concur in the development of Allan’s life, this novel is not focused on the definition of national identity; instead, it is completely focused on the shaping of Allan’s character and manners. Nevertheless, since Allan represents all the vices that a good Scotsman should avoid, the fact that he is compelled to end his life away from Scotland can be read as a symptom of that general desire to identify Scotland, and the Highlands, with virtue and honour. Allan is unworthy of being a Scotsman and is, therefore, compelled to become an exile.

**Pattern III: foreigners settling in the Highlands**

This pattern is more common than the first two; it describes the protagonist’s travels in six novels: Honoria Scott’s Strathmay; or, Scenes in the North, in Mary Brunton’s Discipline, in the anonymous novel Conirdan; or, The St-Kildians, in David Carey’s A Legend of Argyle, in Alexander Sutherland’s Macrimmon. A Highland Tale, and in Alexander Balfour’s Highland Mary. All these novels, but one, open with a hero or heroine who, coming from either Scotland, or England, or the Continent, travels to the Highlands, and eventually settles there.

---

12 My interpretation rests on the fact that The Scottish Chiefs is generally considered as a national tale and, therefore, as a novel concerned with the definition of Scottish manners and identity in relationship with historical events.
The novel which does not conform to this pattern is Alexander Sutherland’s *Highland Mary*, which I nevertheless included in this category, due to the main movement of the novel, which is from the centre to the periphery. Indeed, Mary Macdonald leaves London to move to Burnfoot manse, in northern Scotland. Mary is of Highland origins, but grew up in Edinburgh and London with her tutors; therefore, she never went on the Highlands. Northern Scotland is undoubtedly a peripheral area, if compared to Edinburgh and London; nevertheless, we cannot know whether the manse on the Highlands or not, because the name of the parish – Aberbroomly – is a fictive one. However, the only difference between this novel and the others in this group is that periphery is here represented by northern Scotland, and not by the Highlands.

Noteworthy, almost all the heroes and heroines in these novels have Highland origins, although they become aware of it only at the end of the novels. The only exception is the protagonist of Mary Brunton’s *Discipline*, Ellen Percy, who was born in London. While Ellen Percy is a real foreigner in the Highlands, the other heroes and heroines of these novels are not completely strangers; indeed, Highland blood flows in their veins, although they were reared and educated abroad.

In *Conirdan*, for instance, the hero was deposited on the island of St. Kilda when just a baby, because his parents had died in the massacre of Glencoe. The islanders rear him as one of them, teaching him their manners and virtues. The isle of St. Kilda is portrayed as an idyllic place, a real utopia, everybody agrees with other people and love dominates over self-interest; where everyone is happy with what he/she has and lives in peace. Despite the general idyllic atmosphere, Conirdan is unhappy on the island. His love is unrequited, and his unselfish decision to make his beloved Edith marry the man she really loves, does not make Conirdan happy. Therefore, Conirdan decides to leave the island and to start his quest for happiness in Scotland, but he finds only sorrow. It is in the Highlands, however, that he finds true love and his identity, discovering his parents’ identity.

From a cultural viewpoint, this novel is extremely interesting. Despite education, Conirdan is not a St. Kildian, in his veins flows the blood of an unhappy race, the Highlanders of Glencoe, the victims of a terrible massacre. This novel shows how nothing, not even a life spent in a completely different environment, can erase the sorrows of history from the soul of a Highlander. In the Highlands the same innocent, uncorrupted happiness experienced by the St. Kildians cannot be found; history (and the English) has brought in violence and woes, depriving the inhabitants of Glencoe of their happiness. The brunt of the massacre is
attached to King William of Orange in the novel, so that the relationship between centre (England) and periphery (Glencoe) is assimilated to a colonialist approach, in which the invader uses violence to secure the peacefulness of the conquered.

In most novels the protagonist decides to settle in the Highlands when he/she discovers his/her Highland origins and inherits the family estate. This happens, for instance, in *A Legend of Argyle*. General Gordon, the protagonist of the novel, has only a vague idea of his Scottish origins—alluded to in his name, Gordon—but knows nothing about his birth and origins. It is only towards the end of the novel that he discovers his true origins: he is the son of a protestant, open-minded Highland chief, the Lord of Haddo. Gordon inherits the Haddo estate, where he settles with his beloved Euphemia Hamilton. In this novel, the dominant contrast is not between centre and periphery, but between Jacobitism and the British establishment. The Highlands are described as the place of barbarism, but not out of their manners and habits; instead, it is the feudal lifestyle of the Jacobites that is reported as out-of-date, barbarous and uncivilised. Therefore, while the Earl of Ronay and his minions are the most villainous and savage among the characters involved in the plot, people remember the Lord of Haddo as a civil, kind and tolerant man.

In *Strathmay, or Scenes in the North*, the contrast between feudalism and modern manners is highlighted in the juxtaposition of Strathmay castle and Edinburgh. Edinburgh represents the civilised centre, where the protagonist partakes in the pastimes and amusements of the high classes and falls in love with the beautiful Lillian Bruce. The castle of Strathmay, instead, is portrayed as the core of an old-style feudal estate, a disquieting, sublime castle inhabited by a tyrannical lord and his miserable daughter.

The lord of Strathmay, Donald Macleod is portrayed as a weird man, worn out by torments and anguish; as the novel develops, some detail about his youth reveal his true identity as a Gothic villain, would-be murderer and seducer. His daughter, Morna, falls in love with the hero of the novel, Alfred Douglas, but her affection is unrequited. Before Alfred’s arrival at Strathmay, Morna lived a quite happy life; despite her seclusion in the castle, she enjoyed passing her time with her father and studying. After knowing Alfred, Morna conveys all her feelings and energies in her love for him; the natural aftermath of her shattered hopes of love, united with her father’s death and the discovery of her birth circumstances, cast her in a state of deep depression that eventually leads her to death. The sound of Morna’s name significantly recalls the verb “mourning” but it appears in *Fingal* as a Celtic name meaning “a woman loved by all”; quite paradoxically, Morna dies in Roslin
alone, almost forgotten by the ones she loves; she is found dead on the grave of her mother, caught, indeed, in the act of mourning over the tomb of a woman whom she had never met. As the daughter of a villain and a seduced and ruined woman, Morna is doomed to be a miserable creature until the end of her days. Her sad story stands as a symbol of the evil done by people like Donald Macleod, who embody all the worst features of feudalism and tyranny.

Strathmay, therefore, is not just a picturesque castle in a northern region of Scotland, Caithness, but the place of injustice, barbarism and abuse. Like the Earl of Ronay in A Legend of Argyle, Donald Macleod is not merely a Gothic villain, but the embodiment of the abuses of power typical of feudalism. The periphery is here identified with sublimity, feudalism and barbarism, standing as opposed to the centre (Edinburgh), which instead represents the good society, with balls and enjoyment for Alfred Douglas but, at the same time, the place of Morna’s death.

In Strathmay, Alfred eventually discovers that he is the son of Donald Macleod’s sister, Isabel. At the death of Donald and Morna, he inherits the castle of Strathmay and settles there with his wife. In Macrimmon, the plot develops in a similar way: Charly Clifford learns about his Highland origins and his role of rightful heir to the Dun Rimmon castle and estate, gets married with a Highland woman, and settles in the family castle.

In this novel, Scotland – and the Highlands in particular – are portrayed as a picturesque place, inhabited by kind people as well as villains. During his travels around the Highlands, Charly discovers that he is the son of a member of the Macrimmon family, who live in Glen Rimmon. Although most of the places mentioned in the novel are real ones, Glen Rimmon, the Castle of Dun Rimmon and Castle Ullin are fictive; nevertheless, the paths and routes followed by Charly suggest that they are in the area between Inverness and Fort George.

The contrast between England (the centre) and Scotland (the periphery), is evident from the very start of the novel, as the comments of Charly’s uncle, John Clifford, about the surname of Charly’s father suggest: “you can add Mac-Mac-confound the barbarous sound of it! It has entirely escaped my memory! Yet, on the whole, you will suffer little loss; though you never know it; and trust me, the less you boast of your Scottish blood the

---

better!” 14 John Clifford is an Englishman; his bias against the Scots, although justified by the disappearance of Charly’s father, is a clear example of the hostility between the two as it was featured in many novels of the period.

Northern Scotland represents the periphery in another novel: Highland Mary. Although the novel develops in a fictive area of Scotland (the parish of Abercromly), the Highlands and the valley of Glencoe play a major role. Mary Macdonald is a native Highlander; she was born in Glencoe but, due to her father’s exile after the end of the Forty-Five, she was raised in Edinburgh and London. Until her sixth year of age she lived with Captain Bruce, a friend of her father’s, but then she moved to London, where she dwelled with the Wilmots, a rich, dishonest family belonging to the middle classes. Mary is a native of the periphery but she grew up in the centre; instead of adopting the lifestyle of the centre, as it is portrayed in the novel, she represents the spirit of her native land. In fact, while the Wilmots, who represent the vices of the centre, are devoted to money-making, debauchery and greediness, Mary is pure and virtuous. Indeed, she embodies the Highland myth, but in a feminine version – she is not a brave warrior, but a pure woman, who does her best to defend her virginity and to always behave according to the rules of virtue.

In Highland Mary, centre and periphery are juxtaposed through characters and their role. The Wilmots represent the centre, Mary the periphery. The narrator is clearly in favour of Mary, condemning the habits of George Wilmot, his father, mother and sisters. The opposition between London and the Highlands is strong and relies very much upon the Highland myth. This pattern is featured in another novel – Mary Brunton’s Discipline. In this work too, in fact, the polarity between centre and periphery develops around the two centres of London and the Highlands.

The novel opens in London, where Ellen Percy, the daughter of a rich tradesman, grows up and lives in close contact with the aristocracy. Ellen is a coquette; she is not able to love and entertains only shallow relationships with her friends. After a series of misfortunes, begun with her father’s suicide due to his going bankrupt, Ellen remains alone and penniless. She eventually decides to go to Edinburgh, in the hope to find a job as a governess. Instead, she faces new difficulties that lead her to accept her Scottish friend’s invitation to visit her castle in the Highlands. Ellen’s friend, Charlotte Graham, is the daughter of a Highland laird, master of Castle Eredine.

The travel from Edinburgh to Glen Eredine is of crucial importance in the development of the plot, because it is in the Highlands that Ellen’s inner growth occurs. The movement of the heroine from the south to the north is, indeed, not only geographical, but also moral. Unlike in Waverley, where geographical travelling from the centre to the periphery coincides with a journey from the present to the past, in Discipline, the journey gains moral meaning. Noteworthy, Ellen’s journey seems to be morally layered – the more she travels north, the more she meets with honest people and becomes virtuous. The novel opens in London, the place of vice, shallow amusements, danger and superficial relationships; Edinburgh, still a central area, is almost as dangerous as London, but relationships here are less superficial. In Edinburgh, Ellen makes friends with Charlotte Graham, a virtuous and worthy Highland young woman. Nevertheless, it is only once trespassed the Highland line that Ellen meets with true friends. In Glen Eredine, Ellen learns to be a virtuous woman, gives up her coquetry and hardheartedness, falling in love with Henry Graham. The end of Ellen’s journey is represented not only by the Highlands and the periphery, but also by virtue, as the closing lines of the novel suggest:

Having in my early days seized the enjoyments which selfish pleasure can bestow, I might now compare them with those of enlarged affection, of useful employment, of relaxations truly social, of lofty contemplation, of devout thankfulness, of glorious hope. I might compare them! - but the Lowland tongue wants energy for the contrast.15

Unlike the novels grouped under the second pattern, in which the hero is forbidden to come back to his native Highlands by external causes, the heroes and heroines of these novels willingly choose to settle in the periphery. The novelist’s decision to end their plots in this way can be considered as a symptom of a nationalist approach, privileging the periphery over the centre. One of the possible features in favour of this hypothesis is that all the heroes and heroines (apart from Ellen Percy in Discipline), settle in the periphery after discovering their true identity of native Highlanders. All the novels begin when protagonists that have grown up in the centre, and who move to the periphery, unaware of their family origins. There, they learn about their family history and become heirs to the family estate and castle. In A Legend of Argyle, Macrimmon and Strathmay, the hero inherits his father’s estate and lands; in Conirdan and Highland Mary, the protagonist inherits the possessions of a friend’s or relative of their father’s.

In these novels, the knowledge of one’s identity is connected with inheritance and entails a significant improvement in the protagonist’s social condition. All the characters inherit money, estates and, sometimes, even aristocratic titles. In Discipline, where identity is connected with love, the rise in social condition takes place also thanks to Ellen’s getting married with Henry Graham, the heir to the Eredine estate and castle.

To conclude, this pattern highlights the importance of the periphery as the end of the journey, the place where the characters eventually find their home and true identity. From a cultural viewpoint, this pattern of movement is characterised by an emphasis on the periphery (in particular northern Scotland and the Highlands) as a source of identity, represented by the characters’ family roots. The protagonists’ decisions to settle in the periphery, moreover, seem to atone for some of the faults attached to peripheral areas, such as Jacobitism and feudalism, emerging in such novels as A Legend of Argyle and Strathmay. In other novels, such as Discipline and Highland Mary, the employment of the Highland myth in the characterisation of the Highlanders adds emphasis to the contrast between the centre and the periphery.

**Pattern IV: Highlanders going abroad and coming back**

The novels belonging to this group are, under many aspects, similar to the ones discussed in the previous group (foreigners settling in the Highlands); the heroines and heroines are natives of the Highlands, they spend some time abroad, go back to their native lands and settle there. Nevertheless, there are some important differences; the most eye-catching one is that these novels open when the protagonist is still on the Highlands; therefore, the plot features not only the hero/heroine’s return to the periphery, but also their leaving it. Moreover, unlike in the novels following pattern III, the protagonists of these works are aware of their Highland origins; most of them spent their childhood in the Highlands and were educated there, although they do not know their family roots and origins. Identity issues play a major role, and the eventual settling in the family estate is a common ending.

Noteworthy, this pattern is the most exploited; in fact, it describes the travels and journeys of the protagonists of ten novels: the anonymous Glencore Tower, The Towers of Lothian and Bannockburn; Christian Isobel Johnstone’s Clan-Albin; Mary Johnston’s The Lairds of Glenfern; Martha Blackford’s The Scottish Orphans and Arthur Monteith; David Carey’s Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden; Rosalia St. Clair’s The Doomed One and Andrew Picken’s The Black Watch.
Martha Blackford’s two novels are here studied as a single work, because *Arthur Monteith* is the sequel to *The Scottish Orphans* and continues the story begun in it. The novels tell the story of Arthur Monteith from his childhood to his eventual growth and settling in the family estate. Noteworthy, these two novels differ significantly from the others gathered in this group; although they follow the same pattern of movement (from the periphery to the centre and backwards), there is no defined opposition between centre and periphery.

Both novels are moral tales; therefore, they are focused more on Arthur’s moral growth, than on geo-political issues. Nevertheless, the concern with identity is a prominent one. Indeed, Arthur Monteith was born in the Monteith estate, about seven miles northwards of Stirling, on the Highland Line. At the age of five, Arthur lost his father, who was sentenced to death for having partaken in the 1745 Jacobite Rising. Due to his mother’s incapacity to provide for her children, Arthur and his siblings were given to a family of cottagers, the Mathiesons, who raised them in a cottage on the Pentland Hills. Arthur retains some memories of his family, while his sister and brother were too young to remember anything.

Arthur is a curious boy, willing to learn Latin and other languages. The moralistic tone of the novel focuses on his disobedience to his father and on his restlessness; noteworthy, both are rooted in his unsteady identity. Arthur knows he is not a Mathieson, but does not know anything about his real parents. At the end of the novel he discovers his true identity and goes back to the Monteith estate, where he is welcomed as the new laird of the castle. Noteworthy, Arthur’s moral growth occurs only when he learns about his family roots. This narrative feature, present in so many among the novels studied in this dissertation, is symptomatic of the author’s concern with identity and her belief in the connection between knowing oneself and growing up. By learning about his father’s unfortunate destiny - he was deceived into partaking in the Jacobite Rising by his uncle, who wanted to take possession of the Monteith estate – Arthur also learns the importance of honesty, humbleness, and goodness, becoming a man. Moreover, he learns about his family history, becoming a worthy member of the Monteith family.

The other novels grouped under Pattern IV are characterised by the presence of a contrast between centre and periphery. In *The Towers of Lothian*, for instance, the opposition is between the Lowlands (centre) and the Highlands (periphery). The opposition is inner to Scotland and is stressed in the full title of the novel: *The Towers of Lothian; or, The
Banks of Carron. The banks of the Carron are the place where the story begins – there, a cottager finds two people, a dead man and a shocked woman.\textsuperscript{16} The woman is Lady Ellen Moray and the man is her lover, the Earl of Nightsdale; they were flying from Lady Ellen’s father, who wanted her to marry another man, the Barnard the Earl of Lothian. Despite the cottager’s help, Ellen is apprehended by her father’s minions and pushed into marrying Barnard. They move to the Lowlands, in the castle of Lothian.

The opposition between Highlands and Lowlands takes shape when Lady Ellen moves to the castle of Lothian. While on the banks of the Carron, she lived moments of blessed joyfulness with the Earl of Nightsdale, here she is secluded in her apartments by Barnard, who mistreats and threatens her. Moreover, as long as the plot develops, Barnard’s true identity of Gothic villain emerges: he is not just a seducer or a tyrant, but a ruthless murderer. In the Lowlands there is also the core of the Scottish kingdom, the very centre of the nation; indeed, the novelist sets some chapters in Dunfermline, the royal capital of Scotland until 1603.

Other works set in the remote past are centred on the opposition between centre and periphery, but while in The Towers of Lothian the contrast is between Highlands and Lowlands, in Bannockburn and Glencore Tower the opposition is between Scotland and England. The anonymous writer of Bannockburn called his/her novel after the name of the field of Bannockburn, near Stirling, where a glorious battle was won by the Scots over the English army in 1314; the battle is described in Glencore Tower too, but the historical plot plays a minor role than in Bannockburn. In both novels the English nation is portrayed as a military invader, a villainous country violating the borders of Scotland and threatening its rightful independence. King Robert de Bruce and his Scots, instead, are depicted as great heroes, and their exploits extolled.

Noteworthy, in both novels England is not the centre, at least from a Scottish viewpoint. In fact, Scotland and England are two separate nations, each with its centre and periphery. Nevertheless, the English attempts to invade Scotland and to conquer it are symptomatic of the English desire to turn Scotland into an annexed region and, in other words, a peripheral area. Therefore, in these novels attention is drawn not on a plain

\textsuperscript{16} There are three rivers in Scotland called “Carron”, one is in the Lowlands, near Falkirk; the second is in Western Ross and the third in Sutherland. The one chosen by the author of this novel must be the third one, because it is the only one near Caithness, where the cottager is going at the beginning of the novel. There are some historical inaccuracies in the geographical and historical setting of the novel; indeed, the region of Caithness was not a part of Scotland, but remained under Norse domain until 1266. Moreover, despite being an ancient family, the Morays were not set in that area of Scotland.
opposition between centre and periphery, but on a process aimed at turning Scotland from an independent nation into one of the peripheral areas of the United Kingdom.

Most of the novels following pattern IV feature a contrast between the Highlands and England; this opposition, although not endowed with the same importance in each work, is easily detectable. In Felix M’Donough’s *The Highlanders* this opposition is emphasised by the plot and by the characterisation of places and people– the novel opens in the Highlands, at Castle Glenmore, in Inverness-shire. Here, Lord Gerald de Brook (an English tourist visiting the Highlands) asks shelter during a storm and spends some days with the Glenmore family. Despite his feigned virtues and kindness, the man attempts to seduce the heroine of the novel, Flora Glenmore. Flora, the emblem of Highland virtue, cleverly understands his game and rejects his courtship. From the very start of the novel, the Highlanders are portrayed as hospitable, naïve, poor, humble and virtuous, while De Brook’s manners and character become a symbol of the place he comes from: London. De Brook is an aristocrat; he comes from the centre and his lifestyle is that of a debauched, ruthless seducer. He seduces Flora’s cousin, kidnaps her and leads her to London, where turns her into a prostitute. London is clearly portrayed as a dangerous place, as well as the centre of the empire and the site of aristocracy and richness.

In this novel, as well as in *Discipline*, there is a clear contrast between the vices of the centre and the virtues of the periphery. The Highland myth is embodied in Flora Glenmore and serves as a further means of contrast between Highlanders and Londoners. In *The Highlanders*, some hints are made to the clearances and to Highlanders being compelled to leave their native country, in order to look for employment or to start a new life. Flora herself, after her father’s ruin, goes to London to look for employment as a governess. Other novels feature hints to the Clearances; the one most clearly concerned with this phenomenon is Christian Isabel Johnstone’s *Clan-Albin*, where the inhabitants of the village of Glen Albin, on the expiring of their lease in the glen, decide to leave Scotland and emigrate to Northern America, where they expect to start their new life.

In *Clan-Albin*, the relationship between centre and periphery is more complicated. Indeed, England represents the centre of the empire and it stands as opposed to the Highlands, because the effects of its policy of improvement are portrayed as extremely negative. Nevertheless, the Highlands are not the periphery; instead, they are just one
among the many peripheral regions of the British Empire. In this novel, the world in which the plot develops is one of the most extended ones and reaches as far as Northern America. The extension of the plot to over-sea territories and settlements entails the reformulation of the relationship between centre and periphery. This process results in a relativisation of the idea of periphery – there is no longer a simple polarity between two British regions, but a complex net of relationships in which the periphery becomes stratified into layers. In this system, the Highlands are only a relative periphery, because more peripheral areas, such as Northern America, are present.

In Clan-Albin, the world is portrayed as a modern system, characterised by complex political dynamics. The same relativism about the idea of periphery can be detected in other national tale, written only one year after Clan-Albin: The Lairds of Glenfern. In this novel too, the Highlands are a relative periphery, especially when compared to the West Indies, where Helen Grant moves with her husband, Mr Whitmore. In the Indies, Helen feels ill at ease; what worries her most are the manners of the Indians, which she considers as barbarous and savage.

Noteworthy, in this novel the idea of savagery is no longer attached to the Highlands, but to the Indians. Mary Johnston is aware of a crucial shift, typical of the nineteenth century, from a smaller to a larger scale. While, during the eighteenth century the savage was looked for at home, in the nineteenth century the savages were found in distant territories, such as the Indies. The approach held by the centre, which is, in both periods, England, remains the same – the centre is civilisation, the periphery barbarism. The major difference is that the border between centre and periphery has been moved from inside the British Isles to outside of them. Moreover, unlike other national tales, The Lairds of Glenfern extols the importance to preserve Highland manners and culture not as a means to contrast the centre (as it happens, for instance, in Clan-Albin), but as a defence against the barbarous and primitive manners of more peripheral areas.

**Pattern V: Foreigners visiting the Highlands and leaving them**

This pattern of movement, like the previous one, is bi-directional, because the protagonists of the novels go back to their native land after having visited a foreign place;

---

17 In her second National tale, *Elizabeth de Bruce*, published in 1827, Christian Isobel Johnstone focuses on Irish history and establishes a comparison between the way in which the English government dealt with Ireland and the Highlands. She also highlights how both nations attempted to resist to the English through rebellions that were choked in blood.
nevertheless, the perspective is turned upside-down – while in pattern IV the people coming from the periphery and visiting the centre decided to go back to the periphery, in this pattern the heroes and heroines coming from the centre decide to leave it, after having visited the periphery. The novels built around this pattern are only three: Elizabeth Hamilton’s *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, Honoria Scott’s *Vale of the Clyde* and Sir Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*.

In these novels, the protagonist visits the Highlands but eventually decides to leave them. In *Vale of the Clyde*, the heroine of the novel (Flora), is the daughter of a Highlander and a Lowlander. The families of her parents were enemies, due to their different political faiths – the Highland family of Flora’s mother were Jacobites and aristocrats, while the Lowland family of her father supported King George and belonged to the middle classes. In the past, that is to say, at the times when Flora’s parents were young, the opposition between Highlands and Lowlands was strong; the Highlands were still considered as the periphery, while the Lowlands (and in particular the area around Glasgow), became more and more central, due to their trading and industrial role.

In the novel, Flora has a double identity; the novel opens on her undefined condition and her in-between state, with both the families rejecting her as the outcome of a union they deeply disliked. As long as the plot develops, Flora’s virtuous behaviour, her good nature, manners and qualities win her the sympathies of both the families, reconciling years of political enmity in her own person. She represents the merging of both the Lowlands and the Highlands. Nevertheless, the plot privileges the Lowlands to the Highlands; while the mountains are only a place for pleasant excursions and the meeting with Flora’s old aunt, the Lady of Loch Awe, it is in the Lowlands that Flora eventually settles. She inherits the possessions of her father’s family and gets married with a Lowlander.

In *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*, Mrs Mason leaves the village of Glenburnie – supposedly on the Highlands but explicitly in the periphery – because she has accomplished her mission to improve the village, changing the inhabitants’ habits and manners. Mrs Mason represents the work of the English and Lowland improvers on the Highlands; therefore, she is the embodiment of the attempt of the centre to exert its influence on the periphery. In this novel, the source of identity is not represented by the periphery; instead, it is the identity of the centre that is spread to the periphery. The manners of the inhabitants of Glenburnie are not extolled as a model for modern Scots; instead, it is their effacement that is at the core of the novel.
Hamilton, we may conclude, held an anti-periphery approach. A similar tendency emerges in Thomas Dick Lauder’s *Lochandhu*. The protagonist of Lauder’s novel is Amherst Oakenwold, an Englishman visiting Northern Scotland in the attempt to escape from a dislikeable match with Miss Delassaux, a pitiless and insensitive girl. In the periphery of Scotland, Amherst meets with friends and love (Eliza Malcom), but also with danger and peril. Besides their picturesqueness and sublimity, the Highlands are portrayed as a dangerous place, inhabited by bandits and cattlelifters. The periphery is portrayed as an outlandish place; it is the backdrop for a great part of the plot, but it is neither a source of identity nor a home for the protagonist. Indeed, once saved his beloved Eliza from the plans woven by Lady Delassaux to get rid of her, Amherst goes back to his paternal home in Kent, where he settles with Eliza. The ending of the plot tends to privilege the centre over the periphery, because it is here that the hero defines his identity and settles in life as a man.

5. Nationalist Perspectives and Commonplaces

The five patterns of movement discussed in this chapter undoubtedly help us to study the different perspectives held by early-nineteenth-century Scottish novelists on the geographical and political role of the Highlands. The Scottish mountains are considered as the periphery in most novels, apart from those in which more peripheral areas are featured, such as the Indies in *The Lairds of Glenfern* and Northern America in *Clan-Albin*. In these two novels, as already seen, the Highlands are dealt with as a relative periphery, not as an absolute one, as it happens, for instance, in *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*.

By being generally considered as the periphery, the literary representations of the Highlands can be deemed as a touchstone in the study of early-nineteenth-century Scottish ideas about contemporary geography, history and culture. The way in which the Scottish periphery is portrayed and the function it plays in the development of the plot can reveal important information about the novelists’ ideas on culture and geography.

Nationalist writers tend to emphasise the importance of the periphery as a source of identity. This tendency is mostly spread in the novels following the third and fourth patterns, where the protagonist settles in the periphery - after having discovered that his/her family roots lay there – despite the years spent in the centre. The conviction that the culture and manners of the periphery – in particular of the Highlands – must be preserved and turned into a source of identity for the whole nation is conveyed not only in some national tales, such as *Clan-Albin*, but in all the novels that feature the Highland myth as a means of characterisation of Northern Scotland and its inhabitants. From *The Scottish Chiefs*,...
written in 1810, to *The Black Watch*, published in 1834, the Highland myth played a crucial role in the attempt to rescue Highland manners and to turn them into an alternative to English culture.

It would be quite irrelevant to divide the novels discussed in this dissertation according to their being in favour or against the periphery and, therefore, Highland culture. Indeed, the employment of the Highland myth does not entail extolling of the traditional Gaelic culture as it really was before the improvement; since the novels here studied were all written after the age of improvement, the Highland myth is a modern reconstruction of Highland culture, a literary reproduction affected by English and Lowland culture. In other words, even the writers extolling Highland manners as a source of non-English identity, they are, as it were, portraying a periphery that no longer exists; a sort of utopia created by modern Scots that have already adopted English manners and culture.

The periphery portrayed in these novels is a literary representation; oftentimes, it is portrayed as something belonging to the past. As such, it can be either treated as the repository of lost virtues and qualities (*The Scottish Chiefs*, *Bannockburn*, *Clan-Albin*) or as the place of survival of barbarous and medieval ways of life. Although less numerous, the novels in which the Highlands and Northern Scotland are portrayed as the site of feudalism and barbarism are present: David Carey’s *A Legend of Argyle*, Honoria Scott’s *Strathmay*, Elizabeth Hamilton’s *The Cottagers of Glenburnie*. These novels offer a different perspective on the centre-periphery relationship as it is represented in early-nineteenth-century minor Scottish novels. Indeed, they show how, despite the widespread nostalgia for Scotland’s lost national independence, some writers did not consider Gaelic culture a good alternative to English culture, due to its being rooted in feudalism.

Besides highlighting the presence of different perspectives on the Highlands, the analysis of the relationship between space and plot in early-nineteenth-century novels can help us to learn more about the way in which other areas of the globe were considered. The extension of the world in which novels are set obviously depends upon their historical setting; the more recent is the period in which the novel is set, the wider is the area in which the plot develops (due to obvious historical reasons). While in the novels set before the eighteenth century the world portrayed generally coincides with the British Isles, in the works set during the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries the plot develops in a wider world, extending as far as over-sea territories and colonies.
Noteworthy, the areas external to Great Britain have stereotypical functions in the development of the plot; in other worlds, they are the backdrop for the same events in different novels. The continent, for instance, is the place of war. To France, Spain and Portugal, many among the heroes of the novels here discussed go, in order to fight as members of the British army: Norman in *Clan-Albin*, Charles in *The Lairds of Glenfern*, Charly Clifford in *Macrimmon*, Hector in *The Black Watch*. The function of Europe in these novels is always the same – it is an immense battlefield where the hero of the novel goes, in order to show his prowess and bravery. Noteworthy, these heroes are all members of the British army; by joining the army of the United Kingdom, they accept their British identity, without rejecting their Highland origins, manners and culture (*Clan-Albin, The Lairds of Glenfern*).

The role of battlefield played by Europe is particularly evident in novels set between the end of the eighteenth and the beginning of the nineteenth century, when Great Britain was no longer the site of battles. Indeed, the last battle fought on British soil was that of Culloden in 1745. While in novels set before Culloden, battles were fought in Britain between Scots and English soldiers (e.g. *The Scottish Chiefs, Bannockburn, Glencore Tower*) or between Jacobites and Protestants (e.g. *A Legend of Argyle, Lochiel, Allan Breck*), after the end of internal hostilities and the eventual pacification of the Highlands, battles were fought in Europe. Noteworthy, while novelists tend to describe the battles fought in Great Britain in detail, the battles fought abroad are oftentimes only mentioned or rapidly described. Among these novels, the most interesting one is *The Black Watch*, in which battles in both Great Britain and France are present – the plot, indeed, features both the battle of Culloden and the battle of Fontenoy.

At the times of the Wars of Scottish Independence and the Anglo-Scottish Wars, the heroes of the novels showed their courage and skill at home, defending their country from the invader; at the times of the Jacobite Risings, they either partook in the risings or fought against the rebels; at the end of the eighteenth century they went to fight abroad, joining the British army and partaking in the wars against Napoleon and in the colonialist enterprise.

Over-sea territories such as the West Indies, play a twofold function. In some novels, they are – like the Continent – a battlefield for British soldiers; in *The Scottish Orphans*, Arthur Monteith goes to fight in the British army in the Indies; the time spent there partakes in the growth of Arthur from boy to adult. In *Vale of the Clyde*, Flora’s father served the British army in India for years, until he died of malaria. In other works, the Indies are endowed with an economic function – they are the place where skilful tradesmen can make
money and enrich themselves consistently, as Helen’s husband, Mr Whitmore, in The Lairds of Glenfern. Notwithstanding the fact that trading with the colonies can enrich middleclass people to such an extent that they become richer than aristocrats – as it happens to the Percy family in Discipline - the wealth gained through trading seems to be unsteady, as Ellen Percy’s father going bankrupt shows.

The Americas, instead, tend to be portrayed as the new periphery, a wild territory where unlucky people can start a new life. In Clan-Albin, the inhabitants of Glen Albin move to Northern America, where they settle and create a new village. In Macrimmon, Charly Clifford’s father goes to America to settle there with his wife and son, but unexpected impediments lead him to leave his family back in Great Britain and to settle in Southern America, where he changes his name and gets married with a native woman. In Highland Mary, Mary’s father goes to America as an exile after the 1745; there he meets with hardships and adversities, and is made a prisoner of the Indians.

To conclude, a geocritical approach has been useful to highlight the presence not only of different perspectives on the Highlands and Northern Scotland, but also of some commonplaces in the narrative function of non-British territories. The concern with identity emerges as an important issue, able to affect the development of the plot, the movements of the protagonists, the relationship between centre and periphery and the narrative role of certain places.
PRIMARY SOURCES BY PUBLISHING DATE

1805

1806

1808

1809

1810

1813

1814

1815

1816

1817

1819

1820
1821
CAREY, D., *A Legend of Argyle; or, 'Tis a Hundred Years Since*, London: G. and W. Whittaker. 

1822

1823

1824

1825

1826

1832
ST CLAIR, R., *The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon*, London: Minerva Press.

1834

SECONDARY SOURCES BY CATEGORY

LITERARY CONTEXT

A) Scottish literature


B) Romanticism and Ossian


C) Gothic Novel

RICHTER, D. H., The Progress of Romance Literature Historiography and the Gothic Novel, Columbus: Ohio State University, 1996.

D) National Tale


E) Historical Novel and Scott


THEORY AND CRITICISM

A) Cultural and collective memory


233

B) Scottish Identity and Nationalism


LANDSCAPE AND GEOCRITICISM

A) Landscape and social studies

B) Scottish and Highland Landscape


C) Geocriticism and Literary Geography


**HISTORICAL CRITICISM**

**A) Britain and Scotland**


**B) The Highlands**


**LITERARY WORKS QUOTED**

*HELME, E., Duncan and Peggy; A Scottish Tale*, London: printed for J. Bell, 1794.


APPENDIX I

Novels and Tales Written by Less Known Scottish Authors 1790-1840

Sorted by publication date:

1790
Mackenzie, Anna Maria, Monmouth, London: P. W. Lane.

1796

1799

1800
Hamilton, Elizabeth, Memories of Modern Philosophers, Bath: Crutwell.

1801

1802
Cullen, Margaret, Home, London: J. Mawman.

1803
Kelly, Isabella, A Modern Incident in Domestic Life, Brentford: Norbury.

1804

1805
Mrs Rice, Monteith, A Novel. Founded on Historical Facts, Gainsborough: Moizley.

1806
1807

1808

1809

1810

1811

1812

1813
KELLY, ISABELLA, *Jane de Dunstanville; or, Characters as They Are*, London: J. Souter.

1814

1815

1816
1817


ANONYMOUS (the author of Hardenbrass and Haverill), Reft Rob; or, The witch of Scot-muir, London: Sherwood, Gilbert and Piper.

JERDAN, WILLIAM, Six Weeks in Paris; or, A Cure for the Gallomania, London: Johnston.


1818


FERRIER, SUSAN, Marriage, Edinburgh: Blackwood.


— The Physiognomist, London: Longman and Hurst.

1819


BALFOUR, ALEXANDER, Campbell, or, The Scottish Probationer, Edinburgh: Oliver And Boyd.

BLACKFORD, MARTHA, The Eskdale Boy, A Scottish Tale, for the Instruction and Amusement of Young Persons, London: J. Harris and Son.

BRUNTON, MARY, Emmeline, Edinburgh: Manners and Miller.


MRS ROSS, Hesitation: To Marry or Not To Marry, London: Longman.

SPENCE, ELIZABETH ISABELLA, A Traveller’s Tale of the Last Century, London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, etc.


SUTHERLAND, ALEXANDER, Redmond the Rebel; or, They Met at Waterloo. A Novel, London: Minerva Press.

1820


Lady Humdrum (Mrs Alexander Blair), Domestic Scenes. A Novel, London: Longman.


— The Hermit in the Country; or, Sketches of English Manners, London: Henry Colburn.

MUDIE, ROBERT, Glenfergus, Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.


1821


CAREY, DAVID, A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since, London: J. and W. Whittaker.


— The Ayrshire Legatees, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

LOCKHART, JOHN GIBSON, Valerius, A Roman Story, Edinburgh: Blackwood.
1822

**Anonymous**, *The Court of Holyrood, Fragments of an Old Story*, Edinburgh: Macredie, Skelly and Co.


**Campbell Bury, Charlotte Susan Maria**, *Conduct is Fate*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

**Fraser, James Bailie**, *The Highland Smugglers*, London: Henry Colburn.

**Galt, John**, *Sir Andrew Wylie, of That Ilk*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

—*The Provost*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

—*The Steam Boat*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

**Hogg, James**, *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Woman and Witchcraft. A Border Romance*, London: Longman, Hurts, Rees, etc.

**Lockhart, John Gibson**, *Some Passages in the Life of Mr Adam Blair, Minister of the Gospel at Cross-Meikle*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.


1823


**Galt, John**, *Ringan Gilhaize, or, the Covenanters*, Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.


—*The Gathering of the West*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.


**Hogg, James**, *The Three Perils of Woman; or, Love, Leasing and Jealousy. A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales*, London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, etc.

**Lady Humdrum, Self-Delusion; or, Adelaide D'Hauteroche: A Tale*, London: Longman.


**Smythe Memes, Mrs John**, *Precipitance; a Highland Tale*, London: Longman.

**Spence, Elizabeth Isabella**, *How To Be Rid of a Wife, and, The Lily of Annandale*, London: Longman, Herst, Rees, etc.


**Wilson, John**, *The Trials of Margaret Lindsay*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.

1824


—*The Bachelor's Wife*, Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.


1825

1826
CAMPBELL BURY, CHARLOTTE SUSAN MARIA, *Alla Giornata; or, To the Day*, London: Saunders and Otlay.

1827
JOHNSTONE, CHRISTIAN ISOBEL, *Elizabeth de Bruce*, Edinburgh: Blackwood.
SPENCE, ELIZABETH ISABELLA, *Dame Rebecca Berry; or, Court Scenes in the Reign of Charles the Second*, London: Longman.

1828
PORTER, JANE AND ANNA MARIA, *Coming Out; and the Field of the Forty Footsteps*, London: Longman.

1829
BLACKFORD, MARTHA, *William Montgomery, or, The Young Artist*, London: Hurst, Chance, and Co.
GABRIEL, ALEXANDER, *My Grandfather's Farm, or, Pictures of Rural Life*, Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.
PICKEN, ANDREW, *The Secretarians; or, the Church and the Meeting House*, London: Henry Colburn.
1830
— *The Exclusives*, London: Colburn and Bentley.

1831
FERRIER, SUSAN, *Destiny; or, The Chief’s Daughter*, Edinburgh, Cadell.

1832

1833

1834

1835
TELFER, JAMES, *Barbara Gray, or, the Widow’s Daughter: A Narrative Humble Life*, Newcastle: J. Blackwell and Co.
APPENDIX II

Chronology of Scott’s Works and the Identity and Highlands Corpus

Sir Walter Scott (1771-1832) exerted a crucial influence on contemporary Scottish literature. Some among the authors of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus are likely to have drawn some inspiration from Scott’s works: *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady* (1819) is clearly inspired to Scott’s *Tales of My Landlord*, while David Carey’s *A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since* (1821) directly recalls the subtitle of Scott’s *Waverley; or, ‘Tis Sixty Years Since* (1814) and the title of *A Legend of Montrose* (1819). In this Appendix, I provide a list of Scott’s works, chronologically arranged, sided by a list of the novels of the Identity and Highlands Corpus.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scott’s works</th>
<th>Identity and Highlands Corpus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1802-3 <em>Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1805 <em>The Lay of the Last Minstrel</em></td>
<td>1805 <em>Monteith</em> (Mrs Rice)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1806 <em>Glencore Tower</em> (Anon.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1808 <em>Marmion</em></td>
<td>1808 <em>The Cottagers of Glenburnie</em> (Elizabeth Hamilton)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1809 <em>The Towers of Lothian</em> (anon.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810 <em>The Lady of the Lake</em></td>
<td>1810 <em>Vale of the Clyde</em> (Honoria Scott); <em>The Romance of the Highlands</em> (Peter M. Darling); <em>The Scottish Chiefs</em> (Jane Porter)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1813 <em>Rokeby</em></td>
<td>1813 <em>Strathmay</em> (Honoria Scott)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1814 <em>Waverley; or, ‘Tis Sixty Years Since</em></td>
<td>1814 <em>Discipline</em> (Mary Brunton)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1815 <em>The Lord of the Isles; Guy Mannering</em></td>
<td>1815 <em>Clan-Albin</em> (Christian I. Johnstone)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1816 <em>The Antiquary; The Black Dwarf; Old Mortality (Tales of My Landlord, first series)</em></td>
<td>1816 <em>The Lairds of Glenfern</em> (Mary Johnston)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817 <em>Rob Roy</em></td>
<td>1817 <em>Conirdan</em> (Anon.); <em>Reft Rob</em> (Anon.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1818 <em>The Heart of Midlothian Tales of My Landlord, second series)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819 <em>The Bride of Lammermoor; A Legend of Montrose (Tales of My Landlord, third series)</em></td>
<td>1819 *The Highlander; or, A Tale of My Landlady (E.H.H.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820 <em>The Monastery; The Abbot; Ivanhoe</em></td>
<td>1820 <em>Glenfergus</em> (Robert Mudie); <em>Lochiel; or, The Field of Culloden</em> (David Carey)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821 <em>Kenilworth</em></td>
<td>1821 <em>Bannockburn</em> (Anon.); <em>A Legend of Argyle; or, ‘Tis a Hundred Years Since</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

244
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td><em>The Pirate; The Fortunes of Nigel; Peveril of the Peak</em></td>
<td>(David Carey)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td><em>The Scottish Orphans; Arthur Monteith</em></td>
<td>(Martha Blackford)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td><em>Quentin Durward</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td><em>Macrimmon; A Highland Tale</em></td>
<td>(Alexander Sutherland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td><em>St. Ronan’s Well; Redgauntlet</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td><em>The Highlanders</em></td>
<td>(Felix M’Donough)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1825</td>
<td><em>The Betrothed; The Talisman</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1825</td>
<td><em>Lochandhu; A Tale of the Eighteenth Century</em></td>
<td>(Thomas D. Lauder)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1826</td>
<td><em>Woodstock</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1826</td>
<td><em>Highland Mary</em></td>
<td>(Alexander Balfour)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1827</td>
<td><em>Life of Napoleon</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1827-8</td>
<td><em>Chronicles of the Canongate</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1828-31</td>
<td><em>Tales of a Grandfather</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1829</td>
<td><em>Anne of Geierstein</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1830</td>
<td><em>Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1832</td>
<td><em>Count Robert de Paris; Castle Dangerous</em> (<em>Tales of My Landlord, fourth series</em>)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1832</td>
<td><em>The Doomed One; or, They Met at Glenlyon</em></td>
<td>(Rosalia St. Clair)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1834</td>
<td><em>The Black Watch</em></td>
<td>(Andrew Picken)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1834</td>
<td><em>Allan Breck</em></td>
<td>(George R. Gleig)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Estratto per riassunto della tesi di dottorato

L’estratto (max. 1000 battute) deve essere redatto sia in lingua italiana che in lingua inglese e nella lingua straniera eventualmente indicata dal Collegio dei docenti.
L’estratto va firmato e rilegato come ultimo foglio della tesi.

Studente: Stella Moretti matricola: 810543

Dottorato: Lingue, Culture e Società Moderne

Ciclo: XXVIII

Titolo della tesi361: The Highlands in the Romantic Novel: Culture and Identity in Early 19th-century Scottish Literature

Abstract:
Questa tesi discute la relazione tra il modo in cui le Highlands vengono rappresentate nei romanzi minori scozzesi scritti dal 1800 al 1835 e le tematiche identitarie e culturali proprio della storia scozzese. A tal fine, sono stati scelti 28 romanzi, che vengono analizzati sotto vari punti di vista (storia, cultura, identità nazionale, paesaggio, geografia) per poter evidenziare come la ricerca di una nuova identità nazionale in seguito all’Unione tra Scozia e Inghilterra abbia fortemente influenzato le descrizioni paesaggistiche, geografiche e culturali delle Highlands nei romanzi romantici scozzesi.

This dissertation discusses the relationship between the way in which the Highlands are represented in less-known Scottish novels written between 1800 and 1835 and identity and cultural issues connected with Scottish history. The aim of this work is to demonstrate how, in the Romantic novel, landscape, geographical and cultural representations of the Highlands are consistently affected by the need to create a specific post-Union Scottish identity. In order to do this, twenty-eight less-known novels are discussed, paying particular attention to the relationship between identity and history, culture, landscape and literary geography.

361 Il titolo deve essere quello definitivo, uguale a quello che risulta stampato sulla copertina dell’elaborato consegnato.